

Turkish Protest Music's Struggle for Existence in the Political Sphere of Turkey, 1960-2000

Master Thesis

Alican Ozan İşcan

1131523

Supervisors:

Prof. Dr. Noyan Dinçkal

Prof. Dr. Florian Heesch

Submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master
of Arts with the program Roads to Democracy (ies) at University of Siegen

Fakultät I

Philosophische Fakultät

Siegen, Germany

April 2017

CONFIRMATION

I hereby confirm that this Master Thesis is entirely my own work and that I have not used any additional assistance or resources other than indicated. All quotations, paraphrases, information and ideas that have been taken from other sources (including the Internet as well as other electronic sources) and other persons' work have been cited appropriately and provided with the corresponding bibliographical references. The same is true of all drawings, sketches, pictures and other illustrations that appear in the text.

I am aware that the neglect to indicate the used sources is considered as fraud and plagiarism in which case sanctions are imposed that can lead to the suspension or permanent expulsion of students in serious cases.

.....

Place/ Date

.....

Name (in capital letters)

.....

Signature

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Firstly, I would like to thank to all professors who gave shape to this research with their ideas and guidance, throughout my study in Siegen, Uppsala, and Coimbra. Furthermore, firstly to my supervisors, and secondly to the Roads to Democracy(ies) in general, I would like to express my gratitude for providing me a place where I can conduct this kind of research.

I would also like to thank all the participants who took the time to do interviews with me for their generosity.

Lastly I would also like to thank my family and friends, for their endless support.

ABSTRACT

Throughout the history of the Republic of Turkey, obstruction of freedom of expression has made an appearance in one way or another. The field of music in general was no exception to this situation. The frame that determine this thesis' borders is that it deals specifically with the obstruction of musical expression, more specifically, of protest musicians. The first reason to choose "protest music" as a subject is that it indicates an apparent -and more importantly- a popular political engagement which can easily be categorized through the perspective of history. The second reason is the importance of the sphere of influence that protest music had as a genre in the world after 1960s. In the chapter of the findings, the empirical body of the thesis will revolve around different individual's experiences. The focus will then transfer to the Independent Music scene of Istanbul, rather than staying on protest music, considering the change in the form of obstruction of musical expression, and the form of resistance against it.

Key Words: Turkey, protest music, Turkish music, independent, indie, freedom of expression, urban culture, political music, censorship

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

TRT: TURKISH RADIO AND TELEVISION CORPORATION

YTU: YILDIZ TEKNİK UNIVERSİTESİ

ITU: İSTANBUL TEKNİK UNIVERSİTESİ

BMO: BAĞIMSIZ MUZİK OLUSUMU

MH: MUZİK HAYVANI

YOKS: YOK OYLE KARARLI SEYLER

TABLE OF CONTENT

I. Introduction.....	7
II. Literature Review	11
A. Concerning Occidentalization	11
B. Concerning Folk and/or Localness	15
C. Concerning Protest Music	19
a. Examples from the World.....	19
b. Examples from Turkey	23
III. Theoretical Framework	27
A. How to read the Networks of Organization	27
B. How to read the Networks of Resistance.....	29
IV. Research Methodology	32
A. Qualitative Method and Narrative Interview.....	32
B. Sampling.....	35
V. Findings	39
A. The Historical Aspect.....	39
a. A Brief History of Music Censorship in the Early Republican Period (1923-1960)	39
b. Incidents in the 60s	40
c. Incidents in the 70s.....	41
d. Incidents in the 80s	42
e. Incidents in the 90s	43
B. The Sociological Aspect	44
a. Organizations, As an Area of Conflict	44
b. Studios, and Venue Owners: The Process of Production and Consumption	49
c. Alternative Means of Production, Kadıköy, and "Bağımsız Müzik Oluşumu".....	53
d. Resisting (and transforming) the "Piyasa": Music Journalism, and Solidarity	59
VI. Conclusion	63
BIBLIOGRAPHY	64

I. Introduction

Throughout the history of the Republic of Turkey, obstruction of freedom of expression has made an appearance in one way or another. By this, it is meant that this obstruction came from different in appearance but similar in essence sides. For this very reason, the plausible way to handle this problem is to approach it as a problem of foundation, rather than a problem of governance. The way to see this problem of foundation is simply to take a glance at the political past and present of Turkey, since even though the country housed governments which were ideologically different from each other, their initial reflex which is to suppress art that has been considered as unwarrantable, has always been a common characteristic.

The frame that determine this thesis' borders is that it deals specifically with the obstruction of musical expression, more specifically, of protest musicians. The first reason to choose "protest music" as a subject is that it indicates an apparent -and more importantly- a popular political engagement which can easily be categorized through the perspective of history. The second reason is the importance of the sphere of influence that protest music had as a genre in the world after 1960s. Much like the rest of the world, Turkish musicians also showed interest in the political atmosphere that the New Left created.¹ As Kutschke indicates this global *zeitgeist* of 1968 was experienced in an urban context through the exchange of experiences and critiques of activists from different countries that took part in their own student and protest movements. The belief in universal human rights, the rejection of heteronomy, and a heightened awareness of other nations and other people's concerns were shared particularly in urban centres of protest such as: Paris, Berlin, New York City, Prague, Mexico City, Rome, Tokyo, Bangkok, Buenos Aires, Cairo, Cape Town, Belgrade, and Istanbul.² In addition to these cities, musicians and groups such as, Víctor Jara, Inti-Illimani, Zeca Afonso, Fela Kuti, John Lennon, Bob

¹ Emrah Doğan and Banu Mustan Dönmez, "Türkiye'de Altmış Sekiz Kuşağı Dünya Algısının Popüler Müziğe Yansıması," [Reflection of Sixty-Eight Generation World Perception to Popular Music in Turkey], *İnönü University Journal of Culture and Art* 2, no. 1 (2016): 47.

² Beate Kutschke, "Protest Music, Urban Contexts and Global Perspectives" *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 46, no. 2 (2015): 322.

Dylan, and Ton Steine Scherben can be mentioned in order to display the global characteristic of this artistic instinct that was shared.

This picture summarizes the reason behind the years (1960-2000) that has been chosen for the thesis as well. When we look at Turkish musicians who composed and wrote protest songs, we can see that starting from mid-sixties they have started their professional life by recording SPs or albums. Even though musicians such as Cem Karaca, Zülfü Livaneli, and Selda Bağcan faced political oppression after 1970-80, 1960s were not easy for the musicians who they looked up to. Like the names that are given above as an example for the global characteristic of this music, figures of Turkish protest music also found their muse in the traditional music, which in this case were; Türk Halk Müziği (Turkish folk music), and the aşık edebiyatı (the ashik tradition). Âşık Mahzunî Şerif, Âşık Veysel, and Ruhi Su, who lived through the 60's, can be counted as the prominent figures of these traditions. This is the main reason behind choosing the 60's as the starting point of the thesis. Surely, in order to understand the history of these obstructions, the early republican period will also be mentioned. However the main focus will stay on the history of protest music, because there are already adequate amount of research that is based on the symbolic violence that was operated by the state which was trying to create a new type of citizen, and a new public taste that was suitable for the national identity; whether it was analyzed through the influence of ideas of Ziya Gökalp in early republican period,³⁴ or through the practices of TRT (Turkish Radio and Television Corporation).⁵

For the reason behind the emphasis on Turkey as a categorization, the gaps in the existing literature of research on protest music can be given as an explanation. Damodaran claims, one of the main characteristics of the work that is written, is that the conceptual analysis has been based on Euro-American experiences with protest genres, both as part of

³ Orhan Tekelioğlu, "The Rise of a Spontaneous Synthesis: The Historical Background of Turkish Popular Music" *Middle Eastern Studies* 32, no. 2 (1996): 194.

⁴ Ayhan Erol, "Music, Power and Symbolic Violence: The Turkish State's Music Policies During the Early Republican Period" *European Journal of Cultural Studies* 15, no. 1 (2012): 40.

⁵ Şanar Yurdatapan, "Turkey: Censorship Past and Present," in *Turkey: The Freemuse Files on Censorship of the Arts*, ed. Ole Reitov (Copenhagen: Freemuse, 2016), *Shoot the Singer! Music Censorship Today*, ed. Maria Korpe (London: Zed Books, 2004), 24.

and outside of formal political movements.⁶ Ultimately, gaps in the literature regarding the Turkish protest music are waiting to be filled as much as any other country.

As the name of the thesis indicates, one of the desired results of the thesis is a brief analysis of the political sphere of Turkey which will be perceived through the struggle of Turkish musicians that contributed to the genre of protest music. Other than this analysis, the body of the thesis will revolve around the research questions which are: (1) "What kind of problems did Turkish musicians face in their country, when they engaged themselves with protest music?", and (2) "How did the form of the obstruction of musical expression, and the form of the resistance against it evolved during the past years in Turkey?". In order to answer these questions, the findings of the thesis will be constructed on two aspects. In the first chapter, after a brief mention about the practices of one-party period of Turkey, the incidents of obstructions of musical expression will be counted from the 60's until the 00's, while maintaining a political lens in order to highlight the reasons that caused tension between musicians and the officials. In the second chapter of the findings, the interviews that has been done with individuals who are involved in activities that are related to music will be analyzed in order to discuss the new ways of obstructions and the new ways of resistance.

Rest of the body of the thesis will be categorized in a more conventional manner. In the part of "Research Methodology", the type of the interviews which are done will be identified and explained. Through this explanation, the reason behind choosing the methodology as it is, and the criterions that were taken into consideration while choosing the interviewees will also be clarified. The advantages of the research methodology that has been chosen will be discussed by forming a link between the methodology of the thesis and the theory that has been used. Before doing that, in the part of "Theoretical Framework", the terms and concepts that are associated with the theoretical assumptions will be explained in order to enable an interpretation of the data that has been gathered, and in order to provide a basis for the analysis which will be conducted on the change in the forms of execution of political power. In the part of "Literature Review", the overview of the

⁶ Sumangala Damodaran, "Protest and Music," *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Politics* (2016): 4, accessed April 5, 2017, doi: 10.1093/acrefore/9780190228637.013.81)

literature that has been written on protest music and its effects, and on types of obstructions of musical expression will be provided and discussed upon. Inherently, the emphasis will stay on Turkish scene of protest music, and political sphere. Nevertheless the literature which deals with other countries, and other types of music that can be linked to protest music, will also be mentioned in order to provide a basis for the subject at hand, and to exemplify the research methodologies and the theories that has been used in similar works. Finally, in "Conclusion", the analysis of the thesis will be summarized, the pros and cons of working in fields that the thesis associates itself will be argued, and the ideas, that may enable improvements for future research on the topic that has been dealt with in this thesis, will be provided.

II. Literature Review

The first thing that draws attention in the review of this literature is that, the lack of explicit relevance on the topic of Turkish protest music. Looking from a broader perspective, it is possible to find a variety of topics regarding the field of Turkish music in general, such as: Turkish folklore, music censorship in Turkey, modernization of Turkish music, or Turkish popular music. However, rather than focusing on the subject of protest music itself, most of the studies that were conducted, base their own interest on music as an area of cultural clashes, which they analyze through the interactions between different ideologies, or the implementations of the dominant ideologies of a given time.

In this chapter, the relevant literature will be dealt with in three subcategories. The first subcategory will include the literature that deals with the implementations that were done in the Early Republican Period, and the exchange between "Turkish" Music and "Western" Music. The second subcategory will include works that focus on the characteristics of a "Turkish music" in a globalized world. The existence of these two subcategories is caused by the necessity to formulate the basis for the third subcategory, which will include works that are explicitly based on protest music, or more specifically Turkish protest music. This necessity comes from the direct link between the protest music of Turkey and the folkloric traditions, and the direct interactions between the folkloric traditions and the political powers in the history of Turkey. These three categories will also demonstrate the focus of the academical sphere in Turkey, concerning protest music.

A. Concerning Occidentalization

Defined mostly within the Early Republican Period, the phenomenon of "occidentalization" has been a popular subject in Turkish academia, regarding Turkish music. Ahıska defines *occidentalism* as a reference to a field of social imagination through

which the national elite consume and reproduce the projection of "the West" to negotiate and consolidate their hegemony in line with their pragmatic interests.⁷

This process of reshaping the public taste has been analyzed through different approaches. One of these approaches is the aspect that considers modernist paradigm of Kemalism. Erol claims that, in the case of the Republic of Turkey, the invention of a national culture is directly tied to the invention of the state.⁸ The objective of the reforms that had been put in order by the political elites was to "reach the level of contemporary civilization", as Mustafa Kemal Atatürk often stated. What is meant here by the level of contemporary civilization actually is the level of western civilization. The features such as; technology, rules of conduct, or worldview, that makes the West distinctive, has been regarded as examples of universality.⁹ Naturally this objective of universality reflected on the musical preferences of the state as well. Ergür and Aydın found these patterns of modernization in Turkish Music, in the form of *standardization*. They argue that standardization appears not only as a feature of modernity concerning a meticulous calculation of the world composed of commodities, but as a matrix of perception and reasoning.¹⁰ They indicate the importance of the difference between the sound systems that were accepted in Turkey, and Western standards. They claim that the general tendency that appropriates the calculated action and tries to shape natural entities into scientifically measured units is translated in music as the development of a sound system based on reduced scales, described as rational.¹¹ Furthering their argument, they also exemplify this tendency through the elimination of *maqams* that are less compatible with a modernizing music.¹² By taking these arguments into consideration, it is possible to say, even though

⁷ Meltem Ahıska, "Occidentalism: The Historical Fantasy of the Modern," *The South Atlantic Quarterly* 102 (2003): 366.

⁸ Erol, "Music, Power and Symbolic Violence," 37.

⁹ Ibid, 38.

