

NOT AL-QUDS, BUT DAMASCUS: PALESTINIAN JIHADISTS OF LEBANON
IN THE SYRIAN WAR (2011 – 2017)

A THESIS SUBMITTED TO
THE GRADUATE SCHOOL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
OF
MIDDLE EAST TECHNICAL UNIVERSITY

BY

ERMAN ÇETE

IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS
FOR
THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF SCIENCE
IN
THE DEPARTMENT OF MIDDLE EAST STUDIES

SEPTEMBER 2019

Approval of the Graduate School of Social Sciences.

Prof. Dr. Yaşar Kondakçı
Director

I certify that this thesis satisfies all the requirements as a thesis for the degree of
Master of Science.

Assist. Prof. Dr. Derya Göçer Akder
Head of Department

This is to certify that we have read this thesis and that in our opinion it is fully
adequate, in scope and quality, as a thesis for the degree of Master of Science.

Assist. Prof. Dr. Derya Göçer Akder
Supervisor

Examining Committee Members

Assist. Prof. Dr. Ayşe Ömür Atmaca (Hacettepe Uni., IR) _____

Assist. Prof. Dr. Derya Göçer Akder (METU, ARS) _____

Assoc. Prof. Dr. Işık Kuşçu (METU, IR) _____



I hereby declare that all information in this document has been obtained and presented in accordance with academic rules and ethical conduct. I also declare that, as required by these rules and conduct, I have fully cited and referenced all material and results that are not original to this work.

Name, Last Name: Erman Çete

Signature:

ABSTRACT

NOT AL-QUDS, BUT DAMASCUS: PALESTINIAN JIHADISTS OF LEBANON IN THE SYRIAN WAR (2011 – 2017)

Çete, Erman

MA, Department of Middle East Studies

Supervisor: Assist. Prof. Dr. Derya Göçer Akder

September 2019, 154 pages

Ongoing Syrian War is one of the most important historical event for both the Middle East and the world in recent history. Regional and international powers with their proxies has shaped not only Syrian politics, economy, and international relations, but also neighbors of Syria, such as Turkey, Lebanon, and Iraq, and the roles of world powers such as the United States of America and Russia. The rise and threat of transnational jihadist organizations is one of the crucial consequences of the war, and foreign fighters has become a contentious issue in Western and Arab worlds. With Syrian War, transnational jihadist course found a new haven, and its impact is perceived throughout the Middle East. In this respect, Syria's neighbor Lebanon has become a fertile ground for jihadist groups and this country's Palestinian question has become mor complex. Palestinian refugee camps in Lebanon has emerged as a safe haven for transnational jihadist organizations, and in particular, for jihadist who have been waging war against the Syrian government. This study aims to place Palestinian jihadists of Lebanon in the context of transnational jihad, Syrian War, and Palestinian question inside Lebanon.

Keywords: jihadism, Syrian War, Palestinian question, refugee camps, ISIL

ÖZ

KUDÜS DEĞİL, ŞAM: SURİYE SAVAŞI'NDAKİ (2011 – 2017) LÜBNAN'DAN GELEN FİLİSTİNLİ CİHATÇILAR

Çete, Erman

Yüksek Lisans, Orta Doğu Araştırmaları

Tez Yöneticisi: Dr. Öğr. Görevlisi Derya Göçer Akder

Eylül 2019, 154 sayfa

Süregiden Suriye Savaşı, hem Orta Doğu hem de dünya için yakın tarihin en önemli tarihsel olaylarından biridir. Bölgesel ve uluslararası güçler, vekilleriyle birlikte, yalnızca Suriye'nin siyasetini, ekonomisini ve uluslararası ilişkilerini şekillendirmekle kalmamış, aynı zamanda Türkiye, Lübnan ve Irak gibi komşularıyla ABD ve Rusya gibi dünya güçlerinin rollerini de yeniden şekillendirmiştir. Ulus ötesi cihatçı örgütlerin yükselişi ve tehdit haline gelmesi, savaşın en can alıcı sonuçlarından birisi olurken, yabancı savaşçılar hem Batı hem de Arap dünyası için tartışmalı bir konu haline gelmiştir. Suriye savaşı ile birlikte uluslararası cihat kendisine yeni bir mecra bulmuş ve etkileri tüm Orta Doğu'da hissedilmiştir. Bu bağlamda, Suriye'nin komşusu Lübnan cihatçı gruplar için verimli bir saha haline gelmiş, ülkenin Filistin sorunu daha karmaşıklaşmıştır. Lübnan'daki Filistin mülteci kampları ulus ötesi cihatçı örgütler, özel olarak da Suriye hükümetine karşı savaşan cihatçılar için güvenli bölge haline gelmiştir. Bu çalışma, Lübnan'dan Suriye'ye savaşmaya giden Filistinli cihatçıları ulus ötesi cihat, Suriye Savaşı ve Lübnan'daki Filistin sorunu bağlamında değerlendirmeyi amaçlıyor.

Anahtar Sözcükler: cihatçılık, Suriye Savaşı, Filistin sorunu, mülteci kampları, IŞİD



To my parents

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank to my supervisor Assist. Prof. Dr. Derya Göçer Akder for her insightful contributions and patience for the thesis. Also, I could not forget my former advisors, Prof. Dr. Ebru Boyar and Assist. Prof. Dr. Nadine Kreitmeyr for their kind support.

I would like to offer my thanks to the members of the examining committee, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Işık Kuşçu and Assist. Prof. Dr. Ayşe Ömür Atmaca for their invaluable comments and contributions.

I am indebted my friends Ali Örnek, Hasan Sivri, Ulaş Tuğcu, and Mehmet Karadeniz for their unique understanding and knowledge concerning with the Syrian War and the Middle East. Tulga Buğra Işık, my colleague, checked the thesis and edited it in an instructive way, which deserves lots of gratitude.

I am deeply thankful to my dearest friends, Görkem Demirok, Yunus Bulut Topuz, Mehmet Fatih Can, and Gülnur Güler for their support throughout the writing process of my thesis.

Last but not least, I must express my gratitude to Ilgın Şenses for her patience throughout the process of writing this thesis. This accomplishment would not have been possible without her support. Thank you.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PLAGIARISM	iii
ABSTRACT.....	iv
ÖZ.....	v
DEDICATION	vi
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	vii
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	viii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	x
CHAPTER	
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1. The Scope of the Study	1
1.2. Literature on the contemporary jihad, the Syrian War, and the Palestinian connection	7
2. MODERN JIHAD: POLITICAL AND ECONOMIC ROOTS.....	14
2.1. Introduction.....	14
2.2. From Afghani to Qutb: Ideologic roots.....	16
2.2.1. The rise of salafism and confrontation with the West	16
2.2.2. Turning points: Abolition of the Caliphate and the colonial rule	23
2.2.3. The Brotherhood and birth of a movement	25
2.3. From Qutb to Afghan jihad: Transformation of the Middle East.....	32
2.3.1. The Decline of the Arab Nationalism	32
2.3.2. Double crisis: Global and regional	33
2.3.3. The godfather of ‘Arab-Afghans’ and the Afghan jihad.....	36
2.4. Jihadist double turn: Targeting far enemy, targeting near enemy	40
2.4.1. Post-Soviet confusion: Jihadists split up	40
2.4.2. Rise of Al Qaeda and the occupation of Iraq	41
2.5. Conclusion	43
3. RATIONALE OF THE SYRIAN JIHAD	45
3.1. Introduction.....	45

3.2. The Syrian Ikhwan and its social roots	46
3.3. Different Baaths	47
3.3.1. From radicalism to “corrective movement” of Hafez al-Assad ..	47
3.3.2. Cautious islamization of the country under Bashar al-Assad	49
3.4. Sectarian discourse of the Islamist movements	50
3.4.1. Historical roots of sectarianism	50
3.4.2. Syria is in the cross hairs	52
3.5. Political economy of the war	55
3.5.1. Transformation of Syria in the 20th century under Baath	55
3.5.2. More liberalization during Bashar’s era	59
3.5.3. Syria’s international relations during the 2000s	64
3.6. Some controversies: Mainstream media and disinformation	66
3.7. Reactions against the Syrian Uprising	72
3.8. Conclusion.....	75
4. PALESTINIAN JIHADISTS IN THE SYRIAN WAR	77
4.1. Introduction	77
4.2. Palestinian Question and refugee camps: Birth of Palestinian nationalism	78
4.3. Lebanon as a base for <i>Fedayeen</i>	83
4.4. Nationalism loses ground to Islamism.....	85
4.5. War of camps	90
4.6. Palestinians in the Syrian Jihad	94
4.7. Motives of jihad	99
4.8. Conclusion.....	105
5. CONCLUSION	107
5.1. An ambiguous future for Palestinian camps in Lebanon	109
REFERENCES.....	115
APPENDICES	
A. TURKISH SUMMARY/TÜRKÇE ÖZET.....	143
B. TEZ İZİN FORMU/THESIS PERMISSON FORM.....	154

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

PLO	: Palestine Liberation Organization
PFLP	: Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine
ISIL	: Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant
HTS	: Hayat Tahrir al-Sham
FSA	: Free Syrian Army
UNRWA	: United Nations Relief and Works Agency for Palestine Refugees

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

1.1. The Scope of the study

The Syrian War (2011 -) is one of the most important turning points for not just Syria and the Middle East, but also the whole world. Its significance copes with local, national, transnational, and international levels. Although the Syrian War demographically and politically reshapes Syria and the Levant, the military aspect and its function with respect to the global jihadist cause are breakpoints for the contemporary world system. It attracts wide attention to jihadists around the world, and it can be compared with the Afghan jihad against the Soviet Union during the 1980s. Rise of Al Qaeda and especially Islamic State of Iraq and the Levant (ISIL) is “a symptom of the broken politics of the Middle East and the fraying and delegitimization of state institutions,” according to Gerges.¹ The new jihadist wave, although it was originated from mainly the US occupation of Iraq and partly the Syrian War, has spread throughout the world from the Middle East to East Asia, from Maghreb to Mashreq. Nonetheless, the roots of new jihadist wave adheres to three pillars in a broad sense: the US hegemony and intervention to the region; failure of the post-colonial (and the so-called “secular”) Arab states; liberal economic policies which strictly sharpened the social antagonisms and the failure of the Arab states’ integration to the post-Soviet global capitalist economy.² Palestinian question has been at the heart of the problems of the contemporary Middle East, and in particular, of Lebanon. Palestinian refugee issue is complicated, and its effects run

¹ Fawaz Gerges, “ISIS and the Third Wave of Jihadism,” *Current History* 113, no. 767 (December, 2014): 339-343.

² To understand the contemporary class structure of the Middle East and effects of neoliberal economic policies on the region, see Adam Hanieh, *Lineages of Revolt: Issues of Contemporary Capitalism in the Middle East* (Chicago: Haymarket Books, 2013).

through Lebanon, Jordan, Syria, and occupied Palestine. During Lebanese Civil War (1975-1990) Palestinian refugee camps and Palestinian resistance organizations played prominent roles, and after the decline of Arab nationalism/Palestinian nationalism, the same camps has become a hotbed for transnational jihadist organizations. The Syrian War has both state and non-state actors, and Lebanon is a bridge and support base for jihadist cause within the context of the Greater Syria. It is Lebanese and Palestinian jihadists who gave a significant boost to the jihad in Syria during the war. Hence, the Syrian Jihad is related to Lebanon, Palestinian refugee camps, and transnational jihad network.

This study will try to answer the following questions: Who are these Lebanese-Palestinian jihadists? What are their impacts on Syrian War? What motives do they have to wage jihad against Bashar al-Assad in Syria, instead of, fighting in occupied Palestine against Israel, or American forces in Iraq, Jordan, and Qatar? Which socio-economic conditions have forced Palestinian camp residents to become transnational jihadists? These questions and answers to them are the most important aspect of the Palestinian intervention of the Syrian jihad.

In order to understand transnational jihad inside Palestinian camp and its role in the Syrian War, this study will trace the roots of modern jihad in the Middle East, in particular will focus on the Salafist tradition which emerged during the decline of the Ottoman Empire, Islamist movements in the Middle East in the 20th century, and look at the invention of international jihad, in Afghanistan. The first chapter excludes influential jihadist ideologues of Asia, such as al-Mawdudi, and restrains itself within the context of the Arab world. After the first chapter, the Syrian War will be examined in context of ideological decline of Arab nationalism, and economic policies of the successive Syrian governments. It covers the rise of Al Qaeda and the US invasion of Iraq, and evaluate the jihadist cause within the context of US policy towards the Middle East. Although the Syrian War continues, and Syria's Idlib province is one of the main hub for transnational jihad, the study will be limit itself from the start of the Syrian crises to the demise of the so-called Islamic State, in

2017. Plus, the study excludes Iran-affiliated groups and Hezbollah, and focuses on “Sunni” groups. In the third chapter, after a reminder about the roots of Palestinian question and Lebanon politics, history of and situation in Palestinian refugee camps and Palestinian jihadist groups inside Syria will be mentioned.

The study particularly focuses on the Lebanese-Palestinian jihadists profiles and experiences during the Syrian jihad, and examines their motives with respect to broader Middle East politics and the significance of Lebanon and Syria for the global jihadist current. For this purpose, it briefly looks at the Arab-Israel question in its historical context, and Palestinian refugee problem which sharply changed the Lebanese political landscape throughout decades. Lebanese Islamist circles are operating for years in Lebanon and Palestinian camps, and these camps are very important tools in the hand of global jihadist current, not just for Lebanon or the Greater Syria, but also for other regions such as Afghanistan. Therefore, we need to examine the evolution of Palestinian camps in Lebanon and to understand the reasons behind Islamism within those camps.

This study will also focus on Lebanese-Palestinian jihadist militants in Syria in a greater political and economical context of post-Cold War Middle East, Syria, and Palestinian camps in Lebanon. It will connect the rise of the new jihadist wave and the Syrian jihad to the failure of both post-Soviet world order and the “Arab Spring.”

The Syrian War is a juxtaposition of both local, national, regional, and international shake and especially related with the so-called “Arab Spring” issue. In some manner it has similarities to the Tunisia and Egypt “springs,” but on the other hand, the armed rebellion against the state and its resemblance of “proxy war” is related with Libya and Yemen examples. At the end of the day, Syria is a playground for major powers like the USA, Russia, France, the UK, Saudi Arabia, Iran, Turkey, and Qatar. Also, the jihadist movement made its own support bases in those countries, especially the US’ allies like Gulf countries, and Turkey. Hence, jihadist movement become a transnational phenomenon in two ways: First, it transformed the Greater

Syrian soil as a jihad-land; and second, it literally tries to erase national boundaries within the Middle East. The most shocking example of this was ISIL's media wing release with pictures which claiming "The End of Sykes-Picot," at the 100th anniversary of infamous Sykes-Picot Agreement.³

Still, one estimation in 2015 suggests that hotbeds for jihadist recruitment are in the Middle East and North Africa regions.⁴ The approximation for the Middle East was 8,240, and for the North Africa it was 8,000, respectively. In another research, Zelin states that the foreign jihadist elements penetrated into Syria mostly belonged to the nationalities of the neighbors' of Syria, "namely Lebanese, Iraqis, Palestinians, and Jordanians, many of whom previously fought U.S. forces in Iraq."⁵ The same research also points out that those jihadists mostly infiltrate to Syria from either Lebanon or Turkey. In addition to this fact, Al Qaeda leader Ayman al-Zawahiri called "Sunni Muslims in Lebanon, Turkey, Iraq, and Jordan to help the Syrian jihadists" against Syrian government.⁶

The main branch of Al Qaeda in Syria, at once, was Nusra Front (Nusra literally means "Victory") and the group grew stronger due to the support of the jihadist elements from Lebanon.⁷ Those Lebanese militants were not just "Lebanese"; they

³ James Miller, "Why Islamic State Militants Care So Much About Sykes-Picot?," *Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty*, May 16, 2016, <https://www.rferl.org/a/why-islamic-state-cares-so-much-about-sykes-picot/27738467.html>.

⁴ "Foreign Fighters: An Updated Assessment of the Flow of Foreign Fighters into Iraq and Syria," *The Soufan Group*, December, 2015, http://soufangroup.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/12/TSG_ForeignFightersUpdate3.pdf.

⁵ Aaron Y. Zelin, "Foreign Fighters Trickle into the Syrian Rebellion," *The Washington Institute*, June 11, 2012, <https://www.washingtoninstitute.org/policy-analysis/view/foreign-fighters-trickle-into-the-syrian-rebellion>.

⁶ Jason Burke, "Al Qaeda leader Zawahiri urges Muslim support for Syrian uprising," *The Guardian*, February 12, 2012, <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2012/feb/12/alqaida-zawahiri-support-syrian-uprising>.

⁷ Nasser Chararah, "Salafist Factions on Rise at Palestinian Camp in Lebanon," *Al Monitor*, March 13, 2013, <https://www.al-monitor.com/pulse/originals/2013/03/ain-al-hilweh-looming-battle.html#ixzz5XWbt9hAn>; Mona Alami, "The Impact of the Syria Conflict on Salafis and Jihadis in Lebanon," *Middle East Institute*, April 18, 2014, <https://www.mei.edu/publications/impact-syria-conflict-salafis-and-jihadis-lebanon>.

literally grew in Palestinian camps in Lebanon and were radicalized by both Afghan and Iraq wars, and also factionalist struggle within both Lebanon and Palestinian camps. They signify a complex situation which is intertwined with Palestinian question, global jihad, Lebanese domestic politics, and economic conditions.

Firstly, Palestinian question occupies a certain place for Syria, particularly for Assad governments. According to the United Nations, over 550,000 Palestinian refugees registered in Syria in 2017 with 12 official camps.⁸ Syria is one of the champions of the Palestinian cause and waged war against Israel three times (1948, 1967, 1973) with other Arab states. Therefore, Syria is in the middle of Palestinian resistance against Israel (moreover it has a part, Golan Heights, occupied and annexed by Israel) and also the factional politics of Palestine, both inside Syria and Lebanon due to its involvement in Lebanese Civil War. Syrian government supports certain factions in Palestinian politics, some Palestinian factions support the Syrian government, and Damascus have friends in Lebanese political environment. Those issues have become more complicated after the Syrian War started. Palestinian Hamas, once supported by Damascus, came over against the Syrian government and sided with Qatar and Turkey, while some other Palestinian groups such as Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine - General Command (PFLP - GC) served its arms for the Syrian Army. Pro-Syrian figures, even Bashar al-Assad, blamed Hamas and some other Palestinian factions for acting treason, while Hamas supported anti-Assad demonstration for their “seek of democracy and reform.”⁹ During the Syrian War, Yarmouk refugee camp caught in the middle of war, jihadist elements sneaked into Yarmouk, the Army responded, and lots of Palestinian refugee had to flee from the camp to other places, such as Lebanon. Moreover, there are Palestinian battalions supporting the Syrian Army such as Liwa al-Quds (Jerusalem Brigade).

⁸ “Where We Work,” *UNRWA*, Last modified January 1, 2018, <https://www.unrwa.org/where-we-work/syria>.

⁹ See, Khaled Abou Toameh, “Syria Says No To Restoring Ties With ‘Terrorist-Supporting’ Hamas,” *The Jerusalem Post*, June 12, 2019, <https://www.jpost.com/Middle-East/Syria-No-to-restoring-ties-with-terrorist-supporting-Hamas-592149>; “Hamas prime minister backs Syrian protests against Assad,” *The Guardian*, February 24, 2012, <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2012/feb/24/hamas-pm-backs-syrian-protests>.

Secondly, jihadist elements have been operating inside Palestinian camps for decades in Lebanon. Although Islamist elements in Palestinian resistance can be seen even before the foundation of Israel, and even the PLO leaders once were Muslim Brotherhood members or affiliated with the organization, Palestinian resistance were mainly “secular” for decades. However, PLO’s expulsion from Jordan and Lebanon, Israel’s annihilation of PLO infrastructure, descending of Arab nationalism and rising of Wahhabism via Saudi Arabia, PLO’s attitude towards the legitimization of Israel, the Afghan jihad, bad economic and social conditions amongst refugees, and the end of the Lebanese Civil War changed the structure in Palestinian camps in Lebanon. Hamas and transnational jihadist elements grow stronger in the camps, some Palestinians travelled to Afghanistan to participate jihad against the USSR. These transnational jihadist network, particularly in Lebanon, also with Iraqi connection due to the US invasion, fueled the Syrian War.

As mentioned before, Lebanese politics also paved the way for jihadist cause. Before the famous Cairo Agreement (1969), PLO started to intervene Lebanese political scene, such as clashing with Maronites in Southern Lebanon. According to Cairo Agreement, Lebanese Armed Forces could not enter any of the Palestinian camps in Lebanon, and gave the control of the camps to the PLO (including recruiting guerillas against Israel). This situation created “a state within a state.” In return, PLO gave assurances to Lebanon about its sovereignty. During the Civil War and the invasion of Israel, Palestinian refugee camps became a scene of massacres and clashes. In the end, the PLO was expelled from Lebanon by Israeli siege of Beirut, and PLO’s infrastructure in Lebanon almost completely destroyed by Israel. Also, in 1987, Lebanese government annulled the Cairo Agreement with the PLO, and the decline of PLO in Palestinian camps in Lebanon began.

The PLO’s secular orientation did not fit with Islamists, and the Afghan jihad and “Arab Afghan” fighters gave a good opportunity for Palestinian jihadist to gain military experience and to establish crucial links. After the Civil War, Palestinian

jihadists in camps differed themselves from both the Syrian government and now strong Hezbollah. Palestinian jihadists stopped participating the war against Israel due its “Shiite” orientation and reevaluated Israel as not “a principal enemy.”¹⁰ Jihadist circles among Palestinian camps began to teach jihadist cause and Sunni orthodoxy. Moreover, jihadist established lots of charity organizations.¹¹ Hence, rising jihadism among the Palestinian community in Lebanon is determined by both end of the Civil War, sectarian strife, impact of global jihad, and demise of Palestinian nationalism.

1.2. Literature on the contemporary jihad, the Syrian War, and the Palestinian connection

The literature about international jihadist movement generally starts it from the Afghan jihad against the USSR.¹² Although there were jihadist movements throughout the Muslim world during the 20th century, these movements and organizations were mostly bounded by local and national aspirations. When the Soviets intervened Afghanistan, fight against the Red Army become more and more an international duty for Muslims, independent of their nationality.¹³ For some scholars this moment was the invention of jihad in modern sense, but for some others, it was a new chapter or wave in the jihadist movement.¹⁴ Those scholars evaluate the jihadist movement as “local” or “national” and “global” or

¹⁰ Bernard Rougier, *Everyday Jihad: The Rise of Militant islam Among Palestinians in Lebanon* (Cambridge and London: Harvard University Press, 2007), 85.

¹¹ Ibid, 93.

¹² See. Fawaz Gerges, *Far Enemy: Why Jihad Went Global?* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 3-4; Michael W.S. Ryan, *Decoding Al-Qaeda's Strategy: Deep Battle Against America* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2013), 140; Muhammad Haniff Hassan, *The Father of Jihad: 'Abd Allah 'Azzam's Jihad Ideas and Implications to National Security* (London: Imperial College Press, 2013), 13.

¹³ Hassan, *ibid*, 14.

¹⁴ Compare Fawaz Gerges, “ISIS and the Third Wave of Jihadism” and Aisha Ahmad, *Jihad & co. Black Markets and Islamist Power* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2017), 32-33 and Glenn E. Robinson, “The Four Waves of Global Jihad, 1979-2017,” *Middle East Policy Council*, accessed March 28, 2019, <https://www.mepc.org/journal/four-waves-global-jihad-1979-2017>.

“transnational”, and periodize it from “near-enemy era” and “far-enemy era”.¹⁵ Whether it was due to the involvement of the USA on behalf of the *mujahideen* or not, Afghanistan was the crucial turning point in connection with the internationalization of jihadist current. Although, one of the most prominent Muslim Brotherhood (MB) figures, Sayyid Qutb, radicalized jihadist tradition and his ideas started to be an alternative for the failure of the Arab regimes, especially Jamal Abdel Nasser’s after the 1967 War, it was still bounded by national aspirations for jihadists, namely, by Egypt.¹⁶ One of Al Qaeda’s important figures, Ayman al-Zawahiri, inherited the jihadist cause from Qutb, and became a member of the MB and was sent by the organization to Peshawar in 1980 for “humanitarian” help.¹⁷ This moment was not only a turning point in Zawahiri’s life as a jihadist, but it was also the most important point, “a taproot” for jihadist international.¹⁸

Despite the fact that the Afghan jihad had its root in local Afghan politics and its neighbor Pakistan’s policy against Soviet-allied Afghanistan, these local or Pakistan-based Islamist politicians paved the way for the so-called international holy war against the USSR in Afghanistan. Rivalry between communists and Islamists was very tense during 1970s, especially after the collapse of the monarchy in 1973, and Islamist parties mostly targeted at communist-affiliated organizations, not at the state.¹⁹ After the foundation of the republic, Islamist politicians went to Pakistan and started military training against the new Afghan government with the supervision of

¹⁵ See Fawaz Gerges, *Far Enemy: Why Jihad Went Global?* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 33; Jason Burke, *The New Threat: The Past, Present, and Future of Islamic Militancy* (New York and London: The New Press, 2015), 16.

¹⁶ See Bruce Riedel, *The Search for al Qaeda: Its Leadership, Ideology, and Future* (Washington: Brookings Institution Press, 2008), 18.

¹⁷ Ibid, 18.

¹⁸ Daniel Byman, *ibid*, 4.

¹⁹ For Gulbiddin Hekmetyar and his party Hizb-i Islami’s role, see David B. Edwards, *Before Taliban: Genealogies of the Afghan Jihad* (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2002), 177 and 215-216.

Pakistani intelligence.²⁰ Still, Afghan jihad did not equal to Al Qaeda at that time, i.e. 1980s, but “transnationalization” of the jihadi cause was on the process.²¹ According to Gerges, Al Qaeda is not a kind of “social movement”, not it has a broad social base from the very beginning of the foundation of the organization.²² Al Qaeda’s difference, after mid-1990s, is that it changed the course of jihad, from “attacking to the near enemy”, i.e. “secular” rulers of the Muslim countries, to “attacking to the far enemy”, i.e. the United States and the Western powers.²³ If Afghan jihad paved the way for an international holy war against the Soviet Union with the help of Pakistan, Saudi Arabia, and the United States, then Al Qaeda took the seeds of this international jihad and extended and distorted it to the far enemy. Scholars from different worldviews usually interpret the rise of Al Qaeda and the global jihad with regard to the US national security policy, the change of the international order, countering the jihadist ideology, and inability of local governments.²⁴

The symbol of the era of Al Qaeda and transnational jihad was one of the most prominent jihadists, Abu Musab al-Suri. The “theoretician” of “order without organization” (*nizam la-tanzim*) advised small cells without organizational relations

²⁰ See Barbara Bick, *Walking the Precipice: Witness to the Rise of the Taliban in Afghanistan* (New York: The Feminist Press at CUNY, 2009), 30-31.

²¹ See Fawaz Gerges, *The Rise and Fall of Al-Qaeda* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), 29.

²² Ibid, 29-30.

²³ Ibid, 31.

²⁴ See Angel Rabasa, et al., “Beyond al-Qaeda: The Global Jihadist Movement,” *RAND Corporation*, 2006, https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/monographs/2006/RAND_MG429.pdf; Bruce Riedel, *Deadly Embrace: Pakistan, America, and the Future of the Global Jihad* (Washington: Brookings Institution Press, 2011), 86-106; Bruce Riedel, *The Search for al-Qaeda: Its Leadership, Ideology, and Future*, 134-155; Daniel Byman, *ibid*, 187-229; David Aaron, *Own Words: Voices of Jihad* (Santa Monica: RAND Corporation, 2008), 115-153; David Cook, *Understanding Jihad* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005), 93-128; Laurent Murawiec, *The Mind of Jihad* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008), 295-324. Some scholars see the global jihad in a prism of modernity and the “Western values”. For example see John Gray, *Al Qaeda and What It Means to be Modern* (New York: New Press, 2003), 1-5. For a different and social-educational evaluation see David B. Edwards, *Before Taliban: Genealogies of the Afghan Jihad* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002), 132-167; Diego Gambetta and Steffen Hertog, *Engineers of Jihad: The Curious Connection Between Violent Extremism and Education* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2008), 1-34; John A. Turner, *Religious Ideology and the Roots of the Global Jihad: Salafi Jihadism and International Order* (London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), 11-35.

with Al Qaeda's central command and planned military attacks against the USA and Western targets.²⁵ In 1996, with the famous "fatwa" by Osama bin Laden, Al Qaeda declared jihad against the USA, where Laden said, the Muslim Holy Land were occupied by the "Crusaders," and every single Muslim's duty was to fight against the USA until the liberation of the Holy Land. Laden, heedfully, warned his "mujahideen" about avoiding an internal war between Muslim people, and advised to focus on the US and the West.²⁶ Laden also remarked that due to the imbalance of military power, Al Qaeda needed to stage a guerilla warfare against the USA, and will be avoided the "traditional warfare."²⁷ The same pattern, more clearly, was repeated by a new "fatwa" in 1998, which called all Muslims to attack military and civilian targets in any country.²⁸

The Palestinian connection with this jihadist international started in parallel with Afghan jihad and the islamization of the Palestinian question. The hench-man was the famous Palestinian jihadist, Abdullah Azzam. He was the main Arab ideologist of the jihad against the Red Army in Afghanistan.²⁹ His journey to jihad is very typical for the Islamism in the Levant: June 1967 Arab-Israeli War was a turning point for Azzam. Although the defeat of Arab armies in 1967 War was a huge failure for Arab nationalism, it did not directly retire from the scene for Islamic awakening.

²⁵ See Brynjar Lia, *Architect of Global Jihad: The Life of al-Qaida Strategist Abu Mus'ab al-Suri* (London: Hurst&Company, 2007), 6. Connecting the rise of the global jihad with US foreign policy against the Soviet Union and relations with Taliban see: Jonathan Cristol, *The United States and the Taliban before and after 9/11* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2019), 49-93; Lawrence Pintak, *Seeds of Hate: How America's Flawed Middle East Policy Ignited the Jihad* (London: Pluto Press, 2003), 65-205. From a political-economy perspective see Loretta Napoleoni, *Modern Jihad: Tracing the Dollars Behind the Terror Networks* (London and Sterling: Pluto Press, 2003), 63-139.

²⁶ Osama bin Laden, "Declaration of War against the Americans Occupying the Land of the Two Holy Places," *Al Quds Al Arabi*, 1996, <https://ctc.usma.edu/app/uploads/2013/10/Declaration-of-Jihad-against-the-Americans-Occupying-the-Land-of-the-Two-Holiest-Sites-Translation.pdf>, 5.

²⁷ Ibid, 6.

²⁸ "Osama bin Laden's 1998 Fatwa," accessed April 2, 2019, <https://www.911memorial.org/sites/default/files/Osama%20bin%20Laden's%201998%20Fatwa%20declaring%20war%20against%20the%20West%20and%20Israel.pdf>.

²⁹ John C. M. Calvert, "The Striving Shaykh Abdullah Azzam and the Revival of Jihad," *Journal of Religion & Society* 2, (2007): 83-102.

It was the “twilight of Arab nationalism” at best³⁰, and paved the way for Palestinian nationalism, not Islamism at first.³¹ But Abdullah Azzam, a Jenin-born Palestinian, joined local Muslim Brotherhood branch in Jordan after the defeat, and due to the local Muslim Brotherhood organization’s struggle was not against Hashemite Kingdom of Jordan or Israel, but secular and socialist Arab movements, Azzam’s ideological formation was determined by anti-communist and anti-secular elements.³² He was the connection between Afghan jihad and Arab world with his fatwas during 1980s, and he was the man who acted as an “ambassador” and recruiter of Arab *mujahideen* for Afghan jihad with Osama bin Laden.³³

Still, the challenge between the “far enemy” strategy and the “near enemy” strategy has always been right there in Al Qaeda ideology. Some scholars observe that, for example Ayman al-Zawahiri changed his opinion during 1990s from “near enemy” to “far enemy.”³⁴ This approach will be complicated after 9/11, the US invasions of Afghanistan (2001) and Iraq (2003). The American and the Western scholars mostly try to picture a roadmap to counter the jihadist threat against the “Western world” and to understand the ideology that Al Qaeda pursues.³⁵ After the US invasion ousted Iraqi President Saddam Hussein, Al Qaeda in Iraq had to wage a war against the invaders (“far enemy”) in a Muslim country again. However, another shift occurred

³⁰ See Adeed Dawisha, *Arab Nationalism in the Twentieth Century: From Triumph to Despair* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2016), 252-282.

³¹ For the effect of 1967 War on Palestinian cause, see Helena Cobban, *The Palestinian Liberation Organisation: People, Power and Politics* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1992), 27.

³² See Calvert, *ibid*, pp. 86 and Andrew McGregor, “‘Jihad and the Rifle Alone’: ‘Abdullah ‘Azzam and the Islamist Revolution,” *The Journal of Conflict Studies* 23, no. 2 (Fall 2003): 92-113.

³³ Sebastian Schnelle, “Abdullah Azzam, Ideologue of Jihad: Freedom Fighter or Terrorist?,” *Journal of Church and State* 54, no. 4 (Autumn 2012): 628.

³⁴ Montasser al-Zayyat, *The Road to Al-Qaeda: The Story of Bin Laden’s Right-Hand Man*, translated by Ahmed Fekry, ed. Sara Nimis (London: Pluto Press, 2004), 60-72.

³⁵ See Michael W. S. Ryan, *Decoding Al-Qaeda’s Strategy: The Deep Battle Against America* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2013), 3; Muhammad Haniff Hassan, *ibid*, pp. 10. Also, there are lots of essentialist religious interpretation of Islam and violence. For example see John C. M. Calvert, “The Striving Shaykh Abdullah Azzam and the Revival of Jihad,” *Journal of Religion & Society* 2, (2007): 83-102.

in international jihadist current with parallel to the US policy: After the Hezbollah-Israel war of 2006, the US had started to change its course in the Middle East, and tried to contain Iran and Hezbollah. According to the award-winner journalist Seymour Hersh, it was “a strategic shift”, and the Bush Administration started to look for new “Sunni friends” to counter the Iranian influence from Iraq to Lebanon.³⁶ During that time, a controversy started within the jihadist circles. First, after Hafez al-Assad’s death, famous Abu Musab al-Suri evoked that Syria is a “Nusayri-Alawite” government and Alawites are as dangerous as “the Jews and the Crusaders” and called the Sunni youth of the Greater Syria to wage jihad against the Syrian government.³⁷ Also, the leader of the Al Qaeda Iraq, Abu Musab al-Zarqawi, called for an all-out attack against Shias, without discrimination whether they are civilian or militant.³⁸ Al-Suri and al-Zarqawi changed Al Qaeda and the global jihad’s course again, and started a *civil war* among Muslims in the Greater Syria. The Syrian jihad has taken this course, which started after the invasion of Iraq, and pointed its arms against “infidel regimes” once again and called all Muslims of the world to wage a war against the Syrian government. Some scholars and journalists try to place this war as “a Sunni revolution”³⁹, while some others try to put it in the context of fragmentation of local Iraqi community.⁴⁰ In spite of this “Sunni resentment” approach, it is important to note that in Aleppo and Damascus, lots of Sunnis support

³⁶ See Seymour Hersh, “Redirection,” *The New Yorker*, March 5, 2007, <https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2007/03/05/the-redirection>.

³⁷ Nibras Kazimi, *Syria Through Jihadist Eyes: A Perfect Enemy* (Stanford: Hoover Press, 2010), 33.

³⁸ Emily Hunt, “Zarqawi’s ‘Total War’ on Iraqi Shiites Exposes a Divide among Sunni Jihadists,” *The Washington Institute*, November 15, 2005, <https://www.washingtoninstitute.org/policy-analysis/view/zarqawis-total-war-on-iraqi-shiites-exposes-a-divide-among-sunni-jihadists>.

³⁹ See Patrick Cockburn, *The Rise of Islamic State: ISIS and the New Sunni Revolution* (London: Verso, 2015); Aron Lund, “Syria’s Salafi Insurgents: The Rise of the Syrian Islamic Front,” *UI Occasional Papers*, no. 17 (March 2013): pp. 8; Christopher Kozak, ““An Army in All Corners”: Assad’s Campaign Strategy in Syria,” *ISW Middle East Security Report* 26 (April 2015): 13 and 19; Charles L. Lister, *The Syrian Jihad: Al-Qaeda, the Islamic State and the Evolution of an Insurgency* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2016); Zana Khasraw Gulmohamad, “The Rise and Fall of the Islamic State of Iraq and Al-Sham (Levant) ISIS,” *Global Security Studies* 5, Issue 2 (Spring 2014): 1-11.

⁴⁰ See Fawaz Gerges, *ISIS: A History* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2016), 98-120.

the Syrian government; and before Bashar al-Assad, his father Hafez al-Assad broadened the Baath Party's social support base to Sunni bourgeoisie.⁴¹

Although some scholars state that Islamic revival in occupied Palestine and in Palestinian camps in Lebanon started in 1970s, one of the most important turning points for Islamization was the Israeli invasion of Lebanon against the PLO. It was not only a military setback for the PLO and secular Palestinian nationalism, but also a communal disaster for Palestinians in Lebanon due to the destruction of the civil services that PLO built in many decades.⁴² It juxtaposed with Islamic revival in the Arab world and Islamization of the Palestinian cause (caused by both Iranian revolution and decline of the Arab nationalism). Global jihad elements in occupied Palestine and in Palestinian camps in Lebanon exploited the poverty, lack of civil services and negligence of Arab countries.⁴³ During 2000s and the Syrian War, Palestinian camps in Lebanon saw lots of clashes between Islamists and secular forces.⁴⁴ Lebanon and Palestinian camps in Lebanon were two most important support base of Syrian jihad against Bashar al-Assad during the Syrian War.

⁴¹ Raymond A. Hinnebusch, *Syria: Revolution From Above* (London and New York: Routledge, 2005), 111-112.

⁴² See Cobban, *ibid*, 135-136.

⁴³ See Simon Haddad, "The Palestinian Predicament in Lebanon," *Middle East Quarterly* 7, no. 3 (September 2000): 29-40; see Bernard Rougier, *ibid*, 201; Zeina Halabi, *ibid*, 42-43.

⁴⁴ See "A call to arms: three Palestinian militant groups," *Now*, June 11, 2007, https://now.mmedia.me/lb/en/commentary/a_call_to_arms_three_palestinian_militant_groups; "Factions fight in Lebanese camp," *BBC*, March 21, 2008, http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/middle_east/7309079.stm; Mitchell Prothero, "Lebanon May Attract Sunnis Seeking to Wage Jihad," *US News*, May 15, 2008, <http://www.usnews.com/news/world/articles/2008/05/15/lebanon-may-attract-sunnis-seeking-to-wage-jihad>; Robert Fisk, "Al-Qa'ida sends its warriors from Iraq to wage 'jihad' in Lebanon," *The Independent*, August 15, 2008, <http://www.independent.co.uk/voices/commentators/fisk/robert-fisk-alqaida-sends-its-warriors-from-iraq-to-wage-jihad-in-lebanon-897557.html>; Nasser Chararah, "Salafist Factions on Rise at Palestinian Camp in Lebanon," *Al Monitor*, March 13, 2013, <http://www.al-monitor.com/pulse/originals/2013/03/ain-al-hilweh-looming-battle.html>; Mona Alami, "The Impact of the Syria Conflict on Salafis and Jihadis in Lebanon," *Middle East Institute*, April 18, 2014, <http://www.mei.edu/content/impact-syria-conflict-salafis-and-jihadis-lebanon>.

CHAPTER 2

MODERN JIHAD: POLITICAL AND ECONOMIC ROOTS

Please, my brother, modernize. Open up your country.
Make the schools mixed women and men. Let women
wear miniskirts. Have discos. Be modern. Otherwise I
cannot guarantee you will stay in your throne.

Iranian Shah Mohammad Reza Pahlavi's letter to King
Faisal of Saudi Arabia

Your majesty, I appreciate your advice. May I remind
you, you are not the shah of France. You are not in the
Élysée. You are in Iran. Your population is 90 percent
Muslim. Please don't forget that.

King Faisal's reply to Shah Mohammad Reza Pahlavi

2.1. Introduction

The roots of the contemporary jihadist movement can be traced back to the late Ottoman Empire era and the beginning of colonial rule of the Western powers, namely, Britain and France. Of course, there were some challenges against the Ottomans and the caliphate *within* the Empire, such as Wahhabis of Arabian Peninsula and Muhammad Ahmad of Sudan or some Sufi orders expanded their influences throughout the Muslim world like *Nakshibendiyya*. Surely, all jihadist

organizations refer to some basic medieval Islamic scholars such as Ibn Taymiyyah, Ibn al-Qayyim and call for back to the basics, i.e. prophet's and four caliphs' era. However, contemporary jihad, with its organization, structure, recruitment methods, means of struggle, and political economy occurs as a modern phenomenon. Its formation was determined by the colonial encounter and the inadequacy of the Muslim states, especially the Ottoman Empire. Thinkers and activists such as Jamal al-Din al-Afghani, Abdel Rahman al-Kawakibi, Muhammad Abduh, Abul Ala Mawdudi, Rashid Rida established the so-called "salafist" school which tried to implement principles for reform in Islamic world, especially in the Ottoman Empire (and in the case of Mawdudi, it was India) where the caliphate was theoretically chairing the Islamic nation and seen as a pioneer against the Western influence. They accepted the superiority of the Western world and called for a return to prophet's commanding years as a sort of "Golden Age" for Islamic nation. Reformist thinkers rejected mediated interpretations of Islamic law and called for a return to the Qur'an and the other sacred Islamic texts. This approach uprooted Islamic tradition which has been established throughout for centuries and implied a renewal in Islam and Islamic society. Hence, modern Islamic movements and jihadist thought tried to fill the vacuum that was created by both Western penetration and Islamic renewal. The incompetence of traditional religious and political establishment in the Muslim world was targeted by both secular and Islamist currents. The most important point about the above-mentioned fact is that jihadism in the Middle East is not about "medieval ages", on the contrary, it is a modern phenomenon. All Islamist movements, both jihadists and non-jihadists, are the genuine products of the relationship (actually, unequal relationship) between the West and the Muslim World during the 19th and the 20th centuries. This purpose of this chapter is to trace the contemporary jihadist movement's roots back to the 19th century.