¹⁰ Ali Ergür and Yiğit Aydın, "Patterns of Modernization in Turkish Music as Indicators of a Changing Society," *Musicae Scientiae Special Issue* (2005-2006): 91.

¹¹ Ibid, 91.

¹² Ibid, 96.

these interventions of the state which directly affected music were in essence "aesthetical", they were based on non-musical values.¹³

The analysis of these non-musical values, through the identification of difference in musical discourse, can be found in O'Connell's, Ayangil's, Mutlu's, and Tekelioğlu's works. Tekelioğlu approaches the subject by indicating the importance of Ziya Gökalp's ideas' influence on the invention of a national culture. He claims that Gökalp defines the problem and its solution in such a way that considers "Eastern music" as the enemy, "Folk music" as the source, and "Western music and its harmony" as the model. Tekelioğlu continues by arguing that the programme for reaching this goal of "achieving a national music" reflects an astonishing lack of sophistication, possibly influenced by a naive positivism. The purpose of this programme is to harmonize the folk tunes by using the methods of Western music, and make them polyphonic. He then claims that Gökalp, who is a reader of oversimplified Durkheim, is speaking the language of the western orientalist.¹⁴

Ayangil approaches to this subject through analyzing the adoption of western notation in Turkish Music as the "official system". By stating that the Western influence on Turkish music goes back to the year of 1828, he reminds that the occidentalism did not appear in the Early Republican Period.¹⁵

On the other hand O'Connell and Mutlu, approach to this subject through the analysis of *alaturka*. In one of his works, O'Connell analyzes the identification of difference in musical discourse. He states that an orientalist conception of Turkish style (Italian, *alla turca*) was appropriated in Turkey during the nineteenth century to define a native musical tradition (Turkish, *alaturka*) and to differentiate it from Western musical practice (Turkish, *alafranga*).¹⁶ He also pursues the results of this discourse in another work of his, through analyzing the policies and curriculum of the Fine Arts Academy. He states

¹³ Erol, "Music, Power, and Symbolic Violence," 36.

¹⁴ Tekelioğlu, "The Historical Background of Turkish Popular Music," 202.

¹⁵ Ruhi Ayangil, "Western Notation in Turkish Music," *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society* 18, no. 4 (2008): 401.

¹⁶ John Morgan O'Connell, "In the Time of Alaturka: Identifying Difference in Musical Discourse," *Ethnomusicology* 49, no.2 (2005): 177.

that after the demise of the Ottoman Empire and the subsequent foundation of the Turkish Republic in 1923, some music educators altered established music curriculum to suit the political sensibilities of the new republican elite. The characteristics of this republican elite were also conceptualized through their views of "alaturka" and "alafranga". These views were defined as; viewing Ottoman music (alaturka) as the symbolic capital of a benighted imperial past, and considering western music (alafranga) the appropriate musical expression of a modern nation state.¹⁷ Alternatively, Mutlu approaches to this subject of controlling and reshaping the public taste, regarding the implementations through radios. She states that the prohibition of alaturka music, primarily in the educational institutions, and secondly in the radios between 1934, and 1936 was among the most important regulation implementations.¹⁸

It is possible to say that these works illustrate the occidentalist motive of the nationalist elite in a comprehensive way. However, as Pohlit puts it, this new "official" culture did not spread through the lower social strata and survived only within the urban upper classes, since the new polyphonic music did not grow out of real folk-life.¹⁹ Thus, the literature that deals with the folkloric music of Turkey, and that deals with the debate of "localness" can be analyzed in the next subcategory.

Lastly, before doing that, it is possible to simply mention two more names regarding their distinctive focus, such as: Signell, and Balkış. The comparison that was done by Signell, between the process of modernization in Turkey and Japan through analyzing their music culture is indeed enriching for the literature.²⁰ Furthermore, Balkış also attracts notice with her article on Operatic Orientalism. In her work, she examines the different conceptions of the Turk in historical analysis, and determines the object of inquiry as the

¹⁷ John Morgan O'Connell, "Fine Art, Fine Music: Controlling Turkish Taste at the Fine Arts Academy in 1926," *Yearbook for Traditional Music* 32 (2000): 117.

¹⁸ Fulya Açıksöz Mutlu, "Prohibition of Traditional Turkish Music "Alaturka" On Radios In Early Turkish Republic and Its Reflections On Press," *European Journal of Research on Social Studies* 1 (2014): 115.

¹⁹ Stefan Pohlit, "Musical Life and Westernization in the Republic of Turkey. Schismogenesis and Cultural Revisioning in Contemporary Music" (proceedings of *Europa in Opera, Celsius ("Europa Nova")*, Porto, September 24-25, 2010).

²⁰ Karl Signell, "The Modernization Process in Two Oriental Music Cultures: Turkish and Japanese," *Asian Music* 7, no. 2 (1976): 72-102.

character stereotypes of the operatic Turk on the Habsburg stage and the theoretical considerations in this area.²¹

B. Concerning Folk and/or Localness

In the previous subcategory, the literature that concerns itself with the objectives of the national elite was taken into account in order to put the place of the Turkish folk into perspective. In this part, the literature that deals with Turkish folk music, and with the veil between the rural culture and the urban culture will be mentioned. These works are important for the thesis as they strengthen the basis of it, through clear distinctions of localness and through indicating the interactions between rural and urban music.

The first example that can be mentioned now is Markoff, since one of the works that has an explicit focus on folk music is hers. She begins her analysis by acknowledging the transformation that Turkish folk musical culture has undergone. She indicates the transition of culture from the insular environment of culturally diverse rural communities, to modern, secular, and urbanized society. The work that she has conducted also deals with a new breed of highly skilled and institutionally trained folk music specialists, who tries to reinforce the elevated status of regional musical forms of expression in the urban environment.²²

She claims that even though the folk music has found a niche for itself as a respected musical force in Turkish society, it faces two contradictory challenges. The first challenge being, the state of the art of urban professional performance practice that seems to have become distant from its rural origins. This challenge emerges from the fear of losing regional modes of authentic musical performance.²³ The elements in these modes of authentic musical performance can be exemplified through explaining the traditions that

²¹ Lale Babaoğlu Balkış, "Defining the Turk: Construction of Meaning in Operatic Orientalism," *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 41, no. 2 (2010): 185-193.

²² Irene Markoff, "The Ideology of Musical Practice and the Professional Turkish Folk Musician: Tempering the Creative Impulse," *Asian Music* 22, no. 1 (1990): 129.

²³ Ibid, 131.

folk music specialists practice. Each folk musician in solo performance engages in the process of recreating an idealized model from regional repertoire. In the past, this repertoire was transmitted orally, from father to son (*babadan oğula*), or from master to the apprentice (*ustadan çırağa*). Today, the medium of this transmission can be a notated version, or taped or gramophone reproduction of a performance of a folk musical genre by regional musicians (*mahallî sanatçı*) or urban artists (*sanatçı, sanatkâr*). Musicians remark that everyone increases the variety of renditions (*çeşitlemek*) by producing variants. However, the degree of originality or skill displayed in each individual interpretation (*yorum*) of a known source can differ greatly, as each performer imposes his or her own breed of artistry and craftsmanship (*ustalık*) on regional musical variables. The important thing to mind here is that this personal style should never distort identification with a known regional source. Otherwise, a musical performance will not be accepted as genuine, but rather as concocted, and therefore, not acceptable.²⁴

The other important challenge for the folk music, is the need to compete for the attention of a highly diversified public which has developed a preference for a new popular music genre known as *arabesk*.²⁵ On this point, it is essential to refer to Stokes, who has dealt with the subject of "arabesk" numerous times. In his positioning of Arabesk music, he states that it stands in direct opposition to the official Kemalist conception of culture which considers folk music to be simple, unaffected, direct, sung in "pure Turkish", and employing essentially diatonic melodic constructions. Arabesk, however, he states; is contrived, circumlocutory, couched in highly Arabicized Turkish, and based upon complex and chromatic modes ambiguously related to the makam of Ottoman art music. Continuing, he compares the singers and performers of Turkish folk music, and singers and performers of Arabesk. He claims that while the former includes only the uneducated, simple but honest peasantry of Anatolia; the latter includes gypsies, homosexuals, transvestites, transsexuals, and young children.²⁶ He determines the root of this tendency to arabesk through the implementations of nationalist musicologists, who reconstructed national folk

²⁴ Ibid, 133-134

²⁵ Ibid, 132.

²⁶ Martin Stokes, "Music, Fate and State: Turkey's Arabesk Debate," *Middle East Report* 160 (1989): 29.

music. Even though this folk music was promoted by the Turkish radio and, later, television; the new institutions failed to impose the reconstructed music to the public. People resisted to these implementations by simply switching off their radios, or even, by tuning in to Radio Cairo.²⁷

Stokes again handles the debates on arabesk music in another work of his, claiming that arabesk has provided a particularly important space in which people in Turkey have considered, and continue to consider, their place in the world.²⁸ The mention of folk music is again limited, which only covers of its instrumental features as a tool in the hands of nationalist elites.²⁹ The repetition of only the "reinvented" folk music, results Stokes ending up in an exclusion of folk music in his works that deals with arabesk, since the very inclusion of the folk music materializes only through the lenses of "official Kemalist conception".

After this debate that clarifies which *local* will be focused on considering the roots of protest music, it is possible to go back to Markoff, in order to benefit from her elaborations on the folk music.

In the face of these two challenges that Markoff summarizes, the folk music community, she claims, feels obliged to serve as a bastion, a symbol for a truly Central Asian Turkic cultural past.³⁰ Then she gives examples of pioneers (and at the same time mavericks) in Turkish folk music who aim to preserve their authenticity, and also aim to enhance and enrichen their traditions, such as: Yılmaz İpek, Ali Ekber Çiçek, Arif Sağ, and Yavuz Top. Even though the Turkish community of folk music experts and specialists discourages radical innovation, these examples seek to override the cultural dictates of their

²⁷ Martin Stokes, "Voices and Places: History, Repetition and the Musical Imagination," *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 3, no. 4 (1997): 682.

²⁸ Martin Stokes, "East, West, and Arabesk," in *Western Music and Its Others: Difference, Representation, and Appropriation in Music*, ed. Georgina Born and David Hesmondhalgh (California: University of California Press, 2000), 213.

²⁹ Ibid, 221.

³⁰ Markoff, "The Ideology of Musical Practice," 132.

peers.³¹ As an example for self-defining folk musicians, she elaborates upon Çiçek, who was one of the first to engage in compositional activity while experimenting with new approaches to the refashioning of indigenous repertory. She states that in 1965, Çiçek created the brilliant composition for voice and *bağlama*, "Haydar". Inspired by the mystical poetry of the 18th century, "Haydar" is one of the most well known examples of Çiçek's efforts to communicate spiritual values through music. The *türkü* (ballad, folk song) was conceived through experimentation and improvisation, but also through reworking and repeated performance it became crystallized into a fixed form that has been reproduced again and again with little variation. Markoff claims that the piece is an innovative, yet non-radical expression of one musician's need to explore artistic and expressive potential in order to transcend society's expectations of him, to produce something that would be "so difficult that no one else would be able to master it".³² This example also shows that, there is more to folk music, than only to be handled as a tool of occidentalist elite's failed attempt at recreating national identity through music. It does indeed indicate an important aspect for the literature that deals with localness, and with the veil between rural and urban.

Gedik also expands this debate by claiming that in Turkey, sociology led the way in popular music studies through a sociology of arabesk music rather than a more general sociology of music. He also points out the contrast in the music departments, and the ethnomusicological studies. While, in the former either the traditional music forms of Turkey or western art music were dominant, in the latter the involvement was mostly with traditional Turkish music, which is considered to be non-Western music.³³

Before concluding this subcategory it possible again to mention two more works which are important for the literature regarding the Turkish folk music, and localness. One of them is Dönmez's work which interests itself with the position of *aşık* tradition in the Anatolian culture, through analyzing the tradition within the ritual and non-ritual Turkish

³¹ Ibid, 137-138.

³² Ibid, 138.

³³ Ali C. Gedik, "Reflections on Popular Music Studies in Turkey," *Journal of the International Association for the Study of Popular Music* 2 (2011): 53.

folk music performances.³⁴ Likewise, Kayhan's work attracts attention because of its analysis of rural and urban through the usage of *türkü bars* as a case study.³⁵

C. Concerning Protest Music

In this last subcategory, the literature that deals with protest music itself will be inspected in order to finalize the review of the literature that can be considered to have relevance to this thesis, and to finalize the link between the protest music and its past. It is more preferable to start this inspection with the international literature that deals with protest music in their own context, since it will be easier to locate the place of literature that focuses on Turkish protest music, after exemplifying different works that were conducted on other countries.

a. Examples from the World

The first work that should be mentioned in this category is Denisoff's article on protest movements, which was published in 1968. Considering the freshness of protest music in that period, even the terminology that he uses can be a suitable guide to understand the history of the literature. He starts his article by defining the purpose of using what he calls: *propaganda song*: "to create political or social consciousness favorable to the position of the movement or individual using the propoganda song.". He also claims that the role and function of the propoganda song did not receive adequate amount of attention from sociologists and social scientists as a whole.³⁶

³⁴ Banu Mustan Dönmez, "Törensöl (Cem) ve Dünyasal Türk Halk Müziği Performansı İçinde Âşıklık Geleneginin Konumu," [The Position of Anatolian Minstrelsy Tradition in the Ritual (Cem) and Non-Ritual Turkish Folk Music Performance], *C. Ü. Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi* 34, no. 1 (2010): 33-37.

³⁵ Aslı Kayhan, "Musical Changes of Rural to Urban in Popular Culture. A Case Study: *Türkü Bars* in Istanbul," *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 45, no. 1 (2014): 149-166.

³⁶ R. Serge Denisoff, "Protest Movements: Class Consciousness and the Propaganda Song," *The Sociological Quarterly* 9, no. 2 (1968): 228.

At this point it is also convenient to remember Brown's remarks upon this situation as well. In his work that he has written in 2009, he also confirms this lack of attention that Denisoff identifies. He claims that the scholarly study of popular music, *and the connection between popular music and social movements*, has not received the attention that it deserves. He argues that in one area in which popular music is generally acknowledged to have played an important role, which is the "sixties", scholarly investigation often begins and ends with the observation that sweeping social changes were reflected in, and connected to, the rising popularity of rock music. Continuing, he points out the need for further investigation, by claiming that the protest movements of the 1960s and after, are unintelligible without a more sophisticated understanding of the interdependence of the political and the cultural in general, and of the role of popular music in particular. He also states that the bulk of the work on the socio-cultural content of popular music has been handled mostly by the scholars who are working in cultural and media studies. Even though these disciplines fueled the rise of popular music studies as a discrete field and produced valuable insights, he criticizes the narrowness of historiography's view of the sixties which he considers as "student Marxism-centric, and organization-bound".³⁷

Getting back to Denisoff, he also remarks the connection between the folk music and protest songs. He claims that the folk music revival, the emergence of the New Left, and intensive civil rights activity in the South renewed interest in "protest songs".³⁸ In her work, Damodaran also elaborates on couple of examples regarding this connection. With anti-colonial struggles gathering momentum in countries like India, she claims, a crucial question that came up was the degree of engagement with "tradition". Within a political understanding that colonialism had destroyed and marginalized the cultures of the people, one of the tasks of musical representation was to "bring back" traditional music on behalf of the people.³⁹ Other example that she presents is the Nueva Canción or New Song Movement which involves thousands of musicians throughout Latin America, one of them being Violetta Parra, who collected hundreds of folkloric musical pieces from different

³⁷ Timothy S. Brown, "Music as Weapon? 'Ton Steine Scherben' and the Politics of Rock in Cold War Berlin," *German Studies Review* 32, no. 1 (2009): 1-2.

³⁸ Denisoff, "Protest Movements," 232-233.

³⁹ Damodaran, "Protest and Music," 9.

regions of Chile, in order to reproduce and introduce them in urban areas of the country, as part of the celebration of indigenous music and traditions in affirming socialist values.⁴⁰ She also confirms another version of the need to reproduce the conditions of life of ordinary people, in their own languages and using traditionally existing modes of expression in the music that came out of the Anti-Apartheid Movement in South Africa. She claims that, while the early influences on South African popular music were strongly from the West, by the mid-1930s, African elements were consciously brought into the music in order to make a political statement.⁴¹

Furthermore, she also brings up the subject of classical traditions within protest music. She points out the fact that the engagement with tradition in colonial countries encompassed not only indigenous folk music, but also classical traditions, considering the possibility to be perceived as elitist and hence not representative of "the people". On that account, protest musicians, as part of anti-colonial struggles, had to respond to and contend with conceptualizations of nationalism, where holding up classical traditions became important in representing the people in a nationalist sense. However at the same time they had to simultaneously depict exploitative social and class structures through alternative nationalist symbols, like the folk music.⁴² Brown also touches on this subject by elaborating on the meaning behind Ton Steine Scherben's populist orientation. He remarks that Ton Steine Scherben was the first German rock group to sing in German, which is a highly unusual step in an era when rock performers in continental Europe tended to mimic Anglo-American models right down to the language. Additionally, he points out that this choice of language was not a nationalist statement, but a localist one. It was meant to allow the group to connect as intimately as possible with its target audience, such as the apprentices and young workers of Kreuzberg.⁴³

Considering the metamorphosis that folk music underwent within the protest music, Rosenstone presents examples from the United States in the 1960's. He states that serious

⁴⁰ Ibid, 9.

⁴¹ Ibid, 10.

⁴² Ibid, 10.

⁴³ Brown, "Music as Weapon?," 8.

concerns entered popular music early in the 1960's, when a great revival of folk singing spread out from college campuses, engulfed the mass media, and created a wave of new "pop" star, one of them being Joan Baez. However, he claims, though the concerns of these folk songs were often serious, they were hardly contemporary. He indicates that the change of focus came with performers beginning to write their own songs, rather than relying on the traditional folk repertoire. Chief among them, Bob Dylan, consciously modelled himself on the wandering minstrel of the 1930's, Woody Guthrie. Brown claims that, Dylan began by writing songs that often had little to do with the contemporary environment, such as "Masters of War" which echoed the leftist concern and rhetoric of an earlier era. Yet, simultaneously, Brown points out, Dylan was beginning to write songs like "Blowin' In The Wind," "A Hard Rain's A-Gonna Fall," and "The Times They Are A-Changin'," which dealt with civil rights, nuclear war, and the changing world of youth that parents and educators were not prepared to understand.⁴⁴

Rosenstone also elaborates upon the affects of this music on youth. He notes that the popular music also put youth in touch with serious, intellectual critiques of American life. Even though it starts only as a gut reaction in the song writers, they have put into music the ideas of many American social critics. He claims that, without reading Paul Goodman, David Riesman, C. Wright Mills, or Mary McCarthy, youngsters get in touch with perceptions of life as a "rat race", of Americans as a "lonely crowd, of "white-collar" lives as inclusive of frustration, of the war in Vietnam as far from just.⁴⁵ Schumann also, makes contributions regarding the possible affects or purposes of protest songs, in her work. She states that many of the protest songs did more than just inform, considering that at times, they openly advised a course of action. She exemplifies this claim by mentioning the bus boycott in August 1943 in Alexandra, Johannesburg. During the boycott, the song "Azikhwelwa," meaning "We refuse to ride" vibrated through Alexandra, resulting in

⁴⁴ Robert A. Rosenstone, "'The Times They Are A-Changin'": The Music of Protest," *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 382 (1969): 133.

⁴⁵ Ibid, 143.

15,000 people trudging nine miles to work to protest the bus company's fare increase, until the bus company gives in.⁴⁶

The last example that can and should be mentioned regarding the international literature that deals with protest music in their own context, is Labinjoh's work on Fela Kuti, considering his choice of methodology which is "life history".⁴⁷

b. Examples from Turkey

Even though it is not explicitly on Turkish protest music, it is possible to start this section by mentioning Karahasanoğlu and Skoog's work considering the connection they emphasize on regarding Turkish folk music. They point out that in addition to Ottoman and western musical influences, Turkish folk music has also greatly contributed to the formation of contemporary popular music. In the 1960s, popular musical groups started to become widespread, and Turkey, like many other countries of the world, saw widespread youth unrest during this period.⁴⁸ Many of the musicians involved, they claim, eschewed the derivative and politically naive lyrics of *aranjman* pieces and, choosing instead to write wholly original calls to sociopolitical action, used this new music as a vehicle for political protest. Drawing liberally from both Euro-America and Turkish musical sources, they created a new pop-folk fusion, dubbed as *Anadolu Rock* (Anatolian Rock), which was first coined by Moğollar (an influential instrumental group that backed singers such as Selda Bağcan, Cem Karaca, and Barış Manço), as a term that indicates a specific genre. The instruments they used varied from electric guitar to bağlama, from bass to dümbelek. Karahasanoğlu and Skoog locate Anadolu rock, as a genre, at the crossroads between the popularization of folk music and the Europeanization of Turkish music. Regarding the political essence of the music that was performed, they state that while the artists

⁴⁶ Anne Schumann, "The Beat that Beat Apartheid: The Role of Music in the Resistance against Apartheid in South Africa," *Wiener Zeitschrift für kritische Afrikastudien* 14 (2008): 23.

⁴⁷ Justin Labinjoh, "Fela Anikulapo-Kuti: Protest Music and Social Processes in Nigeria," *Journal of Black Studies* 13, no. 1 (1982): 119-134.

⁴⁸ Songül Karahasanoğlu and Gabriel Skoog, "Synthesizing Identity: Gestures of Filiation and Affiliation in Turkish Popular Music," *Asian Music* 40, no. 2 (2009): 60.

performing Anadolu Rock dabbled in political protest, at the same time, the artists involved in what would eventually be termed *Özgün Müzik* ("original music"), wrote even more overtly political lyrics.⁴⁹ They also indicate that the performers of this genre drew less from European sources than their peers who performed Anadolu Rock, and more from Anatolian folk traditions. Continuing, they mention examples of the most well known performers of *Özgün Müzik* such as: Ahmet Kaya, Zülfü Livaneli, and the ensemble Grup Yorum. Pointing out their strong leftist agenda, Karahasanoğlu and Skoog underline the impact that the coup of 1980 had in their lives; while some continued to perform, many were silenced.⁵⁰ This impact will also be elaborated upon in the thesis, within the chapter of Findings.

For more explicitly relevant works, it is possible to mention the names of Bates, Way, and Efe. Considering its focus on the means of production that is used by musicians who confront with obstruction of their artistic expression, Bates' work holds a unique importance regarding this thesis. He begins by stating that the music industry of Turkey has increasingly come to rely on work performed outside of Istanbul, and often outside of Turkey. He claims that numerous studios and record labels in North America and Central and Western Europe cater to Turkish, Kurdish, and Zazaki-language markets. Inherently, they maintain their ties with Istanbul in myriad cultural, economic, and artistic ways. However, he states, the mobility of musicians is hampered by political boundaries, as Turkish citizens face difficulties in obtaining overseas travel visas. Furthermore thousands live in political exile in Europe and elsewhere, unable to return to their homeland.⁵¹ Starting from this point, Bates conducts an analysis on the ways in which these musicians work through. He states that a cluster of technologies for creating, manipulating, duplicating, and transmitting digitized audio enables diverse, geographically distributed sites to be connected in a veritable transnational production network. Keeping in mind that these technologies have made *distributed production* feasible, he remarks that musicians

⁴⁹ Ibid, 60-61.

⁵⁰ Ibid, 61.

⁵¹ Eliot Bates, "Music, Mobility, and Distributed Recording Production in Turkish Political Music," in *The Oxford Handbook of Mobile Music Studies*, ed. Sumanth Gopinath and Jason Stanyek (New York: Oxford University Press, 2014), 339.

(such as the members of *Grup Yorum*, in Bates' case) who cannot physically be together are able to simultaneously work on albums or films.⁵²

In the works of Way, the spaces of protest, and the subversive role of cultural hybrids are analyzed through the tools of musicians such as: CD covers, promotional videos, and lyrics. In one of his works, he offers a short discussion on cultural imperialism and popular music, focusing on Turkey. He then gives an historical account of Turkey's politics and mediascape in order to help understand the subversion articulated in the video of *Çeşmi Siyahım* by Grup Kızılırmak, which is a cover of a song originally performed by Mahzunî Şerif. This is followed by an analysis of lyrics, visuals, and the music of the song in question.⁵³ In another work of his, he also elaborates upon Mor ve Ötesi and Saian. In this work as well, Way analyzes the discourse of the band's song *Şirket*, through the lyrics and the video of the song. He states that bands like Mor ve Ötesi show their authenticity by being anti-corporate, corporations being seen as corrupting the "pure".⁵⁴ He also focuses on the lyrics of Saian's *Feleğin Çemberine 40 Kurşun* in another work of his, through analyzing the kinetic typography of the song, which basically is a montage of manipulated photographs and animations which visually represent lyrics.⁵⁵

The last of the three is Efe's inquiry that deals with barriers to musical expression in Turkey. Before defining what "music censorship" is, she briefly elaborates upon the reasons and mechanisms of these bans. Stating different factors such as national, ethnic, gender, cultural, and religious; she claims that even though some of these bans are executed through the state and its apparatuses, the majority of them are produced and reproduced by and within the various parts of the society such as family, community, educational system, and music industry.⁵⁶ She then proceeds to define the censorship of music, through

⁵² Ibid, 339.

⁵³ Lyndon C. S. Way, "Spaces of Protest in Turkish Popular Music," in *Relocating Popular Music*, ed. Ewa Mazierska and Georgina Gregory (Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015), 28.

⁵⁴ Lyndon C. S. Way, "Visuals in Turkish Pop: The Subversive Role of Cultural Hybrids," *Visual Communication* 15, no. 2 (2015): 153-154.

⁵⁵ Ibid, 154.

⁵⁶ Diler Özer Efe, "Music, Politics and Freedom: Barriers to Musical Expression in Turkey," *British Journal of Arts and Social Sciences* 13, no. 1 (2013): 16.

referring to two aspects of it. The first aspect of music censorship, which she acquires from the website of Freemuse, has to do with restricting the freedom of musicians to create, perform, or broadcast their work, or to impede their rights to access this music. The second aspect, she claims, regards the obstruction of free access to musical works. Due to this definition, she accepts censorship of music as a violation of the rights of individuals or collectives in terms of free expression. Expanding this definition, she also states that the censorship of the cultural activity of musical expression also means hindering individuals and societies from freely participating in cultural and public life, signifying in other words, the violation of cultural rights.⁵⁷ She then exemplifies the problems that many protest music groups face, such as the cancellation of their concerts on the ground that the Police cannot guarantee the security. Efe claims that the real purpose behind this cancellation is to intimidate and terrorize those groups and their audience. She also states that even when they let the concerts to be held, the Police come with a list of banned songs and ask the musicians not to sing them.⁵⁸

After inspecting the historical network of protest music in the world, and in Turkey, it is possible to conclude this chapter of the thesis. The connections between occidentalism, folk music, and the protest music were analyzed, in order to clarify, specify, and strengthen the framework of subject at hand. In the next chapter, the theoretical framework will be explained in order to clarify the reason behind choosing "independent music" as the contemporary part of the network that can be traced back to protest.