2.2. From Afghani to Qutb: Ideologic roots

2.2.1. The rise of Salafism and confrontation with the West

The famous Renan-Afghani debate is one of the most typical examples of Salafist approach to Islam and Western effects to it. A well-known orientalist of his time, Ernest Renan, tried to distinguish the so-called “Aryan race” and “Semitic race” in accord with their linguistic and cultural lines. For Renan, Aryan race, which includes Europeans, is known for its rational and scientific thought whereas Semitic race is “senescence” and fatalist.⁴⁵ Renan, in one of his speeches, which Afghani felt obliged to reply it, claimed that Islam is the main obstacle to scientific progress and attributed an essential backwardness to it. The French scholar asserted the backwardness of Muslim people in order to raise the question of whether “European spirit” should let the Islamic society alone or not. More clearly, he used his argument to justify the European colonialism.⁴⁶ In his interesting answer to Renan, Jamal al-Din al-Afghani admitted that Islam had been an obstacle to scientific development, but he pointed out that Islam was once the main carrier of the ancient Greek and Persian science, and it is also true that for centuries Christianity was an obstacle to free thinking and scientific reason, and that means Islam can break its chains in the future.⁴⁷ Moreover, Afghani used Renan’s linguistic approach against him, and

⁴⁵ Safdar Ahmed, *Reform and Modernity in Islam: The Philosophical, Cultural and Political Discourses among Muslim Reformers* (London and New York: I.B.Tauris, 2013), 47. Ahmed underlines that reformist Islamists approached Western science from a dual perspective: First, science is a tool to empower the colonial rule in the Muslim world, and second, the scientific knowledge must have captured by Muslims in order to resist Western powers. See, *ibid*, 48.

⁴⁶ York A. Norman, “Disputing the “Iron Circle”: Renan, Afghani, and Kemal on Islam, Science, and Modernity,” *Journal of World History* 22, no. 4 (December 2011): 699-700.

⁴⁷ See, Nikki R. Keddie, “*Imperialism, Science and Religion: Two Essays by Jamal al-Din al-Afghani, 1883 and 1884*,” accessed June 20, 2019, https://edisciplinas.usp.br/pluginfile.php/4414095/mod_resource/content/1/KEDDIE%2C%20Nikki.pdf. In his other article regarding to the British colonial rule in India, Afghani appeals to Muslim faith and Qur’an for challenging against the colonialism. Contrary to Afghani’s reply to Renan, Ottoman author Namık Kemal totally rejected Renan’s assertions about Islam. See, Namık Kemal, *Renan Müdafaaanamesi* (Ankara: Milli Kültür Yayınları, 1962). Kemal’s pamphlet has been largely ignored by scholars, partly its harsh anti-Western tone, and partly it was written for the Ottoman audience in Ottoman Turkish.

defended Arab people with the argumentation that Arabic-speaking people, regardless of their ethnic origin, are within the framework of Arab intellectual sphere.⁴⁸

Although their thoughts had inconsistent elements such as nationalism⁴⁹, focusing on Arab people and Arabic in their world view, Salafist thinkers mostly conducted their political activities through calls for an educational renewal amongst the Islamic world and the Ottoman Empire. Especially, Afghani reshaped the course of Islam with its “usefulness” for social order and both Afghani and Abduh tried to conjoin the reason and the religion.⁵⁰ Some scholars think that Afghani and early pan-Islamism used Islam as a tool for their anti-imperialist agenda due to it was widely believed by the people of the Middle East. Also, while Afghani was defending Islamic virtues against the Western critique, at the same time he accredited secular features to Islam. Besides he tried almost to equate prophecy and philosophy in his writings and speeches.⁵¹

Also, the late Ottoman Islamic revivalism bifurcated when it encounters with the Western world. The Salafist school, on the one hand, tried to prove Islam’s convenience to modern scientific developments with the reference to the medieval Islamic civilization and its successful development, and on the other hand, it rejected

⁴⁸ Safdar Ahmed, *ibid*, 52.

⁴⁹ When he was in Egypt, Afghani attracted the future nationalist leader Saad Zaghloul and a famous Christian writer Adib Ishaq. See, Safdar Ahmed, *ibid*, 49.

⁵⁰ Mark Sedwick, *Muhammad Abduh* (London: Oneworld Publications, 2013), 71.

⁵¹ For this argument, see, Nikki R. Keddie, “Religion and Irreligion in Early Iranian Nationalism,” *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 4, no. 3 (April 1962): 265-295. Elie Kedourie objects Keddie’s argument with claiming that for Abduh (and Afghani), there was a difference between what is said and what is done. See, Elie Kedourie, *Afghani and ‘Abduh: An Essay on Religious Unbelief and Political Activism in Modern Islam* (London and Portland: Frank Cass, 1997), 2. His argument to equate the prophecy and the philosophy ended an Ottoman religious establishment’s backlash against him during his Istanbul trip. See, footnote 15.

the undermining cultural effects of the Western penetration to the Muslim world.⁵² This dual approach will have branded almost all kind of Islamist movements up to this day. The most laconical idiom for that thought is “take the Western science, not its morals.” This dual mindset was the main ground for late Ottoman era, especially Hamidian regime. Abdulhamid II banded the economic and administrative reform and strictly conservative socio-cultural rule together. This policy also determined the reformist Salafist thinkers and their followers.⁵³ During the 20th century, it is interesting to see that the main socio-economic support base and cadre source of the jihadist/Islamist movements was middle-class people, especially western-educated professionals.⁵⁴ Still, at that time the course of *jihad* was tentative and it was about to fix already established caliphate and to reach the level of the West. However, there is a nuance between early Salafist thinkers and the 20th century jihadist movements: While the Muslim Brotherhood and the other jihadist groups sharpened their anti-colonial rhetoric and concentrated on the Western penetration into the Muslim world

⁵² Niyazi Berkes, *The Development of Secularism in Turkey* (London: Hurst & Co., 1998), 264. Berkes argues that although the salafist thinkers appeal to the past of Islam, this successful era of Islam made this achievement contrary to *sharia*.

⁵³ Itzhak Weismann, *Abd al-Rahman al-Kawakibi: Islamic Reform and Arab Revival* (London: Oneworld Publications, 2015), 44.

⁵⁴ See Diego Gambetta and Steffen Hertog, *Engineers of Jihad: The Curious Connection Between Violent Extremism and Education* (Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2016), 42-52. In his biography about the famous Al Qaeda ideologist Abu Mus’ab al-Suri, Brynjar Lia underlines that al-Suri’s choice to become a mechanical engineer is consistent with Islamist current of his time. According to Lia, most of the Islamists chose “secular sciences” for education and become middle-class professionals such as “lawyers, engineers, and doctors.” See, Brynjar Lia, *Architect of Global Jihad: The Life of al-Qaida Strategist Abu Mus’ab al-Suri* (London: Hurst&Company, 2007), 34. In another source, it is emphasized that Islamist movement was an alliance of educated youth, “God-fearing” bourgeoisie and middle-class professionals. See, Gilles Kepel, *Jihad: The Trail of Political Islam*, trans. Anthony F. Roberts (Massachusetts: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2003), 6. Another source points that Hasan al-Banna tried to spread his group’s propaganda to “the urban lower middle class.” See, Noha Mellor, *Voice of the Muslim Brotherhood: Da’wa, Discourse, and Political Communication* (New York: Routledge, 2018), 92. This mixture creates a sort of “practicalness” which is reflected excellently by the founding father of the Muslim Brotherhood, Hasan al-Banna: “In the time that I would waste in writing a book, I could write one hundred young Muslims. Every one of them would be a living, speaking influential book.” Cited by Alison Pargeter, *Müslüman Kardeşler: Muhalefetten İktidara* (İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2016), 18. Also for this “action” over “ideology” issue see, Carrie Rosefsky Wickham, *The Muslim Brotherhood: Evolution of an Islamist Movement* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2013), 24.

for the backwardness of the Islamic society, the founding fathers of the modern Salafist school more inclined to accept the inner inabilities of the Muslim world.⁵⁵

Moreover, especially Afghani's colorful political life and his pragmatic methods were significant. Afghani was in India, Afghanistan, Ottoman Empire, Egypt, France, Iran, Russia and he always tried to evoke "elites" for the realization of his political plans.⁵⁶ Although later some Islamist movements established a more broad social base for their organizations, there has always been a taint of "game of thrones" amongst reformist Islamism due to their relations with state apparatus or administrative people. The tension between being an Islamic-cultural society and a political organization that seeks to conquer the state power haunted jihadist movements, especially the Muslim Brotherhood even during the "Arab Spring." Nevertheless, addressing the ordinary people who deprived of the established political order while developing crucial relations with the same established political order's elites is one of the most important abilities of the modern Islamist movements.

Muhammad Abduh also aimed to reform Islamic thought with education. He tried to merge Western inspired values with Islamic reform, however, this policy was objected both by some Islamist and British rulers. British officers blamed him for being "too Westernized", while his fellow Egyptians branded him as a "colonial agent."⁵⁷ His relations with Urabi revolt signifies of his political worldview: the nationalist-Egyptian dimension, anti-colonial dimension, anti-Ottoman dimension. Again, these aspects did not constitute a consistent and compete ideological

⁵⁵ For this nuance and the inconsistencies of the modern salafism, see, Bassam Tibi, *Islam's Predicament with Modernity: Religious Reform and Cultural Change* (London and New York: Routledge, 2009), 42-45.

⁵⁶ For adventures of Afghani, see, Nikki R. Keddie, *Sayyid Jamal Ad-Din Al-Afghani: A Political Biography* (Los Angeles: University Of California Press, 1972). Afghani's affinity for the "elites" also can be found in his reply to Renan. In this article, Afghani claims that while people do not like "reason", only the "elites" can grasp the essence of the reason.

⁵⁷ Indira Falk Gesink, *Islamic Reform and Conservatism: Al-Azhar and the Evolution of Modern Sunni Islam* (London and New York: I.B. Tauris Publishers, 2009), pp. 166.

discourse. However, during the 20th century, almost all jihadist movements were stamped by the abovementioned lines of thought, more or less. Abduh's opinions about education were shaped by Al-Azhar's incompetence and he regarded Al-Azhar as the main reason for European superiority.⁵⁸

Abduh rejected the Western notion of separation of religion and state, and claimed that in Islam neither political administration nor the religious establishment aims a theocratic regime.⁵⁹ As Albert Hourani states that Abduh was more consistent than his teacher Afghani, and he had much more an impact upon the future generations of Egypt and the whole Muslim world.⁶⁰ He had some relations with European thinkers and often visited Europe "to renew himself", while he was trying to save the Muslim world from its bad situation.⁶¹ According to Abduh, westernization process had created a gap between Islamic rule, laws, moral principles and daily human reasoning. Moreover, Abduh thought, the latter had been prevailing the former and this gap between two spheres was a consequence of the intense secularization.⁶² There was no link between Western educated Egyptians and traditionally educated Egyptians, on top off it, these two types of generation are dangerous for Egypt. He admitted, like Afghani, the misery of the Muslim world, its inadequacy and moral deterioration, and again like Afghani, found the incapacity of the Muslim world in Muslims turning their backs on true Islam. This standpoint also calls for "purification" of Islam, to overcome sectarian divisions in Islam and to popularize the essentials of Islam amongst the uneducated ordinary Muslims.⁶³ In a word, Abduh

⁵⁸ Ibid, pp. 166. It is interesting to see Shakib Arslan, one of the most important nationalist figures after the collapse of the Ottoman Empire, echoes Abduh's opinion about education and Al-Azhar.

⁵⁹ Uriya Shavit, *Scientific and Political Freedom in Islam: A Critical Reading of the Modernist-Apologetic School* (London and New York: Routledge, 2017), pp. 1.

⁶⁰ Albert Hourani, *Arabic Thought in the Liberal Age, 1798-1939* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013), pp. 130-131.

⁶¹ Ibid, pp. 135.

⁶² Ibid, pp. 136.

⁶³ Charles C. Adams, *Islam and Modernism in Egypt: A Study of the Modern Reform Movement Inaugurated by Muhammad 'Abduh* (New York: Russell&Russell, 1968), 108-109.

tried to find an answer that whether a Muslim can still be a Muslim in the modern world.⁶⁴ Nevertheless, Abduh's writings and opinions about Islamic theology is described by some scholars as "hodgepodge" which another proof of the ambiguity of definition of "Salafiyya" school and political usage of Islam against Christianity and the West.⁶⁵

The other important figure in Salafist approach, Rashid Rida, echoed his teacher Abduh's "reform in Islam" steps. He took over Abduh's assessment of colonialism and traditional Islam, which both of them had an hostile opinion, and underlined again the differentiation between Western inspired legal schools and traditional religious schools.⁶⁶ Avoiding from philosophical debates and "purifying" Islam for the sake of Muslims' unity, Rida showed a significant intolerance to Islamic sects during his lifetime. He saw Baha'ism "more of a threat to the ummah than Christianity" and was an opponent of Shiism.⁶⁷ He thought that the inability of Islam in the modern days was caused by Muslims itself, and waiting for a lost or hidden Imam would legitimize the passivity of the Muslim people.⁶⁸ Rida was less "cosmopolitan" than his teacher Abduh and Afghani, and more willing to reject Europe than his successors. Some scholars claim that his polemics against Christians and Christian missions in Egypt paved the way for more radical jihadist attitude of Muslim Brotherhood.⁶⁹ According to this view, Rida transformed Afghani and

⁶⁴ Albert Hourani, *ibid*, 139.

⁶⁵ Jeffry R. Halverson, *Theology and Creed in Sunni Islam: The Muslim Brotherhood, Ash'arism, and Political Sunnism* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), 55.

⁶⁶ Simon Wood, *Christian Criticisms, Islamic Proofs: Rashid Rida's Modernist Defence of Islam* (Oxford: Oneworld Publications, 2007), 25-26.

⁶⁷ *Ibid*, 28.

⁶⁸ Wood states that Rida's negative views about Shiism fits with his promotion of Wahhabism. After the Wahhabi conquest of Hijaz, he totally assessed this move as legitimate. *Ibid*, 29. Rida also appealed to Ibn Taymiyyah, whom contemporary jihadist groups such as Al Qaeda and ISIS mostly use him for their political and sectarian purposes. Moreover, Rida claims that his teacher Abduh had more negative opinions about Shiites than Ibn Taymiyyah. See, Elie Kadouri, *ibid*, 6.

⁶⁹ See Malcolm H. Kerr, *Islamic Reform and Legal Theories of Muhammad Abduh and Rashid Rida* (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1966), 154. Both Afghani and Abduh were keen on

Abduh's Salafism into a Athari-Wahhabite interpretation of Islam and rejection of liberalism.⁷⁰ The same confusion or transitivity about Islamism and nationalism appears in Rida's career: In a way, he seem to be a source of a more sectarian jihadist attitude in the Muslim world in the 20th century, and in another way, he is evaluated a "Syrian nationalist" for active participation in Syrian national politics as President of Syrian National Congress in 1920.⁷¹

However, it should not be thought that Afghani's and his disciples' opinions about religion, society, or state were complete and consistent. He claimed that at one historical point Islam could and did become an obstacle against the rational thinking, but it was not the whole story about Islam or any other religion. According to him, Islam once was a promoter and protector of reason and science, but people who forgot and turned their back to the roots of authentic Islam diminished Islam's main message. Afghani and his disciples admitted that the West was ascending at that time, however, they drew a picture which depicts Christianity as irrational and Islam as rational, in an unpersuasive manner. This comparison took the early reformist to the conclusion that the "real" Islam was more rational and pro-science than Christianity and forced them to make an artificial distinction between Western progress and its morals. Therefore, they put Islamic Golden Age (i.e. Prophet's era and Medieval Islamic civilization) as an objective to renew the Muslim World and to reach the Western progress.

The ambiguity of this Salafist-reformist approach is nourished by its founders' somehow "mystical" lives and their posthumous re-evaluation by another scholars such as Rida. Unsystematic information about Afghani and Abduh combines with the

learning European languages and visiting European cities, on the contrary, Rida's only visit was to Geneva in 1921 as a part of a Syrian-Palestinian delegation. Ibid, 154-155.

⁷⁰ Halverson, *ibid*, 62. Athari school of Islam rejects Islamic science of *kalam*. Atharis see no contradiction between essence and appearance, therefore contradictions are failures of the intellect. According to Halverson, modern Islamism in the first half of the twentieth century emerge as a merge between modern nation-state and Athari thought.

⁷¹ Kerr, *ibid*, 155.

ambiguity of their disciples' records about them. Also, as above mentioned, their theological and political views are hardly consistent and clear, their political motives against the colonialism point both nationalist and Islamist-jihadist version of early reformism. Therefore, often it is difficult to distinguish the nationalistic element in Islamist-jihadist approach, and Islamist-jihadist element in nationalistic approach at the very beginning of Salafist movement. Before the transnational jihadist wave, especially before the Afghan jihad, jihadist attitude towards politics was substantially determined by national bonds. Still, the founding fathers' doctrines of this modern Islamic revivalism were usually "vague" and "unsystematic", but their "social and psychological impact was immense."⁷²

2.2.2. Turning points: Abolition of the Caliphate and the colonial rule

The early course dramatically changed after the British and French colonial rule in the Middle East, and especially after the abolition of the caliphate by the republican Turkey in 1924. Both the colonization of the Levant by the United Kingdom and France and the abolition of the caliphate reshaped the course of modern Islamic thought. First, the goal of establishing the caliphate again become the main determinant of the Islamist movements of the 20th century. Second, struggle against the colonial rule of Britain and France and their local proxies gained importance. Third, the political and cultural struggle against the colonial rule and local elites needed an organizational structure and recruitment policy. Fourth, the collapse of the Ottoman Empire and the rising of Arab nation-states forced all of the political groups to link their activities with national and pan-Arab politics of the Middle East and to form a sort of rocky relations with other political forces such as Arab nationalists and socialists. These contradictions affected jihadist movement during the Cold War, especially its relations with the local governments, local communist movements, and the West.

⁷² Malcolm H. Kerr, *ibid*, 15.

For instance, co-founder of Hamas, Gaza-based Sheikh Ahmed Yassin was a well-known Ikhwan leader admitted that Palestinian struggle must be a “phased struggle” and his growing movement’s first enemy was not Israel, but communism.⁷³ The same line prevailed in Afghanistan where for decades, Afghan governments supported Islamist groups’ schools, gave them lands, and fund their organizations to counter leftist groups.⁷⁴ In 1971, when Afghan government gathered and centralized the administration of mosques and shrines, many Islamic clerics supported this practice. Before that time, Afghani mullahs were dependent on local charities or landowners.⁷⁵ Also, the Muslim Brotherhood’s founder Hasan al-Banna was shocked by “the wave of atheism” when he went to Cairo for his education in 1923.⁷⁶ Abolition of the caliphate in Turkey and the transformation of Cairo University as a secular institute in 1925 angered al-Banna. Al-Banna was abhorred by the University’s students and teachers as unfettered nihilists and libertarians.”⁷⁷ He thought that secular people and organizations via their newspapers, magazines, and books were eroding Islam in Egyptian society, and in Egypt, there were two camps colliding each other, namely secular camp and Islamic camp.⁷⁸ Before the foundations of Ikhwan, Young Men’s Muslim Association (YMMA) was created by al-Banna and it “sought to revive Muslim society through the true Islam to be found in the Qur’an.”⁷⁹

⁷³ Dag Tuastad, “Hamas-PLO Relations Before and After the Arab Spring,” *Middle East Policy Council*, September 17, 2013, <http://www.mepec.org/hamas-plo-relations-and-after-arab-spring>.

⁷⁴ David B. Edwards, *Before Taliban: Genealogies of the Afghan Jihad* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2002), 209.

⁷⁵ Ibid, 210-211.

⁷⁶ Ana Belén Soage and Jorge Fuentelsaz Franganillo, “The Muslim Brothers in Egypt,” in *The Muslim Brotherhood: The Organization and Policies of a Global Islamist Movement*, ed. Barry Rubin (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), 39.

⁷⁷ Al-Banna’s words cited by Gudrun Krämer, *Hasan al-Banna* (London: Oneworld Publications, 2013), 41.

⁷⁸ Mohammed Zaid, *The Muslim Brotherhood and Egypt’s Succession Crisis: The Politics of Liberalisation and Reform in the Middle East* (London and New York: I.B.Tauris Publishers), 70.

⁷⁹ Ibid, 71.

During the first years of the Muslim Brotherhood, the organization simultaneously gained ground amongst “lower middle class” and the officers of King Farouk due to its counter ideology against the nationalists.⁸⁰ Despite the fact that the Muslim Brotherhood denounced party politics and branded itself a social movement, Hasan al-Banna run twice for the election (in 1942 and 1945).⁸¹ The Brotherhood appealed for those who deprived of colonial administration and its local collaborators, however, it presented itself a mere “social” power, not a political one, and developed cordial relations with the monarchy.

Afghani and Abduh paved the way for both “liberal” Islamist current, and more traditional or conservative Islamist teachings (by the efforts of Rida as above mentioned) which later were represented by the Muslim Brotherhood (also known as *Ikhwan*) in the 20th century.⁸² Ikhwan was the champion of the “return” to “pure” Islam and tried to oppose Western-inspired Egyptian system through Islamic values.⁸³ Moreover, the Muslim Brotherhood claimed that the achievements of French and Russian revolutions were gained by “the great Islamic revolution 1,300 years before.”⁸⁴

2.2.3. The Brotherhood and birth of a movement

The Muslim Brotherhood’s history, organizational structure, social base, and ideology are very important for the modern jihadist movement. Personal relations are also important for this jihadist genealogy. Starting with Afghani, modern Salafist

⁸⁰ Gilles Kepel, *ibid*, 28 and 31.

⁸¹ Barbara Zollner, *The Muslim Brotherhood: Hasan al-Hudeybi and Ideology* (London and New York: Routledge), 11.

⁸² *Ibid*, 2 and 62-64. Afghani’s was also prosecuted by the Ottoman religious authorities due to his “unorthodoxy.” See, *ibid*, 80.

⁸³ See, Carrie Rosefsky Wickham, *The Muslim Brotherhood: Evolution of an Islamist Movement* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2013), 22-23.

⁸⁴ *Ibid*, 23.

school's famous ideologists had connections with each others. Abduh and Rida affected Hasan al-Banna's and Ikhwan's ideological discourse personally. Ikhwan's ideological discourse reflected its *Salafi* roots inherited from reformist thinkers such as Afghani, Abduh, and Rida. It was a mixture of jihad, anti-imperialism, anti-secularism, and populism. These concepts and policies were used by Hasan al-Banna and the Brotherhood vaguely in general, and this ambivalence met with political pragmatism on the ground of the national politics.

In addition to the direct colonial encounter in Egypt and other Middle Eastern countries, one of the most crucial points in Islamist movement was Zionist establishment in Palestine. Islamists were highly disappointed by the West's protection of Zionists and ignoring Palestinian Arabs' rights. Muslim Brotherhood established a local branch in Gaza in 1946, helped Palestinian Arabs after the partition of Palestine and foundation of the state of Israel, and participated in Arab-Israeli War. It is important to mention that popular Palestinian secular front Palestine Liberation Organization (PLO) had also connections with Ikhwan, and after the establishment of the PLO, its ideology always included some religious elements besides its secular discourse.⁸⁵ Brotherhood sees Palestinian question as an "Islamic question" and therefore can be solved with a policy of (pan-)Islamism. They see the question in a prism of "Islam versus Judaism" and evaluate Zionism as a hammerhead of "the Crusaders" against the Muslim world. Beginning with 1930s, Ikhwan was rallying around Palestinian cause and started to spread its influence to Jordan, Palestine, and Lebanon.⁸⁶ Defeat of Arab armies before Israel, decline of Arab nationalism, economic turmoil of postcolonial Arab states, and Camp David accords will have contributed the rise of Islamism amongst Palestinians.

⁸⁵ Mohammed K. Shadid, "The Muslim Brotherhood Movement in the West Bank and Gaza," *Third World Quarterly* 10, no. 2 (April 1988): 658-682.

⁸⁶ Abd al-Monein Said Aly and Manfred W. Wenner, "Modern Islamic Reform Movements: The Muslim Brotherhood in Contemporary Egypt," *Middle East Journal* 36, no. 3 (Summer 1982): 336-361.

Ikhwan links the early reformist Islamism with late jihadist movements with its ideological assignment of the Muslim world has been declining since the end of the era of the four caliphs. It sees the four caliphs era as “true representative of Islam”, and with the Umayyad Empire, Islamic state turned to a “kingdom”.⁸⁷ When Ikhwan looks back to the history of Islam, especially for Abbasid and Ottoman periods, it finds a “proto-Arab nationalism” or Arab discomfort due to the Empire’s leaning on Persian and Turkish rulers.⁸⁸

Hasan al-Banna’s early affinity with Sufism distinguishes him from future jihadist movements. However, he was careful about early Sufist tendencies which helped to spread Islam to Africa and Asia, and later “corruption” of Sufism. Al-Banna’s insufficient search for balance between Sufism and orthodox Sunni Islam was grasped by the Brotherhood members in favor of the latter. Al-Banna and Ikhwan evaluated Sufism as un-Islamic and a temporal phenomenon.⁸⁹ Al-Banna’s followers objected Sufism also in another manner: They thought that Sufi orders was the source of corruption in rural areas and an obstacle for reform and progress.⁹⁰ Ikhwan’s founder rejected “individual spirituality” and directed Muslims to solve existing social problems via jihad.⁹¹

Ikhwan’s unpolitical face, its charitable organizations and relations with both the Kingdom’s administrations (al-Banna wrote letters to the King and the Prime Minister and acted as a religious mentor for the Kingdom at that time) and deprived people ensured it a great influence during turbulent years of Egypt, i.e. the 1930s and the 1940s. The Muslim Brotherhood provided services to the Egyptian people, thus it could challenge the government and raised the organization’s prestige amongst the

⁸⁷ Richard P. Mitchell, *The Society of the Muslim Brothers* (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993), 209-210.

⁸⁸ Ibid, 210-211.

⁸⁹ Ibid, 215.

⁹⁰ Ibid, 216.

⁹¹ Ibid, 216.

popular strata.⁹² Still, al-Banna and Ikhwan acted within the established political order, despite the fact that they gained strength and became a political movement in the 1930s. Brothers started to participate parliamentary politics, and besides their charity works and focus on enhancing the morals of Egyptian and Muslim people, Ikhwan and al-Banna carefully accepted constitutional nature of new Egyptian state and directed their political activities within this system. During the oppression of Nasserist era, Ikhwan was cracked up by the state, its leaders were either prisoned, executed, or exiled.

However, after the defeat of Arab armies in 1967 Arab-Israeli War, decline of the Arab nationalism, Egypt's economic downswing, and raise of oil rich Gulf Kingdoms changed the Muslim Brotherhood's and general jihadist movement in the Middle East. Anwar Sadat released Ikhwan's leadership from prisons, allowed some exiled leaders (such as notorious Youssef al-Qaradawi) to return Egypt, and transformed Egypt in a more "Islamic" state during his regime. Moreover, another course of jihad had been preached by a young and attractive figure, Sayyid Qutb, fundamentally changed the discourse of the Muslim Brotherhood and the 20th century jihadist thought.

Young Qutb followed the footsteps of the early reformist Islamist and sought for a balance between modern sciences and Islam. His rural experience with both modern schools and Islamic courses shaped his childhood, but he never rejected "modern sciences" in his whole life. For Qutb Islam is perfectly compatible with reason and human nature, therefore there is no ground for any rational or intuitive system instead of Islamic law. Qutb thought that Islam was contaminated by Greek philosophy and intellectual-theological deviation.⁹³ He insisted that Islam represents a holistic system and rejected any "foreign" influences from other human made

⁹² Mohammed Zaid, *The Muslim Brotherhood and Egypt's Succession Crisis: The Politics of Liberalisation and Reform in the Middle East* (London and New York: I.B. Tauris Publishers, 2010): 72.

⁹³ Andrew F. March, "Taking People As They Are: Islam As a "Realistic Utopia" in the Political Theory of Sayyid Qutb," *The American Political Science Review* 104, no. 1 (February 2010): 189-207.

systems, such as democracy or socialism. He defended the “independence” of Islam.⁹⁴

Nevertheless, according to Qutb, the main problem of the world is the detachment from God.⁹⁵ Qutb’s usage of the term *jahiliyyah*, which refers to the age before the Prophet, for nationalistic Egypt and Sufism, reflects his commitment to “purifying” Islam like his predecessors like Abduh and Rida. This is the same line which future jihadist movements and figures eagerly use for “unorthodox” Islamic tendencies, sects, and religious movements.

Nonetheless, the young Qutb was affected by nationalism and became an Egyptian nationalist before he turned to Islamism. As mentioned above several times, nationalist elements merged with Islamism during the 20th century, and Qutb was not safe from this composition. Although he later evaluated nationalist rule in Egypt as *jahiliyyah*, he still operated within the Egyptian context for his political goals. Targeting “near enemy”, i.e. to fight for national power and to struggle with Western educated local rulers was one of the most important pillars of the first wave of jihad in the 20th century.⁹⁶ For sure, when Qutb and his predecessors thought about the Muslim world, they did not think about national boundaries or just the Middle East. However, when they slipped into the power politics of their age, and also due to their political background (early nationalism, Egyptian exceptionalism in the Muslim world, etc.), they always operated within the national context. When the Muslim Brotherhood was disbanded and exiled by Egyptian authorities, Ikhwan leaders in other countries still tried to be involved in Egyptian politics.

⁹⁴ William E. Shepard, “Islam as a ‘System’ in the Later Writings of Sayyid Qutb,” *Middle Eastern Studies* 25, no. 1 (January 1989): 31-50.

⁹⁵ Sayed Khatab, *The Political Thought of Sayyid Qutb: The Theory of Jahiliyyah* (London and New York: Routledge, 2006), 45.

⁹⁶ Fawaz Gerges, “ISIS and the Third Wave of Jihadism,” *Current History* 113, no. 767 (December 2014): 339-343.

Qutb's experience in the USA (1948-1950) strengthened his abhorrence against the values of the West, while he accepted the technological and scientific superiority of the West. He believed that these values were the primary causes of what the USA was then facing. He fascinated with the American material production labeling her as "workshop of the world", however, denounced the American way of life, her values and lack of the spirit. Comparing Nasserist Egypt with the United States, he equated Egypt with the USA in accord with their distance from Islam and branded Nasserist Egypt as *jahiliyyah*.⁹⁷ He, like Abduh and Rida, rejected the separation of church and state, claimed that it is a Western phenomenon and in Islamic societies there is no religious hierarchy and Quran is the main source of justice and legislation. This analysis led Qutb the removal of Nasserist rule, which was a new course of jihad in contradistinction to Hasan al-Banna and Hasan al-Hudaybi's Ikhwan. Some scholars and important figures of Ikhwan (for instance al-Hudaybi who rejected Qutbist militancy) state that Qutb is the main source of jihadist militancy which started in the 1970s.⁹⁸

Qutb's new and uncompromising attitude towards Nasser, Arab nationalism, and Arab socialism overlapped with the debates within the Islamic circles, especially the Muslim Brotherhood.⁹⁹ Qutb both broke with Ikhwan's non-militant methods and Arab nationalism. Purge of Ikhwan during the Nasserist era caused a split within the Islamist ranks, and gave birth to Qutbist militant jihadism. Struggle for overthrowing Nasserist administration and establishment of an Islamic political and social order drove the Qutb-inspired new jihadist course. Qutb divided the world into two, on the one hand, there was a world which was driven by powers of Satan, and on the other

⁹⁷ Mohammed Zaid, *The Muslim Brotherhood and Egypt's Succession Crisis: The Politics of Liberalisation and Reform in the Middle East*, 86-88.

⁹⁸ Barbara Zollner, *The Muslim Brotherhood: Hasan al-Hudaybi and Ideology* (London and New York: Routledge, 2009), 50-64. However, there are some who see a continuity rather than rupture between Hasan al-Banna and Sayyid Qutb. See, Ana Belén Soage, "Hasan al-Banna and Sayyid Qutb: Continuity or Rupture?," *The Muslim World* 99, no. 2 (April 2009): 294-311.

⁹⁹ Ibid, 52; Fawaz A. Gerges, *Making the Arab World: Nasser, Qutb, and the Clash That Shaped the Middle East* (Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2018), 99-106.

hand, there was a world which a vanguard believer community fighting against tyranny and Satan.¹⁰⁰ And with a critical transformation, Qutb (inspired by al-Mawdudi) placed the concept of *takfir*, which means to charge someone for being an infidel, against their fellow Muslim citizens who accepted the Nasserist administration. This is a critical concept for transnational jihadist organizations such as Al Qaeda and ISIL. According to Gerges, after Qutb, violence became not only a tool against the state, but an identity marker of jihadism. Defensive jihad transformed to an offensive jihad. However, it is important to note that pro-Qutb Islamism was a small portion of the Islamist movement at that time.¹⁰¹ Qutb's militant jihadism will found its way after postcolonial Arab states failure and with regression of the Arab nationalism, while raise of the oil rich and conservative Gulf states.

What Qutb understands with jihad is simple: Man has deviated from God's command, i.e. fell into *jahiliyyah*, Western civilization and its agents in the Muslim world are perfect examples of this deviation, and in order to establish an order in accord with the divine Islamic rule, real believers must struggle against *jahiliyyah* via jihad. Islam cannot be reduced to a mere spiritual issue due to its comprehensiveness. Therefore, in Islamic law state and religion cannot be separated, politics and spirituality strongly mingle together. Hence, Islam commands both social order and daily life. But his understanding of jihad contains ambiguity: He calls to target the *jahili institutions*, not people live under *jahiliyyah*. He claims that rule of Islam excludes the coercion for non-Muslims. However, his understanding of jihadist methods or means substantially vague. He, on the one hand calls for a "battle of ideas" via preaching, and on the other hand, implies violence against *jahili*

¹⁰⁰ Yvonne Yazbeck Haddad, "The Qur'anic Justification for an Islamic Revolution: The View of Sayyid Qutb," *Middle East Journal* 37, no. 1 (Winter 1983): 18-19.

¹⁰¹ Ibid, 136. Surely, al-Banna did not rule out armed struggle. However, he directed his Secret Apparatus to British occupation in Egypt and Zionist elements in Palestine. Qutb reversed this approach to "near enemy", i.e. apostate rulers of Egypt. See, *ibid*, 144.

institutions with his vague term of *movement*.¹⁰² These two methods are the main pillars of militant jihadist movements across the world.

2.3. From Qutb to Afghan jihad: Transformation of the Middle East

2.3.1. The Decline of the Arab nationalism

Islamic revivalism of the 1970s coincides with the demise of Arab nationalism in the Middle East. Arab nationalism's retreat is presented by these events: Syria's secession from the United Arab Republic, Egyptian military failure in Yemen's civil war during the 1960s, and the disastrous defeat of 1967 War. Also, before the war, pro-Egyptian state approach of Abdel Nasser created question marks amongst Arab intellectuals. The consequence of 1967 War was not directly the rise of Islamism in the Middle East. Rather, state nationalisms, such as Palestinian nationalism, raised and Arab nationalism descended.¹⁰³ After the War, Nasser's Egypt became more and more dependent economically to oil rich Gulf states, in parallel with this new state, Nasser started to seek for a *détente* with Saudi Arabia, particularly in Yemen. Another turning point was also significant: In 1970, the Royal Army of Jordan clashed with Palestinian guerillas, crushed and expelled them from Jordan. "Black September" was an event that an Arab nation, suggested to be a protector of Palestine, defended its state interest against Palestinians. Moreover, after the Arab-Israeli War of 1973, Egyptian President Anwar Sadat used the opportunity to cut a deal with Israel with the US mediation. The political and economic embarrassing situation of Arab states once had championed Arab nationalism paved the way for Islamic revivalism in the Middle East during the 1970s. 1973 oil crisis and creation

¹⁰² Luke Loboda, "The Thought of Sayyid Qutb," *Ashbrook Statesmanship Thesis 1*, (2004): 19-23. Qutb's ambiguous terms such as *jihad*, *jahiliyyah*, and *takfir* forced then Supreme Guide of the Muslim Brotherhood Hasan al-Hudaybi to denounce his vision of militant jihadism or "*takfirism*." Although al-Hudaybi targeted directly al-Mawdudi in his pamphlet, frankly it was a critique of Sayyid Qutb's ideas. See, John Calvert, *Sayyid Qutb and the Origins of Radical Islamism* (Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2013), 274-275.

¹⁰³ Adee Dawisha, *Arab Nationalism in the Twentieth Century: From Triumph to Despair* (Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2016), 253-254.

of a Gulf-based petro-dollar empire created economically neo-liberal and politically conservative environment in the Middle East.

Anwar Sadat's *infitah* (opening) policy marked a turning point for liberalization of Egypt. Sadat championed for privatization, claimed that the public sector were "inefficient and uncompetitive", cancelled subsidies such as bread, sugar, rice, and tea, restructured the agricultural sector from production for domestic consumption to production for exportation (perfectly coherent with neoliberal orientation), re-aligned Egypt's foreign policy in order to bond ties with the West and cut ties with the USSR, for attracting Gulf investments and IMF-World Bank loans he made legal amendments which had been restricting free flow of capital, and loosened the pressure against the Muslim Brotherhood in particular and Islamism in general.¹⁰⁴

2.3.2. Double crisis: Global and regional

Transformation of the Middle East during the 1970s intertwined with the broader crisis of global capitalism. Capitalist economies struggled to sustain their economic performance which marked the so-called "Golden Age" of post-War capitalism. The neoliberal policies started to implement which meant internationalization, financialization and demise of the Bretton Woods system. According to Hanieh, financialization of capitalism leant on the integration of Gulf economies to global economic system. Moreover, in 1974, the USA and the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia signed a secret agreement which secures the US economy with regard to Saudi petrodollars in exchange for the US support for Saudi security and military. This move ensured dominance of US dollar in the world trade, and also more or less prevented the use of oil prices for political purposes.¹⁰⁵ Saudi Arabia and the Gulf

¹⁰⁴ See William L. Cleveland and Martin Bunton, *A History of the Modern Middle East* (Boulder: Westview Press, 2009), 377-378; Adam Hanieh, *Lineages of Revolt: Issues of Contemporary Capitalism in the Middle East* (Chicago: Haymarket Books, 2013), 85-90.

¹⁰⁵ Adam Hanieh, *Capitalism and Class in the Gulf Arab States* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), 40-45. To understand financialization during neoliberal age, see, Alfredo Saad-Filho, "Crisis in Neoliberalism or Crisis of Neoliberalism?," *Socialist Register* 47, (2011): 242-259.

states, with the oil price boom and their integration to global financial system, increased their strength against Arab nationalism and socialism, and year by year they attracted more Arab migrant to the Gulf countries. The more Gulf states determined the economic architecture of the Middle East, the more conservative Islamic current became prominent against secular nationalism and socialism.

Therefore, state-oriented economy policies and anti-colonial foreign policies of the postcolonial Arab nations gave their places to neoliberal economy policies and Western-oriented foreign policies by degrees (until the dissolution of the USSR, Syria was an exception). Decreasing public sector proportionally in national economies, privatization, and cutting subsidies created strife between popular strata and state. There were lots of revolts against liberal economy policies especially in Egypt, and charity works and NGOs tried to fill the vacuum. Mona Atia claims that rise of Islamic charity organizations and forced neoliberalism do not contradict each other. This “Faith-Based Organizations” within the neoliberal state became the prominent providers of social services.¹⁰⁶ This pious neoliberalism dependent on the bourgeoisie who got rich through the privatizations. Following the line of the Gulf foundations, this new organizations were coherent with the neoliberal trend.¹⁰⁷ This charity network proved its efficiency during the Afghan jihad against the USSR, through Gulf charities which funded by wealthy Gulf businessmen.¹⁰⁸

In parallel with above mentioned transformation, Qutb’s radical Islamic revivalism envisioned a salvation for not only Muslim people who lived in a state of *jahiliyyah*,

¹⁰⁶ Mona Atia, ““A Way to Paradise”: Pious Neoliberalism, Islam, and Faith-Based Development,” *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 102, no. 4 (2012): 808-827.

¹⁰⁷ Mona Atia, *Building a House in Heaven: Pious Neoliberalism and Islamic Charity in Egypt* (Minneapolis and London: University of Minnesota Press, 2013), 77-105.

¹⁰⁸ Evan F. Kohlmann, “The Role of Islamic Charities in International Terrorist Recruitment and Financing,” *DIIS Working Paper*, no. 7 (2006): 1. A study about the transnational Muslim NGOs finds that most of these kind of NGOs are founded in the Gulf states, the UK, and the US. See, Marie Juul Petersen, “Trajectories of transnational Muslim NGOs,” *Development in Practice* 22, no. 5-6 (August, 2012): 763-778. For an assessment about the importance of charities in Al Qaeda’s financial network, see, Mark Basile, “Going to the Source: Why Al Qaeda’s Financial Network is Likely to Withstand the Current War on Terrorist Financing,” *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism* 27, no. 3 (2004): 169-185.

but also the entire world, whether it was “capitalist” or “communist.” Although Qutb encountered with the capitalist world, especially the United States by his lifetime, he saw the main problem of the whole world as “materialism”, not in the sense that a Marxist critique of capitalism, but in the sense that someone chasing only his/her own material desires and leaving spiritual necessities aside. Therefore, Qutb equated both capitalist world and communist world for their “materialist” attitude towards mankind, and also for their approach to the partition of Palestine. As mentioned above, he sought to put forward Islam as a system independent of capitalism or socialism.

Qutb’s ideas combined with neoliberal burden popular strata, demise of Arab nationalism, and the Cold War politics. The unease of especially middle-class and educated young opened the road for lots of organizations which followed Qutb’s jihadist attitude. The most famous of these organizations was The Jihad Group (*al-Jamaat al-Jihad*). Al-Jamaat’s most important action was the assassination of Anwar Sadat. Its notorious member was an electric engineer, Abd al-Salam Faraj. Faraj followed Qutb’s fight call against *jahiliyyah* and started his struggle with infidels who were ruling in the Muslim lands. Faraj thought that Muslims forgot their duty, i.e. jihad, against apostate rulers in their country. The consequence he drew was crucial in militant jihadist thought: Muslims in Egypt, had to fight against Sadat, i.e. the “Near Enemy”, instead of fight against the US and Israel, i.e. the “Far Enemy.”¹⁰⁹ Al-Jamaat’s “Near Enemy” strategy shared by its then member, a prominent jihadist, later Al Qaeda leader, a pediatrician Ayman al-Zawahiri. According to al-Zawahiri’s account, 1967 defeat was the most crucial moment for Nasser’s young admirers returning their “original identity”, Islamism.¹¹⁰ During 1970s, young al-Zawahiri’s opinions about militant jihad were enhanced by a Palestinian figure, Abdallah Azzam who studied at Al-Azhar. Azzam was the point man of recruiting Arab jihadist for

¹⁰⁹ John Calvert, *ibid*, 280-284; Andrew McGregor, “‘Jihad and the Rifle Alone’: Abdullah Azzam and the Islamist Revolution,” *The Journal of Conflict Studies* 23, no. 2 (Fall 2003): 97.

¹¹⁰ Jeffry R. Halverson, *ibid*, 79. Zawahiri also pays respect to Qutb. He underlines the importance of the execution of Qutb in his radicalization. See, John Calvert, *ibid*, 264-265.

Afghan jihad.¹¹¹ Azzam's role will be mentioned shortly, however, it is remarkable to underline that even al-Zawahiri went to Peshawar, Pakistan, during the 1980s, he was still focusing on gaining experience to wage jihad *inside* Egypt.¹¹²

2.3.3. The godfather of 'Arab-Afghans' and the Afghan jihad

Qutb, Faraj, and Ibn Taymiyyah were the main inspiration for Abdallah Azzam in his jihadist course. He was born in the West Bank, and witnessed his village was destroyed by Israeli forces in 1967. He went to Jordan after Damascus, in order to join Palestinian resistance. However, he found that Palestinian resistance was "too secular", he could not promote Islamism in the ranks of the PLO, and even in one occasion, a Fatah fighter told him that "there is no religion behind the organization."¹¹³ After completing his Ph.D. in al-Azhar, he conceptualized the international jihad.¹¹⁴ Azzam was the main man who recruiting the Arab fighters ("Afghan Arabs") to wage jihad against the USSR and Soviet-friendly Afghan government.

There is important to note that militant jihadism was boosted by Iranian Revolution of 1979, too; however, Afghan jihad had been waging *before* the Iranian Revolution, the leader of the Revolution was a Shiite, and the United States started to arm *mujahideen* in Afghanistan even before the invasion of the Red Army.¹¹⁵ After the Afghanistan's April Revolution in 1978, and Iranian Revolution in 1979, the US

¹¹¹ Nimrod Raphaeli, "Ayman Muhammad Rabi' Al-Zawahiri: The making of an Arch-Terrorist," *Terrorism and Political Violence* 14, no. 4 (Winter 2002): 5.

¹¹² Youssef H. Aboul-Enein, "Ayman al-Zawahiri: The Ideologue of Modern Islamic Militancy," *Future Warfare Series*, no. 21 (March 2004): 7.

¹¹³ Muhammad Haniff Hassan, *The Father of Jihad: Abd Allah Azzam's Jihad Ideas and Its Implications for National Security* (London: Imperial College Press, 2014), 19.

¹¹⁴ Ibid, 98.

¹¹⁵ During an interview in 1998, the then US National Security Advisor Zbigniew Brzezinski admits that the USA started to arm mujahideen before the Soviet invasion. See, Alexander Cockburn and Jeffrey St. Clair, "How Jimmy Carter and I Started the Mujahideen?," *Counter Punch*, January 15, 1998, <https://www.counterpunch.org/1998/01/15/how-jimmy-carter-and-i-started-the-mujahideen/>.

Government started an initiative for Soviet Asia, especially Afghanistan. The US' policy towards Afghanistan consisted of countering the USSR both militarily and politically (with sanctions), and also regrouping the US allies across the region for a joint action. This initiative called "Operation Cyclone" and included to arm *mujahideen* in Afghanistan.¹¹⁶

In Afghanistan, Islamic parties seek to establish an Islamic state or try to counter secular-Marxist parties has always been a reality. One of the best-known Islamic group was *Hizb-i Islami* (The Party of Islam) had been leaded by Gulbiddin Hekmetyar. Hizb-i Islami had operated since the 1960s and had been fighting against Marxist groups and Soviet-friendly Afghan government. Tribal and ethnic differences largely determine the Afghan national politics. In addition to this, Pakistan's perpetual intervention to Afghan politics and social fabric creates lots of problems. Although some Islamic groups inherited Sufi traditions of Afghanistan, Pakistani *madrasas*, Hizb-i Islami and Arab *mujahideen* clothed this heritage and transformed it into a *takfiri* approach.

For Afghan Islamism, the similar path was chosen: Like Egypt, Afghan Islamists in 1950s and 1960s clashed with leftist opposition (especially in Kabul), they thought that religious establishment was inefficient, they could not recognize the threat of left. Therefore, some young Islamists with tribal (or rural) background thought about establishing a political movement at the Kabul University. The Islamic protests against the Marxists were initially supported by the Afghan government in the late 60s and the early 70s.¹¹⁷ The Afghan Islamists saw the USSR and communist movements as their main adversaries.

¹¹⁶ Robert D. Billard, Jr., "Operation Cyclone: How the United States Defeated the Soviet Union," *Undergraduate Research Journal* 3, no. 2 (October 2010): 25-41. For assessment of then US President Jimmy Carter and the US Government, see, David N. Gibbs, "Reassessing Soviet Motives for Invading Afghanistan: A Declassified History," *Critical Asian Studies* 38, no. 2 (2006): 239-263.

¹¹⁷ David B. Edwards, *ibid*, 203-208.

In 1978, after the communist and pro-Soviet People's Democratic Party of Afghanistan (PDPA) captured the power, it found itself in a kind of isolated position: PDPA had factional division inside; the Party was an urban party, and it almost had no power bases amongst rural population; opposition to new regime, especially Islamists, had connection with regional powers, they found a safe haven in Pakistan. The rapid land reform program of PDPA created a strife amongst rural population, and the new government could not mobilize rural poor strata against Islamists and the landowner class.¹¹⁸ Local tribes and *mujahideen*-lead guerillas started to wage attacks against central government.

Therefore, already regionalized (via Pakistan and Saudi Arabia) jihad against the leftists in Afghanistan mingled with the US quest for breaking apart the 1970s détente with the Soviet Union (especially in the "Third World"), and Arab jihadists crushed by their own countries and felt that their Arab states were just waste who sought for an experience.¹¹⁹ According to one account, the early so-called "Arab-Afghan" jihadists did not significantly consist of Egypt or Syria. Those jihadist at that time still were trying to find a way to topple their own countries' regime, and after the failure of this struggle, they started to travel to Afghanistan, especially between 1986-1992.¹²⁰

Abdullah Azzam was a member of Ikhwan and travelled to Saudi Arabia in 1980. This is important due to both Qutbian *takfirism* and growing Saudi/Wahhabi influence merged together when lots of Ikhwan members had travelled to Saudi Arabia during the oppression by Egyptian authorities. He, with the other Brotherhood members, started to develop a hybrid model of Qutbist jihadism and Saudi

¹¹⁸ Fred Halliday, "War and Revolution in Afghanistan," *New Left Review* 1, No. 119 (January/February 1980): 20-41; David N. Gibbs, *ibid*, 245.

¹¹⁹ Mustafa Hamid and Leah Farrall, *The Arabs at War in Afghanistan* (London: Hurst&Company, 2015), 22-23. The defeat of 1967 and the Siege of Beirut (1982) by Israel were mentioned that directed the Arab youth to militant jihadism.

¹²⁰ *Ibid*, 23.

Wahhabism.¹²¹ Another important point is those who lost armed insurgency against Hafez al-Assad government in Syria also travelled to Afghanistan and joined the jihad against the USSR. Moreover, although jihadists at least were skeptical about the Western capitalism, their socio-economic background fitted with capitalism rather than socialism.¹²² This was where the bridge between “Near Enemy” tactics and transnational jihad built.

The US and the Gulf (particularly Saudi Arabia) support for the Afghan jihad was significant. Saudis financed Azzam’s jihadist recruitment center, “Services Bureau” (MAK), and a young and wealthy Saudi businessman, Osama bin Laden was the middle man for Saudis and Azzam, also he was funding the Afghan jihad.¹²³ Azzam and bin Laden established a camp near Pakistan border in Afghanistan, and Azzam travelled to the Western countries, in particular to the USA and Federal Germany, to draw attention to the anti-Soviet jihad. According to an estimation, Azzam’s MAK collected 200 million dollars donation from the Middle East and the West for Afghan jihad.¹²⁴

Although local Afghan mujahideen and foreign Arab Afghan militants allied with their common cause, i.e. expelling the USSR from a Muslim land, their political and religious attitudes differed from each other and this situation created lots of clashes inside the Afghan jihad. Most foreign fighters who came to help for their Muslim brethren were Salafi-Wahhabi background whereas local Afghan *mujahideen* and tribal fighters had a nuanced religious heterodoxy. For instance, an Arab Afghan militant became “famous” for his chopping “atheist” Afghan prisoners into pieces

¹²¹ John C. M. Calvert, “The Striving Shaykh Abdullah Azzam and the Revival of Jihad,” 88.

¹²² Fawaz Gerges, *Far Enemy: Why Jihad Went Global?* (Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005), 71-72.

¹²³ Ibid. 75-76.

¹²⁴ Rohan Gunaratna, *Inside Al Qaeda: Global Network of Terror* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2002), 18-19.

and these events created some unrest amongst Afghan militant.¹²⁵ This tension will become an important aspect of the polemics between the defenders of the “Near Enemy” tactics and the defenders of the “Far Enemy” tactics while a division occurred in the jihadist ranks.

2.4. Jihadist double turn: Targeting far enemy, targeting near enemy

2.4.1. Post-Soviet confusion: Jihadists split up

Although local Afghan *mujahideen* outnumbered Arab Afghans, foreign jihadists used their experience in Afghanistan to strengthen their transnational Islamist networks, to recruit new -young- volunteers for jihadist cause, to enhance the radicalization process. However, when the Red Army retreated from Afghanistan in 1989 and the USSR dissolved in 1991, tension between the rival Islamist factions in Afghanistan occurred.

The bridge between jihad on national scale and jihad on international scale was built by Abdullah Azzam. Still, Azzam advised his fellow jihadist from the Middle East to regroup and gain experience with Afghan jihad in order to fight against their own “*kafir*” regimes, before he was assassinated in 1989. Azzam convinced a Syrian fighter, Abu Musab al-Suri to give up his ambition to wage jihad against Hafez al-Assad government. Al-Suri grasped the “global nature of jihad” during his Afghanistan days.¹²⁶

However, Afghan rivalry became apparent in 1990s. Taliban’s rise, conquest of Kabul in 1996 and cutting of foreign aids by the USA due to the collapse of the

¹²⁵ Fawaz Gerges, *ibid*, 82-83; Gilles Kepel, *ibid*, 147-148.

¹²⁶ Brynjar Lia, *ibid*, 73-75. However, there are some objections against this relationship. According to Ryan, Azzam and al-Suri disagree with the target of jihad. Ryan claims that Azzam rejected to wage against local Muslim rulers whereas al-Suri advocated it. See, Michael W. S. Ryan, *Decoding Al-Qaeda’s Strategy: The Deep Battle Against America* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2013), 52-53.

Soviet Union created a vacuum in both Afghan politics and transnational jihad cause. In Peshawar in the early 1990s, there were rival factions such as traditional Ikhwan defenders, hardline jihadists, and so on. For some scholars, Al Qaeda's elevation was closely interdependent with the decline of Afghan jihad, and an indicator of division amongst the jihadist ranks: it was a sign of *weakness*, not of *strength*.¹²⁷ Although Arab Afghan militant achieved their goals of defeating the Red Army in Afghanistan, they failed to topple down their own infidel regimes.

Moreover, the First Gulf War and Saudi approval to station US troops in Arabian Peninsula created an irreversible division amongst Arab Afghans. According to Abu Musab al-Suri's own account, Saudi clerics and the Muslim Brotherhood issued fatwas that approved Saudi decision to invite American soldiers to the Arabian Peninsula against Iraq's invasion of Kuwait. A minority of Afghan Arabs, such as al-Suri, al-Zawahiri, and bin Laden rejected the first tendency and created a base for more rigorous jihad.¹²⁸

2.4.2. Rise of Al Qaeda and the occupation of Iraq

Osama bin Laden and Al Qaeda sought to liberate the Muslim holy places from "Judeo-Christian alliance" of the West and Israel. This was the main goal that was declared by Al Qaeda and bin Laden's fatwas against American civilian and military elements. This was a "defensive jihad" call in a sense, and also aimed at the Kingdom of Saudi Arabia. Bin Laden, after the deployment of American troops in Saudi Arabia, was one of the most ardent opponents of the Kingdom. One can find the same line that had followed by the first Salafi thinkers who mixed the nationalism and Islamism.

¹²⁷ Fawaz Gerges, *The Rise and Fall of Al-Qaeda* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2011), 69-84.

¹²⁸ Brynjar Lia, *ibid*, 96.

Al Qaeda's later activities are well-known. Its most spectacular act was attack against the USA on September 9th, 2001. The transnational jihad networks of Afghan jihad twisted global jihad's arm. After 9/11, the US Government invaded Afghanistan (2001) and Iraq (2003) directly. Iraq and (after 1979) Iran's containment was an official US foreign policy towards the Persian Gulf ("dual containment" policy). Invasion of Iraq was a part of the redesigning the Middle East, after the dissolution of the USSR; against the "oil-politics" of Saddam Hussein. However, it caused a fierce resistance by both nationalists and jihadist in Iraq. Iraq became a showdown for global jihad network to wage against jihad against the "Far Enemy" in a Muslim country. Between 2003 and 2006, Iraqi resistance against the US and allied forces was staggering.

However, national, regional, international changes in the political scene were overlapped again. In national level, the US tried to establish a Lebanon-style confessionalist system, but in fact Sunni opposition rejected to participate in Iraqi elections. At the same time, jihadist militancy shifted its focus from the far enemy to near enemy, i.e. Shiites, with the contributions of infamous Jordanian jihadist Abu Musab al-Zarqawi. In regional level, the war between Israel and Lebanese national resistance, in particular Hezbollah, was over with the clear defeat of the former. Its resistance gave a vast popularity to Hezbollah amongst both Lebanon and the Middle East. In international level, the US occupation of Iraq destroyed one of the bitter enemies of Iran in the region. Around 2006, the US foreign policy occupied with the "Iranian threat."

Therefore, after 2006, Iraq and Lebanon witnessed a growing Sunni sectarian insurgency against Shiites (although Zarqawi tried to stir hate against Shiites right after the occupation, in 2003). Especially in Lebanon, Saudi Arabia and the Bush Administration co-operate against Hezbollah and Iran via some Sunni jihadist groups.¹²⁹ In Iraq, Al Qaeda in Iraq became "Islamic State of Iraq" in 2006, which

¹²⁹ See, Seymour Hersh, "Redirection," *The New Yorker*, March 5, 2007, <https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2007/03/05/the-redirection>.

declared a caliphate, an Islamic state inside Iraq. This was hardly accepted by Al Qaeda center, especially by Ayman al-Zawahiri who had been sought for a guerilla war against the occupation. The main man for this move was Abu Musab al-Zarqawi, a Jordanian jihadist. He was not known for his theological depth, similar like lately ISIL leaders, unlike core Al Qaeda leaders.¹³⁰

Al-Zarqawi continued to call for attacking “near enemy”. Al-Zarqawi tried to achieve with killing Iraqi Shias indiscriminately to provoke them to retaliate against Sunnis and to create a consciousness amongst Sunnis against Shias.¹³¹ This is the same line ISIL followed in Iraq and Syria. The Syrian jihad legitimized by Al Qaeda leaders as a holy war against “Nusayri-Alawite regime of Bashar al-Assad.” In this way, modern jihad was returning to its basic, i.e. a struggle aims to topple down infidel regimes in the Muslim lands.

2.5. Conclusion

Modern jihadist movement developed by encountering Western thought, colonialism, nationalist/pan-Arab challenge, and the Cold War context vis-a-vis communism. The founding fathers of Salafism paved the way for militant jihadist with their hatred against religious establishment and their aspiration for returning “pure” Islamic historical epoch. Initial Salafist movements, especially the Muslim Brotherhood, adopted a pragmatist political approach and appealed both Egyptian monarchy and socially deprived sectors, such as lower middle classes, and in Syria, Sunni urban mercantile class. Despite their strict anti-Western tone, during the Cold War, Salafist/jihadist movements strongly opposed the USSR and communism, in

¹³⁰ Fawaz Gerges, *ISIS: A History* (Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2016), 57. It is also important to note al-Zarqawi’s relations with Afghanistan jihadists. For example, after the invasion of Afghanistan by the USA, Gulbuddin Hekmetyar facilitated the escape of al-Zarqawi to Iran. Ibid, 63.

¹³¹ Gary Gambill, “Abu Musab al-Zarqawi: A Biographical Sketch,” *Terrorism Monitor* December 16, 2004, <https://jamestown.org/program/abu-musab-al-zarqawi-a-biographical-sketch-2/>.

Afghanistan the tacit alliance between the Islamic forces and the USA against the Red Army and communist-affiliated Afghan government was an important turning point. The decline of Arab nationalism and the neoliberal epoch of the capitalist world economy created an opportunity for transnational jihadist movement. The rise of Al Qaeda changed the course of jihad: the call for an “Islamic world revolution” and targeting the far enemy, i.e. the USA was a crucial turning point. In Syria, the ISIL changed the course again, and the enemy of the jihadist cause again became near enemy, i.e. Alawites, Shias, etc. For Palestinian identity, the PLO’s expulsion from Lebanon and its eagerness to recognize Israel, the rise of Gulf monarchies and flow of money boosted jihadist groups inside Palestinian refugee camps in Lebanon. Poverty, lack of governance, sectarianism, and deprived from Lebanese social fabric undermined the Palestinian national identity and strengthened jihadism in Palestinian community.

CHAPTER 3

RATIONALE OF THE SYRIAN JIHAD

Has it been decreed that each time a ruler in America
wants to win the presidency that he should kill us..

We al-Arab?

Nizar Qabbani, *The Face of Qana*

3.1. Introduction

The Syrian War is one of the most significant historical turning points in global jihad movement, along with *mujahideen* against the USSR (1979), and the US occupation of Iraq (2003). Al Nusra (an offshoot of Al Qaeda), ISIL (Islamic State of Iraq and Levant), and the other jihadist organizations made significant gains in Syria and gave momentum to Syrian bloodshed. Although Syrian jihad has its own national components, especially due to the Muslim Brotherhood's insurgency in 1980s, the regional and the international dimensions of the Syrian crisis made Syrian jihad a new "wave" of global jihadist current.¹³² Successive Baath governments and economic change both in the 20th century and in Bashar al-Assad era created a new class structure in Syria and this new class formation constitutes the economic background for the crisis of 2011. In this chapter, the Syrian jihad will be traced back in the 20th century of Syria and Syria's economic evolution will be highlighted.

¹³² Fawaz Gerges, "ISIS and the Third Wave of Jihadism."

3.2. The Syrian Ikhwan and its social roots

Islamism and the reaction of the state against it generally express themselves as violent. Baathist governments' radical policy (both economically and socially) created a reaction in urban centers, particularly in Aleppo and Hama, amongst Sunni population and it was represented by the Muslim Brotherhood. The Syrian Brotherhood, like its main Egyptian branch, was founded by declining urban -Sunni- middle class people and children of *ulama*. Hanna Batatu shows the leadership of Syrian Ikhwan's socio-economic background from its foundation to the 1980s. The social base of Ikhwan was self-sufficient craftsmen, small traders, descendants of *ulama*, and educated youth. Two of their main ideological affiliation were religiosity and "free enterprise." Therefore, nationalization of some trade branches in Baathist era created a strife between state bureaucracy and urban merchants. Also, rural and urban co-operatives negatively affected tradesmen class in urban and rural centers. However, The Muslim Brotherhood did not have a basement in countryside, it largely stayed for an urban force, contrary to Baath Party.

Urban middle-class and educated youth/professionals pursued an anti-Alawite religious discourse and started violent attacks against the government and army officers/cadets with Alawite background between 1978-1982.¹³³ An off-shot of Ikhwan, "The Fighting Vanguard" was the main organization that carried out assassinations, sabotages, bombings, etc.¹³⁴ The same Vanguard members later travelled to Afghanistan. The Vanguard believed that after the suppression of Hama uprising by the Syrian Army, it was impossible to continue the jihadist cause in Syria. Hence, some fighters joined "Arab Afghans" in Pakistan and became a fighter against the Red Army, although relatively small numbers. However, one of the most

¹³³ Hanna Batatu, "The Syrian Muslim Brethren," in *State and Ideology in the Middle East and Pakistan*, ed. Fred Halliday and Hamza Alavi (London: Macmillan, 1988), 112-133.

¹³⁴ Dara Conduit, "The Syrian Muslim Brotherhood and the Spectacle of Hama," *The Middle East Journal* 70, no. 2 (Spring 2016): 211-226.

prominent Syrian jihadists who joined the “Arab Afghans” was Abu Musab al-Suri, which later became a famous Al Qaeda ideologist.¹³⁵

3.3. Different Baaths

3.3.1. From radicalism to “corrective movement” of Hafez al-Assad

Under successive Baath coups and governments, both party and the state changed rapidly. Hanna Batatu underlines that Baathism in Syrian history does not consist of unified elements, and at least “three Baathism” can be examined. The first Baathism is more or less driven by “ideals”, there were self-sacrificing educated youth who were going to villages and merged with Arab unity. According to Batatu, the founding fathers of Baath Party comes from a merchant class background, and for this class, dismembering the Arab land was disastrous. This issue is significant due to the later rise of rural elements in Baath. The first Baath almost completely consisted of urban figures. Moreover, although in the first phase of Baath Party the members were coming from village-people or their sons, old Baathist figures nearly did not see any importance within peasantry and did not blame big landowners for the country’s misery, on the contrary to the 1960s Baathists.¹³⁶ Baath Party of the 1960s can be seen as a “transition” towards a more rural party, state, and bureaucracy.¹³⁷

Hafez al-Assad did not pursue the radical Baathist course against old social order and its carriers. According to one account, late 1960s Hafez al-Assad expressed a change of course in Baath Party which underlined compromises with both domestic and regional affairs. It meant for Assad to tone down urban-rural conflict and a

¹³⁵ Raphaël Lefèvre, *Ashes of Hama: The Muslim Brotherhood in Syria* (Oxford and London: Oxford University Press, 2013), 141-144; Brynjar Lia, *ibid*, 72.

¹³⁶ Hanna Batatu, *Syria’s Peasantry, the Descendants of Its Lesser Rural Notables, and Their Politics* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1999), 133-144.

¹³⁷ Hanna Batatu, *ibid*, 144-176.

reconciliation with urban middle classes.¹³⁸ After the defeat of the radical wing of Baath, leaded by Salah Jadid, he established a support base amongst wealthy urban Sunni population particularly in Damascus, tried to conceal his Alawite background and held on to religious representations of Sunni Islam, while was connecting with Sunni ulama. Although after 1980, being a member of the Muslim Brotherhood was a crime which be punished with capital punishment, during the 1990s, Hafez al-Assad made an “Islamist” turn in his political course, in parallel with economic liberalization of Syrian economy. Moreover, the dissolution of the USSR meant that Syria lost its main supporter against Israel and the USA militarily. The domination of Washington with respect to the “Middle East peace process” and the new world order which gave Israel first place in the Middle East, forced al-Assad to adopt a nuanced approach to old Islamist rivals. In their turn, some Islamists found an ally in Damascus who was an obstacle to the US plan of hegemony in the Middle East. They ceased hostilities against Hafez al-Assad government, and due to Egypt and Jordan’s co-operative gestures towards Israel and the USA, a wave of Islamist figures started to see Syria as a front against the West. In addition to this, contrary to growing ties between Turkey and Israel, and growing enmity between Syria and Turkey due to the PKK issue, the Syrian government officials adopted an Islamic tone against Turkey. After this change of course, some prominent Syrian Muslim Brotherhood figures returned to Syria from exile, and in return for refraining political activities, they were free to continue their religious activities.¹³⁹ Number of the religious schools increased, books of Sayyid Qutb were printed, and an openness to everyday religious practices were occurred. However, relations between the Syrian government and the Muslim Brotherhood continued to be tense due to al-Assad’s

¹³⁸ Ibid, 172-173. When Assad crushed Jadid and his supporters, urban merchants and their allies flooded to the streets and chanted for Assad. See, *ibid*, 175. However, Hafez al-Assad did not forget his ancestral and political roots: When Lebanese Sunni leaders asked for help against the migration of “Shia peasants”, Assad snubbed them and reminded that he was a peasant and fought against the urban nobles. See Patrick Seale, *Asad: The Struggle for the Middle East* (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1995), 356.

¹³⁹ Eyal Zisser, “Hafiz al-Asad Discovers Islam,” *Middle East Quarterly* 6, no. 1 (March 1999): 49-56.

conditions for return of Ikhwan members could not easily accepted by the organization.¹⁴⁰

To sum up, Hafez al-Assad's "corrective movement" in Baath and the state retreated the original Baath's assertions about Islam and its domination in Syrian or Arab society. The founding fathers of Baath Party tried to put Arab nationalism is a kind of "new religion" instead of Islam. On the contrary, Hafez al-Assad, during both in 1970s and 1990s, rehabilitated Islam's role in Syrian society and used Islam for legitimizing his three decades rule with co-optation.¹⁴¹ He gave room to *ulama* in state apparatus, raised the pay of men of religion (i.e. *imams*, *khatibs*, *muftis*, etc.), helped the construction of new mosques, and tried to prove that the Alawite sect is a legitimate branch of Shiite Islam.¹⁴²

3.3.2. Cautious Islamization of the country under Bashar al-Assad

Bashar al-Assad continued his father's line against Ikhwan, at the same time he made more room for Islam in daily life of ordinary Syrians and political establishment. He annulled a decree that prohibits wearing headscarf in schools, the number of "Islamic charity" organizations increased, religious education become widespread. Assad allowed these activities his approach towards *ulama* or religious authorities.¹⁴³ Even in Western media, there were reports about "Islamic revival" in Syria. According to one report, in 2006, 80 *madrasas* in Damascus were serving more than 75,000

¹⁴⁰ Eyal Zisser, "Syria, Ba'th Regime and the Islamic Movement: Stepping on a New Path?," *The Muslim World* 95, (January 2005): 43-65.

¹⁴¹ Eyal Zisser, *Commanding Syria: Bashar al-Assad and the First Years in Power* (London and New York: I.B. Tauris, 2007), 58.

¹⁴² Hanna Batatu, *ibid*, 360-361.

¹⁴³ Thomas Pierret, "The Syrian Baath Party and Sunni Islam: Conflicts and Connivance," *Crown Center for Middle East Studies*, No. 77 (February 2014): 4.

women and girls.¹⁴⁴ In 2003, the government allowed religious practices in the army.¹⁴⁵ Nevertheless, the new government of Bashar al-Assad was suspicious of growing “Islamic revival” and tried to avert any Islamic challenge against it. Massive urbanization (rural population was a traditional support base for Baath), the poverty that was created by liberal economy policies, and general Islamist atmosphere of the Arab states inspired a return for religion in Syria. In spite of the government’s success against the Muslim Brotherhood uprising in the 1980s, the Islamization of the society took a decisive turn in Syria like other Arab countries. However, Bashar al-Assad’s first “openness” policy and expectation for political liberalism gave its place to disappointment. The premature “Damascus Spring” was cracked by the government, and after the US occupation of Iraq, Bashar al-Assad government was being a target for the Bush Administration. Putting Syria in the so-called “Axis of Evil”, with the assassination of the Prime Minister of Lebanon Rafiq Hariri in 2005 and subsequent withdrawal of the Syrian army from Lebanon once again isolated Syria internationally.

3.4. Sectarian discourse of the Islamist movements

3.4.1. Historical roots of sectarianism

The denouncement of the successive Baath governments by Islamist groups, such as above-mentioned Syrian Muslim Brotherhood, was regular in the 1970s. For example, a group called *Mujahidin* claimed assassinations of Alawites, and branded the Syrian government, as usual, as “sectarian.”¹⁴⁶ The group stated that Alawites are “enemies” and un-Islamic, and pictured their struggle as a fight between “[Sunni]

¹⁴⁴ Katherine Zoepf, “Islamic Revival Led by Women Tests Syria’s Secularism,” *The New York Times*, August 29, 2006, <https://www.nytimes.com/2006/08/30/learning/featuredarticle/20060830wednesday.html>.

¹⁴⁵ Eyal Zisser, “Syria, Ba’th Regime and the Islamic Movement: Stepping on a New Path?,” 61.

¹⁴⁶ Nikolaos van Dam, *The Struggle for Power in Syria: Politics and Society under Asad and the Ba’th Party* (London and New York: I.B. Tauris, 2011), 90.

Muslim majority” and “infidel Nusayri minority.”¹⁴⁷ An Ikhwan-affiliated cleric tried to justify the Islamic rebellion against Hafez al-Assad with both un-Islamic “Nusayris” and minority rule over the majority.¹⁴⁸ The militant Islamist activities in Syria against Baath administration aimed to achieve an all-around civil war between Sunni and Alawite population. This sectarian confrontation followed the similar path of Lebanese Civil War, tried to ignite a “Sunni” mutiny in the army against “Alawite” officers.¹⁴⁹ The similar discourse was put by both al-Zarqawi in Iraq after the US occupation against Shiites and jihadist opponents of al-Assad in Syria after 2011 against Alawites and sometimes Christians.

Hence, the Syrian jihad and its discourse against Baath and Alawites was prepared before the Syrian War. Al Qaeda network started to focus on Syria (and Levant, Greater Syria) as a new insurgency geography in 2008-2009. However, the first signal rocket was launched by famous Syrian jihadist Abu Musab al-Suri right after the death of Hafez al-Assad.¹⁵⁰ Al-Suri depicts the situation in Greater Syria for Sunnis as a matter of life and death, and labels the Syrian government (he calls it “Alawite Nusayris”) a threat like “the Jews and the Crusaders.”¹⁵¹ He cites derogatory words and fatwas from 13th century Islamic scholar, Ibn Taymiyyah against Alawites and addresses the youth of the Greater Syria to participate jihad against the Syrian government. He follows the footsteps of infamous Jordanian jihadist Abu Musab al-Zarqawi, who took Ibn Taymiyyah’s fatwas against Alawites a step further and urged the jihadist movement to target *all* Shias, not only its *elites*.¹⁵²

¹⁴⁷ Ibid, 91.

¹⁴⁸ Ibid, 94.

¹⁴⁹ Ibid, 98.

¹⁵⁰ Nibras, Kazimi, *Syria Through Jihadist Eyes: A Perfect Enemy* (California: Hoover Press, 2010), 32.

¹⁵¹ Ibid, 33.

¹⁵² Ibid, 39.

In 2007, an organization called “Monotheism and jihad group in Levant” (Jamaat al-Tawhid wal Jihad fi Bilad al-Sham, resembles Zarqawi’s organization’s name) urged Sunnis of Syria to topple down Bashar al-Assad. Its leader’s name was “Abu Jandal”, and in a long video, he recited infamous fatwas of Ibn Taymiyyah against Alawites-Nusayris, called for annihilating all of them. This new group branded Hafez and Bashar al-Assad governments as “Nusayri occupation” and claimed that “[Nusayris] were desecrating the honor of the Muslims.”¹⁵³

One of the most important aspect of jihadist turn against Syria was the defeat of al-Zarqawi’s Al Qaeda in Iraq (AQI) during the civil war of 2006-2008 in Iraq. Both US occupation forces and its new Iraqi ally “Sahwa” (Awakening) Sunni groups diminished AQI. AQI had been working against not only the US occupation and Shiites, but also Sunnis who did not cooperate with the jihadist group. With Sahwa forces, lots of Sunni regrouped against AQI, and AQI started to withdraw from its once strongholds, such as Anbar province.¹⁵⁴ This is when global jihad ideologists started to look for another place to fight.

3.4.2. Syria is in the cross hairs

The one who puts Syria and the Levant in a strategic position for global jihad movement was Abu Fadil al-Madi.¹⁵⁵ In his article to a jihadist website in 2009, al-Madi argues the Syria’s position in a global manner. He claims that the Syrian government changed its attitude towards Sunni jihadists after 2005 and started to oppress its network. He also states that the Ba’athist government is “working hard” against Sunnis in general and calls his readers to think about Syria’s strategic

¹⁵³ Raphaël Lefèvre, *ibid*, 147.

¹⁵⁴ Andrew Phillips, “How al Qaeda lost Iraq,” *Australian Journal of International Affairs* 62, no. 1 (March 2009): 64-84.

¹⁵⁵ Murad Batal al-Shishani, “Jihadis Turn their Eyes to Syria as a Post-Iraq Theater of Operations,” *Terrorism Monitor* 7, issue 26 (August 2009): 3-5.

importance according to the global jihad.¹⁵⁶ Al-Madi draws a picture of conflict between “moderates” (such as Jordan, Saudi Arabia) and “Shia crescent”, states that in Iraq jihadist movement has been stuck into a war of attrition with the USA and has been wasting its time and energy. Therefore, al-Madi says, global jihad should turn its attention towards Syria.¹⁵⁷ According to al-Madi’s assessment, Syria would have been a more easier target than Iraq and when Syrian government toppled or dragged into chaos, both Iraqi and Lebanese Sunnis will be in a more stronger position.¹⁵⁸

Al-Madi’s argument resembles Abu Musab al-Zarqawi’s Al Qaeda of Iraq (AQI) which tried to inflame an all-an-out sectarian civil war in Iraq after the US occupation. Despite calls by Al Qaeda Central leaders, such as Osama bin Laden and Ayman al-Zawahiri, AQI’s main man al-Zarqawi continued to attack “near enemy”, i.e. Shias, despite that the other Al Qaeda leaders pointed their fingers to the “far enemy”, i.e. the USA. What al-Zarqawi tried to achieve was killing Iraqi Shias indiscriminately in order to provoke them to retaliate against Sunnis and to create a consciousness amongst Sunnis against Shias.¹⁵⁹ Al-Zarqawi denigrates Shias as “soldiers of occupiers” and justifies attacks against their mosques, markets, etc.¹⁶⁰

While AQI and al-Zarqawi were redirecting the path of jihad, the USA and its allied countries started a new course after the occupation of Iraq. One of the most famous articles of the award-winning journalist Seymour Hersh, due to the fear of the so-called “Shia axis” in the Fertile Crescent, from Tehran to Beirut, the USA and Saudi

¹⁵⁶ Ibid, 3.

¹⁵⁷ Ibid, 4.

¹⁵⁸ Kazimi, 51.

¹⁵⁹ Gary Gambill, “Abu Musab al-Zarqawi: A Biographical Sketch,” *Terrorism Monitor*, December 16, 2004, <https://jamestown.org/program/abu-musab-al-zarqawi-a-biographical-sketch-2/>.

¹⁶⁰ Nibras Kazimi, “A Virulent Ideology in Mutation: Zarqawi Upstages Maqdisi,” in *Current Trends in Islamist Ideology vol. 2*, eds. Hillel Fradkin, Husain Haqqani, and Eric Brown, (Washington, D.C.: Hudson Institute, 2005), 59-73.

Arabia had been searching for a strong Sunni counter-strike against Iran.¹⁶¹ The Bush Administration was thinking that Iraqi occupation had empowered Iran, and therefore, the US government's strategic priority was not "Sunni rebellion" in Iraq, on the contrary, to counter Iran the USA and its allies should have been came side by side with those "Sunni" groups. The USA and Saudi Arabia's main targets were obvious: Hezbollah in Lebanon, and Assad in Syria. Hersh claims that, with Washington's consent, Saudi Arabia "would provide fund and logistical aid to weaken" the Syrian government. The main protagonist of this scene was the Syrian Muslim Brotherhood.¹⁶² At the same time, Saudi Arabia began to fund and arm Lebanese and Palestinian jihadists against Hezbollah. Therefore, Al Qaeda started to send its fighters to wage jihad to Lebanon¹⁶³, and al-Zarqawi operated in Lebanese camps to recruit new jihadists for the organization.¹⁶⁴ Saudi Arabia's strategy was "isolating Syria to 'clip Iran's wings'."¹⁶⁵

Thus, after al-Zarqawi's lead in Iraqi jihad and Saudi Arabia's concerns about "Iranian influence" towards the middle east, global jihad movement and US-Saudi strategies juxtaposed with regard to Syria. The main goal was to contain Iran. That goal implies to carry out an aggressive policies towards Iran and Iran's allies, i.e. Lebanese Hezbollah and Syria.

¹⁶¹ Seymour M. Hersh, "The Redirection," *The New Yorker*, March 5, 2007, <http://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2007/03/05/the-redirection?printable=true>.

¹⁶² Ibid.

¹⁶³ Robert Fisk, "Al-Qa'ida sends its warriors from Iraq to wage 'jihad' in Lebanon," *The Independent*, August 15, 2008, <http://www.independent.co.uk/voices/commentators/fisk/robert-fisk-alqaida-sends-its-warriors-from-iraq-to-wage-jihad-in-lebanon-897557.html>.

¹⁶⁴ Mitchell Prothero, "Lebanon May Attract Sunnis Seeking to Wage Jihad," *US News*, May 15, 2008, <http://www.usnews.com/news/world/articles/2008/05/15/lebanon-may-attract-sunnis-seeking-to-wage-jihad>.

¹⁶⁵ Frederic Wehrey, Theodore W. Karasik, et al, *Saudi-Iranian Relations Since the Fall of Saddam: Rivalry, Cooperation, and Implications for U.S. Policy* (Santa Monica: Rand Corporation, 2009), pp. 89.

3.5. Political economy of the war

3.5.1. Transformation of Syria in the 20th century under Baath

The Syrian economy in the 1960s saw successive Baath administrations which were tended to be “traditional” and “radical”, respectively. The first Baath government (1963-1966) stopped its predecessor’s liberal economic tendencies which were mostly in favor with large landowners. The banks were nationalized again, and nationalization project reached out oil, cotton, import and export sectors. Although during the second and “radical” Baath period (1966-1970) the credits to agriculture mostly went to the large landowners, government control over the market, oppression on bourgeois elements were significant in radical Baath era.¹⁶⁶

When Hafez al-Assad dictated his “corrective” movement after the coup (1970), he took a chance to more or less “liberalize” Baath’s economy policy. In conjunction with the 1973 War, al-Assad adopted a Syrian version of *infitah* (openness) but in a restricted way. The main beneficiary of this first *infitah* was Damascene mercantile bourgeoisie. Before Hafez al-Assad, rapid socialization of the land was not supported with state investment and co-operatives, and on top of it, landowners and investors were alienated from the state due to land reform. Therefore, al-Assad looked to adopt a more inclusive policy for old regime’s landowners to boost agrarian investments. Particularly in Jazirah region, agrarian bourgeoisie who had been seen as a hostile force vor Baath Party were used by the state to stand up the agrarian sector. It was a mixture of both private and state ownership on land, however, struggle in the party continued throughout the 1980s. Nevertheless, though Baath Party under Hafez al-

¹⁶⁶ Syed Aziz-al Ahsan, “Economic Policy and Class Structure in Syria: 1958-1980,” *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 16, no. 3 (August 1984): 301-323; Raymond A. Hinnebusch, “The Political Economy of Liberalization in Syria,” *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 27, no. 3 (August 1995): 305-320.

Assad rehabilitated the rich landowner class, the land reform before him consolidated the party's middle peasantry base in rural regions.¹⁶⁷

Economic difficulties and consequences of radical Baath policies during the 1960s alienated the urban [Sunni] merchant classes, particularly in Aleppo. High inflation rates caused strikes and demonstrations, and in some occasions, this class mentioned displeasure against socialist policies and the alliance with the Soviet Union.¹⁶⁸ During the 1970s, the Syrian economy was boosted by the Gulf petrodollar and loans, however, with the 1980s, mostly due to rivalry in Lebanese Civil War, wealthy Arab countries decreased their aids to Syria. Also, lack of capital and high-skilled labor, industrial projects could not be done and industrial gross was almost stagnant throughout the 1980s.¹⁶⁹

After the debt crisis of 1986, Syrian leadership shifted the country's economy policy from "a planned economy to free-market economy" which did not resemble the policy of *infitah* (opening up) of 1970s.¹⁷⁰ The Syrian government implanted austerity measures, which included reduction in public investment and decreasing salaries, and step by step reversed the nationalization policy of old Baath and adopted privatization. Private sector investments surpassed public sector's (thanks to decrease of the latter, means proportionally, not at real terms) first time in Baath administrations, and new Syrian mercantile bourgeoisie, state bureaucracy, and newly established import-export businessmen exploited the new situation.¹⁷¹ The new policy also was forced by the conditions of the regional and international

¹⁶⁷ Raymond A. Hinnebusch, *Syria: Revolution From Above* (London and New York: Routledge, 2005), 111-112 and 118.

¹⁶⁸ Ibid, 98.

¹⁶⁹ Volker Perthes, "The Syrian Economy in the 1980s," *Middle East Journal* 46, no. 1 (Winter 1992): 37-58.

¹⁷⁰ Hans Hopfinger & Boeckler, "Step by Step to an Open Economic System: Syria Sets Course for Liberalization," *British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies* 23, no. 2 (November 1996): 183-202.

¹⁷¹ Volker Perthes, "The Syrian Private Industrial and Commercial Sectors and the State," *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 24, no. 2 (May 1992): 207-230.

politics. The USSR was in an internal turmoil due to Gorbachev reforms; decrease in the oil prices and political tension between Syria and the Gulf states; and international aids were started to given with political conditions.¹⁷² This new reform path re-organized the relationship between state, bourgeoisie and popular strata, and the ideological formation of Baath Party reconfigured according to new economy policy.¹⁷³ In the 1990s, the second *infatih* changed proportions of private and public sectors in the Syrian economy significantly. In GDP, private sector became more and more important contrary to public sector.¹⁷⁴ The famous Law No. 10 (1991) regulated the investment in Syria and opened the door for foreign and private investment. This is how the Syrian government responded the end of the Cold War, three decades statist domestic economy policy, and Syria's dependence of Gulf aid.¹⁷⁵

After the so-called "oil boom" in 1973, the Gulf states' economy was boosted and attracted external work force, especially from other Arab countries. Salaries in the Gulf states were too high than, for example Egypt and Syria. With the second half of the 1970s, Syrian migrant workers number increased, and according to estimations, in 1992, there were around 112,000 Syrian citizens (living and working) in the Gulf countries. Migrant workers' remittance is an important aspect of trade balance for labor-exporting countries. However, Syria was never like Egypt or Jordan with respect to migrant workers' remittance rate. Also, the Syrian government tried to

¹⁷² Eberhard Kienle, "Beyond the Lion's Reach: External Factors and Domestic Change in Syria", in *Scenarios for Syria: Socio-Economic and Political Choices*, ed. Volker Perthes (Baden-Baden: Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, 1997), 23-41.