⁵⁷ Ibid, 16.

⁵⁸ Ibid, 19-20

III. Theoretical Framework

In this chapter, the inspirations behind the theoretical approach of this thesis will be mentioned. Some of these inspirations have direct influences on the choice of methodology, and some only implicate certain kinds of frameworks regarding the analysis that the thesis presents.

The important thing to underline at this point is the nature of the subject in question, which is Turkish Protest Music. Music, as a term that implicates a certain category, does not indicate *the organization of noise* as Attali puts it, in the case of this thesis.⁵⁹ The organization that this thesis concerns itself with, is the organization of musicians, or rather the organization of people who are associated with the process of making music. Because of this very reason, possible epistemological discussions on *what* music is, or *how* is it possible to gather data from an analysis of music, will be avoided.

A. How to read the Networks of Organization

The first work that should be mentioned here is Abreu's article which includes her analyses on the phonographic industry, and on the treatment that was given to culture industries in sociological writings. She states that, very few works address the ways in which these fields of activity and their respective markets have been established. In both sociology and economics, she claims, it is common to encounter the use of abstract concepts such as "capitalist mode of industrial production" and "market production," but their analytical productiveness depends on the way they are operationalized. The point that she emphasizes on is, in the case of the phonographic industry, such operationalization demands the examination of the ways in which these activities have historically developed, creating a field which is simultaneously industrial, commercial and cultural.⁶⁰ This situation that Abreu confirms, also results to the exclusion of an analysis of new conditions for

⁵⁹ Jacques Attali, *Noise: The Political Economy of Music* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2009), 4.

⁶⁰ Paula Abreu, "The Phonographic Industry and the Recorded Music Market: A Long Misunderstanding," *RCSS* 85 (2009): 1.

creating music and phonographic production, distribution and consumption. She states that especially since the 1980s, uncertainties have emerged much more rapidly, due to the development of digital technologies and their introduction into the sphere of recorded music. Which is only followed by the integration of digital systems, and information and communications technology.⁶¹

Another work which determines the backbone of the empirical part of the thesis, is Becker's *Art Worlds*. On how to read this network of organization, he provides valuable insights through denoting the "network of people" whose cooperative activity, organized via their joint knowledge of conventional means of doing things, produces the kind of art works that art world is noted for.⁶² He states that whatever virtue his analysis has, does not come from the discovery of any hitherto unknown facts or relations. Instead, he claims, it comes from exploring systematically the implications of the art world concept. He indicates that the dominant tradition in the sociology of art, defines art as something more special, in which creativity comes to the surface, resulting in taking the artist and art work, rather than the network of cooperation, as central to the analysis of art as a social phenomenon. In light of this difference, he states that what he has done in his work is not the sociology of art at all, but rather the sociology of occupations applied to artistic work.⁶³

To give a concrete example of this approach, it is possible to take a glance at his elaborations on arts, as a human activity. He asks, given that all the things must be done for an art work to occur as it actually does, who will do them? He then gives an hypothetical extreme case, a situation in which one person did everything: made everything, invented everything, had all the ideas, performed or executed the work, experienced and appreciated it, all without the assistance or help of anyone else. He claims that such a thing hardly can be imagined, because all the arts that are known, like all the human activities that are known, involve the cooperation of others.⁶⁴ Having in mind a crucial activity in the production of art works, which is manufacturing and distributing the materials and

⁶¹ Ibid, 11.

⁶² Howard S. Becker, introduction to *Art Worlds* (California: University of California Press, 1982), x.

⁶³ Ibid, x-xi.

⁶⁴ Howard S. Becker, *Art Worlds* (California: University of California Press, 1982), 7.

equipment most artistic activities require, such as musical instruments, paints and canvas, dancers' shoes and costumes, cameras and film; he indicates that making art works takes time, but making the equipment and materials takes time as well.⁶⁵

On this point, it is also possible to mention Bennett's work. Even though the empirical part of the thesis does not solely focus on specific music scenes, it benefits from them. Bennett, states that the concept of "music scene" has long been used by musicians and music journalists to describe the clusters of musicians, promoters and fans, who grow up around particular genres of music. He claims that, typically, this everyday usage of scene has referred to a particular local setting, usually a city or district, where a particular style of music has either originated, or has been appropriated and locally adapted.⁶⁶ Chicago blues, New Orleans jazz, and Seattle grunge can be given as examples of local musical innovation and production. However in the case of this thesis, the musical scene of Kadıköy was elaborated upon, not because of a certain kind of musical genre, but because of its atmosphere regarding the organizational traits of the music making scene.

B. How to read the Networks of Resistance

Another important inspiration on identifying the forms of resistance, and survival within the "business ontology" of artistic production, Fisher's work provides insights on how to approach to a subject like this. Even though there may not be any guidance that his work can provide on *how* musicians are resisting, it paints a clear picture of *what* they are resisting to.

He uses the term "capitalist realism" as a pervasive *atmosphere*, conditioning not only the production of culture but also the regulation of work and education, and acting as a kind of invisible barrier constraining thought and action. Over the past years, he claims, capitalist realism has successfully installed a *business ontology* in which it is simply

⁶⁵ Ibid, 3.

⁶⁶ Andy Bennett, "Consolidating the Music Scenes Perspective," *Poetics* 32 (2004): 223.

obvious that everything in society should be run as a business.⁶⁷ As an example, he elaborates upon the establishment of settled "alternative" or "independent" cultural zones, while claiming that they endlessly repeat older gestures of rebellion and contestation as if for the first time. "Alternative" and "independent", he states, do not designate something outside mainstream culture; on the contrary, they are the dominant styles within the mainstream. Fisher claims that no one embodied, and also struggled with this deadlock more than Kurt Cobain and Nirvana. In a place where nothing runs better on MTV than a protest against MTV, Cobain knew that his every move was a cliché scripted in advance, and he knew that even realizing it is a cliché. Even success meant failure, since to succeed would only mean that you were the new meat on which the system could feed.⁶⁸

On this point, Bourdieu's debate upon the word *interest* can be remembered, in order to extend the frames of the approach that was adopted. In his work, Bourdieu defines "interest" as to "be there", to participate, to admit that the game is worth playing and that the stakes created in and through the fact of playing are worth pursuing; meaning ultimately, interest is to recognize the game and to recognize its stakes.⁶⁹

Continuing with Fisher, he also comments on the gap that hip hop filled, after Cobain's death, which confirmed the defeat and incorporation of rock's utopian and promethean ambitions. He claims that it was precisely hip hop's performance of the *real* - "the uncompromising"- that enabled its easy absorption into the reality of late capitalist economic instability, where such authenticity has proven highly marketable.⁷⁰

Expanding this atmosphere, he shares his remarks upon new kinds of protests that has been in the form of events organized by the global elite. He states that protests have formed a kind of carnivalesque background noise to capitalist realism, and claims, the anti-capitalist protests share rather too much with hyper-corporate events like Live 8, with their exorbitant demands that politicians legislate away poverty. He indicates that what he is

⁶⁷ Mark Fisher, *Capitalist Realism: Is There No Alternative?* (Winchester: Zero Books, 2009), 16-17.

⁶⁸ Ibid, 9.

⁶⁹ Pierre Bourdieu, *Practical Reason: On the Theory of Action* (California: Stanford University Press, 1998), 77.

⁷⁰ Fisher, *Capitalist Realism*, 10.

trying to say is not identifying Live 8 as a "degraded" form of protest. On the contrary, he claims that it was in Live 8 that the logic of the protest was revealed in its purest form. Elaborating on the issue, he claims that the protest impulse of the 60s posited a malevolent Father, the harbinger of a reality principle that cruelly and arbitrarily denies the "right" to total enjoyment. However this figuration of the Father, Fisher claims, is depended on not by capitalism, but by protest itself.⁷¹

As it was stated in the beginning, the thesis benefits from Fisher's work in order to clarify what the musicians are resisting to. The "business ontology" as Fisher puts it, is one of the major components of culture industries. However, remembering Abreu, especially in an empirical work that operates through a sociological aspect, the culture industries should not be treated only through the economical point of view. It is possible to conclude this chapter, by heeding her comments regarding the complexity of the cultural industries. She claims that the history of the phonographic industry is showing us, that the culture industries constitute organisational fields that have a high level of complexity. She indicates, several principles and logics operating within them: the technical-industrial logic and the market logic, traditionally associated with the sphere of economic activities; the logics of inspiration and fame, associated with the cultural and artistic spheres; and the civic logic, related to public regulation.⁷²

⁷¹ Ibid, 14.

⁷² Abreu, "The Phonographic Industry," 21.

IV. Research Methodology

In this chapter, after defining the research methodology of the thesis, the sampling of the interviewee's will be explained. Even though the findings will be based upon two different aspects which are historical and sociological, the main emphasis will stay on the latter, while the former will simply be a chronological list of incidents that has happened throughout the 60s, until 2000. That is why, the explanations regarding the methodology that is used will be on the sociological aspect of the findings.

A. Qualitative Method and Narrative Interview

The design of this research has been determined as the qualitative research method, considering the self-enclosedness of the music scene in general. Qualitative research as a means for exploring and understanding the meaning individuals or groups ascribe to social or human problem⁷³, fits the objective of this thesis outrightly. It is a suitable method for times when the researcher seeks to establish the meaning of a phenomenon from the views of participants.⁷⁴ In the case of this thesis as well, the data has been collected through interviews which are conducted with individuals that has been chosen for the research.

As a subcategorical frame within the qualitative method, *Narrative Research* was seen fit for this thesis. In a work of his, Creswell determines five qualitative approaches to inquiry: narrative research, phenomenology, grounded theory, ethnography, and case studies. Narrative research as a method, begins with the experiences as expressed in lived and told stories of individuals. The procedures for implementing this research consist of focusing on studying a few number of individuals, gathering data through the collection of their stories, reporting individual experiences, and chronologically ordering the meaning of those

⁷³ John W. Creswell, *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches* (London: Sage Publications, 2009), 4.

⁷⁴ Ibid, 16.

experiences.⁷⁵ In the case of this thesis, rather than chronologically ordering the meaning of those experiences, the categorization will be based on themes that were provided by the researcher and the interviewees.

Given these procedures and the characteristics of narrative research, it is possible to say that narrative research is a challenging approach to use. The researcher needs to collect extensive information about the participant, and needs to have a clear understanding of the context of the individual's experiences. Active collaboration with the participant is necessary, and researchers need to discuss the participant's stories as well as be reflective about their own personal and political background.⁷⁶

As for the type of the interviews, narrative interview has been chosen for the thesis. Establishing *struggle for existence* as a major theme in the research, stories of individuals became important as a source for data. Bauer claims that story-telling is an elementary form of communication of human experiences. Members of social groups or subcultures tell stories with words and meanings specific for a certain social group. It is assumed that narrations preserve a particular perspective in a more genuine form.⁷⁷ After the preparation for the interview, the narrative interview, he claims, is conducted over four phases: *initialization*, *main narration*, *questioning phase*, and *small talk*.⁷⁸

Primarily, the researcher needs to familiarize him or herself with the field. This may mean making preliminary enquiries, reading of documents, noticing informal accounts of events; which ultimately are absorbing the sphere of knowledge of the interviewee.⁷⁹ After this preparation, in the first phase, the context of the investigation, and the procedure of the narrative interview should be explained in broad terms to the informant. He or she must be

⁷⁵ John W. Creswell, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches* (London: Sage Publications, 2007), 53-54.

⁷⁶ Ibid, 57.

⁷⁷ Martin Bauer, "The Narrative Interview: Comments on a Technique for Qualitative Data Collection," *LSE Methodology Institute's Discussion Papers*, no. 1 (1996): 3.

⁷⁸ Ibid, 3.

⁷⁹ Ibid, 3.

asked permission to record the interview on tape.⁸⁰ On this point it should be remarked that, usually, it is possible to find a template of a *Voluntary Participation Form*, in the database of the universities. However in the case of University of Siegen, a template had to be created for the research, in order to be presented to interviewees. Continuing from the second phase, the important thing to underline is, when the narration starts, the interviewee must not be interrupted until there is a "coda", which means the interviewee pauses and signals the end of the story. The interviewer abstains from any comment other than non-verbal signals of attentive listening, however it is possible to take notes for questions later.⁸¹ After the narration comes to a "natural" end, the interviewer opens the questioning phase, which is the third one. Bauer claims that this is the moment when the attentive listening bears fruits, and exmanent questions of the interviewer are translated into immanent questions to complete the gaps in the story.⁸² The fourth and the last phase of the interview is the end of it. The tape recorder should be switched off, in order to get contextual information that may prove to be very important for the interpretation of the data.⁸³

Lastly, in this subcategory, the tools that were used in order to conduct the interviews should be explained. With the vast options of research methods and the rise of technology over the last 50 years, there are more possibilities than ever to gather data in social research, resulting in the need to establish and validate such methods. One example that should be mentioned is the usage of communication programs, such as Skype, to conduct research in place of face-to-face interactions. It is possible to use these programs for qualitative research to conduct interviews with individuals as well as groups.⁸⁴ This situation eliminates the problem of distance, considering how people can now communicate with others pretty much anywhere on the planet, not only hearing each other, but also seeing one another through the use of computers and smart phones. The recording of these

⁸⁰ Ibid, 6.

⁸¹ Ibid, 7.

⁸² Ibid, 7.

⁸³ Ibid, 8.