¹⁷³ Raymond Hinnebusch, "Liberalization in Syria: the Struggle of Economic and Political Rationality," in *Contemporary Syria Liberalization Between Cold War and Cold Peace*, ed. Eberhard Kienle (London: British Academic Press, 1994), 101-103.

¹⁷⁴ Eberhard Kienle, *ibid*, 27.

¹⁷⁵ Due to its "front line" status against Israel, Syria received an amount of nearly 10 billion dollars from Arab states during the 1979-1988 period. See, Sylvie Pölling, "Overall Economic Developments and Reform Policies," in *Scenarios for Syria: Socio-Economic and Political Choices*, ed. Volker Perthes (Baden-Baden: Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, 1997), 43.

prevent skilled-labor migration to the Gulf countries from time to time.¹⁷⁶ Correspondingly, the Gulf monarchies were integrated to world economy. A compromise between the Western oil companies and the Gulf monarchies and the increase of oil prices paved the way for “petrodollar circle” and helped the new configuration of the capitalist world market which had been in crisis since the end of the 1960s. The Gulf economies enhanced the rapid financialization of the world economy: Gulf petrodollars were used for loans in the US and European banks. Moreover, according to an agreement reached between the USA and Saudi Arabia, the latter’s petrodollars were in large amounts invested in the US-related banks and especially for US Federal Reserve Bank. Therefore, integration of the Gulf economies into the highly internationalized and financialized world economy strengthened Gulf’s hegemony over the Middle East.¹⁷⁷ The surging power of the Gulf (and Libya before Gaddafi) combined with the decline of radical pan-Arab cause and acute economic failure of those states. During the 1970s, foreign capital began to flow to Syria in large amounts. Used for mostly infrastructure development and military expenditure, Arab aid to Syria between 1974 and 1978 was estimated around 500 million dollars per year.¹⁷⁸ However, Syria’s backing of Iran during Iraq-Iran War reversed the flow. During the 1990s, despite the fact that Syria’s tiny liberalization, foreign direct investments were relatively low in accordance with Egypt and Jordan.¹⁷⁹ Moreover, until the 1980s, private sector investment in Syria was relatively small (20%) and despite the increase of private investment in light industries, its proportion was stagnant.¹⁸⁰ However, the role of private sector

¹⁷⁶ Onn Wickler, “Syrian Migration to the Arab oil-producing countries,” *Middle Eastern Studies* 33, no. 1 (January 1997): 107-118. According to the same article, when Iraq invaded Kuwait in 1990, 110,000 Syrian citizens left Kuwait and returned home.

¹⁷⁷ Adam Hanieh, *Capitalism and Class in the Gulf Arab States* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011), 29-57.

¹⁷⁸ David W. Carr, “Capital Flows and Development in Syria,” *Middle East Journal* 34, no. 4 (Autumn 1980): 455-467.

¹⁷⁹ Paul Sullivan, “Globalization: Trade and Investment in Egypt, Jordan and Syria Since 1980,” *Arab Studies Quarterly* 21, no. 3 (Summer 1999): 35-72.

¹⁸⁰ Syed Aziz-al Ahsan, *ibid*, 309;

increased during the 1990s, liberalization and privatization became a state policy, and the relation between the state, the bourgeoisie and the popular strata was step by step changed until 2011.

To sum up, under Hafez al-Assad rule, Baath Party transformed the state as a facilitator towards adopting market policies and developing capitalism, although it never accepted the Syrian society was going a transition from socialism to capitalism.¹⁸¹ His double *infitah* policies in the 1970s and in the 1990s rehabilitated the old mercantile bourgeoisie and created a new one. The old and the new bourgeoisie mainly consisted of tradesmen and private industrial investments were relatively low. After the dissolution of the USSR, Syria lost its main economic and political supporter, and al-Assad tried to align himself with the winners of the Cold War. Law no. 10 (1991) was significant for more market-free economic policy. Privatization and support for the private sector marked the Syrian economy in the 1990s. After Hafez's death, this policy continued and accelerated.

3.5.2. More liberalization during Bashar's era

In domestic policies, Bashar al-Assad tried to integrate Syria's economy to the global system and continued his father's reluctant neoliberal economic policy.¹⁸² Bashar al-Assad stated that his administration adopted the so-called "social market economy" policy which made the market is defining the economic framework while the state is leading the process.¹⁸³ While the party and the state adopted a market-oriented economy, they also consolidated the state's class base amongst the bourgeoisie.

¹⁸¹ Linda Matar, *The Political Economy of Investment in Syria* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016), 91-92.

¹⁸² Omar S Dahi and Yasser Munif, "Revolts in Syria: Tracking the Convergence Between Authoritarianism and Neoliberalism," *Journal of Asian and African Studies* 47, no. 4 (2011): 323–332.

¹⁸³ "President al-Asad's Speech on His Re-election," cited by Samer N. Abboud, "Locating the "Social" in the Social Market Economy," in *Syria from Reform to Revolt, Volume 1*, ed. Raymond Hinnebusch and Tina Zintl (New York: Syracuse University Press, 2015), 45.

Integration to the world economy and amending the laws that protecting the domestic production hit the under-developed industrial sector while regulations strengthened commercial businesses. One account states that “Syria has been transformed from a state-planned economy into a FIRE (Finance, Insurance and Real Estate) economy.”¹⁸⁴ Trivets of neoliberal discourse, such as fiscal discipline, competitiveness, macroeconomic stabilization, financial de-regulation, competitive labor market, were adopted by the Syrian government. This meant that decreasing role of the public sector, at least theoretically, would be compensated by emerging private sector. In 2010, private sector’s proportion of GDP was 66%.¹⁸⁵ However, growing private sector could not offer enough new jobs while public sector’s proportion was decreasing, and high unemployment rates became acute during the 2000s. Moreover, cutting subsidies and rural migration to urban centers shook decades old Baath alliance structure and alienated both rural population and urban poor from the Baath Party and the state. The tribal anger (and kinship with Saudi Arabia) was used by the regional powers, namely Saudi Arabia, against Bashar al-Assad with the break of the Syrian War (2011).

Syrian economy highly was dependent on oil production and agriculture, and despite the economic reform path, its annual growth started to slow after Hariri assassination.¹⁸⁶ In 2007, oil industry constituted 25 percent of the GDP, and Syria’s textile industry was growing and mostly it counted itself on cotton, which employed “2.7 million farmers and their dependents, about 15 percent of the population.”¹⁸⁷ During Bashar al-Assad’s first 10 years in the office, agricultural sector’s proportion of GDP fell from 25.6% to 17.4%, service sector surpassed all other productive

¹⁸⁴ Cited by Linda Matar, *ibid*, 108.

¹⁸⁵ Linda Matar, “Macroeconomic Framework in Pre-conflict Syria,” in *Syria: From National Independence to Proxy War*, ed. Linda Matar and Ali Kadri (Cham: Palgrave Macmillan, 2019), 96.

¹⁸⁶ Nimrod Raphaeli, “Syria’s Fragile Economy,” *Middle East Review of International Affairs* 11, no. 2 (June 2007): 34.

¹⁸⁷ Nimrod Raphaeli, “The Political Economy of Syria Under Bashar Al-Assad,” *MEMRI*, April 16, 2007, <https://www.memri.org/reports/political-economy-syria-under-bashar-al-assad>.

sectors (59.6%), and Syria's industry was stagnant.¹⁸⁸ Investments were largely non-industrial, and the expected labor market enhancement was relatively disappointing. Hence, Syrian economy would have been faced a crisis in case of low oil prices and a collapse in agriculture and textile sectors.

A World Bank report from 2008 retains that despite the reverse migration from urban centers to rural areas in late 1990s, in the 10 years to 2004 the real agricultural labour productivity had been decreased and increased rural population was mostly employed in the small size farms. However, in 2008, the agricultural sector still held an important aspect of the Syrian economy, with 27% share in the GDP. Moreover, when it came to the 2000s, rural poverty surpassed the country's overall poverty with 62%. Despite the fact that the government subsidies supported some products such as cotton and wheat, figures showed that mostly rich landowners benefited from those subsidies.¹⁸⁹ During 2006-2010, the country's agriculture faced one of the worst disasters originated from drought. Syria's north-eastern part, *Jazirah* region, mostly was affected by the crisis, and also Damascus, Homs, and Dera'a were hit by the drought. The drought combined with neo-liberal economy policy and unemployment rate and poverty was increased during those years.¹⁹⁰

Due to the budget crisis, Bashar al-Assad government started to cut subsidies step by step. For instance, in 2004, a presidential decree was issued which diminished the government's responsibility for securing jobs for newly graduated engineering

¹⁸⁸ Nabil Marzouk, "The Syrian Conflict: Selective Socioeconomic Indicators," in *Syria: From National Independence to Proxy War*, ed. Linda Matar and Ali Kadri (Cham: Palgrave Macmillan, 2019), 118-119.

¹⁸⁹ "Agriculture in Syria: Towards the Social Market," *World Bank*, June, 2008, <http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/890301468304199912/475460WP0P11051ds0the0Social0Market.doc>, 9-19.

¹⁹⁰ Syria's agricultural production dropped to 2.1 million tonnes in 2008, which had an average rating of 4.7 million tonnes annually. See, Francesca De Châtel, "The Role of Drought and Climate Change in the Syrian Uprising: Untangling the Triggers of the Revolution," *Middle Eastern Studies* 50, no. 4 (2014): 521-535.

students.¹⁹¹ Also, along with a reform program in 2008, the government started to cut fuel and food subsidies which were very important for the Baath Party's popular support base.¹⁹² In 2007, Legislative Decree No. 8 was implemented for private investment, and this decree encouraged local, foreign, and especially Gulf investors.¹⁹³ Gulf monarchies' sovereign wealth funds (SWFs) started to dominate the Middle East thanks to oil price boom starting with 2003, and Syria became a playground for the Gulf SWFs.¹⁹⁴ Large building and infrastructure projects were started by the GCC countries, and in particular, when Syrian-Saudi relations reached a detente in 2009 after the tension with Saudi-backed and Syrian-backed Lebanese factions peaked in 2008, Saudi Arabia's investment increased until the 2011 unrest.¹⁹⁵

When Obama administration sought for a detente with the Syrian government due to the US financial decline and pivoting Asia strategy, despite tit-for-tat between the two countries after the invasion of Iraq and Hariri assassination in order to solve the Arab-Israeli conflict¹⁹⁶ and integrate Syria to the post-Cold War global system, Gulf economies started to increase their investments in the Syrian soil. According to one

¹⁹¹ Carmen Becker, "Strategies of Power Consolidation in Syria Under Bashar al-Asad: Modernizing Control Over Resources," *The Arab Studies Journal* 13/14, no. 2/1 (Fall 2005/Spring 2006): 74.

¹⁹² David Butter, "Syria's Economy: Picking up the Pieces," *Chatham House*, Research Paper, (June 2015): 3; Linda Matar, *ibid*, 116.

¹⁹³ Linda Matar, *ibid*, 112.

¹⁹⁴ It is important to note that the Gulf SWFs not only invested in the Middle East, but also invested mostly in the US and European banks due to the oil boom before the 2008 crisis. This made the Gulf countries a strong financial actor in global financial market, and also those SWFs rescued the position of dollar despite the fact that the decline of US financial empire. However, this deep integration to global financial market caused a similar deep effect to the Gulf, especially Saudi Arabia, after the crisis of 2008. For Gulf's SWFs investments, see, Nimrod Raphaeli and Bianca Gersten, "Sovereign Wealth Funds: Investment Vehicles for the Persian Gulf Countries," *Middle East Quarterly* 15, no. 2 (Spring 2008): 45-53.

¹⁹⁵ Edward Burke and Sara Bazoobandi, "The Gulf takes charge in the MENA region," *Fride Working Paper* 97, (April 2010): 6.

¹⁹⁶ "Foreign Investment in Syria Grows," *Forbes*, October 26, 2009, <https://www.forbes.com/2009/10/23/syria-unctad-trade-business-oxford-analytica.html#3c3071a1765f>.

account, before 2011, the UAE was the top investor in Syria with 10 billion dollars, the second was Kuwait with 6 billion dollars, the third was Qatar with 5 billion dollars, and although Saudi Arabia had 2 billion investment in Syria, negotiations was ongoing between Saudi and Syrian officials concerning with new investments.¹⁹⁷ According to one unofficial data, Saudi investment in Syria grew between 2007-2009, from 750 million USD to 1 billion USD.¹⁹⁸ Gulf Cooperation Council countries, especially Qatar, United Arab Emirates, and Saudi Arabia leaded foreign investment in sectors like real estate, retail, industry, and infrastructure.¹⁹⁹ Also, in 2007, Syria and Turkey signed off a free trade agreement and Turkish investments rose to 400 million USD in 2008.²⁰⁰

But due to the uncompetitiveness of Syrian products both regionally and internationally, the opening of the Syrian market and re-organizing the Syrian economy as a free-market economy created a vacuum and started to undermine the relationship between the state and the popular strata.²⁰¹ In 2010, “during a period of two months, 48 textile were shut down.”²⁰² The agricultural sector’s share in GDP declined 7.8 percent to 2.8 percent from 2005 to 2010, poverty increased (from 30.1 percent to 33.6 percent), and especially the northern and eastern regions of Syria “had the highest poverty rates in the country.”²⁰³

¹⁹⁷ This is the estimation of Al Jazeera cited by Hassan Hassan, “The Gulf states: United against Iran, divided over Islamists,” in *The Regional Struggle for Syria*, ed. Julien Barnes-Dacey and Daniel Levy (London: European Council on Foreign Relations, 2013), 20.

¹⁹⁸ “Syria and Saudi end tariff war,” *The National*, November 3, 2009, <https://www.thenational.ae/world/mena/syria-and-saudi-end-tariff-war-1.507813>.

¹⁹⁹ Emile Hokayem, “The Gulf States and Syria,” *Peace Brief 116*, (September 30, 2011): 2.

²⁰⁰ “Syria heads east to boost foreign investment,” *Financial Times*, July 7, 2008, <https://www.ft.com/content/e0c488b6-4b7d-11dd-a490-000077b07658>.

²⁰¹ Bassam Haddad, “The Political Economy of Syria: Realities and Challenges,” *Middle East Policy*, Volume 18, no. 2 (Summer 2011): 55.

²⁰² Ibid, 52.

²⁰³ Alice Bonfatti, “The socio-economic roots of Syria’s uprising,” *Al Jumhuriya*, September 21, 2017, <https://www.aljumhuriya.net/en/content/socio-economic-roots-syria%E2%80%99s-uprising>.

3.5.3. Syria's international relations during the 2000s

Above-mentioned economy policy did not completely determine the foreign policy of Syria. Under Bashar al-Assad, Syria started to work with international financial institutions, such as IMF and World Bank. After 9/11, al-Assad bandwagoned the US policy “war on terror” in a while, however, before the invasion of Iraq, Syrian government was seen by the Bush Administration (his speech in 2002 in State of the Union) as “beyond the axis of evil”, and one article penned in 2007 by the current US National Security Advisor, John R. Bolton, Syria joined the “axis of evil.”²⁰⁴

This change of course follows this timeline: Assassination of the Prime Minister of Lebanon Rariq Hariri in 2005, Syrian withdrawal from Lebanon, July War of 2006 in Lebanon which ended with Israeli defeat, Israeli airstrike on Syria's alleged nuclear facility in 2007, and the dangerous deadlock in Lebanese system and clashes between Hezbollah and the Future Movement militants in Beirut in 2008 (ended with Doha Agreement). All of these issues cover Lebanese political scene and signify the Syrian-backed Hezbollah's growing influence in Lebanon. Therefore, the USA and its allies in the Middle East sought a policy towards Syria a sort of “carrot and stick”: They tried to weak Bashar al-Assad government, and supposed to detract him from Iran and Hezbollah.²⁰⁵

This is when the Bush Administration and Saudi Arabia started to work with “Sunni” elements in Lebanon to balance the Syrian influence. Lebanon was a “reliance front” for the USA, Saudi Arabia, and Salafist militants for their struggle for the Greater Syria, therefore jihadist activities in Lebanon, and in particular in Palestinian refugee camps increased. Saudi Arabia promised to arm “Sunni” militias in Iraq if the USA would withdraw its troops, and Riyadh could diminish “rising Iranian influence in

²⁰⁴ John R. Bolton, “Syria Joins the Axis of Evil,” *The Wall Street Journal*, September 25, 2007, <https://www.wsj.com/articles/SB119068573117938332>.

²⁰⁵ Dennis Ross, “U.S. Policy toward a Weak Assad,” *The Washington Quarterly* 28, no. 3 (Summer 2005): 87-98. It is interesting to see that a former US policy maker in 2005 presumed that the removal of Bashar al-Assad might cause a “Sunni extremist uprising.” *Ibid*, 97.

Iraq, Lebanon, and the Palestinian territories.”²⁰⁶ The US Administration and Saudis agree to counter and to engage with Iran in different countries, namely the so-called “Shia crescent”, and Syria was in a critical place for this policy. According to award-winning journalist Seymour Hersh, alongside with the protection of Israel, forcing Hamas to share its power with Al Fatah in Gaza, and working with the “Sunni states” in the Middle East, Saudi Arabia convinced the USA to provide cash and logistical aid to weaken the Syrian government, and this could be achieved via the jihadists in Lebanon. Therefore, Saudi Arabia gave its support to the jihadist in Northern Lebanon and Palestinian camps through the Fuad Siniora government, and for instance, in Nahr al-Bared refugee camp, a Salafist group called Fatah al-Intifada stepped up its power against Hezbollah. Also, in another camp, Ain al-Hilweh, another Salafist organization named Asbat al-Ansar broadened its power base amongst Palestinians.²⁰⁷

Therefore, US-Saudi efforts to counter the so-called “Shia crescent” and to break Syria’s alliance with Iran overlapped domestic neoliberal economy policies of Bashar al-Assad. The rise of Sunni radicalism and spread of Gulf money to Lebanon, Iraq, and Syria opened a new chapter in global jihad history. Now, jihadist movement had turned its attention from “enemy afar” to the “near enemy.” Al-Zarqawi signifies this shift in jihadist movement and the ISIL phenomenon follows the footsteps of AQI and al-Zarqawi. Both al-Zarqawi and later-leader of the Syrian Al Qaeda Al Nusra Front Abu Mohammad al-Jolani had sown the seed of jihad amongst the Lebanese-Palestinian camps. And when the Syrian crisis erupted, there were hundreds of jihadists who ready to wage jihad against “infidel Nusayri regime.”

²⁰⁶ Suzanne Goldenberg, “If Us leaves Iraq we will arm Sunni militias, Saudis say,” *The Guardian*, December 14, 2006, <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2006/dec/14/iraq.saudiarabia>.

²⁰⁷ Seymour M. Hersh, “The Redirection,” *The New Yorker*, February 25, 2007, <https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2007/03/05/the-redirection?printable=true>.

3.6. Some controversies: Mainstream media and disinformation

The official Western government line and the narrative of mainstream media of the Western world about the Syrian War is that the peaceful protests against Assad was countered by the government and the army's harsh reaction and intentional jihadization and militarization of the Syrian uprising. According to this narrative, on March 15, 2011, in Daraa some children painted anti-government graffiti on a wall and the Syrian security service arrested and tortured those boys.²⁰⁸ Also, according to this narrative, Assad had deliberately released some prominent jihadist figures from prison in order to prove that he is fighting against extremism and the Western world does not have any options rather than supporting the Syrian government.²⁰⁹ Plus, the Syrian Army have not fighting against jihadist groups, such as ISIL, and also have colluded with ISIL with buying oil and agricultural products.²¹⁰ In brief, the Syrian Army repressed the peaceful protests, and the Assad government militarized and jihadized pro-democracy and secular opposition. This gave momentum to jihadist insurgency in Syria, and then Al Qaeda and other jihadist groups hijacked the

²⁰⁸ See Joe Sterling, "Daraa: The spark that lit the Syrian flame," *CNN*, March 1, 2012, <https://edition.cnn.com/2012/03/01/world/meast/syria-crisis-beginnings/index.html>.

Dave Burke, "The boy whose graffiti changed the world: On sixth anniversary of Syria's civil war, the youth who sparked it by scrawling on a wall says he regrets the deaths but the country 'had to change'," *Daily Mail*, March 15, 2017, <http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-4312502/The-boy-anti-Assad-graffiti-changed-world.html>.

²⁰⁹ See Maria Abi-Habib, "Assad Policies Aided Rise of Islamic State Militant Group," *Wall Street Journal*, August 22, 2014, <https://www.wsj.com/articles/assad-policies-aided-rise-of-islamic-state-militant-group-1408739733>.

Raniah Salloum, "Former Prisoners Fight in Syrian Insurgency," *Spiegel Online*, October 10, 2013, <http://www.spiegel.de/international/world/former-prisoners-fight-in-syrian-insurgency-a-927158.html>.

Phil Sands, Justin Vela and Suha Maayeh, "Assad regime abetted extremists to subvert peaceful uprising, says former intelligence official," *The National*, January 21, 2014, <https://www.thenational.ae/world/assad-regime-abetted-extremists-to-subvert-peaceful-uprising-says-former-intelligence-official-1.319620>.

²¹⁰ Michael Becker, "When Terrorists and Target Governments Cooperate the Case of Syria," *Perspectives on Terrorism* 9, no. 1 (February 2015): 95-103.

revolution.²¹¹ This narrative took place in international media when the US Government designated the Syrian Al Qaeda, Al Nusra Front as a “foreign terrorist organization”²¹², but still, the Western media coverage continued to depict Al Nusra Front as “one of the most effective anti-Assad militias.”²¹³

However, this narrative was just one side of the coin. The depiction of the Syrian opposition as peaceful, pro-democracy and secular does not fit the sectarian discourse and armed insurgency methods that have been used by Syrian opposition. For instance, one of the first people that adopted a sectarian language against Bashar al-Assad and his government was Tartous-born Syrian Salafist Abu Basir al-Tartousi and he started to spread his views from Facebook just after the first demonstrations, on March 20, 2011.²¹⁴ After he participated in the Muslim Brotherhood uprising and jailed in 1976, immediately afterwards he flew to Jordan and then Iraq, Pakistan, and Afghanistan in order to join the war against the USSR and the Afghan government. After a long journey which includes the United Kingdom and Jordan again, he eventually found himself in Syria in 2012 to wage jihad against Bashar al-Assad. However, from the moment of the very beginning of the Syrian crisis, he released religious verdicts which called the downfall of three regimes or movements: the Syrian one, the Iranian one, and Hezbollah.²¹⁵

This “call to jihad” went along with attack on governmental institutions and law enforcement officials. The Syrian War did indeed militarize around mid-April 2011

²¹¹ Samia Nakhoul, “Al Qaeda hijacks spirit of Syria revolt three years on,” *Reuters*, March 11, 2014, <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-syria-crisis-refugees-insight/al-qaeda-hijacks-spirit-of-syria-revolt-three-years-on-idUSBREA2A0QG20140311>.

²¹² “Terrorist Designations of the al-Nusra Front as an Alias for al-Qa’ida in Iraq,” *US State Department*, accessed May 15, 2018, <https://2009-2017.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2012/12/201759.htm>.

²¹³ Tony Karon, “While U.S. Recognizes Syrian Opposition, It Designates One Anti-Assad Group as ‘Terrorist’,” *Time*, December 11, 2012, <http://world.time.com/2012/12/11/why-the-u-s-has-designated-one-anti-assad-group-as-terrorist/>.

²¹⁴ Suhaib Anjarini, “The Mufti of the Syrian Opposition,” *Al Akhbar*, March 5, 2014, <https://english.al-akhbar.com/content/mufti-syrian-opposition>.

²¹⁵ Ibid.

after one month after the protests began. According to one account, some Salafist circles started to smuggle weapons from Turkey through Latakia in mid-April and attacked the police.²¹⁶ But the first massacre, according to the Syrian opposition and its main backers, took place between June 4-6 in Jisr al-Shughour, Idlib. The activists on the ground and the Western media claimed that the Syrian troops killed 120 comrade-in-arms due to their rejection to fire on protesters. Moreover, there were a large bunch of army deserters in the area who were fleeing to Turkey and reorganized to protect the people from the repression of the regular army.²¹⁷ However, at that time, some journalists acted with suspicion towards the reports about the massacre.²¹⁸ Eyewitnesses and participants of the massacre later admitted that the armed groups killed policemen and troops, and then they fabricated the claim that the troops fired on each other.²¹⁹

The other counter narrative was about peaceful protests. As mentioned before, there were signs that the uprising was almost armed in the very beginning. According to

²¹⁶ Rania Abouzeid, *No Turning Back: Life, Loss, and Hope in Wartime Syria* (New York and London: W. W. Norton&Company, 2018), 133.

²¹⁷ Hannah Godfrey and Martin Chulov, "Syrian army tanks move into Jisr al-Shughour," *The Guardian*, June 12, 2011, <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2011/jun/12/syrian-army-tanks-jisr-al-shughour>.

²¹⁸ A reporter from *Anadolu Agency*, Hediye Levent, could enter the town after the massacre and told that all public buildings were destroyed by the armed groups, the corpses were mutilated, and the people of the town happily welcomed the army troops. After the report, Levent was fired from *Anadolu Agency*. See, "Oraya gidince, işlerin bilindiği gibi olmadığı ortaya çıktı", *soL Haber Portalı*, June 16, 2011, <http://haber.sol.org.tr/dunyadan/oraya-gidilince-islerin-bilindigi-gibi-olmadigi-ortaya-cikti-haberi-43636>. Another reporter, this time from *TRT Türk*, Musa Özügürlü was also amongst the journalist who reached Jisr al-Shughour after the massacre. He could not publish his testimony about the issue until 2016. See, Musa Özügürlü, "Cisreşşuğur Katliamı'nın 5. yıldönümü: Musa Özügürlü tanıklığını soL için yazdı", *soL Haber Portalı*, June 6, 2016, <http://haber.sol.org.tr/dunya/cisressugur-katliaminin-5-yildonumu-musa-ozugurlu-tanikligini-sol-icin-yazdi-158254>. Joshua Landis from the University of Oklahoma, wrote in his blog that there were no evidence of the Syrian troops shot at each other, in 2011. See, Joshua Landis, "What happened at Jisr al-Shagour?," *Syria Comment*, June 13, 2011, <https://www.joshualandis.com/blog/what-happened-at-jisr-al-shagour/>. In Western media, Robert Fisk had a suspicion about the massacre had been carried by the Syrian army, in 2013. See, Robert Fisk, "They may be fighting for Syria, not Assad. They may also be winning: Robert Fisk reports from inside Syria," *The Independent*, April 26, 2013, <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/middle-east/they-may-be-fighting-for-syria-not-assad-they-may-also-be-winning-robert-fisk-reports-from-inside-8590636.html>.

²¹⁹ See, Rania Abouzeid, *ibid*, 136-139.

one report, a militant from the group of Ahrar al-Sham, which was founded by Abu Khaled al-Suri, a prominent Al Qaeda member and a friend of Osama bin Laden and Ayman al-Zawahiri, states that his group was established even before March 15, 2011, right after the “Egyptian revolution.”²²⁰

Another debate was about releasing Islamist prisoners. According to the Syrian opposition and the Western media, Bashar al-Assad deliberately released notorious jihadist figures with amnesty in order to “jihadize” the opposition and legitimize its oppression against the protests in the eyes of the Western world. The Syrian government could have branded its opponents as “Al Qaeda” with releasing jihadists from prisons, and it did.²²¹ Nevertheless, releasing political prisoners was one of the main demands of the opposition in 2011. Successive amnesties in March, May, and June granted freedom for political prisoners, including Baath’s long term enemy, the Muslim Brotherhood members.²²² While some members of the opposition cheered those amnesties, others called them “insufficient.”²²³ Moreover, the Syrian government lifted headscarf ban for school teachers, and shut casino in order to appease “Sunni” opposition.²²⁴ Two famous jihadist figures, the leader of the Army

²²⁰ Rania Abouzeid, “TIME Exclusive: Meet the Islamist Militants Fighting Alongside Syria’s Rebels,” *TIME*, July 26, 2012, <http://world.time.com/2012/07/26/time-exclusive-meet-the-islamist-militants-fighting-alongside-syrias-rebels/>.

²²¹ For instance, see, Raniah Salloum, “Former Prisoners Fight in Syrian Insurgency,” *Spiegel Online*, October 10, 2013, <https://www.spiegel.de/international/world/former-prisoners-fight-in-syrian-insurgency-a-927158.html>; Roy Gutman, “Assad Henchman: Here’s How We Built ISIS,” *The Daily Beast*, April 13, 2017, <https://www.thedailybeast.com/assad-henchman-heres-how-we-built-isis>; Phil Sands, Justin Vela and Suha Maayeh, “Assad regime abetted extremists to subvert peaceful uprising, says former intelligence officer,” *The National*, January 21, 2014, <https://www.thenational.ae/world/assad-regime-abetted-extremists-to-subvert-peaceful-uprising-says-former-intelligence-official-1.319620>.

²²² Nicholas Blanford, “Syria’s Assad offers amnesty to political prisoners,” *The Christian Science Monitor*, May 31, 2011, <https://www.csmonitor.com/World/Middle-East/2011/0531/Syria-s-Assad-offers-amnesty-to-political-prisoners>.

²²³ “Assad orders new Syrian amnesty,” *Al Jazeera*, June 21, 2011, <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/middleeast/2011/06/2011621944198405.html>.

²²⁴ Yara Bayoumy, “Syria lifts niqab ban, shuts casino, in nod to Sunnis,” *Reuters*, April 6, 2011, <https://uk.reuters.com/article/uk-syria-assad-niqab/syria-lifts-niqab-ban-shuts-casino-in-nod-to-sunnis-idUKTRE7353SH20110406>.

of Islam Zahran Alloush and the leader of Ahrar al-Sham Hassan al-Abboud were released from prison in 2011. However, for instance, Ahrar al-Sham was funded by the Islamist networks in the Gulf, and especially a Kuwaiti figure donated it mostly.²²⁵ Likewise, Zahran Alloush's cousin and one of the leaders of the Army of Islam was selected as "chief negotiator" of Riyadh-based opposition council.

Foreign fighters and "hijacking the revolution" are another issue in the course of the Syrian War. After the announcement of the formation of Al Nusra Front in January, 2012, there were rumors about flowing foreign jihadists into Syria. In February, 2012, Al Qaeda leader Ayman al-Zawahiri declared his support to Syrian uprising and urged "Muslim states", such as Iraq, Lebanon, and Jordan, to take arms against the Syrian government. At that time, Al Nusra Front started to attack government targets and there were some reports about "hijacking the revolution."²²⁶ However, there were early signs about foreign militias in Syria. The most important junction was Libya. There were two American intelligence reports about the rising jihadism in Syria and the bridge between Libya and Syria, in August, 2012 and in October, 2012, respectively. According to the first Defense Intelligence Agency (DIA) report which was obtained by a conservative institution, *Judicial Watch*, the West, the Gulf states, and Turkey who were supporting the Syrian opposition wanted the establishment of a "Salafi municipality" in eastern Syria in order to isolate the Syrian government. Also, DIA plainly stated that Salafist, Ikhwan, and Al Qaeda was the driver of the Syrian opposition.²²⁷ The other report put that the American intelligence knew that

²²⁵ Aron Lund, "Holy Warriors," *Foreign Policy*, October 15, 2012, <https://foreignpolicy.com/2012/10/15/holy-warriors/>.

²²⁶ Phoebe Greenwood, "Al-Qaeda leader urges Muslim world to support Syrian uprising," *The Telegraph*, February 12, 2012, <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/middleeast/syria/9077386/Al-Qaeda-leader-urges-Muslim-world-to-support-Syrian-uprising.html>.

²²⁷ "Obtained Document," *Judicial Watch*, May 18, 2015, <https://www.judicialwatch.org/document-archive/pgs-287-293-291-jw-v-dod-and-state-14-812-2/>.

weapons and ammunitions had been carrying from Libya to Syria within the knowledge of the US officials by Turkish cargo ships.²²⁸

Libya connection also was written by Seymour Hersh with regard to the infamous sarin gas attack in Syria.²²⁹ According to Hersh's story, CIA was providing weapons to the Syrian opposition via southern Turkey from Libya in early 2012. Hersh claimed that there is a classified report about a secret deal between the American and Turkish governments about the shipment of weapons, with funding of Turkey, Qatar, and Saudi Arabia, and with supervision of the American and British intelligence. It is obvious that some regional countries and some western powers tried to mimic the "Libyan success" in Syria via the same methods.²³⁰

This is the same line the President of Syria, Bashar al-Assad has pursued during the war. In an interview with a prominent Western journal, al-Assad claimed that the Syrian opposition did not have any grassroots organizations in Syria, they received money, weapon, and logistical support from Syria's regional rivals. Therefore, according to al-Assad, it is fruitless to negotiate with an opposition that not have any influence over the Syrian society.²³¹

²²⁸ "Judicial Watch: Defense, State Department Documents Reveal Obama Administration Knew that al Qaeda Terrorists Had Planned Benghazi Attack 10 Days in Advance," *Judicial Watch*, May 18, 2015, <https://www.judicialwatch.org/press-room/press-releases/judicial-watch-defense-state-department-documents-reveal-obama-administration-knew-that-al-qaeda-terrorists-had-planned-benghazi-attack-10-days-in-advance/>.

²²⁹ Seymour Hersh, "The Red Line and the Rat Line," *London Review of Books*, April 17, 2014, <https://www.lrb.co.uk/v36/n08/seymour-m-hersh/the-red-line-and-the-rat-line>.

²³⁰ Aron Lund, "How Assad's Enemies Gave Up on the Syrian Opposition," *The Century Foundation*, October 17, 2017, <https://tcf.org/content/report/assads-enemies-gave-syrian-opposition/?agreed=1#easy-footnote-bottom-3>.

²³¹ "Syria's President Speaks: A Conversation With Bashar al-Assad," *Foreign Affairs* 94, no. 2 (March/April 2015): 58-65.

3.7. Reactions against the Syrian Uprising

The Western and regional reaction with regard to the Syrian uprising was ambiguous at first. As mentioned before, the US government adopted a “stick and carrot policy” towards Syria, tried to vitiate Syrian influence in Lebanon, weaken Syrian government, however, not stuck on a regime change like Iraq. The Bush Administration pointed its finger at Iran and Syria, nevertheless the US President did not particularly call for toppling Bashar al-Assad.²³² In a broader sense, Barack Obama era was determined by great economic crisis of 2008 and American attempt for economic recovery. This situation juxtaposed with “pivoting Asia” strategy which means that the USA both militarily and politically would focus on Asia-Pacific, especially China. Sharing military and political burden in the Middle East, boasting “no boots on the ground” policy success in Libya, employing local proxies and using UAVs from Africa to Pakistan signified the Obama Administration’s Middle East policy, or the so-called “Obama Doctrine.”²³³ Before the “Arab Spring”, in August 2010, there was a report about a memo which Obama sent his top advisors. In this memo, Obama challenged traditional American policy of stability in the Middle East, and called for a “political reform”.²³⁴ Therefore, Obama’s foreign policy was to share American role in the Middle East with America’s allies in the region while ensuring new alliances apart from traditional US friends in the region. In Libya, an international coalition which included NATO, with the approval of a no-fly zone by the UN, attacked Muammar Gaddafi and killed him eventually. The Syrian version of events in August, 2011, started to resemble Libya. In early August,

²³² Julian Borger, “Bush warns Syria and Iran over terror,” *The Guardian*, February 3, 2005, <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2005/feb/03/syria.usa>.

²³³ See, Fawaz A. Gerges, “The Obama approach to the Middle East: the end of America’s moment?,” *International Affairs* 89, No. 2 (2013): 299–323. In an interview, Obama admits his Libya strategy ended with a “mess”, however, he blames his country’s allies and Libya’s “tribalism” problem. See, Jeffrey Goldberg, “The Obama Doctrine,” *The Atlantic*, June 2016, http://businesstoday.lk/pdf/june_2016/President_Obamas_Interview_With_Jeffrey_Goldberg.pdf. A detailed article about Obama’s externalization the burden of war efforts in the Middle East, see, Andreas Krieg, “Externalizing the burden of war: the Obama Doctrine and US foreign policy in the Middle East,” *International Affairs* 92, no. 1 (2016): 97–113.

²³⁴ Cited from Peter Baker by Fawaz A. Gerges, *ibid*, 306.

the Gulf states decided to isolate Syria, and on August 18, the Obama Administration and European leaders called on Bashar al-Assad to step down.²³⁵

The Gulf's initial response to the protests was ambiguous too. Syria broke its international isolation, which was stemmed from the assassination of Rafiq Hariri in 2005, via mediation of Qatar in 2008. The rise of the Qatari investment in Syria mentioned before. Like Qatar, Saudi Arabia sought for a detente with Syria around 2009. The main motive of the Kingdom was still cutting Iranian effect and to appease Syria. When the protests began in 2011, apart from *Al Jazeera*'s coverage of events in Syria, Gulf states were relatively quiet for at least five months. In August, Saudi King called Syrian government as "killing machine", withdrew his ambassador of Syria, and the other Gulf states followed him. Then, Gulf monarchies called al-Assad to step down, expelled Syria from Arab League, and started to arm the rebels in Syria. Qatar and Saudi Arabia started to fund the opposition umbrella group which formed in Turkey in Summer 2011, the Syrian National Council (SNC). Qatar stepped up its efforts to arm the rebels due to the "success" in Libya, and pursued a policy in order to trigger a Western intervention like Libya, with Saudi Arabia. Saudi Arabia used its tribal connections and old Salafist groups, whereas Qatar supported Muslim Brotherhood-linked organizations.²³⁶

The other American ally, Turkey, followed a similar path. Good relations with Erdoğan and al-Assad supported with Turkish investment, including a free trade agreement, and diplomatic support. Also, Turkey volunteered as a mediator between Israel-Syria dispute. Therefore, when the protests began in Syria, Turkey pushed for reforms initially. After al-Assad reject those calls, Turkey adopted more harsh rhetoric against Syria. In August 2011, Erdoğan reminds Libya and Gaddafi to Assad, but still did not call him to step down. After one week the Jordanian King

²³⁵ Jay Solomon, Nour Malas, and Laurence Norman, "World Leaders Urge Assad to Resign," *The Wall Street Journal*, August 19, 2011, <https://www.wsj.com/articles/SB10001424053111903639404576516144145940136>.

²³⁶ Christopher Phillips, "Gulf Actors and the Syria Crisis," *LSE Middle East Centre Collected Papers* 1, (April 2015): 41-52.

Abdullah said “Assad must go” in November, finally Erdoğan compared the Syrian President to Hitler and Mussolini, and again reminded him the fate of Gaddafi and called him to step down.²³⁷ Later, al-Assad’s political advisor Bouthaina Shaaban claimed that what Erdoğan implied with “reforms” was bringing the Muslim Brotherhood members into the Syrian government.²³⁸ Turkey has provided safe havens for Syrian armed opposition, and also Al Qaeda-linked groups conducted their assaults against Idlib in 2015 from Hatay.²³⁹

The role of the USA, Gulf states, and Turkey on formation the Free Syrian Army (FSA) is significant. FSA initially was founded by an army defector Riad al-Assad in July 2011, in Turkey. According to released Hillary Clinton emails by Wikileaks, above mentioned countries trained the FSA militarily in Turkey, and helped them to block the Syrian army’s movement. US efforts directed the FSA to establish “no kill zones” in Syria. US base in İncirlik, Turkey, and Turkish port İskenderun used for the training of the FSA militants. FSA’s first anti-tank and sniper teams also were trained in Turkey. Moreover, US and Saudi special forces cut Deir al-Zour-Palmyra road and ensured free movement for FSA elements.²⁴⁰

²³⁷ Ian Black, “Syria's Assad should step down, says King Abdullah of Jordan,” *The Guardian*, November 14, 2011, <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2011/nov/14/syrian-president-assad-urged-to-quit>; Jonathon Borch, “Turkey tells Syria’s Assad: Step down!,” *Reuters*, November 22, 2011, <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-syria-idUSL5E7MD0GZ20111122>.

²³⁸ “Assad Adviser Hints Erdogan Trying to Bring Muslim Brotherhood to Power in Syria,” *Sputnik*, February 22, 2019, <https://sputniknews.com/middleeast/201902221072644073-syria-assad-erdogan-brotherhood/>. Also Assad claims that Turkey has been working closely with armed groups affiliated with the Muslim Brotherhood. See, Alexis Papachelas, “Chemical attack accusations ‘fake,’ Assad tells Kathimerini in exclusive interview,” *Kathimerini*, May 10, 2018, <http://www.ekathimerini.com/228495/article/ekathimerini/news/chemical-attack-accusations-fake-assad-tells-kathimerini-in-exclusive-interview>.

²³⁹ Hasan Sivri, “Suriye'deki son saldırı ve katliamlar "Antakya Operasyon Odası"ndan yönetiliyor,” *İntizar*, April 28, 2015, <http://intizar.web.tr/analiz/haber/1726/suriyedeki-son-saldiri-ve-katliamlar-antakya-operasyon-odasindan-#.XTscIzMzZQI>.

²⁴⁰ Further details about those Clinton emails, see, Erman Çete and Tulga Buğra Işık, *Clinton Yazışmalarında AKP’nin Kirli Savaşları* (İstanbul: Yazılama, 2016), 127-133.

However, Libya policy did not fit Syria. For instance, despite the fact that its intervention in Libya was significant, NATO ruled out the proposal of no-fly zone over Syria.²⁴¹ Russia and China rejected resolutions directed at Syria at the UN Security Council and Russia directly intervened in Syria in 2015. Also, Iran and Hezbollah has engaged militarily since 2013, at least officially in the side of Syrian government. The Obama Administration avoided any direct engagement with Syria, even alleged chemical attack in 2013. Moreover, US allies in the region pursued different courses, and the opposition was highly fragmented. Above all else, Bashar al-Assad government and the Syrian army has preserved its inner stability and Baath Party's alliance with urban -and Sunni- merchants, middle class and state bourgeoisie has remained active with support of minorities in fear that an Islamist takeover.

3.8. Conclusion

Change of Syria in the 20th century created new socio-political forces. Successive Baath governments broke the old class structure and created a new configuration, especially empowered rural classes and minorities. Reaction against Baath governments was represented by Islamists, mainly the Syrian Ikhwan. The Syrian Muslim Brotherhood mobilized urban Sunni middle class in the context of a sectarian discourse against Alawites, and this discourse has continued up to day within the ranks of Islamist forces in Syria. Neoliberal economy policies during the 1990s and Bashar al-Assad period paved the way for agricultural collapse before the uprising of 2011. Moreover, Bashar al-Assad's cautious Islamization of the Syrian society and Gulf countries' economic power created a fertile ground for jihadist cause.