⁸⁴ Jessica R. Sullivan, "Skype: An Appropriate Method of Data Collection for Qualitative Interviews?," *The Hilltop Review* 6 (2012): 54.

sessions can also be handled via third-party programs and/or a voice recorder. However, it poses another kind of problem that should be dealt with. In any type of research, there are ethical concerns that need to be faced. Sullivan elaborates on this issue by indicating that even though conducting research over the Internet may open many doors for research possibilities, with it comes the question of consent.⁸⁵ The delicate point in this situation is the anonymity of the participant, considering the privacy of the data that is collected by the participants. In the case of Internet, the fragile condition of privacy may be a nuisance for the interviewee, regarding the nature of information that he or she gives. However, in the case of this thesis, this situation posed no problem, since the information of interviewees' identity was crucial for the research that is conducted. Nevertheless, even though there was not a case of anonymity in the research, the interviewees' consent was requested, highlighting this delicate situation.

B. Sampling

In this subcategory, the criteria regarding the people whom to do interviews with will be explained. Also the difficulties that may occur while trying to communicate with people who are working in the music scene, will be elaborated upon, with some remarks on challenges of arranging the interview through programs like Skype.

The first thing that was taken into consideration was Becker's approach, which has been explained in the previous chapters. Meaning, the people were chosen regarding their positions in the Turkish music scene. The purpose of the interviews was to reach a composition of music scene in Turkey, through the experiences, and opinions of individuals that comes from different backgrounds. It is possible to say that these individuals were configured as pieces of a puzzle. However, even though they had to have different shapes for them to complement each other, they also had to be identified within a certain category in order to reach a meaningful picture after completing the puzzle. This certain category was defined as "the struggle for existence". Either as a political, or an economical problem, the focus was on the experiences of individuals regarding this struggle. On of the other

⁸⁵ Ibid, 57.

major themes was the "independent background". The reason to determine this theme as it is, was to indicate an atmosphere of resistance to the "business ontology" of the *music market*.

Starting from the first person that was communicated with, Ülker Uncu was an important asset to the research, since she was the only individual out of the six, with a background that is intensively involved with "protest music". Being the manager of prominent groups such as Kardeş Türküler, and Bajar, she had considerable information regarding the problems, that musicians who have political affinities, are facing today. Her contact information was found from the official websites of the groups that she is involved with. Even though, possibly, the e-mail address that was in the website, was not one of those that notices the person when there is a new e-mail, through smartphones, she replied quite swiftly. However, arranging a date for the interview was not as easy as to get into contact. The important thing that a potential researcher in this area should mind is, the characteristics of the occupation of the interviewee. By taking these characteristics into consideration, it is possible to say that managers of musicians have a quite busy schedule. That is why it is convenient to advise potential researchers to get into contact with individuals like this, as early as possible.

Secondly the personal ties with individuals was benefitted from within this thesis. One of them being with Erdem Topsakal, the vocalist of Yok Öyle Kararlı Şeyler (commonly known as: *Yökş*), a prominent rock band within a new generation of musicians. His connections with Kadıköy, in general, was an important source of information. His group experienced an ideal process for this thesis, regarding the difference of environments in production. Starting with *Müzik Hayvanı*, an important initiative that was formed as an independent label, Yökş ultimately went on to work with Sony Music. Taking this process into consideration, Topsakal's experiences was important for this puzzle. Because of the personal ties, it was very easy to arrange a meeting via Skype.

The third individual that was contacted, was within the spectrum of personal ties as well. Fırat Erdoğan, a graduate from *İTÜ Türk Musikisi Devlet Konservatuvarı Müzik*

Teknolojileri Bölümü (Istanbul Technical University Turkish Music State Conservatory, Music Technologies), he has been working in studios, and also has worked with oud manufacturers. In a manner of speaking, it is possible to say that he had "inside information" regarding the production of music, which indicates his importance for the research at hand.

The fourth, Mehmet Sinan Güvenç, was selected considering the importance of another area of Turkish music scene: music journalism, or to be more precise, music criticism. An editor of the online music blog *birbabaindie*, Güvenç is also a musician that puts his skills to practice through *Yarımada*, and *An*.

Tayfun Polat, who is the fifth individual that has been contacted, has been the most essential source for the research considering his position in the independent music scene of Turkey. The network that he got through his years, working in the field of music has granted him a position like "an older brother" of independent musicians. An important figure of Kadıköy's music scene; he has been working as a DJ in *Karga Bar* since 2001, and has been the editorial director of *kargamecmua*, and director of *KargART* since 2007. He also is a radio programmer in Açık Radyo, with his programme called "*yerli*" in which he hosts local artists who are "outside the mainstream" as he puts it. Considering all of these features, saying, that even conducting an interview with him gave inspirations regarding the structure of the thesis, would not be an overstatement.

The last of these individuals is Eray Düzgünsoy. He has been manager of *Dunia*, another important venue within the Kadıköy music scene, and he is the founder of Müzik Hayvanı, an independent initiative that created a platform for musicians who want to share their work through nonconventional means. It is possible to name a few of the artists whose work are included in the catalogue of Müzik Hayvanı, such as: Alper Maral, Stefan Fricke, Ah! Kosmos, Yok Öyle Kararlı Şeyler, and In Hoodies. Being a bachelor of musicology, he is also a part of *Yakaza Ensemble*, with his afghani rubab, dombra, guitars, and vocals.

To summarize, as it can be seen, the selection of these individuals for the research has been done in a way that can provide a picture that is composed of different pieces. Considering the usage of technology in new forms of music sharing, or of artistic existence,

none of these individuals had difficulties regarding the usage of Skype. However, a potential researcher in this area should always act early to get in touch with these kind of participants, considering their intensive programmes that can include tours, concerts, or festivals.



V. Findings

In this chapter, the empirical findings of the research will be categorized, recounted, and analyzed. However, before doing that, the problems that were faced by musicians of protest music, and özgün müzik (as well as some other genres, in order to gain perspective) will be counted, in order to see the changes in forms of obstruction of musical expression. Therefore, the findings will be divided in two chapters. The first one, which is the historical aspect, will include these events in a chronological manner. The second one, which is the sociological aspect, will include the results that were gained from the interviews which are conducted for the thesis.

A. The Historical Aspect

This subcategory will begin with a brief mention of music censorship in Turkey, starting from the one-party period, until the coup d'état of 1960. Afterwards, the incidents will be categorized as decades, considering the political atmosphere of Turkey.

a. A Brief History of Music Censorship in the Early Republican Period (1923-1960)

As it was discussed upon within the chapter of "literature review", the Early Republican period of Turkey was identified through its occidentalist notions. The cultural policy of the early Republican Regime was based on bans and assimilations towards the "others" of the Republic. Especially the period between 1923 and 1950, was a time of radical institutionalization in the area of music.⁸⁶

The Ottoman Court Orchestra became the presidential orchestra of the Turkish Republic in 1924, and "Eastern music" branches of the conservatories were closed down in 1926.⁸⁷ The first state-sponsored and controlled radio station began its activities in 1927,

⁸⁶ Efe, "Music, Politics and Freedom," 16-17.

⁸⁷ Erol, "Music, Power and Symbolic Violence," 44.

and many types of music, particularly traditional Turkish art music and Sufi music, were condemned as decadent Ottoman heritage.⁸⁸

Another ban was introduced for *Rebetiko*, the music created by Anatolian Greeks. Over 1.5 million of them were "exchanged" with Turks living in Greece after 1922. Since they were being expelled from the country, their music was also expelled from the cultural, musical sphere of Turkey.⁸⁹

Also, a prominent figure of Turkish folk music, Ruhi Su's case was the first classic example of politics-inspired bans in Turkey. Accepted as the man who taught the intellectuals to listen to folksong, he sang as a bass-baritone with the Presidential Symphony Orchestra and State Opera as early as 1935. However, in 1952, he was sentenced to 5 years in prison, because of his socialist beliefs.⁹⁰

Taking these examples into consideration, it is possible to claim that the discomfort that lied within the institutions of Turkey was mostly based on nationalistic reflexes, which usually merged itself with occidentalist concerns.

b. Incidents in the 60s

The genre that can be emphasized regarding the bans in the 60s, is *Arabesk*. Often called "music of slums", "minibus music" or "music of sorrow", Arabesk could never make its peace with cultural politics of Turkey. It was banned not only on state broadcasting, but also in public transport vehicles like the minibuses.⁹¹

⁸⁸ Ibid, 42-44.

⁸⁹ Yurdatapan, "Turkey," 23.

⁹⁰ Teresa Hanley, "And the "beat" Goes On: Censorship in Turkey," in *Music Will Not Be Silenced*, ed. Maria Korpe (Istanbul: Ömür Matbaası, 2007), 43.

⁹¹ Ibid, 37.

Anadolu Rock, however was not condemned or banned as a genre during the 60s, as was the case with Arabesk, even though the physical appearance of the musicians of this genre (long hair, marginal clothing) were disliked by the public.⁹²

It is possible to conclude by stating that the emphasis regarding the bans were still mostly related to the "east-west" debate.

c. Incidents in the 70s

In July 1971, singer Selda Bağcan released two singles, which included two folk songs about prison. It was the year the military got a major role in politics for the second time in Turkey's history and many activists were imprisoned. Bağcan's songs also attracted attention, deemed unfavourable, and were exposed to unofficial bans.⁹³

In 1973, one of the most interesting cases regarding the obstruction of musical expression, was seen in Turkey. Barış Manço's song "Lambaya Püf De" ("Put Out the Lamp"), ran into difficulty because its lyrics were deemed "obscene". Manço then sent an instrumental version of the song to the board and it was rejected again for the very same reason. When the board members were asked what they found obscene in the song this time, their reply was: "The guitarist plays the song in an erotic fashion!".⁹⁴

Another case was on 1975, when Turkey participated in the Eurovision Song Contest for the first time. Although the public jury elected Ali Rıza Binboğa's "Yarınlar Bizim" ("Tomorrow is Ours"), it was found "*not European enough*" for representing

⁹² E. Taçlı Yazıcıoğlu, "Contesting the Global Consumption Ethos: Reterritorialization of Rock in Turkey," *Journal of Macromarketing* 30, no. 3 (2010): 242.

⁹³ Hanley, "Censorship in Turkey," 39.

⁹⁴ Murat Meriç, "A Boycott Story and TRT Supervisory Board," in *Turkey: The Freemuse Files on Censorship of the Arts*, ed. Ole Reitov (Copenhagen: Freemuse, 2016), 36.

Turkey by the jury of TRT. After a controversial decision, 17 year old Semiha Yankı was chosen instead.⁹⁵

d. Incidents in the 80s

The military coup of September 12, 1980, brought about drastic changes in all levels of Turkish society, and naturally, music was not excluded from its effects. The military, disapproving of the increasing leftist tendency of both the government and the people in general, chose to clamp down on all those with socialist leanings. The coup had a direct effect on the more overtly political musicians, such as Cem Karaca and those who performed Özgün Müzik.⁹⁶

One of the most known incidents regarding this effect, on January 6, 1983, Cem Karaca was stripped of his rights of citizenship, on the same day with Yılmaz Güney.⁹⁷ Also, Şanar Yurdatapan, had to leave Turkey after the coup, with his then-wife Melike Demirağ.⁹⁸ In 1982, Atilla Özdemiroğlu, Şanar Yurdatapan's songwriting partner in the 1970's, faced TRT's supervisory boards because of his song "Firuze". The board refused to allow the song to be broadcast because it did not fit the norms of "light-western music".⁹⁹

Ruhi Su, again, was one of the figures who attracted attention from authorities in the 80s. During the military administration after 1980, he was denied permission to leave the country for medical treatment. When he died in 1985, his funeral turned into the first mass protest event of the era.¹⁰⁰

⁹⁵ Hanley, "Censorship in Turkey," 37.

⁹⁶ Karahasanoğlu and Skoog, "Synthesizing Identity," 61.

⁹⁷ *Beni Bekleme Kaptan*, directed by Sema Cabbaroğlu (2013).

⁹⁸ Hanley, "Censorship in Turkey," 38.

⁹⁹ *Ibid*, 38.

¹⁰⁰ *Ibid*, 43.

Another important figure of the Turkish protest music scene is Grup Yorum. Inspired by Inti Illimani of Chile, and Ruhi Su, the group has shown up at almost every protest event since its formation in 1985. Starting from their first arrest in 1988, when they sang a Kurdish folk song in Istanbul, the band has encountered some major obstructions. A concert in Mersin was banned and in the same year the group and the audience were beaten and the band taken into custody.¹⁰¹

e. Incidents in the 90s

Continuing with Grup Yorum, in 1991, a truck that was carrying the group's latest album was stopped by the Police in Diyarbakır, and the boxes that contained the albums were shot at. In 1993, a concert in Northern Cyprus was blocked, and many among the audience were taken into custody, and were deported. In 1999, Ortaköy Cultural Center, the group's gathering point for performances was closed by the police, before a concert.¹⁰²

1999 was a bad year for other musicians as well. After 17 albums and a soundtrack, the Association of Magazine Journalists honored Ahmet Kaya, the most prominent figure of Özgün Müzik, as the Musician of the Year. After he took his award, he made a speech and said that "*he was going to sing a Kurdish song in his next album and he believed that some brave producers and media owners would broadcast the song and its video clip*". On that moment, he was booed, had knives and forks thrown at him, and was taken down from the stage. Having been proclaimed as a traitor, an almost national condemnation campaign was started against him through the mass media. Having been isolated, he left the country for Paris, where he died because of a heart attack one year later.¹⁰³

Another distinctive example which can be mentioned within a different context is Nazan Öncel's *Demir Leblebi*. In 1999, the song was banned on the grounds that it was against the Turkish customary rights. Indeed, it was, because the song was telling about the

¹⁰¹ Ibid, 40.

¹⁰² Ibid, 40.