The Syrian War has continued within the context of a proxy war. Most factions in the war have one or more foreign backers and diverging interests even in the same camp make a political solution impossible. Plus, Syria's influence on Lebanon and

²⁴¹ Luke Harding, "Nato all but rules out Syria no-fly zone," *The Guardian*, October 30, 2011, <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2011/oct/30/nato-syria-no-fly-zone>.

Palestine complicates the issue. Syrian opposition's military insurgence methods initially was light, but after militant flow from Lebanon, especially from Palestinian camps changed the military picture in the war and added a new dimension not only militarily, but also social and politically. Lebanese militants, for instance, strengthened once weak al Nusra Front, and made this group one of the most significant and dangerous armed organizations in the scene of Syria's lasting war. This issue will be elaborated in Chapter 4.



CHAPTER 4

PALESTINIAN JIHADISTS IN THE SYRIAN WAR

Arab children,
Don't read our suffocated generation,
We are a hopeless case.
We are as worthless as a watermelon rind.
Don't read about us,
Don't ape us,
Don't accept our ideas,
We are a nation of crooks and jugglers.

Nizar Qabbani, *Footnotes in Setback's Notebook*,
written after the 1967 War

4.1. Introduction

The term “Palestinian question” often has a meaning related with some external factors. It is sometimes called “Arab-Israeli conflict” and sometimes refers to Israeli occupation. But Palestinian question always implies another and mostly ignored fact: The question, whether it is related with refugees or Palestinian statehood, is a question of defining the Palestinian identity and its political movement. All Palestinian factions, apart from their “ultimate goal”, i.e. liberation of Palestine from Israeli occupation, have their political and ideological views about the Palestinian society and its future, and therefore they always struggle for power, for Palestinian consent, and also fight with each other to govern Palestine, occupied territories, or refugee camps. Hence, struggle against Israel is always a race for gaining

Palestinians' hearts and minds. In this chapter, the birth of Palestinian question will briefly be explained. Afterwards, the impact of Palestinian question and Palestinian refugees in Lebanon will be examined. At last, the role of Palestinian jihadists will be elaborated.

4.2. Palestinian Question and refugee camps: Birth of Palestinian nationalism

The Palestinian question is deeply rooted in Jewish migration to Palestine and Zionism. The essence of Zionism is “desire for a safe haven state”²⁴², especially for the European Jews who were killed by pogroms in Eastern Europe in 1800s. The most critical aspects of the Zionist movement is Jewish migration to Palestine (in Hebrew, it is called *aliyah*, i.e. “ascent”) and the notion that Arabs (or Palestinians) in historical Palestine land *do not exist* and therefore do not have any civil or national rights. This crucial point is mentioned in both infamous Balfour Declaration (1917) and statements of prominent Zionist leaders. In Balfour Declaration, Palestinian Arabs are characterized as “non-Jewish community.”²⁴³ But one of the most striking declaration of non-existence of Arabs was Israel’s ex-Prime Minister Golda Meir’s statement: “It was not as though there was a Palestinian people... and we came and threw them out and took their country away from them. They did not exist.”²⁴⁴

In this respect, Palestinian national movement or Arab states that claimed the leadership of Arabs has tried to define what Palestinian identity is and struggle for historical Palestine also has shaped with this debate. For example, after the UN Partition Plan of Palestine (1947), Arab heads of states met to assess the situation and in the end they declared that their goal is “obstructing the partition plan, preventing the creation of a Jewish state, and preserving Palestine as an independent unified

²⁴² Gregory Harms and Todd M. Ferry, *The Palestine Israel Conflict A Basic Introduction* (London: Pluto Press, 2008), 51.

²⁴³ Ibid, 69.

²⁴⁴ Helene Cobban, *The Palestinian Liberation Organisation People, Power and Politics* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984).

Arab state.”²⁴⁵ At his moment, struggle for Palestine changed its course from a inter-communal conflict to a inter-state war.²⁴⁶ Before the partition and declaration of an independent State of Israel, i.e. during the British Mandate (1920-1948), Palestinian question was a conflict between native Arabs and migrant Jews, or between Arabs and British troops, or between Jewish guerrillas and British troops.

The most important consequence of independent Israel was the exodus of Palestinians. Palestinians were uprooted from their ancestral homeland and took refuge in neighbor Arab countries, especially in Egypt, Jordan, Lebanon, and Syria. This exodus (*Al-Nakba*) designated the whole Palestinian identity and later Palestinian political movement. According to Said, the exodus created a split in the Palestinian community, while the Palestinians uprooted from their land and took shelter in the other countries mostly tended to see themselves within general Arab politics, the Palestinians stayed in occupied territories or Israel found themselves cut from Arab world.²⁴⁷ Once the famous Palestinian leader Yasser Arafat stated that their struggle “is the hardest revolution of modern times because it is not just a movement for national liberation, it is also one waged by a people 40 percent of whom are in exile.”²⁴⁸

The first Arab exodus was mostly consist of upper and middle classes of Palestinian community.²⁴⁹ One of the remarkable points of class differentiation of the Palestinian people was the ideological strife between settled middle-class/professionals and villagers which the former community tended to support pan-Arab thought, while the latter was a staunch support base for the PLO’s “Palestine first” approach.²⁵⁰ The

²⁴⁵ Efraim Karsh, *Palestine War 1948* (Oxford: Osprey Publishing, 2002), 30.

²⁴⁶ Ibid, 34.

²⁴⁷ Edward W. Said, *The Question of Palestine* (New York: Vintage Books, 1980), 117.

²⁴⁸ Helene Cobban, *ibid*, 253.

²⁴⁹ Benny Morris, *The Birth of Palestinian Refugee Problem Revisited* (Cambridge: Cambridge university Press, 2004), 67.

²⁵⁰ Helene Cobban, *ibid*, 40.

theme of “The Return” was the main political motive of the PLO and its support base for decades.

The military impotence of Arab states against Israel, the maltreatment of the hosting neighbor countries and the hope of “The Return”, and also rapid high education rates amongst in-exile Palestinian youth generated a new Palestinian generation who broke up with universalist ideologies such as pan-Arabism, communism or political Islam. *Filastinuna* (the first periodical of *Fatah* movement, means in Arabic “Our Palestine”) was the main and -maybe- only ideological motive of those young Palestinians who grew up in exile, especially the neighbor Arab countries which had been trying to lead the whole Arab world. Arab states, especially Egypt, Jordan, and Syria become more and more involved in Palestinian issue, both through Palestinian refugees, and Palestinian lands that Israel did not occupy yet, i.e. Gaza Strip and West Bank. Each country, mainly Egypt and Jordan due to their territorial sovereignty, (Gaza was belonged to Egypt and West Bank was belonged to Jordan until 1967) had had powerful restrictions on Palestinians. Also, Jordan and Egypt, had been strictly monitoring the Muslim Brotherhood in Gaza and West Bank. The first palpable organization in those two regions was the Brotherhood.²⁵¹

A student in Cairo University, who leaded Palestinian students tried to contact the Muslim Brotherhood to establish an armed wing of the organization. The student was Yasser Arafat, and although he served in the Egyptian army during the Suez Crisis (1956), he developed the “Palestine first” approach with his comrade-in-arms, and his approach to the Brotherhood was not ideological, but just pragmatic and organizational.²⁵² This pragmatic approach of newborn Fatah movement can clearly seen in its 1958 Charter. It refers “religion” just one time, and has no specific mention to Islam: "Liberating Palestine and protecting its holy places is an Arab,

²⁵¹ Dag Tuastad, “ Hamas-PLO Relations Before and After the Arab Spring,” *Middle East Policy Council*, September 17, 2013, <http://www.mepc.org/hamas-plo-relations-and-after-arab-spring>.

²⁵² Ibid.

religious and human obligation."²⁵³ This "Palestine first" doctrine was not only exclude Islamist current which sees Palestine (and mainly Jerusalem) is the center of *Ummah*, but also clashed with Arab unity or pan-Arabism.

According to young Arafat and his *Filastinuna*, 1948 Arab-Israeli War and expansion of Israel had showed that the Arab states could not capable of defeating Israel.²⁵⁴ Fatah cadres did not believe an Arab *blitzkreig* against Israel, and they did not trust the capability of the Arab armies.²⁵⁵ Instead, *Filastinuna* sought for a guerrilla warfare against Israel from neighboring Arab countries, because both Israel was militarily on alarm in its territories and West Bank (before 1967) belonged to Jordan and the military situation was not secure.²⁵⁶ So, the newborn movement insisted on a genuine Palestinian approach which aimed to liberate Palestine through armed struggle and wanted to rely on Palestinian self-organization, especially the diaspora and refugee camps in Arab countries. Those young Palestinians challenged the argument that "Arab unity is the road to the liberation of Palestine", instead they put the goal that the liberation of Palestine is the ultimate goal. This was the first and the most important shift in Palestinian movement: From Arab nationalism to Palestinian nationalism.²⁵⁷

This was the new reality and also reproduction of Palestinian class differentiation. Again, the Palestinian bourgeoisie lived in a different condition in diaspora with respect to those who lived in refugee camps in Jordan, Lebanon, and Syria. Most of Palestinian guerrillas that had killed by Israel and hosting Arab states were from refugee camps. Those Palestinian refugees were not only the subject of oppression by Israel, but also they had been harassed by Arab armies. Hence, Palestinian militancy

²⁵³ Ibid.

²⁵⁴ Jonathan Schanzer, *Hamas vs. Fatah The Struggle for Palestine* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), 16.

²⁵⁵ Helene Cobban, *ibid*, 27.

²⁵⁶ Ibid, 27.

²⁵⁷ Ibid, 24.

and nationalism was supported by peasantry and working-class Palestinians while Palestinian bourgeoisie tended to act in accordance with the other Arab states.²⁵⁸ A survey conducted in 1951-52 shows that Palestinian refugees' average annual income per capita dropped 20 percent with respect to 1944.²⁵⁹ Despite the thirst of "the Return", Palestinians in exile spent their first years to survive and adopted a stance that leaving the struggle for liberation of Palestine to Arab states.²⁶⁰ Still, during this 1948-1967 period, "a sense of being Palestinian" emerged across the refugee camps.²⁶¹ One of the most senior Fatah leaders, Farouq al-Qaddumi once stated that Fatah "represents the refugees" and the organization depends on the "refugee class."²⁶² Plus, although Palestinian nationalism resembled the old Palestinian movement of 1920s-1940s, the old Palestinian politicians disappeared from the scene and gave their seat to new generation, mostly came from poor or middle-class background.²⁶³

The PLO took the stage in March 1968 in Karamah, which is a Jordanian town where the PLO had a headquarters. Israeli forces heavily attacked the town, and despite the fact that the PLO guerrillas were defeated, the guerrilla movement showed the whole world and especially to Palestinians that armed struggle can damage Israel.²⁶⁴ In other words, "The battle at Karamah became an instant legend among Arabs, and thousands of young Arab nationalists flocked to Fatah and the resistance

²⁵⁸ Rosemary Sayigh, *The Palestinians: From Peasants to Revolutionaries* (New York: Zed Books, 2008), 103-104.

²⁵⁹ Ibid, 119.

²⁶⁰ Ibid, 113.

²⁶¹ Adam Ramadan, "A Refugee Landscape: Writing Palestinian Nationalisms in Lebanon," *ACME: An International Journal for Critical Geographies* 8, no. 1 (2009): 69-99.

²⁶² Helena Cobban, *ibid*, 198.

²⁶³ Rashid Khalidi, *Palestinian Identity: The Construction of Modern National Consciousness* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2010), 180.

²⁶⁴ W. Andrew Terrill, "The Political Mythology of the Battle of Karamah," *Middle East Journal* 55, no. 1 (Winter 2001): 91-111.

movement”,²⁶⁵ according to one of the PLO leaders “5,000 new recruits applied to join Fatah within the next 48 hours.”²⁶⁶ Now, the PLO had a military and political objective that “liberation of the whole of Palestine through armed struggle and the establishment of a democratic, secular state for Arabs and Jews.”²⁶⁷ While Palestinian national movement began to develop its military capacity, there was another advancement made its way: the PLO and its factions created and developed a civil network especially within refugee camps “to meet the social and economic needs of the Palestinian people.”²⁶⁸ Those institutions provided all kind of services to Palestinians, and in return Palestinians gave a wide range political and military support to the PLO.²⁶⁹ The Fatah network tied all social and economic programs to each other: Money from the Gulf and the other Arab states, taxes from the refugee camps, political and military activities from the occupied territories after 1967.²⁷⁰

4.3. Lebanon as a base for *Fedayeen*

The PLO’s main bases remained in Jordan and Lebanon, until infamous Black September (1970) and Battle of Beirut (1982), and the heart of the Palestinian armed struggle against Israel was no doubt, Lebanon.²⁷¹ After the expulsion from Jordan by Jordanian Army in 1970, the PLO focused on Lebanon to wage guerrilla attacks from south of the country, and also established a “state-in-state” through its institutions.

²⁶⁵ Gregory Harms, *The Palestine-Israel Conflict: A Basic Introduction* (London: Pluto Press, London, 2008), 118.

²⁶⁶ Cobban, *ibid*, 42.

²⁶⁷ Yezid Sayigh, “Palestinian Armed Struggle: Means and Ends,” *Journal of Palestine Studies* 16, no. 1 (Autumn 1986): 95-112.

²⁶⁸ Cheryl A. Rubenberg, “The Civilian Infrastructure of the Palestine Liberation Organization: An Analysis of the PLO in Lebanon Until June 1982,” *Journal of Palestine Studies* 12, no. 3 (Spring 1983): 55.

²⁶⁹ *Ibid*, 78.

²⁷⁰ Helene Cobban, *ibid*, 260.

²⁷¹ Laleh Khalili, “Commemorating Battles and Massacres in the Palestinian Refugee Camps of Lebanon,” *American Behavioral Scientist* 51, no. 11 (July 2008): 1562-1574.

As one observer stressed that the Palestinian nation owed its survival not only the PLO's military and political capability, but also "social institutions concerned with culture, health, education, welfare, information, economic development and mass organizations."²⁷² The Palestinian Red Crescent Society, The Sons of Martyrs Society, Planning Centre, The Palestinian Research Center, Social Affairs Organization were some institutions which the PLO founded in Lebanon.²⁷³ Many of those institutions services were halted or destroyed by Israeli occupation forces during the invasion of Lebanon.

The PLO and the Lebanese government cut a deal in 1969 in Cairo and agreed that while Lebanese army and government cannot intervene Palestinian camps in the country, Palestinian movement would not intervene Lebanese internal politics. However, Lebanon's fragile confessionalist political system did not allow this non-intervention politics. The first phase of Lebanese Civil War (1975-76) was almost purely a "Palestinian" color, with Maronites Christians. Nevertheless, the turning point was, again, Israel's occupation of Lebanon in 1982. During the siege of Beirut (lasted for 67 days), Israel sought for the expulsion of the PLO guerrillas and damaged not only military targets, but also civilian infrastructure of refugee camps, PLO networks and Lebanese infrastructure. Ultimately, the PLO fighters were evacuated from Beirut but after the evacuation Israeli army and Phalangist militias attacked the Palestinian refugee camps, namely Sabra and Shatila, killed over 1,200 Palestinians.²⁷⁴

In Lebanon, Palestinian refugees were one of the main losers of the Civil War and Israeli occupation. The Civil War raised the tension between Maronite community and Palestinians, and after the invasion of Israel, the same tension occurred between mostly Shiite Southern Lebanon residents and Palestinian guerillas. Moreover, when

²⁷² Rubenberg, *ibid*, 61.

²⁷³ Cobban, *ibid*, 14.

²⁷⁴ Cobban, *ibid*, 130.

the Civil War began, most of UNRWA and Lebanese state services ceased and the PLO took the charge of public services (such as electricity, security, hospitals, etc.) for both Palestinians and Lebanese. The organization actually run refugee camps; however, Lebanese people also benefit from those facilities served for refugees in camps. This reinforced the perception of “state within state.”²⁷⁵

After Israeli invasion of Lebanon, the PLO headquarters moved into Tunisia, and after the camp massacres, another phase in Palestinian national movement came to an end: Struggle against Israel from outside of Palestine was over. After that, Palestinian movement switched from outside refugee camps to occupied territories. Plus, armed struggle became an auxiliary component of the struggle beside mass movement, *Intifada*. Lastly, the First *Intifada* signified a new emerging force: Political Islam and Hamas.

4.4. Nationalism loses ground to Islamism

1967 Arab-Israeli War was a turning point for Arab nationalism. Of course, the notion of “being a part of the Arab world” did not exhausted; however, the most important aspect of Arab nationalism torn apart: Arab unity.²⁷⁶ The champion of the Arab nationalism, Nasser himself even admitted the defeat and stated that their duty after the war was to heal Egypt. Thus, the goal was revised: After 1967, Egypt’s main objective was to take care about Egypt (*wataniyye*), not Arab nation (*qawmiyye*).²⁷⁷ In addition to this, Nasser, who had been waging an “Arab Cold War” against his regional rivals such as Saudi Arabia, now economically surrendered to rich oil and pro-Western kingdoms of the Gulf.

²⁷⁵ Rashid Khalidi, *Under Siege: PLO Decisionmaking During the 1982 War* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2014), 126-130.

²⁷⁶ Adeed Dawisha, *Arab Nationalism in the Twentieth Century: From Triumph to Despair* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2016), 253.

²⁷⁷ Ibid, 255.

One of the most important consequences of the war was rise of the political Islam.²⁷⁸ For Islamists, “alien” ideologies like nationalism and socialism showed that they were incapable of defeating Zionism and imperialism, “the defeat was devastating because the margin of deviance from the faith was great.”²⁷⁹ While political Islam did not emerge merely after the 1967 defeat, it also did not took the political and social stage of Palestine readily. During 1970s, especially after 1973 Arab-Israeli War and Egypt’s Anwar Sadat’s willingness to make a peace treaty with Israel and the USA, the Israeli elections of 1977 and Judaization of historical Palestine, invasion of Lebanon and Christian Arabs’ cooperation with Israel, and finally, the Islamic Revolution in Iran fueled an “Islamic awakening” in the region, and especially in Lebanon and Palestine.²⁸⁰

PLO’s main support base, i.e. refugee camps, had become impoverished steadily after the expulsion of the PLO from Beirut. After the end of the Lebanese Civil War, with the Taif Agreement, Palestinian refugees’ basic civil and political rights were denied. Refugee camps’ services mostly were carrying out by UNRWA, however, “as a result of serious budget cuts and an alarming level of corruption within UNRWA’s administration” the life in the camps were deteriorated.²⁸¹ In Lebanon, unemployment in refugee camps had reached 95 percent.²⁸² According to an account, in Lebanon 60% of Palestinian youth do not get primary education, above 60% of

²⁷⁸ Dimitrios Machairas, “The strategic and political consequences of the June 1967 war,” *Cogent Social Sciences* 3, issue 1 (2017): 1-9.

²⁷⁹ Yvonne Haddad, “Islamists and the “Problem of Israel”: The 1967 Awakening,” *Middle East Journal* 46, no. 2 (Spring 1992): 267.

²⁸⁰ *Ibid*, 267.

²⁸¹ Zeina Halabi, “Exclusion and identity in Lebanon’s Palestinian refugee camps: a story of sustained conflict,” *Environment&Urbanization* 16, no 2 (October 2004): 42.

²⁸² *Ibid*, 43.

camp population do not reach clean water, and population density in camps are very high.²⁸³

Islamists saw the 1967 defeat as a defeat of secularism, and specially the Muslim Brotherhood took initiative step by step. Co-founder of Hamas Sheikh Ahmed Yassin was a well-known Brotherhood figure in Gaza. He admitted that Palestinian struggle must be “a phased struggle.”²⁸⁴ He was in support of building Islamic institution before armed struggle. And also, his growing movement’s first enemy was not Israel, but “communism.”²⁸⁵

The political transformation of the PLO, from “total liberation of Palestine” to “national government in the occupied territories” was already questioned by Palestinian “rejectionists”, such as Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine (PFLP). PFLP criticized the PLO for its “surrenderist” tendency and rejected its readiness for a political settlement with Israel.²⁸⁶ But the real challenge against the PLO came from an Islamist organization that emerged two months after the First *Intifada*.

Hamas (the acronym for *Harakat al-Muqawama al-Islamiyya*, The Islamic Resistance Movement) was founded in December 1987 and to put itself solely against the PLO’s political and ideological position. Hamas’ first political program announced in 1988, and it rejected PLO’s new political program that appeared on the horizon.²⁸⁷ Later in that year, the PLO-dominated Palestinian National Council

²⁸³ Sari Hanafi, “Palestinian Refugee Camps in Lebanon: Laboratories of State-in-the-Making, Discipline and Islamist Radicalism,” in *Thinking Palestine*, ed. Ronit Lentin (London and New York: Zed Books, 2008), 84-85.

²⁸⁴ Dag Tuastad, “ Hamas-PLO Relations Before and After the Arab Spring,” *Middle East Policy Council*, September 17, 2013, <http://www.mepc.org/hamas-plo-relations-and-after-arab-spring>.

²⁸⁵ Ibid.

²⁸⁶ Cobban, *ibid*, 62.

²⁸⁷ Menachem Klein, “Competing brothers: The web of Hamas-PLO relations,” *Terrorism and Political Violence* 8, no. 2 (1996): 111-132.

accepted 1947 UN Partition Plan, therefore it declared that the body was ready to recognize the State of Israel. Hamas signified the Islamization of the Palestinian cause with stating that “The Palestinian cause is not about land and soil, but it is about faith and belief.”²⁸⁸ While Yasser Arafat and the PLO gained international recognition with their acceptance of the two-state solution, in occupied territories, namely West Bank and Gaza Strip, Hamas seized the opportunity to challenge the leadership of the PLO for its weakness against Israel.²⁸⁹ Before the First *Intifada*, the Muslim Brotherhood in the occupied territories, especially in Gaza, had managed to establish its network due to its abstain of armed struggle, therefore Israel turned a blind eye to Brotherhood’s activities.²⁹⁰ The religious endowments *waqf* gave the organization “real estate” power, but the Brotherhood’s real impact was on mosques: between 1967 and 1987, the number of mosques in the West Bank rose from 400 to 750, in the Gaza Strip from 200 to 600.²⁹¹ Islamists rejected pan-Arabism and Palestinian secular nationalism, and Sheikh Ahmed Yassin’s 1973-born umbrella organization *Islamic Collective* had established a network around mosques and schools, and in 1978, “Israeli military allowed the Islamic Collective to register as an official charitable organization”, despite prohibition of the PLO-affiliated institutions.²⁹²

Hamas took an aggressive stand against Israel and PLO’s peace compromises. Later, Hamas (and the other Islamist groups such as Palestinian Islamic Jihad) rejected the participation of Palestinian factions and Arab states in Middle East Peace Conference in Madrid (1991), after Oslo Accords, and Palestinian-Israeli Declaration of

²⁸⁸ Meir Litvak, “The Islamization of the Palestinian-Israeli Conflict: The case of Hamas,” *Middle Eastern Studies* 34, no. 1 (January 1998): 148-163.

²⁸⁹ Jonathan Schanzer, “The Challenge of Hamas to Fatah,” *Middle East Quarterly*, (Spring 2003): 29-38.

²⁹⁰ Ziad Abu-Amr, “Hamas: A Historical and Political Background,” *Journal of Palestine Studies* 22, no. 4 (Summer 1993): 7-8.

²⁹¹ *Ibid*, 8.

²⁹² Loren D. Lybarger, *Identity and Religion in Palestine The Struggle Between Islamism and Secularism in the Occupied Territories* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2007), 80-81.

Principles (1994).²⁹³ Hamas rejected “peace process” and declared that “self-government” offered “a death sentence” to the Palestinian people.²⁹⁴ Hamas continued to carry out attacks against Israeli targets, and even deepen its hostility towards Fatah and the PLO.²⁹⁵ Despite this fact, Hamas did not declare a total war against the Palestinian National Authority (PNA). The Islamic organization had mostly avoided a civil war, but after 2006 elections, the Palestinian factions were on the brink of a total civil war. During 1990s, PA tried to control Islamist NGOs, most of them were affiliated with Hamas, although the movement rejected this claim.²⁹⁶

The new turning points were the Second *Intifada* (alias *al-Aqsa Intifada*) and the 2006 elections. The breakout of the Second *Intifada*, occurred right after the collapse of the “peace process” and ongoing Judaization of Islamic holy places boosted the popularity of Hamas amongst Palestinians. This rise was confirmed in 2006, when elections for the second Palestinian Legislative Council were held. Hamas won the elections, and at the end of the March, Hamas leader Ismael Haniyye formed a new government. The achievement of Hamas was related with these factors: The rejection of “peace process”, mistrust of PA’s political and also corrupt system, social networks for Palestinians.²⁹⁷ Despite Fatah movement did not want to hand over the governmental institutions to Hamas, in June 2007, Hamas militarily took over Gaza Strip.

To sum up, Palestinian cause passed four stages: i) inter-community strife during the British mandate between Palestinian Arabs and Zionist Jews; ii) after 1947 UN

²⁹³ Ali al-Jarbawi, “The Position of Palestinian Islamists on the Palestine-Israel Accord,” *The Muslim World* 84, issue 1-2 (April 1994): 127–154.

²⁹⁴ Michael Irving Jensen, *The Political Ideology of Hamas: A Grassroots Perspective* (London: I.B. Tauris, London, 2009), 19.

²⁹⁵ Ibid, 20.

²⁹⁶ Ibid, 28.

²⁹⁷ Jonathan Schanzer, *Hamas vs. Fatah The Struggle for Palestine* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008), 96-97.

partition plan and foundation of the State of Israel, Palestine became a field of an Arab-Israeli warfare, and implementation of Arab unity; iii) with 1967 Arab-Israeli War and defeat of Arab armies, Arab nationalism eroded and Palestinian nationalism rose, the PLO and guerrilla warfare dragged alone; iv) after Israeli invasion of Lebanon, expulsion of PLO from Beirut, and the First Intifada, Palestinian national movement clearly shifted its course from secular nationalism to political Islam. Jihadist elements in Palestinian refugee camps started to surge the Palestinian cause at this fourth stage.

4.5. War of camps

After the foundation of the state of Israel, in 1948, Palestinians were uprooted from their lands and sought for refugee in neighboring countries such as Lebanon, Jordan, Syria, and Egypt. Palestinians who fled to Syria were mostly the northern part of Palestine, especially Jaffa and Haifa.²⁹⁸ According to UNRWA data, there are 9 official Palestinian camps, and 3 unofficial Palestinian campuses along Syria. Registered refugees are 618,128²⁹⁹. The largest and the most populous camp is Yarmouk in Damascus, which was established in 1957 and before 2011 crisis hosted 148,500 refugees. In case of Lebanon, there are around 530,000 registered refugees in 12 official camps. The most populous camps are Ain al-Hilwah in Southern Lebanon and Nahr al-Bared in Northern Lebanon, respectively.³⁰⁰

While Syria and Jordan offer relatively good conditions for Palestinian refugees, especially in labor market and education, in Lebanon discrimination against Palestinian refugees has legally and socially transformed from bad to worse. An inquiry suggests that unemployment and poverty in Lebanese camps surpassed the

²⁹⁸ “Where We Work,” *UNRWA*, January “, 2011, <https://www.unrwa.org/where-we-work/syria>.

²⁹⁹ “UNRWA Fields of Operations Map,” accessed April 13, 2018, https://www.unrwa.org/sites/default/files/content/resources/unrwa_fields_of_operations_map_2017.pdf.

³⁰⁰ Ibid.

Syrian and Jordanian ones. After the expulsion of the PLO from Lebanon, unemployment rate had skyrocketed due to most of Palestinians were employed by the PLO bureaucracy. Moreover, the right to return and opposing the Palestinian settlement in Lebanon (“*tawteen*”) have been other factors that causing the discrimination against Palestinian refugees in Lebanon.³⁰¹ Destroying PLO’s infrastructure and decreasing Gulf aid during the 1980s merged with the First *Intifada* within the occupied territories and the Oslo Accord which forced to turn Palestinian attention from diaspora/refugee camps to Palestine.

Decline of the PLO and Palestinian nationalism and the rise of militant Islamism and jihadism corroborates the broader course across the Middle East. After Israeli invasion of Lebanon, the PLO fighters mobilized to defend Beirut, and inside camps in the southern part of Lebanon Islamist militia took charge of the resistance against the Israeli occupation.³⁰² PLO’s intention to reach a compromise with Israel, and rise of rejectionist forces in refugee camps merged with Syria and Iran’s position against PLO’s two-state solution policy. The Islamist circles took advantage of the absence of the PLO, deteriorating conditions in camps, and re-Islamize the Palestinian identity, adopted a religio-political stance which depicted Palestinians as a part of Muslim community. Moreover, Palestinian camps’ unique position gave Islamism another boost due to the lack of state control. Camps were funded by Salafist-jihadist figures from the Gulf (and more or less, Iran), and Salafist preachers redirected their discourse from occupiers to Shiites. They especially targeted Palestinian youth and women through educational training. The aim was to bring up a new pious generation who would struggle for liberation of the Muslim *ummah* with purely Islamic discourse. Therefore, Palestinian cause placed within a broader Islamic context. To strengthen this discourse, religious training indoctrinated the youth as

³⁰¹ Sari Hanafi, Jad Chaaban and Karin Seyfert, “Social Exclusion of Palestinian Refugees in Lebanon: Reflections on the Mechanisms that Cement their Persistent Poverty,” *Refugee Survey Quarterly* 31, no. 1 (January 2012): 34–53.

³⁰² Bernard Rougier, *Everyday Jihad: The Rise of Militant Islam Among Palestinians in Lebanon* (Cambridge and London: Harvard University Press, 2007), 44.

being better than other Palestinian and Lebanese community.³⁰³ In Ain al-Helweh and Nahr al-Barid camps, donors from Kuwait, UAE and Saudi Arabia funded schools, mosques, and social services for Palestinian community through Islamist groups. The decentralized structure of financial services gave momentum to jihadist groups, such as Usbat al-Ansar.³⁰⁴

As indicated before, Palestinian jihadist Abdallah Azzam was the most important henchman who internationalized jihadist cause via Afghan jihad. Azzam did not only recruit Arab jihadists for Afghan jihad against the USSR, but also he redirected the Palestinian youth from the PLO-affiliated groups to the jihadist organizations.³⁰⁵ The occupation and the reality of homelessness made easy the Palestinian jihadists to make jihad international.³⁰⁶ Moreover, Palestinian workers who were working in the Gulf states learnt Wahhabi version of Islam, and especially after the First Gulf War, expulsion of the Palestinian workers from the Gulf accelerated the spread of Salafi thinking amongst the Palestinian refugees. Jihadists from other nationalities using transnational jihadist network settled and enjoyed relative freedom inside camps and imposed religious way of life on camp residents. Jihadist network changed the Palestinian identity with evaluating Palestinian cause within a broader global jihad context. In Lebanon, due to the Syrian dominance over political sphere, jihadist groups adopted a neutral stance vis-a-vis Israel and its adversaries, such as Hezbollah. This political stance with its sectarian aspect against Shiites and Alawites, later paved the way for all-out war against the other Palestinian factions, Lebanese security forces, the other sects in Lebanon, and the Syrian government. Jihadist groups like Usbat al-Ansar, Jund al-Sham, and Fatah al-Islam had responsibilities of assassinations of secular-leftist Palestinian figures. However, some Palestinians

³⁰³ Ibid, 61.

³⁰⁴ Ibid, 64-65.

³⁰⁵ Ibid, 75.

³⁰⁶ Thomas Hegghammer and Joas Wagemakers, "The Palestine Effect: The Role of Palestinians in the Transnational Jihad Movement," *Welt des Islams* 53, no: 3-4 (2013): 281-314.

believe that these jihadist group, especially in Nahr al-Bared camp, injected from outside.³⁰⁷

In 2007, a jihadist group affiliated with Al-Qaeda, Fatah al-Islam engaged a four-month long war with Lebanese security forces in Nahr al-Bared Palestinian refugee camp near Tripoli. The war ended with almost total destruction of the camp and 446 casualties. The opposition in Lebanon blamed Saudi Arabia and its main main in Lebanon, Saad Hariri for supporting Fatah al-Islam a counterweight against Hezbollah.³⁰⁸ Despite the fact that relationship between Al Qaeda and Fatah al-Islam ambiguous, after Nahr al-Bared battle, Al Qaeda leadership called to support the group.³⁰⁹ Fatah al-Islam's first leader al-Abbsi had good relations with the leader of Al Qaeda in Iraq, Abu Musab al-Zarqawi. There is a report about former Nusra Front, now Hayat Tahrir al-Sham leader Abu Muhammad al-Golani briefly visited Lebanon in 2006 to support Jund al-Sham, another Palestinian jihadist group in Ayn al-Hilweh. Jund al-Sham merged with Fatah al-Islam and boosted the latter's militant capabilities.³¹⁰ A Fatah al-Islam affiliated figure, Bilal Badr and his group attacked Fatah in Ain al-Hilweh camp in 2017, and there were rumors that this group was affiliated with Hayat Tahrir al-Sham which has been operating in Syria against Bashar al-Assad, an offshoot organization of Al Qaeda.³¹¹

³⁰⁷ Rami Siklawi, "The Dynamics of Palestinian Political Endurance in Lebanon," *Middle East Journal* 64, no. 4 (Autumn 2010): 597-611.

³⁰⁸ Muhammad Ali Khalidi and Diane Riskedahl, "The Road to Nahr al-Barid: Lebanese Political Discourse and Palestinian Civil Rights," *Middle East Report*, no. 244 (Fall 2007), <http://www.mafhoum.com/press10/306S26.htm>.

³⁰⁹ Rebecca Bloom, "Fatah al-Islam," *Council on Foreign Relations*, June 8, 2007, <https://www.cfr.org/backgrounder/fatah-al-islam>.

³¹⁰ "Mapping Militant Organizations, Fatah al-Islam", *Stanford University*, August 11, 2014, <http://web.stanford.edu/group/mappingmilitants/cgi-bin/groups/view/17>.

³¹¹ Mona Alami, "Who is behind new round of violence in Lebanon refugee camp?," *Al Monitor*, April 13, 2017, <https://www.al-monitor.com/pulse/originals/2017/04/lebanon-ain-al-hilweh-palestinian-camp-jihadist-nucleus.html>.

In 2008, there were reports about raising support for Al Qaeda in Iraq's slain leader al-Zarqawi in Palestinian refugee camps. Lebanon's tense sectarian situation and camps' relatively free space intermingled with regional powers' (i.e., Jordan, Kuwait, and Saudi Arabia) ambition to counterbalance Hezbollah and Iran. Moreover, Lebanese security officials claimed at that time that Hariri's Future Movement and some Saudi princes were working with Sunni groups affiliated with Al Qaeda ideology.³¹²

4.6. Palestinians in the Syrian Jihad

After the breakout of the Syrian crisis, Palestinian factions' main policy was impartiality. Although one of the Palestinian official called the clashes as "internal matter of Syria"³¹³, Palestinian factions began to take sides, Free Syrian Army (FSA) started to arm Palestinians against the Syrian army, and a very critical shift, Hamas turned its back to one of its main backers, Bashar al-Assad and declared its sympathy towards anti-government groups.³¹⁴ The headquarter of Hamas had been Damascus after its leaders expelled from Amman, and Syrian government -with Tehran- was on of the main supporters of Hamas against Israel.³¹⁵ Hamas filled the vacuum in refugee camps due to the PLO's expulsion from Lebanon in 1982, and 1993 Oslo Accords which after that the PLO leadership focused on West Bank and Gaza. The organization established social networks along camps in Syria and "present itself as

³¹² Mitchell Prothero, "Lebanon May Attract Sunnis Seeking to Wage Jihad," *US News*, May 15, 2008, <http://www.usnews.com/news/world/articles/2008/05/15/lebanon-may-attract-sunnis-seeking-to-wage-jihad>. Another report claimed that in 2008, Al Qaeda was sending its militants to wage jihad in Lebanon. See, Robert Fisk, "Al-Qa'ida sends its warriors from Iraq to wage 'jihad' in Lebanon," *The Independent*, August 15, 2008, <https://www.independent.co.uk/voices/commentators/fisk/robert-fisk-al-qaida-sends-its-warriors-from-iraq-to-wage-jihad-in-lebanon-897557.html>.

³¹³ "Syrian rebels arm Palestinians against Assad," *Reuters*, October 31, 2012, <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-syria-crisis-palestinians/syrian-rebels-arm-palestinians-against-assad-idUSBRE89U1I320121031>.

³¹⁴ "Hamas ditches Assad, backs Syrian revolt," *Reuters*, February 24, 2012, <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-syria-palestinians/hamas-ditches-assad-backs-syrian-revolt-idUSTRE81N1CC20120224>.

³¹⁵ Valentina Napolitano, "Hamas and the Syrian Uprising: A Difficult Choice," *Middle East Policy* 20, no. 3 (Fall 2013): 73.

the sole defender of refugee rights.”³¹⁶ After Hamas’ declaration of support to anti-Assad groups in Syria, rumors began to spread that Hamas was training anti-Assad groups in Syria, especially around Aleppo and Damascus.³¹⁷ In one occasion, a Hamas member killed in Idlib while was fighting against the Syrian army. A Palestinian source from Ain al-Helweh states that “it was common knowledge” that Hamas members had been operating with FSA in Yarmouk and Neirab refugee camps.³¹⁸ Although the organization denied its involvement, it admitted that the man killed was a Hamas member before he deserted the organization. In 2015, Syrian President Bashar al-Assad claimed that in Yarmouk Camp Hamas was supporting Al Qaeda’s Syrian wing Al Nusra Front against ISIL.³¹⁹ Another claim was a Hamas-affiliated group in Yarmouk Camp, *Aknaf Beit al-Maqdes* aligned with anti-Assad groups in Syria.³²⁰ An Al Qaeda-affiliated Syrian anti-Assad group, *Ahrar al-Sham*, once stated that that received help from their “brothers in Gaza”, but not specifically mention to Hamas.³²¹ According to a Palestinian journalist, the militants that fighting with Islamist factions of Syria were not *in* Gaza, but *from* Gaza and most of them

³¹⁶ Ibid, 74.

³¹⁷ “Hamas reportedly training rebels, fighting to oust Assad,” *Times of Israel*, April 5, 2013, http://www.timesofisrael.com/hamas-reportedly-training-rebels-fighting-to-oust-assad/?fb_comment_id=630828176933510_92824888#f35190511c1a89c. Al Qaeda affiliated group Ahrar al-Sham stated that Hamas taught them how to protect tunnels from the army attack. See, Mamoon Alabbasi, “How did Hamas’s military expertise end up with Syria’s rebels?”, *Middle East Eye*, May 22, 2015, <https://www.middleeasteye.net/news/how-did-hamass-military-expertise-end-syrias-rebels>.

³¹⁸ “Hamas training Syrian rebels in Damascus,” *Ynet*, May 4, 2013, <https://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4364337,00.html>.

³¹⁹ “Assad: Syria has ‘no relation at all’ with Hamas,” *Ma’an News*, April 19, 2015, <http://www.maannews.com/Content.aspx?id=760573>.

³²⁰ Caleb Weiss, “Islamic State releases photos from Yarmouk Palestinian refugee camp in Damascus,” *Long War Journal*, April 5, 2015, <https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2015/04/islamic-state-releases-photos-from-yarmouk-palestinian-refugee-camp-in-damascus.php>.

³²¹ Mamoon Alabbasi, “How did Hamas’s military expertise end up with Syria’s rebels?”, *Middle East Eye*, May 22, 2015, <http://www.middleeasteye.net/news/how-did-hamass-military-expertise-end-syrias-rebels-1129524334>.

were ex-members of Izzeddine Qassam Brigades, armed wing of Hamas. He claimed that they split up from Hamas and went to Syria to join anti-Assad fight.³²²

The first batch of Palestinian militants who fight against the Syrian government joined Al Qaeda's Syrian wing Al Nusra Front.³²³ They traveled to Syria from Gaza, and Palestinian camps in Lebanon. A Palestinian jihadist in Syria, Abu Mohammad al-Filistini and his unit "Saraya Ghuraba Filistin" urged Palestinian jihadists from Lebanon, especially from Ain al-Helweh to join "jihad" against Bashar al-Assad.³²⁴ However, there were reports that after al-Filistini's death (March 2018) in Latakia, Syria, the group unable to continue its operations. Moreover, Lebanese authorities and other Palestinian factions from camps has co-operated to prevent jihadists to smuggle into Syria since 2017. According to a report, most jihadists from Ain al-Helweh left the camp. Also, after disagreement with Hayat Tahrir al-Sham, the new "official" Al Qaeda branch in Syria, *Huras al-Din*, has attracted Palestinian jihadists.³²⁵ In 2014, a Lebanese prosecutor charged 15 people for receiving military training in Ain al-Helweh camp and Syria to attack against a security official.³²⁶ In early 2019, Lebanese security officials arrested a jihadist figure from Ain al-Helweh

³²² Ibid.

³²³ Kyle Orton, "What Role Do The Palestinians Play In The Jihad In Syria And Iraq?," *The Syrian Intifada*, September 6, 2014, <https://kyleorton1991.wordpress.com/2014/09/06/what-role-do-the-palestinians-play-in-the-jihad-in-syria-and-iraq/>.

³²⁴ Caleb Weiss, "Palestinian jihadist group in Syria issues call to arms to refugee camp in Lebanon," *Long War Journal*, February 6, 2018, <https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2018/02/palestinian-jihadist-group-in-syria-directs-message-to-refugee-camp-in-lebanon.php>. This is a sub-unit of an Uighur-origin group called Katibat al Ghuraba al Turkistan. See, Caleb Weiss, "Uighur group in Syria creates Palestinian sub-unit," *Long War Journal*, January 25, 2018, <https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2018/01/uighur-group-in-syria-creates-palestinian-sub-unit.php>.

³²⁵ Mazen Radwan, "Depleted Palestinian Militants Back in Lebanon from Syria," *7D News*, February 5, 2019, <https://7dnews.com/news/depleted-palestinian-militants-back-in-lebanon-from-syria>.

³²⁶ Terror suspects charged following Army raids, *The Daily Star*, June 27, 2014, <https://www.dailystar.com.lb/News/Lebanon-News/2014/Jun-27/261777-terror-suspects-charged-following-army-raids.ashx#axzz35mf9UXc1> (Accessed on August 3, 2019).

who affiliated with Al Nusra Front in the camp.³²⁷ Ain al-Helweh³²⁸ and Nahr al-Bared, two prominent refugee camps in Lebanon were the main pillars of jihadist movement along Lebanon and the Levant.³²⁹ According to one source, “Palestinians refugees... act as a bridge between Lebanese radicals and Syrian radical organizations” and Al-Fatah officials believe that refugee camps had become a bed for sleeper cells.³³⁰ Usbat al-Ansar and Fatah al-Islam were the most famous Palestinian jihadist organizations in camps of Lebanon. Usbat al-Ansar’s leader Abu Muhjin had fought in Iraq against the US occupation with al-Zarqawi.³³¹ These two organizations have recruited militants across the region to fight in Iraq, Syria, and Yemen. However, some Palestinian groups such as Fatah al-Islam established wings in Syria to wage jihad against Assad. Fatah al-Islam created a group named “Al Khilafah Brigades” and its leader was killed in Syria in 2012.³³² A former Fatah al-Islam leader, Khaled Mahmoud is the founder of Jund al-Sham group in Syria, and recruited militants from Bab al-Tabbanah neighborhood, in Tripoli. According to a Salafi sheikh, Lebanese jihadists mostly fought with Ahrar al-Sham and al-Fajr Movement.³³³ Also, ISIL appointed in 2014 a new “emir” for Lebanon, Palestinian

³²⁷ “The Directorate of Intelligence turned in the Palestinian Mahmoud Ali Ward to the relevant judiciary,” accessed August 4, 2019, <https://www.lebarmy.gov.lb/en/content/directorate-intelligence-turned-palestinian-mahmoud-ali-ward-relevant-judiciary>.

³²⁸ A Palestinian jihadist figure from Ain al-Helweh was killed in Syria, see Caleb Weiss, “Al Qaeda-linked Lebanese jihadist eulogizes Palestinian figure killed in Syria,” *Long War Journal*, February 28, 2018, <https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2018/02/al-qaeda-linked-lebanese-jihadist-eulogizes-palestinian-figure-killed-in-syria.php>.

³²⁹ Bernard Rougier, *ibid*, 75.

³³⁰ Mona Alami, “The Impact of the Syria Conflict on Salafis and Jihadis in Lebanon,” *Middle East Institute, Middle East Policy Focus* 3, (April 2014), 7, https://www.mei.edu/sites/default/files/publications/Alami%20Policy%20Focus_0.pdf.

³³¹ Nasser Chararah, “Salafist Factions on Rise at Palestinian Camp in Lebanon,” *Al Monitor*, March 13, 2013, http://www.american taskforce.org/daily_news_article/2013/03/13/salafist_factions_rise_palestinian_camp_lebanon.

³³² Bill Roggio, “Fatah al Islam emir killed while waging jihad in Syria,” *Long War Journal*, September 5, 2012, https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2012/09/fatah_al_islam_emir.php.

³³³ “Khaled Mahmoud: A Prisoner in Lebanon Turns Emir in Syria,” *The Syria Times*, January 5, 2013, <http://syriatimes.sy/index.php/arab-and-foreign-press/2054-khaled-mahmoud-a-prisoner-in-lebanon-turns-emir-in-syria>.

origin Abdul Salam al-Ordoni.³³⁴ Al Nusra Front had become stronger when its core Syrian leadership merged with prominent Palestinian and Lebanese jihadists.³³⁵ An Al Nusra Front offshoot, Jund al-Aqsa was also founded by a Palestinian citizen of Jordan, Abu Abdulaziz al-Qatari. Al-Qatari was a jihadist veteran of Afghanistan, and was claimed to be a close associate of Osama bin Laden, Ayman al-Zawahiri, and Abdullah Azzam.³³⁶ Moreover, due to the split of Palestinian community in Yarmouk Camp, a group established to fight against those pro-Assad Popular Front for the Liberation of Palestine - General Command (PFLP - GC).³³⁷ A report stated that most of Palestinian jihadists fighting in Syria have been operating with Al Nusra Front.³³⁸ Another group which Palestinians fought with was al-Fajr Islamic Movement. The group fought alongside Al Nusra Front and had some Palestinians killed in various battles. It should be noted that nearly all of these jihadists were former members of Hamas or its armed wing Izzeddine Qassam Brigades.³³⁹

Up to now, Palestinian groups which have been operating or the groups that Palestinians have been fighting in Syria against the Syrian government were below:

³³⁴ Lisa Lundquist, "Lebanon," *The Long War Journal*, June 29, 2014, http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2014/06/the_islamic_state_of_iraq_140.php.

³³⁵ Elizabeth O'Bagy, "Jihad in Syria," *ISW*, 2012, <http://www.understandingwar.org/sites/default/files/Jihad-In-Syria-17SEPT.pdf>.

³³⁶ David Andrew Weinberg, "Analysis: Jund al-Aqsa's deep Gulf roots", *Long War Journal*, November 18, 2016, <https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2016/11/analysis-jund-al-aqsas-deep-gulf-roots.php> (Accessed on August 3rd, 2019). According to the same source, al-Qatari initially joined Ahrar al-Sham in Syria.

³³⁷ Syria rebels bring fight to pro-Assad Palestinians, *Reuters*, 31 October 2012, <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-syria-crisis-palestinians/syria-rebels-bring-fight-to-pro-assad-palestinians-idUSBRE89U0H320121031> (April 13th, 2018).

³³⁸ David Barnett and Bill Roggio, "Palestinian jihadist trainer killed fighting for Al Nusrah Front", *Long War Journal*, March 15, 2013, https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2013/03/palestinian_jihadist.php (April 13th, 2018).

³³⁹ David Barnett, "Jihadist media unit releases posters for Palestinian fighters killed in Syria", *Long War Journal*, October 1, 2013, https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2013/10/jihadist_media_unit_releases_p.php (Accessed on August 3, 2019).

- Al Nusra Front
- Islamic State of Iraq and Levant (ISIL)
- Hayat Tahrir al-Sham
- Al-Fajr Islamic Movement
- Ahrar al-Sham
- Jund al-Sham
- Fatah al-Islam
- Saraya Ghuraba Filistin
- Aknaf Beit al-Maqdes (Hamass affiliated)
- Yarmouk Martyrs Brigade
- Liwa al-Asifah (Affiliated with Golan Falcons)
- Liwa al-Ummah³⁴⁰

4.7. Motives of jihad

According to an estimation in 2013, jihadists number in Syria from Palestine, Lebanon, and Jordan were 74-114, 65-890, and 180-2,089, respectively.³⁴¹ An expert estimates that “scores of Salafists in Gaza” have joined Al Nusra Front and ISIL in Syria.³⁴² A survey from 2018 estimates that 900 foreign fighters travelled to Iraq and Syria from Lebanon.³⁴³ In 2014, Lebanese sources (including the interior minister)

³⁴⁰ This group was formed by a Libyan, Mahdi al-Harati, and consisted of jihadists from many countries, including Palestine. See Ms. J. Skidmore, “Foreign Fighter Involvement in Syria,” *IDC Herzliya*, January 2014, <https://i-hls.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/01/Foreign-Fighter-Involvement-in-Syria.pdf>.

³⁴¹ Aaron Y. Zelin, “Up to 11,000 foreign fighters in Syria; steep rise among Western Europeans,” *Washington Institute*, December 17, 2013, <http://icsr.info/2013/12/icsr-insight-11000-foreign-fighters-syria-steep-rise-among-western-europeans/>.

The inquiry does not separate Lebanese citizens, Jordanian citizens, and Palestinian refugees.

³⁴² Giorgio Cafiero, “Syria’s Civil War, Assad and the Palestinians,” *International Policy Digest*, April 3, 2014, <https://intpolicydigest.org/2014/04/03/syria-s-civil-war-assad-palestinians/>.

³⁴³ Elena Pokalova, “Driving Factors behind Foreign Fighters in Syria and Iraq,” *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism* 42, no. 9 (2019): 798-818. Another estimation from 2016 gives the same number for Lebanon. See, Edwin Bakker and Mark Singleton, “Foreign Fighters in the Syria and Iraq Conflict: Statistics and Characteristics of a Rapidly Growing Phenomenon,” in *Foreign Fighters Under*

claimed that number of Lebanese militants in Syria was between 200 and 300.³⁴⁴ In 2015, Salafi figures from Tripoli and Bakaa predicted that 800-1000 “Sunnis” from Lebanon had travelled to Syria to wage jihad.³⁴⁵ However, it is not easy to distinguish which jihadist was originally a Lebanese or a Palestinian camp resident. Also, due to camps’ relatively free situation vis-a-vis the Lebanese state and army, lots of non-Palestinian people and groups infiltrate them. For instance, a native from Tripoli, Shadi al-Mawlawi was the main recruiter of Lebanese and Palestinian jihadists in Ain al-Helweh camp in 2012. Also, Abdallah Azzam Brigades’ Saudi leader Majid al-Majid had hidden in Ain al-Helweh in 2013. A notorious Lebanese anti-Hezbollah preacher and his followers has been living in the camp since 2013.³⁴⁶ Nonetheless, some hints can be found that point out Palestinian jihadists. According to a report from 2013, there were 48 death notice of jihadists whose origin country was Lebanon which were announced by jihadist groups. Moreover, 24 of 48 Lebanese militants’ point of origin was Tripoli.³⁴⁷ Tripoli is the main hub in northern Lebanon for salafist-jihadist network, both with a Sunni community (famous Bab al-Tabbanah neighborhood) and Nahr al-Bared Palestinian refugee camp. It is possible to say that even if a jihadist was not a Palestinian, he could be found a safe haven in refugee camps or can be trained by a jihadist group in those camps. Lebanon is ranked four in accordance with the jihadist foreign fighters per country’s population (200 per million).³⁴⁸ A study which covers Jordanian foreign fighters in Syria and

International Law and Beyond, ed. Andrea de Gutty et al. (The Hague: T.M.C. Asser Press, 2016): 9-25.

³⁴⁴ Samya Kullab, “Lebanon wary of fighters returning from Syria,” *Al Jazeera*, July 21, 2014, <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/middleeast/2014/07/lebanon-wary-fighters-returning-from-syria-201472084326576297.html>.

³⁴⁵ Mona Alami, “The Rise of ISIS in Lebanon,” *Atlantic Council*, December 2, 2015, <https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/blogs/menasource/the-rise-of-isis-in-lebanon>.

³⁴⁶ Nicolas Dot-Pouillard, “Between Radicalization and Mediation Processes: a Political Mapping of Palestinian Refugee Camps in Lebanon,” *Civil Society Knowledge Center*, (October, 2015): 4.

³⁴⁷ Aaron Y. Zelin, “Up to 11,000 Foreign Fighters in Syria; Steep Rise Among Western Europeans,” *The Washington Institute*, December 17, 2013, <https://www.washingtoninstitute.org/policy-analysis/view/up-to-11000-foreign-fighters-in-syria-steep-rise-among-western-europeans>.

³⁴⁸ Efraim Benmelech and Esteban F. Klor, “What Explains the Flow of Foreign Fighters to ISIS?,” *NBER Working Paper Series*, no. 22190 (April 2016): 4.

Iraq states that the main region where the fighters come from was Zarqa, whose population is mostly Palestinian.³⁴⁹ In 2016, there were reports that around 30 Palestinians, all of them youngsters, smuggled from Ain al-Helweh to Raqqa, Syria to fight with ISIL.³⁵⁰

Palestinians who are from refugee camps and have been fighting alongside with jihadist groups mostly consist of Afghan-Soviet War *mujahideen*, or the new generation who have nothing to lose. According to one report, those Palestinians who have been fighting in Syria give their lives “a purpose”, and also, in Lebanon’s Ain al-Helweh Camp, the unemployment was around 80 percent.³⁵¹ One of the Fatah officials in camp stresses that “The Islamic groups are much more organized and have much more money” and the new generation occupy themselves either with drugs or jihad.³⁵² Plus, Lebanese officials point out that extremist elements in refugee camps have been collecting donations from people from the Gulf countries.³⁵³ According to one Fatah official from Ain al-Helweh Camp, in 2015, 52 Lebanese Palestinian refugees had killed in Syria who were fighting alongside with Al Nusra Front or ISIL, and their ages were differentiated between 17 to 20. The official assumes that the cause behind waging jihad in Syria was unemployment.³⁵⁴ According to another account, after clashes between the Syrian army and ISIL/Nusra in Palestinian Yarmouk Camp near Damascus, around 11,000 Palestinians and Syrians fled to Ain al-Helweh and there were some of jihadist militants inside those refugees. In Ain al-Helweh, it is claimed that jihadist network has an expertise on

³⁴⁹ Alberto Caballero Diez, “Jordanian Foreign Fighters in Syria and Iraq: how did they become radicalized and how they can be de-radicalized?,” *IEEE, Opinion Document*, no. 68 (July 2016): 3.

³⁵⁰ Erling Sogge, “Negotiating Jihad in Ain al-Hilweh,” *Carnegie Endowment For International Peace*, May 25, 2016, <https://carnegieendowment.org/sada/63670>.

³⁵¹ Maria Abi-Habib, “Young Palestinian Refugees Join Jihadists Fighting in Syria,” *Wall Street Journal*, November 20, 2013, <https://www.wsj.com/articles/no-headline-available-1384378326# = .>

³⁵² Ibid.

³⁵³ Ibid.

³⁵⁴ Ruth Pollard, “Palestinian camp in Lebanon named as one corner of jihadist 'death triangle',” *The Sydney Morning Herald*, February 13, 2015, <https://www.smh.com.au/world/palestinian-camp-in-lebanon-named-as-one-corner-of-jihadist-death-triangle-20150213-13dw4w.html>.

recruiting “disenfranchised youth” due to lack of confidence to the traditional Palestinian leadership and Palestinian social and economic expulsion from Lebanon. Moreover, new refugee influx has increased the burden the relief organizations which have been operating inside camps.³⁵⁵

Motives of jihadists differ from one country to another. For instance, having looked at Jordanian-Palestinian jihadists in Syria and Iraq, the effect of poverty and unemployment was too complicated. A survey indicates that unemployment or poverty does not the main motive for Zarqa in particular (unemployment rates were the lowest in Jordan in 2013, 2014, and 2015), and Jordan in general. The militants had different socioeconomic backgrounds and the main motive to wage jihad in Syria for them was “to protect Sunnis against [Alawite] Bashar al-Assad.” Moreover, Jordanian jihadists’ motivation did not religion-driven.³⁵⁶ A research that covers the foreign jihadists finds that although some scholars challenge about socioeconomic factors, the main portion of foreign fighters are relatively uneducated and coming from low-level strata.³⁵⁷ According to one approach, ISIL was appealing to the “marginalized youth” in Lebanon, and the same trend could be seen amongst Palestinian youth in Ain al-Helweh camp, and Lebanese security apparatus discovered an ISIL-affiliated cell which was directed by two Palestinians.³⁵⁸ In 2014 lots of Jund al-Sham members from Lebanon were arrested by Lebanese authorities. Most of them between the ages 17-29, “unemployed, marginalized in their own community, suffered from injustice, and used the arms trade to generate income.”³⁵⁹

³⁵⁵ Erling Sogge, *ibid.*

³⁵⁶ “From Jordan to Jihad: The Lure of Syria’s Violent Extremist Groups,” *Mercy Corps*, Policy Brief (2015), 3-6.

³⁵⁷ Arie Perliger and Daniel Milton, “From Cradle to Grave: The Lifecycle of Foreign Fighters in Iraq and Syria,” *Combating Terrorism Center* (November 2016): 15-16.

³⁵⁸ Mona Alami, *ibid.*

³⁵⁹ Samya Kullab, *ibid.*

Various economic, social, administrative, and spatial factors contribute the differentiation between Jordanian and Lebanese Palestinian refugee camps. Those four factors are strictly intermingled to each other. First, in Lebanon, Palestinian refugees are still largely excluded from the official labor market and governmental services.³⁶⁰ Second, as mentioned before, after the expulsion of the PLO from Lebanon, and the destruction of refugee camps' infrastructure by Israeli occupation and "war of camps" during the Lebanese Civil War, Palestinian refugees in Lebanon partly lost their employment abilities and access to education or health services. While the PLO relocated to the Palestinian Authority in accordance with the Oslo Accord, the cradle of Palestinian nationalism and identity, i.e. refugee camps in Lebanon, more or less were abandoned and the power vacuum was filled by other Palestinian factions, especially transnational jihadist network. Third, Palestinian refugee camps in Lebanon were designed to exclude Palestinians from the other segments of Lebanese society, on the contrary to the Syrian and Jordanian ones. Those camps in Syria and Jordan are "open spaces" which means that they resemble other standard Syrian or Jordanian neighborhoods, whereas in the case of Lebanon they are "closed spaces" which means that they socially are excluded from the rest of the Lebanese society. Unemployment rate in Lebanese camps is higher than other parts of Lebanese society, and the same is valid for poverty rate.³⁶¹ Fourth, the sectarian/confessional nature of the political system of Lebanon makes (mostly Sunni) Palestinians more vulnerable to sectarian strife.

Lebanon's historical, economical, and political relations with the Levant and due to the fact that it would never possible for one party to rule Lebanon for its own, create a unique situation for Lebanon: For a jihadist from Lebanon should make his calculations not for Lebanon, but for the Greater Syria. Some jihadist voices

³⁶⁰ "Palestine Refugee Agency Faces Greatest Financial Crisis in Its History Following 2018 Funding Cuts, Commissioner-General Tells Fourth Committee," *United Nations*, November 9, 2018, <https://www.un.org/press/en/2018/gaspd684.doc.htm>.

³⁶¹ See, Sari Hanafi, Jad Chaaban and Karin Seyfert, "Social Exclusion of Palestinian Refugees in Lebanon: Reflections on the Mechanisms that Cement Their Persistent Poverty," *Refugee Survey Quarterly* 31, no. 1 (March 2012): 34–53.

underline Lebanon's role in global jihad as a "support base" for the greater jihadist cause.³⁶² For instance, a Salafi sheikh claimed that, throughout 2012 Lebanese jihadists in Syria used Lebanon as "a recruiting and resupply base", and those activities ensured by family relations between Syrian armed groups and Tripoli's Salafist network.³⁶³ A group of jihadist organizations established an Islamic front inside Ain al-Helweh in 2013, tried to expand its activities head towards Burj al-Barajneh Palestinian refugee camp in Dahiyeh, and announced that it will be use Lebanon as "a salvation land" for those jihadist who were fighting in Syria.³⁶⁴

However, some claim that the influence of ISIL in Palestinian refugee camps were limited, and especially after operations around the Syrian border by both the Syrian army and Lebanese army-Hezbollah, militant flow to Syria has been decreased. Especially battles of Qalamoun, Yabroud, and al-Kusayr (2013-2014) on the side of the Syrian border ended with the defeat of the armed groups and the Syrian army took control of these towns which are important for Homs and Damascus. In addition to this, Hezbollah and Lebanese army clashed with ISIL and Al Nusra Front in 2014 on the side of Lebanon, namely in Aarsal region. Again, in 2017, both parties launched another operation in Aarsal and Qalamoun region to expel ISIL. Before the operation Hezbollah and Hayat Tahrir al-Sham (new name for Al Nusra Front) reached an agreement to transfer the latter's militants and families from Aarsal to Idlib.³⁶⁵ Despite the fact that Palestinian militants still inside Syria with jihadist groups, it can be said that militant influx from Lebanon to Syria was substantially has cut by the Syrian army, Hezbollah, and Lebanese army and border control has tightened. This development coincides with the fact that ISIL has ceded to be a

³⁶² Bernard Rougier, *ibid*, 166.

³⁶³ Mona Alami, *ibid*.

³⁶⁴ Amal Khalil and Qassem Qassem, "Al-Nusra Front: Seeking a Lebanese Base in Ain al-Hilweh," *Al Akhbar*, December 4, 2013, <https://uprootedpalestinian.wordpress.com/2013/02/07/al-nusra-front-seeking-a-lebanese-base-in-ain-al-hilweh/>.

³⁶⁵ Chafic Choucair, "Hezbollah and the Battle of Aarsal: Restoration in the Lebanese Centre," *Al Jazeera Centre for Studies*, August 20, 2017, <http://studies.aljazeera.net/en/reports/2017/08/hezbollah-battle-aarsal-restoration-lebanese-centre-170820094848622.html>.

“state” in 2017 after the recapture of Mosul and Raqqa by Iraqi army and anti-ISIL US coalition respectively; and Al Qaeda has become an “emirate” within the border of Idlib province in Syria. Consequently, Lebanon front of the Syrian War has relatively been quiet since 2017.

However, Palestinians in Lebanon are still facing with difficulties. In 2016, Palestinian refugees protested UNRWA aid cuts almost for two months sit-ins.³⁶⁶ In 2019, a new legislation that aims to control “illegal labor” in Lebanon sparked protests amongst Palestinian refugees. Palestinians claimed that with this new law discriminates even Palestinian who are working in legal conditions. Also, since 2005, Lebanese law has suspended Palestinians from working in 70 sectors, including engineering and medicine.³⁶⁷ Hence, socio-economic aspect of Islamization of Palestinian camps is still lay out there.

4.8. Conclusion

Palestinian cause has gone through four phases: Communal tension between Arabs and Jews due to Zionist migration to Palestine; Arab-Israel conflict after the creation of the state of Israel; the rise of Palestine-first approach and guerilla struggle against Israel from Lebanon by the PLO; the PLO’s recognition of Israel and the rise of Hamas and Islamist forces. Spread of Wahhabism with the Saudi money in the Middle East coincided with the demise of the PLO and destruction of the infrastructure of the Palestinian refugee camps by Israeli invasion of Lebanon. Hence, transnational jihadist network has used Palestinian camps in Lebanon due to the lack of state institutions in camps, and during the Syrian jihad, Lebanon was seen by the jihadist groups as a support base for the Greater Syria. Palestinian and

³⁶⁶ Furkan Guldemir, “Palestinian refugees in Beirut protest UNRWA aid cuts,” *Anadolu Agency*, May 10, 2016, <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/politics/palestinian-refugees-in-beirut-protest-unrwa-aid-cuts/569929>.

³⁶⁷ Amana ElAshkar, “Palestinian refugees in Lebanon denounce new 'inhumane' work restrictions,” *Middle East Eye*, July 23, 2019, <https://www.middleeasteye.net/news/palestinian-refugees-lebanon-denounce-latest-work-restrictions>.

Lebanese jihadists from refugee camps empowered the jihadist organizations in Syria, such as Al Nusra Front and the ISIL. Moreover, poverty, lack of governance, marginalization, sectarianism, and the fragility of the political system of Lebanon are the main motives for waging jihad inside Syria for Palestinian refugees.



CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION

The Palestinian aspect of the Syrian Jihad is a juxtaposition of modern jihadist thought, economic transformation of the Middle East in the 20th century, the change of Palestinian cause, and the Palestinian refugee problem in the context of Lebanese national politics.

This study looked back the origin of the contemporary jihadist movement in order to understand how and why Palestinians did join the Syrian War against Bashar al-Assad. In Chapter 2, the founding fathers of the modern Salafist thought was examined in the context of the Western “superiority”, rejection of traditional religious establishment, the abolition of the Caliphate, colonialism, political pragmatism vis-a-vis national regimes, and changing the target of the jihad. Although modern Salafist/jihadist thought rejects nationalism and puts ahead the unity of Muslims, there has been always a contradictory aspect of those Islamist thinkers and movements with respect to national politics and nationalism. The jihadist cause has gone through phases: at first, the Muslim Brotherhood aimed at new Western-educated Egyptian elites, then the organization took arm against British colonial rule, and during the Nasser era, it again struggled for a revolutionary change in the Egyptian society. However, the demise of Arab nationalism, the rise of Saudi Arabia and spread of Wahhabism through the Middle East, jihadist cause turned into a transnational issue, especially with the Afghan jihad. It is important to note that the inventor of “Arab-Afghan” militia against the Red Army in Afghanistan was a Palestinian jihadist, Abdullah Azzam. He transformed the jihadist network from a national one to an international one, and paved the way for a hardcore organization, namely Al Qaeda. This epoch (the second part of the 1990s) was characterized with targeting the far enemy, i.e. the USA, and its end was 9/11 attacks. After the invasion

of Iraq, the jihadist cause again had another turn, and started to target the near enemy, this time a call for a total war of annihilation against Shias and later, Alawites. The Bush Administration's desire to contain Iran, Hezbollah, and Syria created a consequence: emerging new "Sunni" groups in Lebanon against Hezbollah and Syria. Hence, Salafism's animosity against Sufism and Shia found a channel and *de facto* political free hand in the contemporary Middle East.

In this respect, the Syrian War intermingled with national, regional, and international imbalance. Chapter 3 tried to explain the history of modern Syria tainted with sectarian tensions, and Islamist forces in Syria represented both a "Sunni" hatred against the "Nusayri regime" and a class dimension which consisted of deprived urban Sunni merchant class. In the 1990s and during Bashar al-Assad era, Syria adopted more and more liberal economy policies, cut government subsidies, and created new class configurations in Syria. Collapse of the agricultural sector between 2006 and 2010, migration from rural to urban centers, Baath Party's alienation from popular strata paved the way for 2011 uprising. Additionally, the "Arab Spring" context and regional and international intervention combined with a proxy war. This makes Syria a fertile ground for jihadist cause in the Levant, and with its historical relationship, Lebanon became a support base for the Syrian Jihad.

The Palestinian aspect of the Syrian War is twofold: the first one is related with Syria's own Palestinian policy and Palestinian refugees in Syria. Some camps in Syria has been a stage for confrontation between the Syrian army and the jihadist groups, and some Palestinian factions have sided with either the Syrian army or armed groups. However, as Chapter 4 underlined, Palestinian refugee camps in Lebanon offers a relative "free" environment for transnational jihadist network, due to the lack of governance, poverty, marginalized youth, and the fragile and confessionalist conditions of Lebanese socio-political atmosphere. Lots of jihadists from other nationalities found shelter in refugee camps, and funding from the Gulf countries boosted the jihadist services inside the Palestinian camps. Moreover, the uncertain future of Palestine-Israel negotiations and the ambiguous statute of

Palestinians in Lebanon catalyzed jihadist infiltration into the camps, and the recruitment of Palestinian youth in particular. Palestinian camps in Lebanon differ from Jordan's and Syria's with respect to their lack of integration to the society, and for that reason Palestinians in Lebanon become distinct from their fellows in Jordan and Syria about the motives of jihad in Syria. Additionally, the sectarian tension drives the Palestinian jihadists to wage jihad not in Palestine against Israel, but in Syria against Bashar al-Assad. They tend to "save" Syrian "Sunnis" from "Nusayri regime," and chose to stay neutral the struggle between Iran-Syria-Hezbollah and Israel. They see Palestinian problem at best a problem within the greater global jihadist cause. Therefore, for them, if Al-Quds will be liberated, the Muslims should start with the "infidel" regimes and peoples, such as Syria and its government. Moreover, Lebanon's sectarian equilibrium (with powerful regional backers) prevents Palestinian (and other) jihadists to easily take arms against the Lebanese government and army. Therefore, Palestinian camps becomes a support base for the greater jihadist cause, for the Greater Syria in particular.

5.1. An ambiguous future for Palestinian camps in Lebanon

Still ongoing Syrian War has shaped national Syrian politics, regional balance of power, positions of international actors, and the course of transnational jihad. Also, the war has gone through stages. Local protests which had relations with broader "Arab spring" context turned into an armed conflict between various parties inside and outside Syria. States like the USA, Britain, France, Russia, Jordan, Qatar, Saudi Arabia, UAE, Turkey, and Iran; non-state actors like Hezbollah, Al Qaeda, ISIL, and other jihadist groups broke their alliances and realigned themselves other actors during the war. This path can also be followed concerning the political goals of the war. For instance, the Obama Administration stuck with the Assad-must-go approach between 2011 and 2013. However, after infamous Ghouta chemical attack incident in 2013, the USA rejected any military confrontation with Syria (and Russia), accepted Russia's chemical weapons deal, and redirected its political course from regime change to "war on terror", i.e. countering ISIL, in 2014, and now, "containing Iran"

in northeastern Syria and blocking Syria's economic reconstruction efforts with its Kurdish proxies, Syrian Democratic Forces (SDF). Likewise, until 2015, Russia tried to save its only base in the Middle East, challenged the US hegemony due to the latter's decreasing influence throughout the region, and diversified its alliances in the region. After direct involvement in Syrian War, Russia became a real actor in Syria and the Middle East, forced Bashar al-Assad to reform his government, built a shaky alliance with Iran and Turkey, facilitated reconciliation efforts in southern Syria, and created a *modus vivendi* -although vulnerable- with the USA in Syria.

Change of courses also can be observed with regard to the Gulf, Jordan, and Turkey. Gulf monarchies led by Saudi Arabia, at first, quietly monitored the situation in Syria until June 2011, and when the US government adopted a regime change discourse, they became more and more harsher towards Bashar al-Assad. Qatar supported a Muslim Brotherhood government in Syria and helped to militarize the conflict via Libyan arm supplies. Jordan and UAE also helped armed groups on the ground, especially Jordan established "operation room" for armed groups in the southern Syria. Turkey, initially, called for "reforms" in Syria, and tried to persuade Bashar al-Assad during early on of the crisis. However, various Syrian sources, including Bashar al-Assad himself, claimed that even before the crisis, Turkish President Recep Tayyip Erdoğan had tried to convince the Syrian leader to rehabilitate the Muslim Brotherhood. Then, Turkey sided with Qatar and supported Ikhwan-Affiliated armed groups. However, after the coup d'état in Egypt which ousted Mohammed Morsi, a new conflict emerged in the region: Gulf states led by Saudi Arabia and the UAE versus Qatar-Turkey axis. Blockade against Qatar by the other Gulf states, and growing Saudi hostility against Turkey, reflected themselves within the Syrian context. Turkey started mostly to focus on autonomous Northern Syria entity led by Democratic Union Party (PYD) and People's Protection Units (YPG) which is affiliated with the PKK. Eventually, after the US support of YPG (inside SDF), Ankara's main military goal in Syria has become crushing the PYD entity in Syria. Saudi support for SDF's Arab tribes has created another tension between the Gulf kingdom and Turkey.

The Syrian jihad has changed its course during the war, too. The modern transnational jihad had matured during the Afghan War and pursued the mixture of far enemy (i.e. the USSR) and near enemy (Soviet-backed Afghan government) tactics. Al Qaeda changed the course of jihad to the USA in the second half of the 1990s, and after the invasions of Afghanistan and Iraq, struggle against the occupation force became clearer as the main motive of the jihad. However, in Iraq and Lebanon, jihadist course transformed again, and near enemy, i.e. Iran and “Shias”, were to be the primary focus of transnational jihad in Levant. ISIL (and its predecessor AQI) was a production of untidy Iraqi politics and the US invasion of Iraq. Transnational jihad’s shift to focus on near enemy coincided with the Bush Administration’s policy of containing Iran, and eventually, jihad -again- went “local”, resembling the old school Ikhwani or Qutbist jihadist thought.

Moreover, contradictions and clashes between jihadist groups has never ceased during the war. The biggest debate within the jihadist ranks was ISIL’s split from the core Al Qaeda leadership. Although, one part of the debate, the leader of Al Nusra Front Abu Mohamed al-Golani was sent to Syria to establish a jihadist group by the leader of ISIL (then Islamic State of Iraq - ISI) Abu Bakr al-Baghdadi, ISIL challenged the authority of Al Qaeda and its leader, Ayman al-Zawahiri and severed its ties with the latter. After the split, some other “local” jihadist factions formed an alliance called “Islamic Front” and started to clash with ISIL in Syria.

However, unease within the jihadist ranks were not limited with ISIL-Al Qaeda split. In 2018, disorder within the new-born group, Hayat Tahrir al-Sham (HTS, ex Al Nusra Front) emerged. Al Qaeda loyalists criticized al-Golani for relying heavily on foreign states’ support, i.e. Turkey, and created a new group named Hurras al-Din (Guardians of Religion). Later, Al Qaeda leader al-Zawahiri issued a harsh response to HTS, and claimed that the latter group was trying to establish its authority in Idlib under “secular” Turkish supervision without directly naming HTS or al-Golani. In another message, al-Zawahiri implied to criticize ISIL and those who were seeking

an Islamic emirate inside Syria or Iraq and advised to focus on “guerilla fighting against the Crusader and its Shia allies” instead of “clinging to ground.”

Moreover, in Idlib for example, jihadist factions often try to control state of affairs inside the “Islamic emirate” and fight each other for administration. Foreign factors also impact upon their decisions. Some factions like Hurras al-Din do not want Turkish command in Idlib, and some factions, at least temporarily, defend a sort of agreement with Turkey to hold their ground. These debates have continued within the framework of Islamic theology too. However, after the collapse of the “Islamic State” and uncertain future of the “Idlib emirate” jihadist course and jihadists in the Levant are looking for new regions to stick on their cause.

In a sense, the Syrian War transformed into a war of attrition, and for now, Syria is shared among spheres of influence, i.e. Russia, the USA, Turkey, Saudi Arabia, Iran, and so on. Jihadist groups are mostly operating inside Idlib province, and until now they have been enjoying a *modus vivendi* among foreign forces. The future of jihad in the Levant seems ambiguous, and therefore, the future of the foreign jihadists inside Syria mirrors the same image.

This ambiguous situation invites the problem of “foreign jihadists”, as a phenomenon that is largely being discussed by the Western countries with respect to their national security. Some countries like the United Kingdom revoke jihadists’ citizenship, whereas some countries such as France do not allow jihadists to return their home country. However, besides Western jihadists, there are lots of Arab foreign jihadists in Syria and Iraq.

Within this context, Palestinian question and still stateless Palestinians make it more difficult to confront the foreign fighters issue. As mentioned throughout this study, the camps in Lebanon (and in Jordan to some extent) has become a fertile ground for transnational jihad due to socioeconomic factors, foreign interference, sectarian strife, and inefficacy of state institutions. There is still a lack of information about

Palestinian jihadists from Lebanese camps who has been waging jihad in Syria. In spite of a plenty of newspaper articles, scholarly researches on the impact of the Syrian War on the Palestinian refugee camps are not sufficient yet. The Syrian jihad has reshaped the politics and demographics in the Middle East region, and in particular Palestinian diaspora in Lebanon. Palestinian exodus from the largest refugee camp in Syria, Yarmouk, changed the situation in Lebanon again, like *al-Nakba* or Lebanese Civil War. Not only Palestinians flee from the camp, but also Syrians took refuge in Palestinian camps in Lebanon. Recently, some Lebanese newspapers has begun a campaign against Syrian refugees, a sign of fear for fragile political system of Lebanon.³⁶⁸ The complex political situation in Lebanon and Palestinian camps, therefore, one of the obstacles to get a clear picture about Palestinian jihadists in Lebanon and Syria.

Recent developments about new labor law in Lebanon shows an important example the strife between Palestinians and Lebanese authorities.³⁶⁹ New labor law restricts “illegal workers”, and one of the main target areas of the new law is Palestinian refugees. A survey conducted by UNRWA states that around two-thirds of Palestinian refugees in Lebanon are poor or extremely poor, and Syrian refugee influx has deteriorated the situation of Palestinians. Another survey indicates that 61% of Palestinian refugees in Lebanon feel “insecure” in the camps.³⁷⁰ Especially in Ain al-Helweh camp, clashes between jihadist factions and Fatah or leftist groups often occur and tension remains in despite of joint patrols by non-jihadist factions in

³⁶⁸ See, “Outrage after Lebanon doctor blames Syrian refugees for Raising cancer rates,” September 6, 2018, <https://www.alaraby.co.uk/english/news/2018/9/5/outrage-after-lebanon-doctor-blames-cancer-on-syria-refugees>; Zeina Khodr, “Anti-Syrian refugee sentiment rises in Lebanon,” *Al Jazeera*, June 27, 2019, <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2019/06/anti-syrian-refugee-sentiment-rises-lebanon-190627124719360.html>.

³⁶⁹ Lama Al-Arian, “In Lebanon, Palestinians Protest New Employment Restrictions,” *NPR*, July 26, 2019, <https://www.npr.org/2019/07/26/745041157/in-lebanon-palestinians-protest-new-employment-restrictions>.

³⁷⁰ UN High Commissioner for Refugees, “The Situation of Palestinian Refugees in Lebanon,” February 2016, <https://www.refworld.org/docid/56cc95484.html>.

the camp.³⁷¹ Economic deprivation, discrimination, unable to access services of education and health, competition amongst unskilled labor make Palestinian refugees more vulnerable. Moreover, dependence on the UN services and rejection of being settled in Lebanon (“*tawteen*”) due to unsolved Palestinian question make the situation more complex. After aid cuts from the Trump Administration, the main UN body for Palestinian refugees, UNRWA, found itself in a difficult situation.

Consequently, poor living conditions, socioeconomic deprivation, lack of governmental institutes, sectarian approach of some regional powers and declined Palestinian nationalism pave the ground for transnational jihadist network for operating in Palestinian refugee camps. Fluidity of Palestinian identity and relative freeness of the camps create a fertile ground for jihadist elements. Although jihadist cause in Levant have been declining since 2017, transnational network are looking for new areas such as South Eastern Asia. However, Syrian jihad enhanced transnational jihadist discourse vis-a-vis Palestinian question, i.e. Palestinian national resistance against Israeli occupation is just a point inside broader (and global) jihadist framework. The effect of Palestinian jihadist on Syrian jihad and the effect of Syrian jihad on Palestinian cause are still waiting for detailed examination.

³⁷¹ Nicolas Dot-Pouillard, "Between Radicalization and Mediation Processes: a Political Mapping of Palestinian Refugee Camps in Lebanon," *Civil Society Knowledge Centre*, January 10, 2015, <https://civilsociety-centre.org/paper/between-radicalization-and-mediation-processes-political-mapping-palestinian-refugee-camps>.

REFERENCES

- “A call to arms: three Palestinian militant groups.” *Now*, Last modified June 11, 2007.
https://now.mmedia.me/lb/en/commentary/a_call_to_arms_three_palestinian_militant_groups_.
- “Agriculture in Syria: Towards the Social Market”, World Bank, June, 2008, pp. 9-19,
<http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/890301468304199912/475460WP0P11051ds0the0Social0Market.doc>.
- “Assad Adviser Hints Erdogan Trying to Bring Muslim Brotherhood to Power in Syria.” *Sputnik*, Last modified February 22, 2019.
<https://sputniknews.com/middleeast/201902221072644073-syria-assad-erdogan-brotherhood/>.
- “Assad orders new Syrian amnesty.” *Al Jazeera*, Last modified June 21, 2011.
<https://www.aljazeera.com/news/middleeast/2011/06/2011621944198405.html>.
- “Assad: Syria has 'no relation at all' with Hamas.” *Ma'an News*, Last modified April 19, 2015. <http://www.maannews.com/Content.aspx?id=760573>.
- “Factions fight in Lebanese camp,” *BBC*, Last modified March 21, 2008.
http://news.bbc.co.uk/2/hi/middle_east/7309079.stm.
- “Foreign Fighters: An Updated Assessment of the Flow of Foreign Fighters into Iraq and Syria”, *The Soufan Group*, Last modified December, 2015,
http://soufangroup.com/wp-content/uploads/2015/12/TSG_ForeignFightersUpdate3.pdf.
- “Foreign Investment in Syria Grows.” *Forbes*, Last modified October 26, 2009.
<https://www.forbes.com/2009/10/23/syria-unctad-trade-business-oxford-analytica.html#3c3071a1765f>.
- “From Jordan to Jihad: The Lure of Syria’s Violent Extremist Groups”, *Mercy Corps*, Policy Brief (2015), pp. 3-6.

“ Hamas ditches Assad, backs Syrian revolt.” *Reuters*, Last modified February 24, 2012. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-syria-palestinians/hamas-ditches-assad-backs-syrian-revolt-idUSTRE81N1CC20120224>.

“ Hamas prime minister backs Syrian protests against Assad.” *The Guardian*, Last modified February 24, 2012. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2012/feb/24/hamas-pm-backs-syrian-protests>.

“ Hamas reportedly training rebels, fighting to oust Assad.” *Times of Israel*, Last modified April 5, 2013. http://www.timesofisrael.com/hamas-reportedly-training-rebels-fighting-to-oust-assad/?fb_comment_id=630828176933510_92824888#f35190511c1a89c.

“ Hamas training Syrian rebels in Damascus,” *Ynet*, Last modified May 4, 2013. <https://www.ynetnews.com/articles/0,7340,L-4364337,00.html>.

“ Judicial Watch: Defense, State Department Documents Reveal Obama Administration Knew that al Qaeda Terrorists Had Planned Benghazi Attack 10 Days in Advance.” *Judicial Watch*, Last modified May 18, 2015, <https://www.judicialwatch.org/press-room/press-releases/judicial-watch-defense-state-department-documents-reveal-obama-administration-knew-that-al-qaeda-terrorists-had-planned-benghazi-attack-10-days-in-advance/>.

“ Khaled Mahmoud: A Prisoner in Lebanon Turns Emir in Syria.” *The Syria Times*, Last modified January 5, 2013. <http://syriatimes.sy/index.php/arab-and-foreign-press/2054-khaled-mahmoud-a-prisoner-in-lebanon-turns-emir-in-syria>.

“ Mapping Militant Organizations, Fatah al-Islam.” *Stanford University*, Last modified August 11, 2014. <http://web.stanford.edu/group/mappingmilitants/cgi-bin/groups/view/17>.

“ Obtained Document.” *Judicial Watch*, Last modified May 18, 2015, <https://www.judicialwatch.org/document-archive/pgs-287-293-291-jw-v-dod-and-state-14-812-2/>.

“ Oraya gidince, işlerin bilindiği gibi olmadığı ortaya çıktı.” *soL Haber Portalı*, Last modified June 16, 2011, <http://haber.sol.org.tr/dunyadan/oraya-gidilince-islerin-bilindigi-gibi-olmadigi-ortaya-cikti-haberi-43636>.

“Osama bin Laden’s 1998 Fatwa.” accessed April 02, 2019, <https://www.911memorial.org/sites/default/files/Osama%20bin%20Laden's%201998%20Fatwa%20declaring%20war%20against%20the%20West%20and%20Israel.pdf>.

“Outrage after Lebanon doctor blames Syrian refugees for Raising cancer rates.” *The New Arab*, Last modified September 6, 2018. <https://www.alaraby.co.uk/english/news/2018/9/5/outrage-after-lebanon-doctor-blames-cancer-on-syria-refugees>.