¹⁰³ Ibid, 38-39.

sexual harassment (of the singer herself) within the family. It can be seen as a striking example indicating the connection between censorship and moralism or conservatism as well as sexism.¹⁰⁴

To conclude the chapter regarding the historical aspect, it is possible to claim that the obstructions regarding the freedom of musical expression were carried out in a drastically direct manner. The nature of these obstructions was formed through several different types of discomfort, such as political, ethnical, moral, and cultural. In the next chapter, new forms of obstructions of expression, and new forms of struggle of existence will be deduced from the interviews that were conducted with individuals who were chosen for this research.

B. The Sociological Aspect

In this chapter, the data gathered from the interviews will be analyzed through several themes that were determined beforehand. These themes indicate elements of the music scene in Turkey, through which the analysis regarding the forms of obstructions and resistance are made.

a. Organizations, As an Area of Conflict

The first subcategory deals with the function of organizations in the music scene of Turkey. Keeping the change in the forms of interference in mind, it is possible to claim that organizations that are related to musical activities, have become an area of conflict. Being a manager of politically concerned groups, Ülker Uncu has many experiences regarding this issue. When asked upon the problems that they have faced during the years she first emphasized on the groups' background:

"Some of the musicians of Kardeş Türküler and Bajar are in a group called BGST (Boğaziçi Gösteri Sanatları Topluluğu). This is a community that has entered its 25th year.

¹⁰⁴ Efe, "Music, Politics and Freedom," 18.

The community generally works in two areas: on the one hand, it organizes events in performance arts such as dance, music and theater; and publishes books on various fields of social research, on the other. From the very beginning, this community has been articulating their shows not as a propaganda, but through art, as much as possible. Of course the groups have an attitude regarding what is going on in the world, they have things to say, but they prefer to do it by articulating them through a song, rather than to a directly say it to the audience."¹⁰⁵

That is why, it is possible say that, even though they also sing songs in languages such as Kurdish, and Armenian, Kardeş Türküler is relatively more accepted in Turkey. Uncu states that the approach of the groups has always been balanced. The idea is not to say that one side is right or wrong regarding their political beliefs. The idea is to say "Despite all that happened, it is possible to live together". However, she indicates, it was not like this in the 90s, regarding the usage of Kurdish in songs. She states that when you are connected to the Kurdish movement, even if this connection is based on an assumption, the concerts that are organized by the Western municipalities have the possibility to be cancelled. Kardeş Türküler however, stands on a different ground regarding this issue. Because of its connections with Boğaziçi University, people do not approach the ideas of the group like they do to the Kurdish musicians', hence they are also facing less threats. Regarding the organisational aspect that helped the group to get in touch with the audience, she shared her remarks:

"In the 90s the ÖDP (Özgürlük ve Dayanışma Partisi) was established. It was the organizing period of opposition movements. We mostly went to their activities and universities. The change was caused by two things: In 2000, some of the concerts in Istanbul Open-Air Theatre began to be organized through Kalan Müzik, and for the first time, a concert area which is usually for pop music, or for expensive productions, opened up its doors to musicians such as Neşet Ertaş, Erkan Oğur, and Kardeş Türküler. Also the

¹⁰⁵ "Kardeş Türküler ve Bazar'daki müzisyenlerin bir kısmı BGST diye bir topluluğun içinde. Bu 25. yılını sürdüren bir topluluk. Genel olarak da iki alanda birden çalışıyor: Bir yandan dans, müzik, tiyatro, gibi performans sanatlarında etkinlikler düzenliyor; bir yandan da çeşitli toplumsal araştırmalar alanında kitaplar yayınlıyor. Bu topluluk, en başından beri mümkün olduğunca gösterilerini propaganda üzerinden değil, sanatsal olarak kurguluyor. Mutlaka olan bitene dair bir tavır üretiyor, bir takım sözü var, ama bunu direkt seyirciye bir şeyler söylemekten çok bir şarkıya yedirerek yapmayı tercih ediyorlar."

00s was a time when the pressures were declining. Audience demand to Kardeş Türküler increased. And also for traditional music, regarding the place in which this music was listened to, it indicated a time of difference. Apart from that, "Vizontele" has increased the popularity of the group. In 1999, the album "Doğu" was released. It was one of the albums that led the youth to listen to traditional music. However the group had not been to the east of Ankara yet. At that time, the BKM (Beşiktaş Kültür Merkezi) did something different. Cem Yılmaz and Sezen Aksu were touring. They also wanted to try out Kardeş Türküler. It started in Çanakkale, Bursa, Denizli and attracted attention. Then started the east tours in cities like Diyarbakir, Urfa, Antep."¹⁰⁶

Although she also says that still, there are cities that they were not able to organize a concert in, for example, Trabzon.

Furthermore, regarding the conflict through the organizations, she shared her remarks. She stated that especially in these last two years, official institutions, concert halls, and organizers have started to feel the pressure of the government. "What happens if the group that we arrange, says something on the stage that is or that can be perceived as anti-government? Would something happen also to us?" are the questions that Uncu gives as an example regarding the fears of organizers. She also shares her remarks on a highly controversial incident that occurred on 2016. When famous pop singer Sıla Gençoğlu tweeted "I am absolutely against the coup but I don't prefer to participate in such a show" to announce that she would not go to the demonstration that was organized by the government in Istanbul, it triggered a social media lynching against her, including insults and even threats of murder. All of the municipalities that was controlled by AKP cancelled any

¹⁰⁶ "90lı yıllarda ÖDP yeni kurulmuştu. Muhafif hareketlerin örgütlenme dönemi idi. Daha çok onların etkinlikleri ve üniversitelere gittik. Farklılaşma iki şeyle oldu: 2000 yılında İstanbul Açık hava'daki konserlerin bir kısmı Kalan Müzik üzerinden yürümeye başladı ve ilk kez, bir pop müzik alanı, bir büyük prodüksiyon alanı, Neşet Ertaş'a, Erkan Oğur'a, Kardeş Türküler'e açıldı. 2000ler tabii baskıların da azaldığı bir dönemdi. Kardeş Türküler'e seyirci talebi arttı. Geleneksel müzikler için de, bu müziğin dinlenildiği yer bakımından değişiklik gösteren bir döneme işaret ediyordu. Bunun dışında, "Vizontele" popülerleşmeyi arttırdı. 1999'da "Doğu" albümü çıkmıştı. Gençleri geleneksel müziği dinlemeye yönlendiren albümlerden biri oldu. Fakat henüz Ankara'nın doğusuna gidilmemişti. O dönem, BKM bir yenilik yaptı. Cem Yılmaz, Sezen Aksu turnesi yapıyorlardı. Kardeş Türküler'i de deneyelim dediler. Çanakkale, Bursa, Denizli'de başladı, ilgi gördü. Sonra doğu turneleri başladı. Diyarbakır'a, Urfa'ya, Antep'e gidildi."

already-booked concerts by the singer.¹⁰⁷ Regarding this issue Uncu emphasizes on something else. She states that, in the example of Sıla, they did not obstruct the organization itself; rather, they cancelled the agreement between the company of the organizers and the concert hall. This, she claimed, is on a completely different level.

Uncu also explained how these organizations operate, while emphasizing the Gezi Park protests as a breaking point:

"After the Gezi, there was a serious increase in tension. Firms that do business with municipalities, put all the activities to be held in a certain period out to tender. If the event somehow constitutes a threat according to the management's viewpoint, the pressure is not made on the band or the musician, but rather on the brokerage firm. In order to be able to continue their business, the brokerage firms began to choose the musicians whom they thought were more risk-free. Even considering the rise on the dollar and the euro which makes it no longer possible to arrange a concert, the artists from abroad are still considered more risk-free. It is not easy to participate AKP's municipal festivals anyway after you say something. After the Gezi, this distinction was much clearer, as "our side and others". They have chosen to call people whom they have found close to their views."¹⁰⁸

Even if they are not critics of the government, the musicians who express different things are not welcome within the municipal festivals. Uncu claims that the area of such musicians are compressed to events with tickets. After the explosions and bombings that has happened, the participation of the audience also diminished, since the concerts are seen as potential targets. Other than Kardeş Türküler, she also shared her experiences through Bajar, which is a rock band that have songs in both Turkish and Kurdish. She said that the problems that Bajar had was predominantly because of Kurdish. Most of the places that Kardeş Türküler was able to go, Bajar could not.

¹⁰⁷ Yiğit Günay, "Turkey: The Coup Still Continues for the Art Scene," in *Turkey: The Freemuse Files on Censorship of the Arts*, ed. Ole Reitov (Copenhagen: Freemuse, 2016), 10.

¹⁰⁸ "Gezi'den sonra ciddi bir şekilde gerginlik arttı. Belediyelerle iş yapan firmalar, belli bir dönemde yapılacak tüm etkinlikleri ihaleye açıyor. Eğer etkinlik bir şekilde yönetimin bakışına göre bir tehdit oluşturacaksa, baskıyı gruba ya da müzisyene yapmak yerine aracı firmaya yapıyor. Aracı firmalar, işlerini sürdürebilmek için, yapacakları etkinlikleri daha risksiz gördükleri müzisyenler üzerinden seçmeye başladı. Hatta dolar ve euro arttığı için artık pek mümkün olmuyor ama, yurt dışından gelecek olan sanatçıya daha risksiz olduğu düşünülerek bakılıyor. Bir şey söylediğiniz anda zaten AKP belediyelerinin festivallerine girmek pek kolay değil. Gezi'den sonra bu ayrım "bizim yanımızdakiler ve diğerleri" olmak üzere çok daha net bir şekilde oturtuldu. Görüş, anlayış olarak yakın buldukları kişileri çağırmayı tercih ettiler."

Erdem Topsakal also elaborates on the issue of organization. He states that when there are problems regarding the struggle for existence of musicians, the solution can only be based on festivals and organizations:

"First of all, everyone focuses on their own problem. That is why it is hard for people to get together. But a sense of tribalism exists, which is far from organized, in the sense of a friendly environment. When you have an attachment, such as Kadıköy, or Cihangir, you can find support. However when it comes to organizing, it can be solved only on the basis of festivals and organizations. Organizers can come together and do something. For example, something like Zeytinli Rock Festivali. The job depends on the organizers' work and resistance. They need to organize more festivals, extend the days. Everything cannot be solved through effort of the musicians, unfortunately. The musicians give the biggest struggle that they can, by continuing producing. The biggest struggle that he/she gives is here. However managers, venue owners, and organizers need to be a bit more aggressive in this regard. The proliferation of organizations that can include amateur and professional musicians is important. For example, Serkan Fidan and Umut Kuzey who organized Zeytinli, started to organize 5 different festivals in one year."¹⁰⁹

To summarize, it is possible to say that there has been a change in the form of obstructions of musical expression. While in the past it was possible to confront more direct interventions, now it seems the governments also adapted themselves regarding the tools of oppression. In this part, the main focus was on organizational processes in a physically broader sense. However, in the next subcategory, a more local and limited spectrum of potential conflicts that are caused by different artistic principals will be analyzed.

¹⁰⁹ "Öncelikle herkes kendi derdinde. Bu yüzden insanlar zor bir araya geliyor. Fakat bir tayfacılık söz konusu, örgütlülükten ziyade, arkadaş çevresi anlamında. Bir aidiyetin olunca, Kadıköy gibi, Cihangir gibi, bir şekilde destek bulabiliyorsun. Fakat örgütlenme söz konusu olunca ancak festival ve organizasyon bazında çözülür bu. Organizatörler bir araya gelip bir şeyler yapabilirler. Zeytinli Rock Festivali gibi bir şey örneğin. İş organizasyon tarafındaki çalışmaya ve dirence bağlı. Daha çok festival düzenlemeliler, günleri uzatmalılar. Her şey grupların çabasıyla olmuyor maalesef. Müzisyenler, üretimini devam ettirerek verebilecekleri en büyük mücadeleyi veriyor. Verdiği en büyük mücadele burada. Fakat menajerlerin, mekân sahiplerinin, organizatörlerin bu konuda biraz daha mücadeleci olması gerekiyor. Amatör ve profesyonel müzisyenlere yer verilen organizasyonların çoğalması önemli. Örneğin, Zeytinli'yi düzenleyen Serkan Fidan ve Umut Kuzey senede 5 farklı festival yapmaya başladı."

b. Studios, and Venue Owners: The Process of Production and Consumption

Studios and venue owners are important actors in the process of creating, and sharing music. Like in any other part of the music scenes, through these parts it is possible to implement an understanding of what music is, and should be. When elaborating upon the external factors that affects the musicians' motivation, Topsakal counts, the place in which you are going to share your music, and its manager, as important pieces of the music scene. He also claims that, as well as managers of venues, the production company which will publish your song and with which you will sign a contract, is also an important element that can affect the motivation of a musician. When asked about if these production companies interfere musicians in their creative process, through aesthetical aspects, Topsakal shared the story of the band in a brief manner:

"Our adventure of music production started in houses, then it spread to small studios. As people started to listen, we wanted to act, as a demonstration of respect and diligence, in order to get cleaner, better sound. Instead of producing a group from scratch, like all other companies, Sony Music chose to select a band that set itself and its audience up. At this phase, comes a point of change for the group in terms of dependence/independence. Indeed they interfere the music, and lyrics, these are real but how? Not at gunpoint. It comes in the form of a question, a proposal, and in the end the initiative is left to the band. But of course the band can get confused, because there is a professional team in front of you and they are telling you if it is done this way or that way, it will be better."¹¹⁰

Regarding the problems that emerge because of the managers of venues, Topsakal was not as patient:

¹¹⁰ "Müzik üretme maceramız evlerde başladı, sonra ufak stüdyolara yayıldı. İnsanlar dinlemeye başladıkça, saygı ve çalışkanlık göstergesi olarak daha temiz kaydedelim, daha güzel ses alınsın diyerek hareket ettik. Sony Music sıfırdan bir grup üretmek yerine, tüm diğer şirketler gibi, kendisini ve kitlesini kurmuş bir grup seçmeyi tercih etti. Bu aşamada, grup için bağımlılık/bağımsızlık mevzusunda değişme noktası oluyor. Müziğe söze karışmalar etmeler, bunlar gerçek ama ne şekilde? Silah zoruyla değil. Soru formunda, öneri formunda geliyor, inisiyatif gruba kalıyor. Ama tabii aklı karışıyor grubun, çünkü karşında profesyonel bir ekip var ve sana şöyle yaparsak, böyle edersek daha iyi olur diye geliyor."