“Palestine Refugee Agency Faces Greatest Financial Crisis in Its History Following 2018 Funding Cuts, Commissioner-General Tells Fourth Committee.” *United Nations*, Last modified November 9, 2018. <https://www.un.org/press/en/2018/gaspd684.doc.htm>.

“Syria and Saudi end tariff war.” *The National*, Last modified November 3, 2009. <https://www.thenational.ae/world/mena/syria-and-saudi-end-tariff-war-1.507813>.

“Syria heads east to boost foreign investment.” *Financial Times*, Last modified July 7, 2008. <https://www.ft.com/content/e0c488b6-4b7d-11dd-a490-000077b07658>.

“Syria rebels bring fight to pro-Assad Palestinians.” *Reuters*, Last modified October 31, 2012, <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-syria-crisis-palestinians/syria-rebels-bring-fight-to-pro-assad-palestinians-idUSBRE89U0H320121031>.

“Syrian rebels arm Palestinians against Assad.” *Reuters*, Last modified October 31, 2012. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-syria-crisis-palestinians/syrian-rebels-arm-palestinians-against-assad-idUSBRE89U1I320121031>.

“Terror suspects charged following Army raids.” *The Daily Star*, Last modified June 27, 2014. <https://www.dailystar.com.lb/News/Lebanon-News/2014/Jun-27/261777-terror-suspects-charged-following-army-raids.ashx#axzz35mf9Uxc1>.

“Terrorist Designations of the al-Nusrah Front as an Alias for al-Qa'ida in Iraq.” *US State Department*, Last modified December 11, 2012. <https://2009-2017.state.gov/r/pa/prs/ps/2012/12/201759.htm>.

“The Directorate of Intelligence turned in the Palestinian Mahmoud Ali Ward to the relevant judiciary.” accessed August 4, 2019, <https://www.lebarmy.gov.lb/en/content/directorate-intelligence-turned-palestinian-mahmoud-ali-ward-relevant-judiciary>.

“The Situation of Palestinian Refugees in Lebanon.” Last modified February 2016. <https://www.refworld.org/docid/56cc95484.html>.

“UNRWA Fields of Operations Map.” *UNRWA*, Last modified January 1, 2017. https://www.unrwa.org/sites/default/files/content/resources/unrwa_fields_of_operations_map_2017.pdf.

“Where We Work.” *UNRWA*, accessed July 05, 2019, <https://www.unrwa.org/where-we-work/syria>.

Aaron, David. *Own Words: Voices of Jihad*. Santa Monica: RAND Corporation, 2008.

Abboud, Samer N. “Locating the “Social” in the Social Market Economy.” In *Syria from Reform to Revolt, Volume 1*, edited by Raymond Hinnebusch and Tina Zintl, 45-65. New York: Syracuse University Press, 2015.

Abi-Habib, Maria. “Assad Policies Aided Rise of Islamic State Militant Group.” *Wall Street Journal*, Last modified August 22, 2014. <https://www.wsj.com/articles/assad-policies-aided-rise-of-islamic-state-militant-group-1408739733>.

Abi-Habib, Maria. “Young Palestinian Refugees Join Jihadists Fighting in Syria.” *Wall Street Journal*, Last modified November 20, 2013. [https://www.wsj.com/articles/no-headline-available-1384378326#_ =](https://www.wsj.com/articles/no-headline-available-1384378326#_=).

Aboul-Enein, Youssef H. “Ayman al-Zawahiri: The Ideologue of Modern Islamic Militancy,” *Future Warfare Series*, no. 21 (2004): 1-34.

Abouzeid, Rania. “TIME Exclusive: Meet the Islamist Militants Fighting Alongside Syria’s Rebels.” *TIME*, Last modified July 26, 2012. <http://world.time.com/2012/07/26/time-exclusive-meet-the-islamist-militants-fighting-alongside-syrias-rebels/>.

Abouzeid, Rania. *No Turning Back: Life, Loss, and Hope in Wartime Syria*. New York and London: W. W. Norton&Company, 2018.

Abu-Amr, Ziad. " Hamas: A Historical and Political Background," *Journal of Palestine Studies* 22, no. 4 (1993): 5-19.

Adams, Charles C. *Islam and Modernism in Egypt: A Study of the Modern Reform Movement Inaugurated by Muhammad 'Abduh*. New York: Russell&Russell, 1968.

Ahmad, Aisha. *Jihad & co. Black Markets and Islamist Power*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2017.

Ahmed, Safdar. *Reform and Modernity in Islam: The Philosophical, Cultural and Political Discourses among Muslim Reformers*. London and New York: I.B.Tauris, 2013.

Ahsan, Syed Aziz-al. "Economic Policy and Class Structure in Syria: 1958-1980," *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 16, no. 3 (1984): 301-323.

Al-Arian, Lama. "In Lebanon, Palestinians Protest New Employment Restrictions." *NPR*, Last modified July 26, 2019. <https://www.npr.org/2019/07/26/745041157/in-lebanon-palestinians-protest-new-employment-restrictions>.

al-Assad, Bashar. "Syria's President Speaks: A Conversation With Bashar al-Assad," *Foreign Affairs*, Vol. 94, No. 2 (March/April 2015), pp. 58-65.

al-Jarbawi, Ali. "The Position of Palestinian Islamists on the Palestine-Israel Accord," *The Muslim World* 84, no. 1-2 (1994): 127-154.

al-Shishani, Murad Batal. "Jihadis Turn their Eyes to Syria as a Post-Iraq Theater of Operations," *Terrorism Monitor* 7, no. 26 (2009): 3-5.

al-Zayyat, Montasser. *The Road to Al-Qaeda: The Story of Bin Laden's Right-Hand Man*. Translated by Ahmed Fekry. Edited by Sara Nimis. London: Pluto Press, 2004.

- Alabbasi, Mamoon. "How did Hamas's military expertise end up with Syria's rebels?" *Middle East Eye*, Last modified May 22, 2015, <https://www.middleeasteye.net/news/how-did-hamass-military-expertise-end-syrias-rebels>.
- Alami, Mona. "The Impact of the Syria Conflict on Salafis and Jihadis in Lebanon." *Middle East Institute*, Last modified April 18, 2014. https://www.mei.edu/sites/default/files/publications/Alami%20Policy%20Focus_0.pdf.
- Alami, Mona. "The Rise of ISIS in Lebanon." *Atlantic Council*, Last modified December 2, 2015. <https://www.atlanticcouncil.org/blogs/menasource/the-rise-of-isis-in-lebanon>.
- Alami, Mona. "Who is behind new round of violence in Lebanon refugee camp?." *Al Monitor*, Last modified April 13, 2017. <https://www.al-monitor.com/pulse/originals/2017/04/lebanon-ain-al-hilweh-palestinian-camp-jihadist-nucleus.html>.
- Anjarini, Suhaib. "The Mufti of the Syrian Opposition." *Al Akhbar*, Last modified March 5, 2014. <https://english.al-akhbar.com/content/mufti-syrian-opposition>.
- Atia, Mona. "'A Way to Paradise': Pious Neoliberalism, Islam, and Faith-Based Development," *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* 102, no. 4 (2012): 808-827.
- Atia, Mona. *Building a House in Heaven: Pious Neoliberalism and Islamic Charity in Egypt*. Minneapolis and London: University of Minnesota Press, 2013.
- Bakker, E., & Singleton, M. "Foreign Fighters in the Syria and Iraq Conflict: Statistics and Characteristics of a Rapidly Growing Phenomenon." In *Foreign Fighters Under International Law and Beyond*, edited by Andrea de Guttery et al., 9-25. The Hague: T.M.C. Asser Press, 2016.
- Barnett, D., & Roggio, B. "Palestinian jihadist trainer killed fighting for Al Nusrah Front." *Long War Journal*, Last modified March 15, 2013. https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2013/03/palestinian_jihadist.php.

- Barnett, David. "Jihadist media unit releases posters for Palestinian fighters killed in Syria." *Long War Journal*, Last modified October 1, 2013. https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2013/10/jihadist_media_unit_releases_p.php.
- Basile, Mark. "Going to the Source: Why Al Qaeda's Financial Network is Likely to Withstand the Current War on Terrorist Financing," *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism* 27, no. 3 (2004): 169-185.
- Batatu, Hanna. "The Syrian Muslim Brethren", *State and Ideology in the Middle East and Pakistan*, ed. Fred Halliday and Hamza Alavi (London: Macmillan, 1988), pp. 112-133.
- Batatu, Hanna. *Syria's Peasantry, the Descendants of Its Lesser Rural Notables, and Their Politics*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1999.
- Bayoumy, Yara. "Syria lifts niqab ban, shuts casino, in nod to Sunnis." *Reuters*, Last modified April 6, 2011. <https://uk.reuters.com/article/uk-syria-assad-niqab/syria-lifts-niqab-ban-shuts-casino-in-nod-to-sunnis-idUKTRE7353SH20110406>.
- Becker, Carmen. "Strategies of Power Consolidation in Syria Under Bashar al-Asad: Modernizing Control Over Resources," *The Arab Studies Journal* 13/14, no. 2/1 (2005/2006): 65-91.
- Becker, Michael. "When Terrorists and Target Governments Cooperate the Case of Syria," *Perspectives on Terrorism* 9, no. 1 (February 2015): 95-103.
- Benmelech, E., & Klor, E. F. "What Explains the Flow of Foreign Fighters to ISIS?," *NBER Working Paper Series*, no. 22190 (April 2016): 0-25. Accessed May 15, 2019. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/314571544_What_Explains_the_Flow_of_Foreign_Fighters_to_Isis.
- Berkes, Niyazi. *The Development of Secularism in Turkey*. London: Hurst & Co., 1998.
- Bick, Barbara. *Walking the Precipice: Witness to the Rise of the Taliban in Afghanistan*. New York: The Feminist Press at CUNY, 2009.

Billard, Jr., Robert D. "Operation Cyclone: How the United States Defeated the Soviet Union," *Undergraduate Research Journal* 3.2, (October 2010): 25-41.

bin Laden, Osama. "Declaration of War against the Americans Occupying the Land of the Two Holy Places." *Al Quds Al Arabi*, 1996, Accessed April 02, 2019, <https://ctc.usma.edu/app/uploads/2013/10/Declaration-of-Jihad-against-the-Americans-Occupying-the-Land-of-the-Two-Holiest-Sites-Translation.pdf>.

Black, Ian. "Syria's Assad should step down, says King Abdullah of Jordan." *The Guardian*, Last modified November 14, 2011. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2011/nov/14/syrian-president-assad-urged-to-quit>.

Blanford, Nicholas. "Syria's Assad offers amnesty to political prisoners." *The Christian Science Monitor*, Last modified May 31, 2011. <https://www.csmonitor.com/World/Middle-East/2011/0531/Syria-s-Assad-offers-amnesty-to-political-prisoners>.

Bloom, Rebecca. "Fatah al-Islam," *Council on Foreign Relations*, June 8, 2007, <https://www.cfr.org/backgrounder/fatah-al-islam> (Accessed on August 2nd, 2019).

Bolton, John R. "Syria Joins the Axis of Evil," *The Wall Street Journal*, September 25, 2007, <https://www.wsj.com/articles/SB119068573117938332> (Accessed on July 23, 2019).

Bonfatti, Alice. "The socio-economic roots of Syria's uprising," *Al Jumhuriya*, September 21, 2017, <https://www.aljumhuriya.net/en/content/socio-economic-roots-syria%E2%80%99s-uprising> (Accessed on April 12, 2018).

Borch, Jonathon. "Turkey tells Syria's Assad: Step down!." *Reuters*, Last modified November 22, 2011. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-syria-idUSL5E7MD0GZ20111122>.

Borger, Julian. "Bush warns Syria and Iran over terror." *The Guardian*, Last modified February 3, 2005. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2005/feb/03/syria.usa>.

- Burke, Dave. "The boy whose graffiti changed the world: On sixth anniversary of Syria's civil war, the youth who sparked it by scrawling on a wall says he regrets the deaths but the country 'had to change'." *Daily Mail*, Last modified March 15, 2017. <http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-4312502/The-boy-anti-Assad-graffiti-changed-world.html>.
- Burke, E., & Bazoobandi, S. "The Gulf takes charge in the MENA region", *Fride Working Paper*, Vol. 97 (April 2010), pp. 6.
- Burke, Jason. "Al Qaeda leader Zawahiri urges Muslim support for Syrian uprising." *The Guardian*, Last modified February 12, 2012. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2012/feb/12/alqaida-zawahiri-support-syrian-uprising>.
- Burke, Jason. *The New Threat: The Past, Present, and Future of Islamic Militancy*. New York and London: The New Press, 2015.
- Butter, David. "Syria's Economy: Picking up the Pieces," *Chatham House*, (June 2015): 0-31. Accessed June 15, 2019. https://www.chathamhouse.org/sites/default/files/field/field_document/20150623SyriaEconomyButter.pdf.
- Cafiero, Giorgio. "Syria's Civil War, Assad and the Palestinians." *International Policy Digest*, Last modified April 3, 2014. <https://intpolicydigest.org/2014/04/03/syria-s-civil-war-assad-palestinians/>.
- Calvert, John C. M. "The Striving Shaykh Abdullah Azzam and the Revival of Jihad," *Journal of Religion & Society* 2, (2007): 83-102.
- Calvert, John. *Sayyid Qutb and the Origins of Radical Islamism*. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2013.
- Carr, David W. "Capital Flows and Development in Syria," *Middle East Journal* 34, no. 4 (Autumn 1980): 455-467.
- Çete, E., & Işık, T. B. *Clinton Yazışmalarında AKP'nin Kirli Savaşları*. İstanbul: Yazılama, 2016.

- Chararah, Nasser. "Salafist Factions on Rise at Palestinian Camp in Lebanon." *Al Monitor*, Last modified March 13, 2013. <http://www.al-monitor.com/pulse/originals/2013/03/ain-al-hilweh-looming-battle.html>.
- Choucair, Chafic. "Hezbollah and the Battle of Aarsal: Restoration in the Lebanese Centre." *Al Jazeera Centre for Studies*, Last modified August 20, 2017. <http://studies.aljazeera.net/en/reports/2017/08/hezbollah-battle-aarsal-restoration-lebanese-centre-170820094848622.html>.
- Cleveland, William L. and Bunton, Martin. *A History of the Modern Middle East*. Boulder: Westview Press, 2009.
- Cobban, Helene. *The Palestinian Liberation Organisation People, Power and Politics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984.
- Cockburn, Alexander and Clair, Jeffrey St. "How Jimmy Carter and I Started the Mujahideen?", *Counter Punch*, January 15th, 1998, <https://www.counterpunch.org/1998/01/15/how-jimmy-carter-and-i-started-the-mujahideen/> (accessed June 30th, 2019).
- Cockburn, Patrick. *The Rise of Islamic State: ISIS and the New Sunni Revolution*. London: Verso, 2015.
- Conduit, Dara. "The Syrian Muslim Brotherhood and the Spectacle of Hama", *The Middle East Journal* 70, no. 2 (Spring 2016): 211-226.
- Cook, David. *Understanding Jihad*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 2005.
- Cristol, Jonathan. *The United States and the Taliban before and after 9/11*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2019.
- Dahi, O. S., & Munif, Y. "Revolts in Syria: Tracking the Convergence Between Authoritarianism and Neoliberalism," *Journal of Asian and African Studies* 47, no. 4 (2011): 323–332.
- Dawisha, Adeed. *Arab Nationalism in the Twentieth Century: From Triumph to Despair*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2016.

De Châtel, Francesca. "The Role of Drought and Climate Change in the Syrian Uprising: Untangling the Triggers of the Revolution," *Middle Eastern Studies* 50, no. 4 (2014): 521-535.

Diez, Alberto Caballero. "Jordanian Foreign Fighters in Syria and Iraq: how did they become radicalized and how they can be de-radicalized?," *IEEE, Opinion Document* no. 68 (July 2016): 0-15. Accessed June 15, 2019.
http://www.ieee.es/en/Galerias/fichero/docs_opinion/2016/DIEEEO68-2016_CombatientesJordanos_Siria_AlbertoCaballero_ENGLISH.pdf.

Dot-Pouillard, Nicolas. "Between Radicalization and Mediation Processes: a Political Mapping of Palestinian Refugee Camps in Lebanon," *Civil Society Knowledge Center*, (October 2015): 0-27. Accessed June 14, 2019.
<https://civilsociety-centre.org/pdf-generate/31635>.

Edwards, David B. *Before Taliban: Genealogies of the Afghan Jihad*. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2002.

ElAshkar, Amena. "Palestinian refugees in Lebanon denounce new 'inhumane' work restrictions." *Middle East Eye*, Last modified July 23, 2019.
<https://www.middleeasteye.net/news/palestinian-refugees-lebanon-denounce-latest-work-restrictions>.

Fisk, Robert. "Al-Qa'ida sends its warriors from Iraq to wage 'jihad' in Lebanon." *The Independent*, Last modified August 15, 2008.
<http://www.independent.co.uk/voices/commentators/fisk/robert-fisk-alqaida-sends-its-warriors-from-iraq-to-wage-jihad-in-lebanon-897557.html>.

Fisk, Robert. "They may be fighting for Syria, not Assad. They may also be winning: Robert Fisk reports from inside Syria." *The Independent*, Last modified April 26, 2013. <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/middle-east/they-may-be-fighting-for-syria-not-assad-they-may-also-be-winning-robert-fisk-reports-from-inside-8590636.html>.

Gambetta, D., & Hertog, S. *Engineers of Jihad: The Curious Connection Between Violent Extremism and Education*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2008.

Gambill, Gary. "Abu Musab al-Zarqawi: A Biographical Sketch." *Terrorism Monitor*, Last modified December 16, 2004.

<https://jamestown.org/program/abu-musab-al-zarqawi-a-biographical-sketch-2/>.

Gerges, Fawaz A. "The Obama approach to the Middle East: the end of America's moment?," *International Affairs* 89, no. 2 (2013): 299–323.

Gerges, Fawaz A. *Making the Arab World: Nasser, Qutb, and the Clash That Shaped the Middle East*. Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2018.

Gerges, Fawaz. "ISIS and the Third Wave of Jihadism," *Current History* 113, no. 767 (December 2014): 339-343.

Gerges, Fawaz. *Far Enemy: Why Jihad Went Global?*. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press, 2005.

Gerges, Fawaz. *ISIS: A History*. Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2016.

Gerges, Fawaz. *The Rise and Fall of Al-Qaeda*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2011.

Gesink, Indira Falk. *Islamic Reform and Conservatism: Al-Azhar and the Evolution of Modern Sunni Islam*. London and New York: I.B. Tauris Publishers, 2009.

Gibbs, David N. "Reassessing Soviet Motives for Invading Afghanistan: A Declassified History," *Critical Asian Studies* 38, no. 2 (2006): 239-263.

Godfrey, H., & Chulov, M. "Syrian army tanks move into Jisr al-Shughour." *The Guardian*, Last modified June 12, 2011. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2011/jun/12/syrian-army-tanks-jisr-al-shughour>.

Goldberg, Jeffrey. "The Obama Doctrine." *The Atlantic*, June 2016, http://businesstoday.lk/pdf/june_2016/President_Obamas_Interview_With_Jeffrey_Goldberg.pdf (Accessed on July 26, 2019).

Goldenberg, Suzanne. "If Us leaves Iraq we will arm Sunni militias, Saudis say." *The Guardian*, Last modified December 14, 2006. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2006/dec/14/iraq.saudi-arabia>.

Gray, John. *Al Qaeda and What It Means to be Modern*. New York: New Press, 2003.

Greenwood, Phoebe. "Al-Qaeda leader urges Muslim world to support Syrian uprising." *The Telegraph*, Last modified February 12, 2012. <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/worldnews/middleeast/syria/9077386/Al-Qaeda-leader-urges-Muslim-world-to-support-Syrian-uprising.html>.

Guldemir, Furkan. "Palestinian refugees in Beirut protest UNRWA aid cuts." *Anadolu Agency*, Last modified May 10, 2016. <https://www.aa.com.tr/en/politics/palestinian-refugees-in-beirut-protest-unrwa-aid-cuts/569929>.

Gulmohamad, Zana Khasraw. "The Rise and Fall of the Islamic State of Iraq and Al-Sham (Levant) ISIS," *Global Security Studies* 5, no. 2 (Spring 2014): 1-11.

Gunaratna, Rohan. *Inside Al Qaeda: Global Network of Terror*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2002.

Gutman, Roy. "Assad Henchman: Here's How We Built ISIS." *The Daily Beast*, Last modified April 13, 2017. <https://www.thedailybeast.com/assad-henchman-heres-how-we-built-isis>.

Haddad, Bassam. "The Political Economy of Syria: Realities and Challenges," *Middle East Policy* 18, no. 2 (Summer 2011): 46-61.

Haddad, Simon. "The Palestinian Predicament in Lebanon," *Middle East Quarterly*, 7, no. 3 (September 2000): 29-40.

Haddad, Yvonne Yazbeck. "The Qur'anic Justification for an Islamic Revolution: The View of Sayyid Qutb," *Middle East Journal* 37, no. 1 (Winter 1983): 14-29.

Haddad, Yvonne. "Islamists and the 'Problem of Israel': The 1967 Awakening," *Middle East Journal* 46, no. 2 (Spring 1992): 266-285.

- Halabi, Zeina. "Exclusion and identity in Lebanon's Palestinian refugee camps: a story of sustained conflict," *Environment&Urbanization* 16, no 2 (October 2004): 39-48.
- Halliday, Fred. "War and Revolution in Afghanistan," *New Left Review*, no. 119 (Jan., Feb, 1980): 20-41.
- Halverson, Jeffry R. *Theology and Creed in Sunni Islam: The Muslim Brotherhood, Ash'arism, and Political Sunnism*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.
- Hamid, Mustafa and Farrall, Leah. *The Arabs at War in Afghanistan*. London: Hurst&Company, 2015.
- Hanafi, S., Chaaban, J., & Seyfert, K. "Social Exclusion of Palestinian Refugees in Lebanon: Reflections on the Mechanisms that Cement their Persistent Poverty," *Refugee Survey Quarterly* 31, no. 1 (January 2012): 34-53.
- Hanafi, Sari. "Palestinian Refugee Camps in Lebanon: Laboratories of State-in-the-Making, Discipline and Islamist Radicalism." In *Thinking Palestine*, edited by Ronit Lentin, 82-100. London and New York: Zed Books, 2008.
- Hanieh, Adam. *Capitalism and Class in the Gulf Arab States*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2011.
- Hanieh, Adam. *Lineages of Revolt: Issues of Contemporary Capitalism in the Middle East*. Chicago: Haymarket Books, 2013.
- Harding, Luke. "Nato all but rules out Syria no-fly zone." *The Guardian*, Last modified October 30, 2011. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2011/oct/30/nato-syria-no-fly-zone>.
- Harms, G., & Ferry, T. M. *The Palestine Israel Conflict A Basic Introduction*. London: Pluto Press, 2008.
- Hassan, Hassan. "The Gulf states: United against Iran, divided over Islamists." In *The Regional Struggle for Syria*, edited by Julien Barnes-Dacey and Daniel Levy, 17-25. London: European Council on Foreign Relations, 2013.

- Hassan, Muhammad Haniff. *The Father of Jihad: Abd Allah Azzam's Jihad Ideas and Its Implications for National Security*. London: Imperial College Press, 2014.
- Hegghammer, T., & Wagemakers, J. "The Palestine Effect: The Role of Palestinians in the Transnational Jihad Movement," *Welt des Islams* 53, no. 3-4 (2013): 281-314.
- Hersh, Seymour. "Redirection", *The New Yorker*, March 5th, 2007, <https://www.newyorker.com/magazine/2007/03/05/the-redirection>, (accessed 3rd April 2019).
- Hersh, Seymour. "The Red Line and the Rat Line." *London Review of Books*, Last modified April 17, 2014. <https://www.lrb.co.uk/v36/n08/seymour-m-hersh/the-red-line-and-the-rat-line>.
- Hinnebusch, Raymond A. "The Political Economy of Liberalization in Syria", *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 27, no. 3 (August 1995): 305-320.
- Hinnebusch, Raymond A. *Syria: Revolution From Above*. London and New York: Routledge, 2005.
- Hinnebusch, Raymond. "Liberalization in Syria: the Struggle of Economic and Political Rationality." In *Contemporary Syria Liberalization Between Cold War and Cold Peace*, edited by Eberhard Kienle, 97-114. London: British Academic Press, 1994.
- Hokayem, Emile. "The Gulf States and Syria," USIP Peace Brief, no. 116 (September 30, 2011): 0-5. Accessed July 15, 2019. <https://www.usip.org/sites/default/files/PB%20116.pdf>.
- Hopfinger, H., & Boeckler, M. "Step by Step to an Open Economic System: Syria Sets Course for Liberalization", *British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies* 23, no. 2 (November 1996): 183-202.
- Hourani, Albert. *Arabic Thought in the Liberal Age, 1798-1939*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 2013.

Hunt, Emily. "Zarqawi's 'Total War' on Iraqi Shiites Exposes a Divide among Sunni Jihadists." *The Washington Institute*, Last modified November 15, 2005. <https://www.washingtoninstitute.org/policy-analysis/view/zarqawis-total-war-on-iraqi-shiites-exposes-a-divide-among-sunni-jihadists>.

Jensen, Michael Irving. *The Political Ideology of Hamas: A Grassroots Perspective*. London: I.B. Tauris, 2009.

Karon, Tony. "While U.S. Recognizes Syrian Opposition, It Designates One Anti-Assad Group as 'Terrorist'." *Time*, Last modified December 11, 2012. <http://world.time.com/2012/12/11/why-the-u-s-has-designated-one-anti-assad-group-as-terrorist/>.

Karsh, Efraim. *Palestine War 1948*. Oxford: Osprey Publishing, 2002.

Kazimi, Nibras. "A Virulent Ideology in Mutation: Zarqawi Upstages Maqdisi," *Current Trends in Islamist Ideology* 2, (2005): 59-73.

Kazimi, Nibras. *Syria Through Jihadist Eyes: A Perfect Enemy*. California: Hoover Press, 2010.

Keddie, Nikki R. "Religion and Irreligion in Early Iranian Nationalism," *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 4, no. 3 (April 1962): 265-295.

Keddie, Nikki R. *Imperialism, Science and Religion: Two Essays by Jamal al-Din al-Afghani, 1883 and 1884*, 2004, Accessed June 20, 2019, https://edisciplinas.usp.br/pluginfile.php/4414095/mod_resource/content/1/KEDDIE%2C%20Nikki.pdf.

Keddie, Nikki R. *Sayyid Jamal Ad-Din Al-Afghani: A Political Biography*. Los Angeles: University Of California Press, 1972.

Kedourie, Elie. *Afghani and 'Abduh: An Essay on Religious Unbelief and Political Activism in Modern Islam*. London and Portland: Frank Cass, 1997.

Kemal, Namık. *Renan Müdafaaamesi*. Ankara: Milli Kültür Yayınları, 1962.

Kepel, Gilles. *Jihad: The Trail of Political Islam*. trans. Anthony F. Roberts. Massachusetts: The Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 2003.

Kerr, Malcolm H. *Islamic Reform and Legal Theories of Muhammad Abduh and Rashid Rida*. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1966.

Khalidi, M. A., & Riskedahl, D. "The Road to Nahr al-Barid: Lebanese Political Discourse and Palestinian Civil Rights." *Middle East Report*, Last modified 2007. <http://www.mafhoum.com/press10/306S26.htm>.

Khalidi, Rashid. *Palestinian Identity: The Construction of Modern National Consciousness*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2010.

Khalidi, Rashid. *Under Siege: PLO Decisionmaking During the 1982 War*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2014.

Khalil, A., & Qassem, Q. "Al-Nusra Front: Seeking a Lebanese Base in Ain al-Hilweh." *Al Akhbar*, Last modified December 4, 2013. <https://uprootedpalestinian.wordpress.com/2013/02/07/al-nusra-front-seeking-a-lebanese-base-in-ain-al-hilweh/>.

Khalili, Laleh. "Commemorating Battles and Massacres in the Palestinian Refugee Camps of Lebanon, *American Behavioral Scientist* 51, no. 11 (July 2008): 1562-1574.

Khatab, Sayed. *The Political Thought of Sayyid Qutb: The Theory of Jahiliyyah*. London and New York: Routledge, 2006.

Khodr, Zeina. "Anti-Syrian refugee sentiment rises in Lebanon." *Al Jazeera*, Last modified June 27, 2019. <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2019/06/anti-syrian-refugee-sentiment-rises-lebanon-190627124719360.html>.

Kienle, Eberhard. "Beyond the Lion's Reach: External Factors and Domestic Change in Syria." In *Scenarios for Syria: Socio-Economic and Political Choices*, edited by Volker Perthes, 23-41. Baden-Baden: Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, 1997.

Klein, Menachem. "Competing brothers: The web of Hamas-PLO relations," *Terrorism and Political Violence* 8, no. 2 (1996): 111-132.

- Kohlmann, Evan F. "The Role of Islamic Charities in International Terrorist Recruitment and Financing", *DIIS Working Paper*, no. 7 (2006): 0-23. Accessed June 26, 2019. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/resrep13293>.
- Kozak, Christopher. "'An Army in All Corners': Assad's Campaign Strategy in Syria," *ISW Middle East Security Report* 26 (April 2015): 0-55. Accessed July 25, 2019. <http://www.understandingwar.org/sites/default/files/An%20Army%20in%20All%20Corners%20by%20Chris%20Kozak%201.pdf>
- Krämer, Gudrun. *Hasan al-Banna*. London: Oneworld Publications, 2013.
- Krieg, Andreas. "Externalizing the burden of war: the Obama Doctrine and US foreign policy in the Middle East," *International Affairs* 92, no. 1 (2016): 97–113.
- Kullab, Samya. "Lebanon wary of fighters returning from Syria." *Al Jazeera*, Last modified July 21, 2014. <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/middleeast/2014/07/lebanon-wary-fighters-returning-from-syria-201472084326576297.html>.
- Landis, Joshua. "What happened at Jisr al-Shagour?." *Syria Comment*, Last modified June 13, 2011. <https://www.joshualandis.com/blog/what-happened-at-jisr-al-shagour/>.
- Lefèvre, Raphaël. *Ashes of Hama: The Muslim Brotherhood in Syria*. Oxford and London: Oxford University Press, 2013.
- Lia, Brynjar. *Architect of Global Jihad: The Life of al-Qaida Strategist Abu Mus'ab al-Suri*. London: Hurst&Company, 2007.
- Lister, Charles L. *The Syrian Jihad: Al-Qaeda, the Islamic State and the Evolution of an Insurgency*. New York: Oxford University Press, 2016.
- Litvak, Meir. "The Islamization of the Palestinian-Israeli Conflict: The case of Hamas," *Middle Eastern Studies* 34, no.1 (Jan 1998): 148-163.
- Loboda, Luke. "The Thought of Sayyid Qutb," *Ashbrook Statesmanship Thesis* 1, (2004): 19-23.

- Lund, Aron. "Holy Warriors." *Foreign Policy*, Last modified October 15, 2012. <https://foreignpolicy.com/2012/10/15/holy-warriors/>.
- Lund, Aron. "How Assad's Enemies Gave Up on the Syrian Opposition." *The Century Foundation*, Last modified October 17, 2017. <https://tcf.org/content/report/assads-enemies-gave-syrian-opposition/?agreed=1#easy-footnote-bottom-3>.
- Lund, Aron. "Syria's Salafi Insurgents: The Rise of the Syrian Islamic Front," *UI Occasional Papers*, no. 17 (March 2013): 0-50. Accessed June 25, 2019. <https://www.ui.se/globalassets/ui.se-eng/publications/ui-publications/syrias-salafi-insurgents-the-rise-of-the-syrian-islamic-front-min.pdf>.
- Lundquist, Lisa. "Lebanon." *The Long War Journal*, Last modified June 29, 2014. http://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2014/06/the_islamic_state_of_iraq_140.php.
- Lybarger, Loren D. *Identity and Religion in Palestine The Struggle Between Islamism and Secularism in the Occupied Territories*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2007.
- Machairas, Dimitrios. "The strategic and political consequences of the June 1967 war," *Cogent Social Sciences* 3, (2017): 0-8. Accessed June 25, 2019. <https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/pdf/10.1080/23311886.2017.1299555>.
- March, Andrew F. "Taking People As They Are: Islam As a "Realistic Utopia" in the Political Theory of Sayyid Qutb," *The American Political Science Review* 104, no. 1 (February 2010): 189-207.
- Marzouk, Nabil. "The Syrian Conflict: Selective Socioeconomic Indicators." In *Syria: From National Independence to Proxy War*, edited by Linda Matar and Ali Kadri, 115-133. Cham: Palgrave Macmillan, 2019.
- Matar, Linda. "Macroeconomic Framework in Pre-conflict Syria." In *Syria: From National Independence to Proxy War*, edited by Linda Matar and Ali Kadri, 95-115. Cham: Palgrave Macmillan, 2019.
- Matar, Linda. *The Political Economy of Investment in Syria*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2016.

- McGregor, Andrew. "'Jihad and the Rifle Alone': 'Abdullah 'Azzam and the Islamist Revolution,'" *The Journal of Conflict Studies* 23, no. 2 (Fall 2003): 92-113.
- Mellor, Noha. *Voice of the Muslim Brotherhood: Da'wa, Discourse, and Political Communication*. New York: Routledge, 2018.
- Miller, James. "Why Islamic State Militants Care So Much About Sykes-Picot?." *Radio Free Europe/Radio Liberty*, Last modified May 16, 2016. <https://www.rferl.org/a/why-islamic-state-cares-so-much-about-sykes-picot/27738467.html>.
- Mitchell, Richard P. *The Society of the Muslim Brothers*. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993.
- Morris, Benny. *The Birth of Palestinian Refugee Problem Revisited*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Murawiec, Laurent. *The Mind of Jihad*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008.
- Nakhoul, Samia. "Al Qaeda hijacks spirit of Syria revolt three years on." *Reuters*, Last modified March 11, 2014. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-syria-crisis-refugees-insight/al-qaeda-hijacks-spirit-of-syria-revolt-three-years-on-idUSBREA2A0QG20140311>.
- Napoleoni, Loretta. *Modern Jihad: Tracing the Dollars Behind the Terror Networks*. London: Pluto Press, 2003.
- Napolitano, Valentina. " Hamas and the Syrian Uprising: A Difficult Choice," *Middle East Policy* 20, no. 3 (Fall 2013): 73-85.
- Norman, York A. "Disputing the "Iron Circle": Renan, Afghani, and Kemal on Islam, Science, and Modernity," *Journal of World History* 22, no. 4 (December 2011): 693-714.
- O'Bagy, Elizabeth, *Jihad in Syria*. Washington, DC: ISW, 2012. <http://www.understandingwar.org/sites/default/files/Jihad-In-Syria-17SEPT.pdf>.

- Orton, Kyle. "What Role Do The Palestinians Play In The Jihad In Syria And Iraq?." *The Syrian Intifada*, Last modified September 6, 2014. <https://kyleorton1991.wordpress.com/2014/09/06/what-role-do-the-palestinians-play-in-the-jihad-in-syria-and-iraq/>.
- Özüğurlu, Musa. "Cisreşşuğur Katliamı'nın 5. yıldönümü: Musa Özüğurlu tanıklığını soL için yazdı." *soL Haber Portalı*, Last modified June 6, 2016. <http://haber.sol.org.tr/dunya/cisressugur-katliaminin-5-yildonumu-musa-ozugurlu-tanikligini-sol-icin-yazdi-158254>.
- Papachelas, Alexis. "Chemical attack accusations 'fake,' Assad tells Kathimerini in exclusive interview." *Kathimerini*, Last modified May 10, 2018. <http://www.ekathimerini.com/228495/article/ekathimerini/news/chemical-attack-accusations-fake-assad-tells-kathimerini-in-exclusive-interview>.
- Pargeter, Alison. *Müslüman Kardeşler: Muhalefetten İktidara*. İstanbul: Ayrıntı Yayınları, 2016.
- Perliger, A., & Milton, D., *From Cradle to Grave: The Lifecycle of Foreign Fighters in Iraq and Syria*. West Point: Combating Terrorism Center, 2016. <https://ctc.usma.edu/app/uploads/2016/11/Cradle-to-Grave2.pdf>.
- Perthes, Volker. "The Syrian Economy in the 1980s," *Middle East Journal* 46, no. 1 (Winter 1992): 37-58.
- Perthes, Volker. "The Syrian Private Industrial and Commercial Sectors and the State," *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 24, no. 2 (May 1992): 207-230.
- Petersen, Marie Juul. "Trajectories of transnational Muslim NGOs," *Development in Practice* 22, no. 5-6 (August 2012): 763-778.
- Phillips, Andrew. "How al Qaeda lost Iraq", *Australian Journal of International Affairs* 62, no. 1 (March 2009): 64-84.
- Phillips, Christopher. "Gulf Actors and the Syria Crisis," *LSE Middle East Centre Collected Papers* 1, (April 2015): 41-52.

- Pierret, Thomas. "The Syrian Baath Party and Sunni Islam: Conflicts and Connivance," *Crown Center for Middle East Studies*, no. 77 (February 2014): 1-27.
- Pintak, Lawrence. *Seeds of Hate: How America's Flawed Middle East Policy Ignited the Jihad*. London: Pluto Press, 2003.
- Pokalova, Elena. "Driving Factors behind Foreign Fighters in Syria and Iraq," *Studies in Conflict & Terrorism* 42, no. 9 (Published online on Feb 12, 2018): 798-818. Accessed August 04, 2019.
<https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/1057610X.2018.1427842>.
- Pollard, Ruth. "Palestinian camp in Lebanon named as one corner of jihadist 'death triangle'." *The Sydney Morning Herald*, Last modified February 13, 2015.
<https://www.smh.com.au/world/palestinian-camp-in-lebanon-named-as-one-corner-of-jihadist-death-triangle-20150213-13dw4w.html>.
- Pölling, Sylvie. "Overall Economic Developments and Reform Policies." In *Scenarios for Syria: Socio-Economic and Political Choices*, edited by Volker Perthes, 41-59. Baden-Baden: Nomos Verlagsgesellschaft, 1997.
- Prothero, Mitchell. "Lebanon May Attract Sunnis Seeking to Wage Jihad." *US News*, Last modified May 15, 2008.
<http://www.usnews.com/news/world/articles/2008/05/15/lebanon-may-attract-sunnis-seeking-to-wage-jihad>.
- Rabasa, A., Chalk, P., Cragin, K., Daly, S. A., Gregg, H. S., Karasik, T. W., O'Brien, K. A., & Rosenau, W. *Beyond al-Qaeda. Part 1. The Global Jihadist Movement*. Santa Monica: RAND Corporation, 2006, Accessed May 15, 2019,
https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/monographs/2006/RAND_MG429.pdf.
- Radwan, Mazen. "Depleted Palestinian Militants Back in Lebanon from Syria." *7D News*, Last modified February 5, 2019. <https://7dnews.com/news/depleted-palestinian-militants-back-in-lebanon-from-syria>.
- Ramadan, Adam. "A Refugee Landscape: Writing Palestinian Nationalisms in Lebanon," *ACME: An International Journal for Critical Geographies* 8, no 1 (2009): 69-99.

- Raphaeli, N., & Gersten, B. "Sovereign Wealth Funds: Investment Vehicles for the Persian Gulf Countries", *Middle East Quarterly* 15, no. 2 (Spring 2008): 45-53.
- Raphaeli, Nimrod. "Ayman Muhammad Rabi' Al-Zawahiri: The making of an Arch-Terrorist", *Terrorism and Political Violence* 14, no. 4 (Winter 2002): 1-22.
- Raphaeli, Nimrod. "Syria's Fragile Economy", *Middle East Review of International Affairs* 11, no. 2 (June 2007): 34-51.
- Raphaeli, Nimrod. "The Political Economy of Syria Under Bashar Al-Assad." *MEMRI*, Last modified April 16 2007. <https://www.memri.org/reports/political-economy-syria-under-bashar-al-assad>.
- Riedel, Bruce. *Deadly Embrace: Pakistan, America, and the Future of the Global Jihad*. Washington: Brookings Institution Press, 2011.
- Riedel, Bruce. *The Search for al Qaeda: Its Leadership, Ideology, and Future*. Washington: Brookings Institution Press, 2008.
- Robinson, Glenn E. "The Four Waves of Global Jihad, 1979-2017," *Middle East Policy Council* 24, no. 3 (2017):70-88.
- Roggio, Bill. "Fatah al Islam emir killed while waging jihad in Syria." *Long War Journal*, Last modified September 5, 2012. https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2012/09/fatah_al_islam_emir.php.
- Ross, Dennis. "U.S. Policy toward a Weak Assad," *The Washington Quarterly* 28, no. 3 (Summer 2005): 87-98.
- Rougier, Bernard. *Everyday Jihad: The Rise of Militant Islam Among Palestinians in Lebanon*. Cambridge and London: Harvard University Press, 2007.
- Rubenberg, Cheryl A. "The Civilian Infrastructure of the Palestine Liberation Organization: An Analysis of the PLO in Lebanon Until June 1982," *Journal of Palestine Studies* 12, no. 3 (Spring, 1983): 54-78.

Ryan, Michael W. S. *Decoding Al-Qaeda's Strategy: The Deep Battle Against America*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2013.

Saad-Filho, Alfredo. "Crisis in Neoliberalism or Crisis of Neoliberalism?," *Socialist Register* 47, (2011): 242-259.

Said, A. M. S., & Wenner, M. W. "Modern Islamic Reform Movements: The Muslim Brotherhood in Contemporary Egypt," *Middle East Journal* 36, no. 3 (Summer 1982): 336-361.

Said, Edward W. *The Question of Palestine*. New York: Vintage Books, 1980.

Salloum, Raniah. "Former Prisoners Fight in Syrian Insurgency." *Spiegel Online*, Last modified October 10, 2013. <http://www.spiegel.de/international/world/former-prisoners-fight-in-syrian-insurgency-a-927158.html>.

Salloum, Raniah. "Former Prisoners Fight in Syrian Insurgency." *Spiegel Online*, Last modified October 10, 2013. <https://www.spiegel.de/international/world/former-prisoners-fight-in-syrian-insurgency-a-927158.html>.

Sands, P., Vela, J., & Maayeh, S. "Assad regime abetted extremists to subvert peaceful uprising, says former intelligence official." *The National*, Last modified 21 January 2014. <https://www.thenational.ae/world/assad-regime-abetted-extremists-to-subvert-peaceful-uprising-says-former-intelligence-official-1.319620>.

Sayigh, Rosemary. *The Palestinians: From Peasants to Revolutionaries*. New York: Zed Books, 2008.

Sayigh, Yezid. "Palestinian Armed Struggle: Means and Ends," *Journal of Palestine Studies* 16, no. 1 (Autumn 1986): 95-112.

Schanzer, Jonathan. "The Challenge of Hamas to Fatah," *Middle East Quarterly*, (Spring 2003): 29-38.

Schanzer, Jonathan. *Hamas vs. Fatah The Struggle for Palestine*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.

- Schnelle, Sebastian. "Abdullah Azzam, Ideologue of Jihad: Freedom Fighter or Terrorist?," *Journal of Church and State* 54, no. 4 (November 2012): 625-647.
- Seale, Patrick. *Asad: The Struggle for the Middle East*. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1995.
- Sedwick, Mark. *Muhammad Abduh*. London: Oneworld Publications, 2013.
- Shadid, Mohammed K. "The Muslim Brotherhood Movement in the West Bank and Gaza," *Third World Quarterly* 10, no. 2 (April 1988): 658-682.
- Shavit, Uriya. *Scientific and Political Freedom in Islam: A Critical Reading of the Modernist-Apologetic School*. London and New York: Routledge, 2017.
- Shepard, William E. "Islam as a 'System' in the Later Writings of Sayyid Qutb," *Middle Eastern Studies* 25, no. 1 (January 1989): 31-50.
- Siklawi, Rami. "The Dynamics of Palestinian Political Endurance in Lebanon," *Middle East Journal* 64, no. 4 (Autumn 2010): 597-611.
- Sivri, Hasan. "Suriye'deki son saldırı ve katliamlar "Antakya Operasyon Odası"ndan yönetiliyor." *İntizar*, Last modified April 28, 2015. <http://intizar.web.tr/analiz/haber/1726/suriyedeki-son-saldiri-ve-katliamlar-antakya-operasyon-odasindan-#.XTscIZMzZQI>.
- Skidmore, J. "Foreign Fighter Involvement in Syria." *IDC Herzliya*, January 2014, Accessed April 13, 2018, <https://i-hls.com/wp-content/uploads/2014/01/Foreign-Fighter-Involvement-in-Syria.pdf>.
- Soage, A. B., & Franganillo, J. F. "The Muslim Brothers in Egypt." In *The Muslim Brotherhood: The Organization and Policies of a Global Islamist Movement*, edited by Barry Rubin, 39-57. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.
- Soage, Ana Belén. "Hasan al-Banna and Sayyid Qutb: Continuity or Rupture?," *The Muslim World* 99, no. 2 (April, 2009): 294-311.

Sogge, Erling. "Negotiating Jihad in Ain al-Hilweh." *Carnegie Endowment For International Peace*, Last modified May 25, 2016. <https://carnegieendowment.org/sada/63670>.

Solomon, J., Malas, N., & Norman, L. "World Leaders Urge Assad to Resign." *The Wall Street Journal*, Last modified August 19, 2011, <https://www.wsj.com/articles/SB10001424053111903639404576516144145940136>.

Sterling, Joe. "Daraa: The spark that lit the Syrian flame." *CNN*, Last modified March 1, 2012. <https://edition.cnn.com/2012/03/01/world/meast/syria-crisis-beginnings/index.html>.

Sullivan, Paul. "Globalization: Trade and Investment in Egypt, Jordan and Syria Since 1980," *Arab Studies Quarterly* 21, no. 3 (Summer 1999): 35-72.

Terrill, W. Andrew. "The Political Mythology of the Battle of Karamah," *Middle East Journal* 55, no. 1 (Winter 2001): 91-111.

Tibi, Bassam. *Islam's Predicament with Modernity: Religious Reform and Cultural Change*. London and New York: Routledge, 2009.

Toameh, Khaled Abou. "Syria Says No To Restoring Ties With 'Terrorist-Supporting' Hamas." *The Jerusalem Post*, Last modified June 12, 2019. <https://www.jpost.com/Middle-East/Syria-No-to-restoring-ties-with-terrorist-supporting-Hamas-592149>.

Tuastad, Dag. "Hamas-PLO Relations Before and After the Arab Spring," *Middle East Policy Council* 20, no. 3 (Fall 2013): 86-98.

Turner, John A. *Religious Ideology and the Roots of the Global Jihad: Salafi Jihadism and International Order*. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014.

van Dam, Nikolaos. *The Struggle for Power in Syria: Politics and Society under Asad and the Ba'th Party*. London and New York: I.B. Tauris, 2011.

Wehrey, F., Karasik, T. W., Nader, A., Ghez, J., Hansell, L., Guffey, R. A. *Saudi-Iranian Relations Since the Fall of Saddam: Rivalry, Cooperation, and Implications for U.S. Policy*, Santa Monica: Rand Corporation, 2009.

Weinberg, David Andrew. "Analysis: Jund al-Aqsa's deep Gulf roots." *Long War Journal*, Last modified November 18, 2016. <https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2016/11/analysis-jund-al-aqsas-deep-gulf-roots.php>.

Weismann, Itzhak. *Abd al-Rahman al-Kawakibi: Islamic Reform and Arab Revival*. London: Oneworld Publications, 2015.

Weiss, Caleb. "Al Qaeda-linked Lebanese jihadist eulogizes Palestinian figure killed in Syria." *Long War Journal*, Last modified February 28, 2018. <https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2018/02/al-qaeda-linked-lebanese-jihadist-eulogizes-palestinian-figure-killed-in-syria.php>.

Weiss, Caleb. "Islamic State releases photos from Yarmouk Palestinian refugee camp in Damascus." *Long War Journal*, Last modified April 5

Weiss, Caleb. "Palestinian jihadist group in Syria issues call to arms to refugee camp in Lebanon." *Long War Journal*, Last modified February 6, 2018. <https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2018/02/palestinian-jihadist-group-in-syria-directs-message-to-refugee-camp-in-lebanon.php>.

Weiss, Caleb. "Uighur group in Syria creates Palestinian sub-unit." *Long War Journal*, Last modified January 25, 2018. <https://www.longwarjournal.org/archives/2018/01/uighur-group-in-syria-creates-palestinian-sub-unit.php>.

Wickham, Carrie Rosefsky. *The Muslim Brotherhood: Evolution of an Islamist Movement*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2013.

Wickler, Onn. "Syrian Migration to the Arab oil-producing countries", *Middle Eastern Studies*, Vol. 33, No. 1 (January, 1997), pp. 107-118.

Wood, Simon. *Christian Criticisms, Islamic Proofs: Rashid Rida's Modernist Defence of Islam*. Oxford: Oneworld Publications, 2007.

Zaid, Mohammed. *The Muslim Brotherhood and Egypt's Succession Crisis: The Politics of Liberalisation and Reform in the Middle East*. London and New York: I.B. Tauris Publishers, 2010.

Zelin, Aaron Y. "Foreign Fighters Trickle into the Syrian Rebellion." *The Washington Institute*, Last modified June 11, 2012. <https://www.washingtoninstitute.org/policy-analysis/view/foreign-fighters-trickle-into-the-syrian-rebellion>.

Zelin, Aaron Y. "Up to 11,000 Foreign Fighters in Syria; Steep Rise Among Western Europeans." *The Washington Institute*, Last modified December 17, 2013. <https://www.washingtoninstitute.org/policy-analysis/view/up-to-11000-foreign-fighters-in-syria-steep-rise-among-western-europeans>.

Zisser, Eyal. "Hafiz al-Asad Discovers Islam," *Middle East Quarterly* 6, no. 1 (March 1999): 49-56.

Zisser, Eyal. "Syria, Ba'th Regime and the Islamic Movement: Stepping on a New Path?," *The Muslim World* 95, no. 1 (February 2005): 43-65.

Zisser, Eyal. *Commanding Syria: Bashar al-Assad and the First Years in Power*. London and New York: I.B. Tauris, 2007.

Zoepf, Katherine. "Islamic Revival Led by Women Tests Syria's Secularism", *The New York Times*, August 29, 2006, <https://www.nytimes.com/2006/08/30/learning/featuredarticle/20060830wednesday.html> (Accessed on July 13, 2019).

Zollner, Barbara. *The Muslim Brotherhood: Hasan al-Hudeybi and Ideology*. London and New York: Routledge, 2009.

APPENDICES

A. TURKISH SUMMERY/TÜRKÇE ÖZET

Suriye’de 2011 yılının Mart ayında başlayan eylemler, çok kısa bir süre içerisinde bölgesel ve uluslararası aktörlerin müdahale ve savaş alanı haline gelmiş, süregiden savaş yalnızca Suriye’nin değil bölgenin ve dünyanın da çehresini değiştirmiştir. Katar, Suudi Arabistan, Birleşik Arap Emirlikleri, Türkiye, İran gibi bölgesel güçler Suriye’deki vekilleri aracılığıyla savaşa müdahil olurken, ABD ve Rusya gibi uluslararası güçler de sürece hem askeri hem de diplomatik olarak ağırlık koymaya çalışmaktadır. Öte yandan savaş Suriye ve bölgede büyük demografik değişikliklere neden olmuş, özellikle komşu ülkelerde (Türkiye, Lübnan, Ürdün) Suriyeli mülteciler sorunu başgöstermiştir. Suriye ile olan tarihsel ve politik bağları nedeniyle Lübnan özel bir yerde dururken, Lübnan’ın özgün politik sistemi ve Filistin sorunu bağlamında taşıdığı önem, Suriye Savaşı’na özel bir etkide bulunmuştur. Suriye Savaşı; uluslararası cihatçılık, uluslararası ve bölgesel güçlerin müdahaleleri, Suriye’nin iktisadi ve siyasi yapısı, Lübnan ve Filistin sorunu kümelerinin kesişim noktasında yer almaktadır.

Lübnan’daki dini/mezhepsel temsile dayanan politik sistem, İsrail devletinin kurulması ve ardından Filistinlilerin topraklarından edilmesiyle birlikte taşınamaz hale gelmiş, Lübnan’ın güneyinin Filistin direnişinin merkezi haline gelmesiyle birlikte iç savaşa doğru giden bir seyir izlemiştir. Lübnan İç Savaşı, “Filistin sorunu” dolayısıyla patlak vermiş, Filistin Kurtuluş Örgütü (FKÖ) ile örgütün Filistin mülteci kamplarında elde ettiği güç, başta İsrail olmak üzere bir dizi ulusal ve bölgesel gücün hiddetini üzerine çekmiştir. FKÖ’nün uzun süre egemen olduğu kamplar, örgüt ile Lübnan devleti arasında imzalanan Kahire Anlaşması’nın (1969) hükümleri doğrultusunda Filistinli direniş gruplarının egemenliğine bırakıldığı için,

anlaşma daha sonra ilga edilmesine rağmen, bugüne kadar süren “devlet içinde devlet” özelliğine kavuşmuştur.

1967 Arap-İsrail Savaşı’nda Arap ordularının başarısızlığı ve Mısır lideri Cemal Abdül Nasır önderliğindeki Arap milliyetçiliğinin ekonomik ve politik gerilemesi, önce Filistin’in kurtuluşunu merkeze alan Filistin ulusal hareketine yol vermiş, daha sonra 1970’li yıllarda dünya kapitalist sisteminin yeniden yapılandırılması bağlamında ekonomik ve politik olarak Orta Doğu’da ABD ve Avrupa tarafından desteklenen Suudi Arabistan’ın yükselişi ve İslamcı hareketlerin güç kazanmasına neden olmuştur. Yükselen petrol fiyatları, Körfez sermayesinin ABD ve Avrupa’daki büyük ölçekli yatırımları, özellikle Suudi Arabistan’ın dünya sistemi içerisindeki yerini kuvvetlendirirken, ülkenin resmi ideolojisi Vahhabilik küresel çapta faaliyet yürüten kurumlar aracılığıyla yayılmak istenmiştir. Bu döneme, ekonomik neoliberalizm, İslamcılık ve Soğuk Savaş ideolojisi olarak anti-komünizm damga vurmuştur.

Dönemin Filistin sorununa yansıması, FKÖ’nin Lübnan’dan çıkartılması ve mülteci kamplarını merkeze alan Filistin milliyetçiliğinin erozyona uğraması şeklinde tezahür etmiştir. İran İslam Devrimi’nin yarattığı İslamcı uyanışla da birleşen seküler milliyetçiliğin gerilmesi fenomeni, Filistin kamplarının altyapısının İsrail işgali tarafından yok edilmesi ve FKÖ’nün uzlaşmacı tutumu da eklenince, yerini Hamas’ta cisimleşen İslamcılığa bırakacaktı. Birinci İntifada’nın İsrail işgali altındaki Filistin topraklarında patlak vermesi, Filistin davasının odağını değiştirecek, Lübnan’daki kamplar ekonomik sorunlar, işsizlik, marjinalleşme ve eğitimsizlik gibi nedenlerle yavaş yavaş çehresini değiştirecekti.

Bu değişimin mihenk taşı, cihatçı düşüncenin uluslararasılaşmasına yol açan Afganistan’daki Sovyet karşıtı cihattı. Filistinli Abdullah Azzam’ın önderliğini yaptığı “Arap Afgan mücahitler”, Pakistan ve Suudi Arabistan ile ABD’nin desteğiyle Afganistan’daki Sovyet yanlısı hükümete ve Kızıl Ordu’ya karşı savaşıyor ve cihat fikrini “yakın düşman”dan “uzak düşman”a, yani komünizm ve

Sovyetler Birlięi'ne yöneltecekti. Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nun son döneminde, özellikle Avrupa sömürgecilięi ile temasta şekillenen Selefilik, uzun ve kırılmalı bir yolculuk izleyerek 20. Yüzyıldaki militan cihatçı akımları beslemişti. Uzunca bir süre “İslam'dan uzaklaşan ve Batılı eğitim ile Müslüman halk kitlelerine yabancılaşan yerel elitlere” karşı mücadeleyi savunan Selefi cihatçılık, Afganistan ile birlikte yön deęiştirip yakın düşman ile uzak düşmanı birbirine bağlamıştı. Bununla birlikte, 19. Yüzyıl sonunda şekillenen ve İslam'ın ilk çağlarına (Peygamber'in ve Dört Halife'nin çağına) dönmeyi hedefleyen Selefilik, Cemaleddin Afganî, Muhammed Abduh, Reşit Rıza gibi kurucu babaların Mısır'daki Müslüman Kardeşler hareketine ilham vermesiyle birlikte Batı karşıtlığı, İslam'da arınma, dini ve eğitsel kurumların köhnelięi, Şii/Sufi/Alevi düşmanlığı gibi ideolojik motifleri bugünkü “modern” cihatçılıęa aktarmıştı. Sonuç olarak, Afganistan'da Kızıl Ordu'ya karşı savaşla gündeme oturan “modern” cihatçılık, hem 19. Yüzyılda temelleri atılan Selefililięin, hem de 1970'li yıllardaki uluslararası ve bölgesel dönüşümün meşru bir çocuęuydu.

Bu çalışma, temel olarak řu sorulara cevap aramaktadır: Lübnan'daki mülteci kamplarından Suriye'ye savaşmaya giden Filistinli cihatçılar, hangi motivasyonlarla savaşmaktadır? Çalışma, Filistinli cihatçıların sayılarını, sosyo-ekonomik durumlarını ve kamplardaki cihatçı hareketlerin muhtemel geleceęini incelemektedir. Bu incelemeyi yaparken, cihatçı hareketin 19. ve 20. yüzyıldaki izini sürerken, Suriye tarihine ve Suriye Savaşı'nın nedenlerine deęinip Filistin sorununu Lübnan bağlamında deęerlendirmektedir.

Çalışmanın Giriş kısmında, yukarıdaki soruların aktarılmasının yanında, Suriye Savaşı'na dair güncel literatür deęerlendirilmektedir. Bu literatür, çağdaş cihatçı hareketlerin tarihine de içermekte, özellikle 11 Eylül saldırıları sonrasındaki yazın genellikle Amerikan ulusal güvenlik çıkarları perspektifinden meseleye yaklaşmaktadır. Güncel deęerlendirmeler de, ya Suriye Savaşı'nın mezhep tarafına odaklanmakta, ya da Beşar Esad yönetimi Arap dünyasındaki sömürgecilik sonrası “otoriter” yönetimler ekseninde açıklanmaya çalışılmaktadır. Bu çalışma ise, Orta

Doğu'nun iktisadi ve politik dönüşümünü dünyadaki değişime bağlamakta, Suriye'yi ve Lübnan'daki Filistin sorununu da bu bağlama oturtarak paralel bir hikâye olarak modern Selefi-cihatçı düşünceyi anlatmaktadır.

Bu bağlamda, çalışmanın Giriş'i takip eden ikinci bölümünde Selefi düşüncenin ve modern cihatçılığın kaynakları incelenmektedir. Suriye Savaşı'nın ve bu savaşta Filistinli cihatçıların düşünsel izlekleri modern Selefi düşünceye, Müslüman Kardeşler hareketine ve onunla ilişkisi hâlâ tartışma konusu olan Seyyid Kutub'un yazılarına kadar gitmektedir. Bu bölümde Selefilik'in kurucu babalarına odaklanılırken, Seyyid Kutub ve sonrasındaki militan cihatçı geleneğin Orta Doğu'nun dönüşümüyle bağlantısı incelenmektedir. Avupa sömürgeciliğinin, özellikle de Britanya ve Fransa'nın Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nun Arap bölgelerine 19. yüzyıldaki sızmaları, hem Osmanlı'nın çıkış arayan aydınlarını, hem de çevredeki Arap düşünürleri yeni siyasi düşünceleri arayışına itmiştir. Selefi düşüncenin çıkışı, İslam dünyasının Batı karşısındaki geri kalmışlığını aşma isteğiyle paralel ilerlerken, sorun "kirlenmiş İslam" anlayışında görülmüş ve altın çağ arayışına girilmiştir. Peygamber'in hüküm sürdüğü yıllarla Dört Halife dönemini İslam'ın altın çağı olarak gören Selefi düşünce, bu çağ ile sömürgecilik çağının Müslümanlarını kıyaslamış ve İslam'ın gerçek hüviyetini kavuşması için arınması gerektiğini ileri sürmüştür. Selefi düşüncenin kurucu babalarına bakılırsa, bir zamanlar ileri düşüncelerin membaı olan İslam dünyası, sonrasında dini düşünceyi bozan kurumsal ve düşünsel prangalardan kurtularak sömürgecileri de alt edebilecektir. Afganî, Abduh ve Rıza bu nedenle Müslümanları geriye düşüren köhnemiş eğitim kurumlarının yenilenmesi gerektiğini savunmuş, İslam'da hukukun kaynağı olan Kuran ve Sünnet'e dönüşün hayata geçirilmesi gerektiğini düşünmüşlerdir. Onlara göre İslam hukukunda, Batı'da olduğu gibi bir devlet ve din ayrımı bulunmamakta, Müslüman dünyasında bu seküler sistemi uygulama denemeleri toplumda doldurulamayacak bir yarığa, bir ikiliğe sebep olmaktadır. Bu ikilik, Batı etkisiyle eğitilmiş yöneticilerle geleneksel İslami değerlerle yetişmiş halk arasında; hem Batı eğitimi almış hem de İslami eğitim kurumlarıyla büyümüş halk kitlesi arasında ortaya çıkmaktadır. Selefi düşünce, düşünürlere göre, bu ikiliği İslam'ın özel ve

kamuya bütün olarak bakan şeriatı aracılığıyla aşmayı hedeflemektedir. Modern Selefilğin kurucuları açısından, İslam toplumlarının eğitim yoluyla aydınlatılması birincil önemdedir. Bu nedenle, Selefilğin bir politik hareket olmazdan önce “kültürel” bir hareket olarak faaliyetine başlaması bu doktrinle tutarlıdır. Nitekim, modern Selefilğin etkilediği ilk kitlesel hareket olan Müslüman Kardeşler’in kurucusu Hasan el-Benna, örgütü politik değil kültürel bir hareket olarak tanımlamıştır. Buna rağmen, Müslüman Kardeşler tüm sömürgeci karşıtı söylemine rağmen pragmatist bir siyaset izlemiş, Britanya destekli Kral Faruk ve yönetimiyle iyi ilişkiler kurmuş, krallık ve Britanya düşmanı milliyetçi muhalefete karşı bir bariyer olarak görülmüştür. Yine Selefilğin kurucu babaları cihat, anti-emperyalizm, anti-sekülerizm ve popülizmin eklektik bir bileşimini savunmuşlar ve zaman zaman tutarsızlığa düşmüşlerdir. Aynı düşünür hem milliyetçiliği Müslümanları bölen bir ideoloji olarak kınarken, aynı zamanda hilafetin Araplara ait olması gerektiğini savunabilmektedir. Müslüman Kardeşler, Britanya’ya karşı mücadeleyi ön plana çıkartırken, Hür Subaylar Devrimi’nin ardından iktidara gelen Cemal Abdül Nasır ile mücadeleye girişmiş ancak büyük oranda tasfiye edilmiştir. Bu dönemin en etkili ismi Seyyid Kutub, Selefi düşüncüyü militan cihatçılıkla buluşturmuş ve saf İslami yönetimin kurulması için “materyalizm” ve “cahiliye” batağındaki ulusal yöneticilere ve kurumlara karşı cihat çağrısında bulunmuştur. Kutub, “materyalizm”den kapitalizmin Marksist eleştirisini değil, “maddi/dünyevî değerlerin peşinden koşma”yı anlamaktadır. Bu nedenle kendisini hem kapitalizme hem de komünizme karşı konumlandıran Kutub, bu iki sistemin karşısına İslam’ı bağımsız bir başka sistem olarak çıkarmaya çalışmıştır. Daha sonra Nasırcı Arap milliyetçiliğinin düşüşü ve Orta Doğu’nun dönüşümü sürecinde, Kutubcu militan cihatçılık ile Suudi Arabistan’dan yayılan püriten Vahhabiliğin füzyonu, uluslararası cihatçılığa çok önemli bir ideolojik yakıt sağlamıştır. Nasırcı Arap milliyetçiliğinin devletçi ekonomik politikaları yerini Enver Sadat’ın “açılım” adı altındaki liberal politikalarına bırakırken, daha önceleri devletin üstlendiği toplumsal ve ekonomik işlevleri İslamcı STK’lar doldurmaya başlamıştır. “İnanç Temelli Örgütler” hayır işleri adı altında devlet hizmetlerini üstlenmiş, Körfez sermayesinin akışıyla birlikte bu STK’lar neoliberal trendle uyum içerisinde gelişmiştir. Afganistan’daki Sovyetler

Birliđi karřıtı cihat pratiđi, bu militan Selefi-cihatçı dūřuncenin yayılmasına neden olmuř, daha sonra El Kaide de bu Afgan cihadının iinden ıkmıřtır. Afganistan rneđinde, dūnya apındaki STK'lar Krfez'deki zengin ve Vahhabi iřadamları tarafından fonlanmıř, İslamcı STK'ları iin de dūnya apında būyk bađıř organizasyonları dzenlenmiřtir. El Kaide ile birlikte cihat dūřuncesi 1990'lı yıllarla birlikte ‐uzak dūřman‐ a ynelmiř ve 11 Eyll 2001'deki ABD'ye ynelik saldırılar ve ardından Afganistan ile Irak'ın iřgal edilmesi, kresel cihat fikrine yeni bir ehre kazandırmıřtır. Irak'ta Saddam Hseyin ynetiminin devrilmesinin ardından dnemin Bush ynetimi İran'ın blgedeki etkinliđinin arttıđını tespit etmiř, Suudi Arabistan ile birlikte Orta Dođu'daki ‐řii eksenini‐ne karřı bir ‐Snni eksenini‐ siyasetine bařlamıřtır. 2006'da Hizbullah'ın İsrail'i yenmesi, Irak'ın iřgalden sonra oluřturulan Lbnan benzeri dini-mezhepi politik sisteminde řiilerin artan etkinliđi, Irak El Kaidesi lideri Ebu Musab el-Zerkavi'nin tekfirici anlayıřı yaygınlařtırmasıyla birleřince, uluslararası cihat fikri ‐Yahudi ve Halılardan daha tehlikeli‐ olarak grdđ řiilere –ve kısmen de Alevilere- ynelik topyekn bir imha ađrısına dnřmřtir. Bugn Suriye'de devam eden ‐cihatın‐ tarihsel arka planı zetle byledir: Batı smrgeciliđinin Orta Dođu'ya giriři; Orta Dođu'nun blnmesi, hilafetin kaldırılması ve milliyetiliđin ykseliři; İsrail'in kuruluřu ve Arap-İsrail atıřmaları, Arap milliyetiliđinin dūřř; kapitalizmin kresel krizi ve yeniden yapılandırma, neoliberalizm temelinde Orta Dođu'nun kapitalizme entegrasyonu ve Suudi Arabistan'ın ykseliři; Sođuk Savař anti-komnizmi ve Afganistan'da Sovyet karřıtı, ABD'nin de dahil olduđu ‐birleřik cephe.‐ Btn bunlarla birlikte, militan cihatılıđın ve Selefililiđin İslam ierisinde en byk beđi oluřturdukları dūřnlmemelidir. Cihatı hareketin kendi ierisinde de gerilimler srmekte, Suriye Savařı'nın ortaya ıkardıđı zere, El Kaide ve trevi rgtlerin zaman zaman birbirleriyle atıřtıkları grlmektedir. Suriye Savařı, uluslararası cihat řebekesi ierisinde IřİD-El Kaide blnmesine neden olmuř, El Kaide'nin Suriye'deki kolu El Nusra Cephesi de, zellikle blgesel ve uluslararası desteđin kesilmemesi iin El Kaide merkeziyle arasında mesafe koyarak isim deđiřirmiřtir. Bunun yanı sıra, merkezi El Kaide liderliđi de Suriye'deki ve Levant blgesindeki ‐cihat‐ın

gerektirdiklerine dair kendi kadrolarıyla zaman zaman ters düşmüş, saha kontrolü ile gerilla mücadelesi arasında gidip gelen taktikler savunmuştur.

Üçüncü bölümde, Suriye'nin 20. yüzyıldaki ekonomik ve politik tarihine kısa bir bakış atılmaktadır. Bağımsızlığın ardından politik çalkantılar yaşayan ülke, ardı ardına gelen Baas hükümetleri ile birlikte radikal bir toplumsal ve politik dönüşüm süreci yaşamış, Baas iktidarında ayrıcalıklarını kaybeden toplumsal sınıflarla yeni iktidarda yükselişe geçen toplumsal sınıflar arasındaki çatışmalar yer yer iç savaş görünümünü almış ve mezhepçi bir karaktere bürünmüştür. Bugünkü Suriye Savaşı'nda gayet belirgin olan mezhepçi ton, Suriye'nin 20. yüzyılında tabloya eklenmiştir. Özellikle Baas iktidarının millileştirme ve toprak reformu politikalarıyla gücünü kaybetmeye başlayan kentli Sünni tüccar sınıfı, Baas'ın kırsal nüfusu Suriye'nin toplumsal hayatını soktuğu politikalarına muhalefetin temel adresi olmuştur. Bu sınıf politil temsiliyetini Müslüman Kardeşler örgütünde bulmuş, Kardeşlik'in politikaları, Baas iktidarlarında devlet ve toplum katında yükselmeye başlayan Alevi ve Dürzi azınlıklara karşı mezhep farklılıklarına da oynayan bir karaktere bürünmüştür. Bu gerilim, 1970'li yılların sonunda silahlı çatışmalara dönüşmüş ve 1982'de Hama ile sonuçlanan bir iç savaş hüviyetine kavuşmuştur. Bununla birlikte, Hafız Esad'ın Baas Partisi içindeki ekonomik ve politik olarak daha "ılımlı" pozisyonu güçlenmiş, baba Esad partinin toplumsal tabanını eski rejimin kalıntılarına doğru uzatarak Şam ve Halep'teki "Sünni" tüccar sınıfını yeni rejime belli ölçülerde bağlamayı başarmıştır. 1980'li yılların borç krizi Esad'ı ekonomide liberalizasyona itmiş, 1990'lı yıllarda Sovyetler Birliği'nin de çözülüşü ile birlikte dış yatırım çekmek ve İsrail'e karşı bir cephe oluşturmak amacıyla liberal politikalar İslamcılığa en azından bölgesel düzeyde alan açmakla sonuçlanmıştır. FKÖ'nün İsrail'le Oslo'da anlaşması ve İslamcı hareketlerin FKÖ'ye olan itirazları, Hafız Esad yönetimini bölgesel düzeydeki İslamcı hareketlerle ittifak kurmaya yöneltmiştir. Suriye, SSCB'nin yokluğunda işgal altındaki Golan Tepeleri'ni konvansiyonel askeri metotlarla geri alamayacağını düşünmüş ve Hizbullah-İran ekseninde İsrail'e karşı mücadeleye dahil olmuştur. Lübnan'da, Suriye ordusunun Refik Hariri suikastinden sonra geri çekilmesine rağmen, Suriye belirleyiciliğinde bir politik atmosfer

yaratarak etkinliğini devam ettirmiş ve İsrail'e karşı bir ağırlık oluşturmuştur. Hafız Esad döneminde başlayan ve Beşar Esad döneminde hızlanarak devam eden dış açılma ve ekonomik reform süreci de savaşın nedenleri arasında sayılmaktadır. Devletin neoliberal dönüşümü, ekonomik sübvansiyonların kesilmesi, özelleştirmeler, para politikasının gevşetilmesi, tarımda savaş öncesi çöküşü hızlandıran büyük kuraklık Suriye Savaşı'nın ekonomik arka planını oluşturmaktadır. İkinci bölümde, bu reform sürecine de değinilmektedir. Reformu, Beşar Esad'ın "sosyal piyasa ekonomisi" anlayışı özetlerken, baba Esad döneminde başlayıp oğul Esad döneminde hızlanan yeni sınıfsal konfigürasyonlar önem kazanmıştır. "Yeni burjuva sınıfı" denen bu sınıf, özelleştirmeler ve ekonominin dışa açılımı/dış kaynak bulma sürecinde devlet eliyle zenginleşen bir toplumsal kesim olarak öne çıkmaktadır. Suriye devletinin içerisindeki yolsuzluk ve nepotizm gibi uygulamaların büyük oranda bu yeni sınıf ile devlet arasındaki işbirliğine dayandığı düşünülmektedir. Bunun yanı sıra, Suriye Savaşı'na ilişkin medya anlatıları da değerlendirilmekte ve anaakım medyanın savaşa dair tutumunun bir eleştirisi sunulmaktadır. Suriye Savaşı, sahada silahların patlamasının yanı sıra uluslararası bir enformasyonun savaşına da sahne olmuştur, olmaya devam etmektedir. Bu savaşın içerisinde protestoların başlangıcı ve niteliği; Esad karşıtı muhalefetin ideolojik pozisyonu; dış güçlerin, özellikle de ABD ve bölgedeki müttefikleri Katar, Suudi Arabistan ve Türkiye'nin müdahaleleri; Suriye hükümetinin protestolara tepkileri; silahlı grupların lojistik kaynakları; savaş sürecindeki büyük çaplı katliamlar yer almaktadır. Bu bölümde incelenen Savaş'a verilen tepkiler de yukarıdaki konuyla bağlantılıdır. Bölgesel ve uluslararası güçlerin 2011'in Mart ayında başlayan eylemlere verdiği tepkiler çeşitlilik arz etmiş, aynı ülke savaş boyunca farklı farklı pozisyonlar almıştır. ABD, Obama yönetiminin Orta Doğu'dan Asya-Pasifik'e stratejik olarak ağırlık kaydırmak istediği bir zaman diliminde Suriye Savaşı'na dahil olarak Beşar Esad'ın devrilmesine destek olmuş, ancak doğrudan bir askeri müdahaleden imtina etmiştir. Rusya 2015'te direkt olarak sahaya inmiş ve sahneyi baştan başa değiştirmiştir. İran, kendi ulusal güvenliğini Suriye'de çizmişken, Amerikan müttefikleri Katar, Türkiye ve Suudi Arabistan Suriye üzerinde birbirlerinin ayağına basan pozisyonlar almışlardır. ABD ve Türkiye'nin Suriye'deki

askeri varlıkları Şam yönetimi tarafından yasadışı görülürken, iki ülke de güçlerini “rejim değişikliği” için kullanmıyor gözükmelerine rağmen “siyasi geçiş” adı altında Suriye’nin yönetimini belirlemek istemekten geri durmamaktadır. Türkiye, bu pozisyonunu Suriye’nin müttefikleri Rusya ve İran’la başlattığı “Astana mutabakatı” ile garanti altına almak istemektedir. Ancak bu üçlünün Suriye’nin geleceği ve Türkiye’nin askeri varlığı konusunda mutabık olmadıkları da görülmektedir. Ezcümle, Suriye Savaşı’nın şiddeti azalsa da, “siyasi çözüm” konusunda ufukta bir ışık görülmemektedir. Ülkelerin Suriye politikaları ve ittifakları sürekli değişmekte, en tepede ise uluslararası rekabet durmaktadır. ABD Başkanı Donald Trump’ın Suriye’den asker çekme açıklaması bu devletin içindeki başka kanatlar tarafından farklı yorumlanırken, İran’a yönelik saldırgan politika Suriye’yi de etkilemektedir.

Çalışmanın dördüncü bölümünde Filistin ve mülteciler sorunun doğuşuna değinilmektedir. Filistin sorunun geçirdiği evreler (İngiliz manda yönetiminde Araplar ile Yahudiler arasındaki ulusal gerilim; İsrail’in kuruluşuyla birlikte Filistin’in bir Arap-İsrail sorununa dönüşmesi; 1967 Savaşı’ndan sonra “önce Filistin” yaklaşımının yükselişe geçmesi ve FKÖ egemenliği; FKÖ’nün Lübnan’dan çıkarılması ve Birinci İntifada ile birlikte İslamcı hareketlerin yükselişi) arka planı oluştururken, Lübnan’daki mülteci kamplarının Filistin davası için taşıdığı önem incelenmektedir. Filistin sorununu dünyanın gündemine taşıyan ve Arap ordularının İsrail karşısındaki zayıflığını gerilla tipinde bir halk savaşıyla gidermek isteyen FKÖ, kendi ideolojik ve toplumsal tabanını esas olarak mülteci kamplarında tesis etmiştir. Filistin sorunu, Filistinlilerin yurtlarından edilmesi nedeniyle uzunca bir süre esas olarak bir mülteci sorunu olarak gündeme gelmiştir. Ürdün’den çıkarıldıktan sonra Lübnan’a yerleşen ve buradaki kamplarda “devlet içinde devlet” kuran FKÖ, Filistinlilerin eğitim, sağlık, barınma gibi ihtiyaçlarını karşılarken, önemli bir istihdam kapısı da olmuştur. Güney Lübnan’dan İsrail’e saldırılar düzenleyen FKÖ milisleri, uzun bir süre Lübnan halkı içinde Hristiyanlar hariç önemli bir mevzi kazanmış, Filistinlilerin yanı sıra Lübnanlılara da sosyal hizmetler götürmeye başlamıştır. Filistinlilerin Lübnan’daki kırılğan politik sistem üzerinde bir yük oluşturduğunu düşünen kesimler, özellikle de Maruniler, İç Savaş’a giden yolun

taşlarını döşerken, 1982'deki İsrail işgali FKÖ için Lübnan'da sonun başlangıcı olmuştur. İsrail, yalnızca FKÖ'yü Lübnan'dan çıkarmak yönünde hareket etmemiş, ülkedeki Filistin nüfusuna karşı da bir imha kampanyasına girişmiş, FKÖ'nün kamplarda oluşturduğu altyapıları yok etmek suretiyle Filistin milliyetçiliğinin toplumsal tabanını da yok etmek istemiştir. İç Savaş sürerken İsrail işgali sonucunda Lübnan'dan ayrılmak zorunda bırakılan FKÖ'nün kamplardaki egemenliğinin çözülmesi, Orta Doğu'nun ekonomik ve politik dönüşümüyle ilişkilendirilmiş, Suudi Krallığı'nın yükselişi ve uluslararası cihatçı hareketlerin gelişimi Filistin sorunundaki dönüşüme bağlanmıştır. Filistin sorununun merkezinin mülteci kamplarından işgal altındaki Filistin topraklarına kayması, Birinci İntifada ve Oslo Anlaşması sonrasında Filistin Yönetimi'nin işgal topraklarına taşınmasıyla birlikte ilerlemiş, FKÖ'nün İsrail ile uzlaşması seküler Filistin milliyetçiliğine karşı İslamcı hareketlerin yükselişine neden olmuştur. 1990'lı yılların sonuna kadar Lübnan'daki kamplara kesin bir geri dönüş yapamayan FKÖ'nün bıraktığı boşluk, Birleşmiş Milletler'in de etkisiz kalmasıyla birlikte Körfez'den akan fonlar ve cihatçı hareketler tarafından doldurulmaya başlanmıştır. Lübnan'daki Filistin mülteci kampları, Lübnan devletinin de müdahale etmekten kaçınması sebebiyle, her milletten cihatçıya ev sahipliği yapmaya başlamıştır. Suriye Savaşı'nın başlangıcında, Lübnan'dan savaşımaya giden militanlar, Suriye'deki cihatçı grupların güçlenmesinde kritik bir tol oynamışlardır. Kimi Selefi figürler, Lübnan'ın karışık dini ve mezhepsel yapısı nedeniyle yalnızca Lübnan'ı ölçek olarak kabul eden bir cihatçı hareketin düşünülmemeyeceğini, Lübnan'ın ancak geniş Bilad'üş Şam topraklarının içerisinde değer kazanacağını ve Suriye'deki cihat için bir "destek cephesi" olabileceğini söyleyerek, Lübnan'ın genişletilmiş Suriye coğrafyası için taşıdığı öneme dikkat çekmiştir. 2017 ve 2018 yıllarında Suriye ordusu, Lübnan ordusu ve Hizbullah tarafından yapılan ortak operasyonlarla sınır hattı kapatılınca Lübnan'dan Suriye'ye militan akışı büyük oranda durmuş, mülteci kamplarının içerisinde zaman zaman çatışmalar yaşansa da cihatçı şebeke "uyku moduna" geçmiştir. Bu yıllar, IŞİD'in "devlet" olma halinin bitişine ve El Kaide'nin Suriye-Lübnan sınırının iki yakasındaki etkinliğinin son bulmasına tekabül etmektedir. Son olarak, kamplardan Suriye'ye savaşımaya giden cihatçıların bağlı bulunduğu gruplar,

grupların etkinliđi, cihatçıların profilleri ve savaş motifleri incelenmiştir. Bu bağlamda, Ürdün ve Suriye’deki Filistin mülteci kamplarının toplumsal ve mekansal özellikleri ile Lübnan’daki kampların toplumsal ve mekansal özellikleri mukayese edilmiş, Lübnan’daki Filistinlilerin diğeri iki ÷lkeye nazaran entegrasyon ve hukuki statü gibi noktalarda daha kötü koşullarda yaşadığı tespit edilmiştir. Lübnan’daki Filistinli mültecilerin yaşam koşulları, yeni bir yasa ile birlikte daha da kırılgan hale gelmiş, çok sayıda Filistinlinin çalışma izni iptal edilirken, Filistinliler çeşitli eylemlerle Lübnan devletinin ilgili yasayı geri çekmesini talep etmiştir. Suriye-Lübnan sınırının büyük oranda kontrol alınmasıyla birlikte militan akışının seyrelmesine rağmen, kamplardaki devlet egemenliğinin eksikliği, ekonomik sorunlar, bölgesel ve uluslararası şartlar cihatçı şebekelerin örgütlülüğünün sürmesine neden olacak gibi görünmektedir. Kamp yetkilileri, IŞİD’e katılan gençlerin yaş ortalamasının 17 ila 20 arasında değiştiğini, bu gençlerin Suriye’de savaşmaya gitmelerinin temel nedeninin işsizlik olduğunu ileri sürmektedirler. Ayn el-Hilve mülteci kampında işsizlik zaman zaman yüzde 80’e kadar çıkarken, “cihat”ın kamptaki Filistinli gençlere bir yaşam motivasyonu sağladığı da iddialar arasında. Filistinlilerin, Lübnanlı militan cihatçı örgütlerle Suriyeli militan cihatçı örgütler arasında bir köprü vazifesi gördüğü de yine kamp sakinleri tarafından ortaya atılan görüşlerden. Bazı iddialara göre, El Nusra Cephesi’nin lideri Ebu Muhammed el-Culani de 2006 yılında kamplardaki bir cihatçı gruba destek vermek için Lübnan’a gelmişti. Nusra’nın Suriye Savaşı’ndaki rolünün büyümesinin Lübnan’dan gelen militanlarla birlikte ortaya çıktığı kuvvetli bir şekilde dillendiriliyor. Öte yandan, kamplardaki kontrolün zayıflığı ve uluslararası ölçekte faaliyet yürüten cihatçı gruplara mensup kişilerin görece rahat biçimde kamp içinde faaliyet yürütebilmeleri ya da sığınabilmeleri, Suriye’deki Filistinli kamplardan gelme cihatçıların profillerini çıkartmada zorluk yaratmaktadır. Bundan dolayı, Lübnan’daki Filistin mülteci kampları ve buradaki cihatçı örgütler hakkında güncel araştırmalara ihtiyaç duyulmaktadır.

B. TEZ İZİN FORMU / THESIS PERMISSION FORM

ENSTİTÜ / INSTITUTE

Fen Bilimleri Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Natural and Applied Sciences

☐

Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Social Sciences

☒

Uygulamalı Matematik Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Applied Mathematics

☐

Enformatik Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Informatics

☐

Deniz Bilimleri Enstitüsü / Graduate School of Marine Sciences

☐

YAZARIN / AUTHOR

Soyadı / Surname : Çete
Adı / Name : Erman
Bölümü / Department : Orta Doğu Araştırmaları

TEZİN ADI / TITLE OF THE THESIS (İngilizce / English) : Not al-Quds, but Damascus:
Palestinian Jihadists of Lebanon in the Syrian War (2011 – 2017)

TEZİN TÜRÜ / DEGREE: **Yüksek Lisans** / Master

☒

Doktora / PhD

☐

1. **Tezin tamamı dünya çapında erişime açılacaktır.** / Release the entire work immediately for access worldwide.
2. **Tez iki yıl süreyle erişime kapalı olacaktır.** / Secure the entire work for patent and/or proprietary purposes for a period of **two years**. *
3. **Tez altı ay süreyle erişime kapalı olacaktır.** / Secure the entire work for period of **six months**. *

☒☐☐

* Enstitü Yönetim Kurulu kararının basılı kopyası tezle birlikte kütüphaneye teslim edilecektir.
A copy of the decision of the Institute Administrative Committee will be delivered to the library together with the printed thesis.

Yazarın imzası / Signature

Tarih / Date