"Venue owners generally are without vision. Commercial concerns are on the forefront. Whoever is popular, they treat him/her well. If the band that will perform is not popular, the behavior of the manager will be inappropriate. Technically, they have very little knowledge. The whole thing for them is selling alcohol and making money. Their perspective of the bands are too rational, too monetary. It's just the ticket counts. The venues where an unrecognized band could give concerts are diminished in number. The popular bands can already find themselves places to perform. Karga is doing this in Kadıköy. The rest have the perception of shopkeepers."¹¹¹

Considering Topsakal's emphasis on Karga Bar, it would be convenient to look to the elaborations of Tayfun Polat, an important figure of Karga, and of independent music in general, regarding the venues:

"Most of the musicians are treated very badly, in Turkey. Especially small musicians playing in big venues are treated very badly. From the lack of treats, to the behaviours in the backstage, from the demeanours of the tonmeister during the soundcheck, to telling musicians to finish the performance in the middle of it, or to change the hour of the concert in an arbitrary manner, or even to cancel the concert, and so on, it is possible to find venues that have problematic attitudes. I insist on telling all my musician friends that you should either expose them or should not ever perform there again. Of course they can not do that either. On one hand they do this thing as a living. However I think if musicians boycott some places, for example, if they do not go and perform in such places, the venues will then be forced to correct themselves. Thankfully Karga is a very popular place regarding these issues."¹¹²

¹¹¹ "Mekân sahipleri genel anlamda vizyonsuz. Ticari kaygıları çok ön planda. Kim popülerse ona iyi davranıyorlar. Eğer gelen grup popüler değilse davranış da ona göre uygunsuz oluyor. Teknik olarak çok az bilgiye sahip oluyorlar. Olay tamamen alkol satıp para kazanmak. Gruplara bakış açıları fazla rasyonel, fazla parasal. Sadece bilet sayısı. Tanınmayan bir grubun konser verebileceği mekânlar çok azaldı. Popüler olan grup zaten kendine mekân bulur. Kadıköy'de Karga bunu yapıyor. Geri kalanlar çok esnaf anlayışlı."

¹¹² "Türkiye'de çok kötü davranılıyor çoğu müzisyene. Özellikle büyük mekânlarda çalan küçük müzisyenlere çok kötü davranılıyor. İçki ikramından tutun da, kulisteki davranışlara, tonmaysterin soundcheck sırasındaki tavırlarından tutun da, hadi bitirin diye performansın ortasında kesmeye, ya da performans saatini kafasına göre değiştirmeye ya da iptal etmeye varan problemli davranışlar gösteren mekânlar var. Ben de ısrarla bütün müzisyen arkadaşlara diyorum ki ya ifşa edin ya da böyle davranan bir yere bir daha gidip çalmayın. Bunu da yapamıyorlar tabii ki. Bir taraftan çoğu da ekmek parası diye bakıyor bu işe. Ama mesela bazı mekanları

One of the important things to notice regarding the performance and reception of the music, is the role of the audience. Even though it is usually ignored, the attitudes of the audience is an important part of the musical scene as well. Polat also shared his complaints on this issue:

"We are experiencing a kind of audience problems based on genres. Odd things that everyone experience happen, such as: silent concerts, debates on smoking cigarettes in the concert hall, constant conversations, constantly saying "I am here" via the usage of phone, not being interested in the concert. However there are considerable amount of belongings in audiences of some genres. We have been doing punk and heavy metal concerts for the last 1-2 years, for example. There are such loyal crowds, and indeed they are there for the music. We do not see this even in jazz. And I'm trying to touch all kinds of things when I'm arranging the programme. If there is one hip-hop, for example, in one month I'm trying to arrange the second one as an avant-garde. That is why we can see different audiences. While I'm playing in the DJ cabin or watching the concert upstairs, I see now that no one has anything to do with listening to music anymore. Everyone is looking for socialization. I hear sentences that I have not heard in my life, for example, "Can you lower the volume of the music?", because he/she came to chat. He/she came to share something else than music. When social media has penetrated every aspect of our lives, these exchanges have become a more important experience than the concert."¹¹³

bence boykot etse müzisyenler, gidip çalmasa, mekan kendini düzeltmek zorunda kalacak. Bu açılardan baktığımda çok şükür ki Karga çok sevilen bir yer."

¹¹³ "Biraz tür bazlı olarak dinleyici problemleri yaşıyoruz. Bu herkesin yaşadığı sessiz konser mevzusu, salonda sigara içilip içilmemesi, sürekli sohbet edilmesi, sürekli telefon aracılığıyla "ben buradayım" demenin öncelikli hale gelmesi, konserle ilgilenilmemesi gibi tuhaflıklar oluyor. Fakat bazı müzik türlerinde ise çok fazla bir aidiyet var. Biz son 1-2 senedir fazlaca punk ve heavy metal konseri yapmaya başladık mesela. Ama öyle bir kemik kitle var ki, ve gerçekten de müzik için oradalar. Bunu cazda bile göremiyoruz. Bir de programı yaparken ben bütün türlere dokunmaya çalışıyorum. Bir tür ağırlıklı olmasın diye örneğin bir tane hip-hop varsa o ay ikinciyi almamaya çalışıyorum, avant-garde alıyorum. Bu yüzden farklı dinleyicileri de görebiliyoruz. Ben DJ kabininde çalarken de, yukarıda konser seyrederken de artık görüyorum ki artık kimsenin müzik dinlemekle ilgili aslında bir alakası yok. Herkes sosyalleşme arıyor. Hayatta duymadığım laflar duyuyorum mesela "Müziğin sesini biraz kısar mısınız?" gibi, çünkü sohbet etmeye gelmiş. Başka bir şey paylaşmaya gelmiş. Bu sosyal medyacılık bizim hayatımızın her alanına nüfuz ettiğinde bu paylaşımlar, konserden daha önemli bir tecrübe haline geldi."

Coming back to the characteristics of studios in Turkish music scene, the interview that was conducted with Fırat Erdoğan can be benefitted from. When asked regarding the kind of problems that personnels who are working in studios face, he immediately indicates one major problem: wage. He claims that the general music listener profile of the country is low. There is not any requests of quality music. There also is not an artist who makes an effort to put the musical expression in the forefront. When it comes to produce the music, he states, the work that is done now became something like a standard format. The melodies are also variations of each other. This situation also originates from the fact that most of the famous musicians' arranger is the same person, and the same arranger generally produces the same things in the same style. He furthers his argument by saying that this situation is not only valid for pop music, but for folk music as well:

"There are stereotypes: for example, when you need to record the bağlama, you first record the melody. Then, you play another version of the same thing again. Lastly you spread them as stereo. All of the instruments gets the same treatment. This is imposed on everyone in this stereotyped manner. These are the things that actually reduce the physical and acoustic quality of the music, when you look at it from a theoretical point of view."¹¹⁴

Erdoğan also states that the money that is used in the work, is related to the profile of the music listener as well. The more you afford to pay for the production, the more beautiful it will sound. If compared, the sector in the United States affords to put considerable amount of money in an album. When there is low-budget works, neither the musician nor the studio personnel are satisfied. He claims that the work that is done in studios can be really tiring. This also includes stage performances. They also make the sound arrangements there. That is why when there are situations where the wage is delayed, or never given, it can become depressing for the personnel. He also complains about the narrowmindedness of the studio owners:

¹¹⁴ "Mesela halk müziğinde de bu böyle, sadece pop değil. Kalıplaşmış şeyler var: Bağlama kaydedilecek mesela, bağlamayı melodik olarak kaydediyorsun, başka bir versiyonunu aynen kaydediyorsun, bir tane daha çalınıyor, onları stereo olarak farklı düzlemlere yayıyorsun. Bütün enstrümanlar böyle şekilde yapılıyor hemen hemen. Bu kalıplaşmış bir şekilde herkese dayatılıyor. Bunları teorik olarak irdeleyince aslında yapılan aşamalar müziğin kalitesini düşüren, kaydedilen şeyin fiziksel, akustik olarak kalitesini düşüren şeyler."

"In our case, for example, there is a certain set of methods that you can get guaranteed good results. When we apply certain techniques, we can hear the recording in a wider panorama, in the spectrum. There are certain microphone standards. But when you do so, the studio can oppose. Because there is a "tone" in their head, they do not want to get away from it. You are constantly molding and fixing 3 bağlamas, 3 guitars, but there are acoustic phenomenons that need to be considered."¹¹⁵

Considering the problems that were mentioned in this subcategory, it is possible to say that the problems usually occur because of the merge of two different misconducts. One being the "business ontology" that was mentioned within the context of theoretical framework, and the other simply being ignorance. In the case of Turkey, taking the interviewees' remarks into consideration, the processes of production and consumption needs to undergo a change through the participation of individuals who have an academical perspective regarding music, and art in general.

c. Alternative Means of Production, Kadıköy, and "Bağımsız Müzik Oluşumu"

In these last years, means of producing music has changed, likewise anything, considering the technological developments. It is possible to do recordings from personal computers with the help of sound cards, and recording microphones. However it is also important not to forget, what the past can manifest regarding the alternative means (and modes) of production. Erdoğan also elaborates on this issue by taking rural areas into consideration:

"Think about a century ago, before production technology became widespread. As the regions were introverted, there were many different musical variations in each region. Maybe the instrument scale, and the variety is not so much, but for example both the Burdur region and the Acıpayam region expressed something different entirely. Formerly

¹¹⁵ "Bizde mesela, belli bir takım garanti iyi sonuç alabileceğin kayıt metodları var. Belli teknikleri uyguladığımız zaman, daha geniş bir panoramada duyarız, spektrumda duyarız kaydı. Belli mikrofon standartları var. Ama sen böyle kaydettiğin zaman stüdyonun sahibi itiraz edebiliyor. Çünkü kafasına eskiden oturmuş bir "tını" var, o tınıdan uzaklaşmak istemiyor. Sürekli kalıp kalıp 3 bağlama, 3 gitar kaydediyorsun ama burada akustik fenomenler var göz önünde bulundurulması gereken."

their producers, were the compilers. They were traveling, taking notes. The taste of music at that time is very different. It makes you stop for a moment because of the originality of the feelings that it conveys. Very few musicians were able to maintain their authentic taste. The old recordings were good because of this reason: they were recording through magnetic wires, and the wires are expensive. You have to play it only once. The musicians were doing a lot of rehearsals, then they were going in and out in one go. Now the musician plays the same part a hundred times, but the taste may not be as good as it was played in one shot."¹¹⁶

Taking this example into consideration, another important aspect of alternativeness, comes from authenticity. Even though, the term may not be a reliable source looking from an analytical perspective, it has been, and still is, used within the context of Kadıköy, or of independent music scene of Istanbul. Especially the place that Karga holds in this context as a venue holds a considerable importance regarding this research.

After becoming the manager for KargART, Polat started to organize various concerts in the top floor of Karga. When in the beginning they were organizing these organizations once a month. After five years the point they have ended up in, is organizing approximately ninety concerts in a season. He states that after one point, it became a center of attraction, and now people want to perform especially in this venue. Because Karga was as thick as thieves with the audience of Kadıköy, because the stage is relatively small, and because of the sincerity, people whom Polat thought they could never afford, wanted to perform in this stage. One of the important things that were mentioned by almost every interviewee, is the Taksim's fall from grace. Due to its metamorphosis under the name of "*urban transformation*", its crowdedness, and its dangerousness, lots of important venues in Taksim which created music scenes in the past, went out of business. This resulted in a

¹¹⁶ Bir asır öncesini düşün, prodüksiyon teknolojileri yaygınlaşmadan öncesini. Yörelere de kendi içine kapalı olduğu için her yörede müzikal olarak çok değişik varyasyonlar var. Belki enstrüman skalası, çeşitliliği o kadar yok ama Burdur yöresi ayrı Acıpayam ayrı. Eskiden de bunların prodüktörleri, derlemeciler. Geziyorlar, notaya alıyorlar. O dönemdeki müzik tadı çok farklı. Hissiyat olarak orijinal olduğu için durduruyor seni. Otantik tadını koruyabilen müzisyen çok az kaldı. Eski kayıtlar şu sebepten iyi, makara kaydı yapıyorsun, ve makaralar pahalı. Tek seferde çalmak zorundasın. Adamlar çok yoğun prova yapıyorlar, sonra tek seferde girip çalıyorlar. Şimdi yüz kere çalıyor adam aynı yeri, ama tadı tek seferde çalınan kadar güzel olmayabiliyor.

shift of current regarding cultural centers in Istanbul. Polat also explained his position and Karga's position within this current:

"One of the reasons we can stay independent is that we are a small venue, regarding the concert hall. It is very normal for us to be able to carry out our independent works because the venue is full when forty people are already there... We also work with major groups. Because of the radio program, I came to the position of an older brother in independent music. I like to have this dialogue with young musicians, but I do not want to talk to people, who are in the position of brothers or friends, about if they can perform for 100 liras or 1000 liras less. I do not want to talk about money anymore. They must be seeing this sincerity. This term is used very often in independent music. It is stripped of its meaning somewhat, but I think that it is also valid for the venues, if there is a sincerity, like in the lyrics of songs or in the spirit of the bands in social media. Most of the audience feel a belonging to the place. This is especially true in Kadıköy. Beyoğlu had such well-established venues as well, however most of them unfortunately closed but there are still who resist. I think that the point of intersection between the audience and the musician, between the venue and the musician, between the audience and the venue is sincerity. Although it started to be used more and more in the independent music jargon, I think that sincerity is still valid."¹¹⁷

Another important formation within the independent scene of Kadıköy is Müzik Hayvanı. It was formed in the years of 2010-11, and starting from that point until now, they have published fifty-five albums. Within these works, the albums which were not preferred by the mainstream record companies in general were in the foreground for this label.

¹¹⁷ "Bağımsız kalabilmemizin sebeplerinden biri, konser salonu bakımından küçük olmamız. Bizim bağımsız işleri yürütebiliyor olmamız çok normal çünkü kırk kişi gelince mekan doluyor zaten... Majör gruplarla da çalışıyoruz. Radyo programı yüzünden bağımsız müzikte bir abilik pozisyonuna geldim ben. Seviyordum da genç müzisyenlerle bu diyalogu sürdürmeyi ama böyle abi-kardeş ya da iki arkadaş pozisyonunda olduğum kişilerle 100 liraya ya da 1000 liraya daha az çalar mısın konuşması yapmak istemiyorum. Artık ticareti konuşmak istemiyorum. Bu samimiyeti görüyorlar herhalde geliyorlar. Bağımsız müzikte çok kullanılıyor bu samimiyet kelimesi. Biraz içi de boşaltılıyor ama, nasıl söz yazımında ya da grubun sosyal medyadaki halet-i ruhiyesinde bir samimiyet fark ediliyorsa, mekanlar için de bu geçerli bence. Çoğu dinleyici aidiyet hissediyor mekanlara karşı. Bu özellikle Kadıköy'de çok fazla vardır. Beyoğlu'nda da öyle köklü mekanlar vardı, çoğu maalesef kapandı ama hala direnenler var. Dinleyiciyle müzisyen arasında, mekanla müzisyen arasında, dinleyiciyle mekan arasındaki kesişim noktasının samimiyet olduğunu düşünüyorum ben. Her ne kadar bağımsız müzik jargonunda fazla kullanılmaya başlamış da, samimiyetin halen geçer akçe olduğunu düşünüyorum."

Realizing that album sales in general were getting worse day by day, Müzik Hayvanı proceeded on his way with the main purpose of sharing music. They lowered the album costs. Since there were no copyright-related expectations, they created albums with hard copies of minimum 150, maximum 300, and distributed them in, without expecting any payment other than donations. It is possible to summarize the results of their collective regarding what Düzgünsoy said upon Müzik Hayvanı:

"After a while, the albums that we published have somehow started to mobilize Istanbul's independent music scene in serious way. There is a formation like Müzik Hayvanı under our hand, there is Dünya, a venue where the MH (Müzik Hayvanı) meets. Live performances can be given in this studio. Therefore, there is also an area where we can perform the second and third concerts of the groups we have released. These things started to appeal to people. After a while, this atmosphere started to form Dünya's own social environment. A social network began to emerge, where musicians were constantly coming and going, where new albums were spoken about, where guitarists from one band would start to work with a bassist from another band. We also started to create sub labels when we were doing only experimental music, and audio art. We then as MH, decided that we will not make any contract with any group. The only function of the MH is to share music. There are no binding agreements that will get in the way of someone out there who wants to be in another project or want to work with another label. So we have not said that this formation is a record company since the beginning, we called it as a music collective."¹¹⁸

Attracted by the atmosphere of Kadıköy, most of the bands did their first gigs in these venues. Düzgünsoy also claims that in Istanbul, this situation turned into a form of *route*. Starts in Dünya, continues in Karga, then a larger venue is selected; one gig in İKSV

¹¹⁸ "Bir yerden sonra bizim yayınladığımız albümler, bir şekilde İstanbul'un bağımsız müzik piyasasını ciddi anlamda hareketlendirmeye başladı. Elimizin altında Müzik Hayvanı gibi bir oluşum var, o MH'nin bulunduğu bir Dünya, mekan var. Bu mekanda canlı performanslar verilebiliyor. Dolayısıyla albümünü çıkardığımız grupların lansmanını, ikinci, üçünü konserini yapabileceğimiz bir alan da var. Bunlar insanlara çok cazip gelmeye başladı. Bir yerden sonra bu atmosfer Dünya'nın da kendi sosyal ortamını oluşturmaya başladı. Müzisyenlerin devamlı gelip gittiği, yeni albümlerin konuşulduğu, bir gruptan bir gitaristin diğer gruptan başka bir bassçıyla beraber albümlerini oluşturmaya başladığı bir sosyal ağ oluşmaya başladı. Biz de MH olarak sadece experimental music, audio art yaparken alt label oluşturmaya başladık... Dedik ki hiçbir grupla bağlayıcı hiçbir sözleşme yapmayacağız. MH'nin buradaki tek işlevi müziği paylaşmak olsun. Buradan çıkıp da başka bir projenin içinde bulunmak isteyen ya da başka bir label ile çalışmak isteyecek birinin önüne ket vuracak hiçbir bağlayıcı anlaşma olmasın. Dolayısıyla biz başından beri biz bu oluşuma bir plak şirketi demedik, müzik kolektifi dedik."

Salon, one in Babylon, another gig in a festival in Zorlu: the route is completed. Another important asset of Düzgünsoy for this research was his experiences from *Yakaza Ensemble*. Being a non-conventional group for Turkish music scene, they had a hard time explaining their understanding of music to Turkish record labels, eventually convincing them. After getting an offer from a record label in Japan, they published their second album from there.

He claims:

"When you are already doing something abroad, you are starting to look more valuable or special in this country. This is an odd situation. There has been such an effect since the beginning of the Japanese affair. However this did not resulted us giving concert per minute. In the end, people continued to think that if we are entertaining people with this music, or if we fill the place."¹¹⁹

He indicates that most of the bands in Turkey, are trying to do this. Most of them want their work to be originated from abroad. It can be from the largest record label of Germany, or it can be an independent laber from Greece. What people want to do here is to share their connection with overseas in the social media. It is perceived as an act that brings prestige. Also an expectation regarding a tour in Europe becomes more real.

Mehmet Sinan Güvenç is one of those musicians who had overseas connections through his band. Getting a message from Facebook, he has met with someone from Germany who wanted to include their songs in a compilation record.

Another important thing that should be mentioned in this subcategory is Bağımsız Müzik Oluşumu (Independent Music Initiative). When doing research on the thesis, this name appeared in every important corner regarding the independent music scene of Turkey. However it was impossible to find any source regarding what this thing was. From the interviews that were conducted with İrfan Alış (vocalist of "Peyk", a pioneer of

¹¹⁹ "Bizim memlekette zaten yurt dışında bir şeyler yaptığınız zaman daha bir değerli gözükmeye ya da özel görünmeye başlıyorsunuz. Bu tuhaf bir durum. Bizde Japonya meselesi başladığından beri saygı duyulacak işmiş demek, gibi bir etki oluştu. Fakat bu dakika başı konserler vermemize de sebep olmadı. Nihayetinde insanlar biz bu müzikle insanları eğlendiriyor muyuz, mekanı dolduruyor muyuz diye düşünmeye devam ettiler."

independent bands of Turkey), it was understood that he was somehow connected to this initiative. Nevertheless, it was not possible to find a fragment of information regarding BMO in those interviews as well. That is why, in order to be able to mention its name, and its activities, questions regarding this initiative have been asked to interviewees.

Topsakal claimed that what BMO was trying to do was already done by Müzik Hayvanı. Other than that he also stated, there was not any clear explanations on what they actually wanted to achieve. Güvenç also stated that there was a constant emphasis on "being together", however it lacked focus regarding a solution, and it lacked a final declaration. Being the most informed interviewee regarding this initiative, Polat told me the story of BMO in detail:

"We can say that İrfan was the one behind this initiative. Özgür from Peyk, Orçun from Sattas, Burçin, who is the manager of Sattas and a lot of others, Alper from Luxus, came together to do something. Then İrfan wanted to include me. I said this is not my job. This is the formation of musicians, musicians need to do this. But they said that I know lots of people, so I should at least bring them together. That's how I got involved in it. I just went to the first meeting. But I think a mistake was done. At the beginning, if ten groups would just come together and prepare a petition that had ten concrete items, it would progress much more healthy. The business got so big, and went out, it was a pity. It had so much good intentions, but to be able to organize that crowd, time was needed, and no one had that much. Furthermore there are also examples that was already successful. For example, N for N-M collective. A hip-hop collective from Eskişehir is already doing this. They have been doing this for 8 years. They have their own communities, an unbelievable sense of solidarity, and 50 albums. Likewise, Müzik Hayvanı did the same."¹²⁰

¹²⁰ "İrfan'ın başının altından çıktı diyebiliriz. Peyk'ten Özgür, Sattas'tan Orçun, Sattas'ın ve bir sürü başka kişinin menajeri Burçin, Luxus'tan Alper, bir şeyler yapalım diye bir araya geliyorlar. Sonra İrfan beni de dahil etmek istedi. Ben bu benim işim değil dedim. Bu müzisyenlerin oluşumu, müzisyenlerin yapması lazım. Ama dediler ki sen herkesi tanıyorsun, en azından bizi bir araya getir. Ben de işin içine böyle dahil oldum. Sadece ilk toplantıya gittim. Fakat bir hata yapıldı bence. Başta çok rahatlıkla 10 tane grup, 10 madde üzerinde bir duyuru hazırlasaydı, hareket böyle başlasaydı, daha sağlıklı ilerlerdi. İş çok büyüdü, söndü, yazık oldu. Çok da iyi niyetli bir çabaydı, fakat o kalabalığı çevirmek için başka bir mesai gerekiyor, o mesai de kimsede yoktu. Bir de yapılı örnekleri var bir tarafta. Mesela N for N-M kollektifi. Eskişehir çıkışlı bir hip-

Looking at these initiatives even if they have been successful or not, it is possible to see that there is a highly active scene of independent music in Istanbul. The alternative ways of producing and sharing music has been a topic of interest regarding all fields of making music. In the next subcategory some other aspects will be handled, regarding

d. Resisting (and transforming) the "Piyasa": Music Journalism, and Solidarity

The equivalent of the the *Piyasa* in English is, "the Market". Polat states that this term is commonly used by Murat Beşer, a prominent music journalist, to define Turkish music scene. In this chapter the nature of interactions between the "business ontology" and "independent music" will be analyzed. Another important aspects of this research is the affects of independent music scene on the "mainstream". As an influential sphere, independence music has produced its own kind of music journalism as well, while also transforming the methods of big record labels. However, as the musicians get closer to the mainstream, they get more affected as well. That is why it is possible to claim that even though there is a kind of interaction, there is also an explicit distance between independence music and the mainstream.

Uncu exemplifies this issue through Ahmet Kaya. Even though Kardeş Türküler also sang in Kurdish, they did not face reaction as much as Kaya. She indicates that, the critical point in that situation, was Kaya saying what he said in an environment that awarded pop music. All of the press was there, and what Kaya did, as a popular figure, was indeed a protest. Hence he ultimately incurred the wrath of mainstream media, while Kardeş Türküler was relatively unconcerned in general. This was due to its distance between itself and the mainstream.

One other important aspect regarding this issue is Topsakal's remarks on the Gezi. He states that if you are a mainstream artist indeed, the things you do and say will

hop kolektifi bunu yapıyor zaten. BMO'nun orada yapmaya çalıştığı şeyi yıllardır yapıyorlar, 8 yıldır. Kendi communityleri var, acaip bir yardımlaşmaları var, 50 tane albüm çıkarttılar. Keza Müzik Hayvanı da öyle. İş biraz download'un streaming'in olduğu dijital dünyada haklarımızı nasıl koruyacağız, sendikalaşma vs. bunlara geldi. Bunlardan başlamak gerekiyordu bence. Daha çok birlikte nasıl daha çok kişiye ulaşacağımız konserler organize edebiliriz, ya da birlikteyiz, bu 10 grup birlikte organizasyonlar yapmaya başlıyoruz demek bile başka bir şeye sebebiyet verirdi."

definitely appear in mass media. However in the case of alternative bands, kind of things that Sila went through, do not happen. He claims, from that point of view, being an alternative artist is definitely an advantage. They are one of the few bands in Gezi who have sung about it but did not get affected.

Other than the political sphere of the music scenes, cultural sphere of it is as much as important to be mentioned. Starting from music journalism, it is possible to share what Güvenç said about this topic:

"birbabaindie" is not the same with birbabaindie of seven years ago. I used to share my personal views in the blog but now over the past year and a half, the industry has become affected by birbabaindie. Which means if I write something, it's affecting something. Hence I have to transform these writings into things that will give information, that will serve society. If there is such a thing as music journalism, it is completely ill. You can be a music journalist when you write, "X released an album, they have a song called "Y", and "Z"", if it can be called music journalism."¹²¹

Also Polat elaborates on this issue. He believes that the culture segments of mainstream media is in a very bad condition. There is also a lack of music journal. He claims however, there are good music blogs that generated an audience. Nevertheless they also cannot escape from being too subjective, since technically, they are not equipped enough. Another situation he underlines is the few number of musicians:

"We have an understanding based on motivation that always operates like: There are very few groups already, and they are crawling, why should we criticize them in a bad way, considering how hard they did their record, let's not offend them. For example, I get a lot of criticism, such as "you like everything". Now we have a lot of productions, we need to start to say that something is "bad". Our attitude has always been that, we just ignored. If the music was bad, we did not even mention its name. We have not written upon it, we have

¹²¹ "birbabaindie 7 yıl önceki birbabaindie değil. Ben eskiden kişisel görüşlerimi aylaşıyordum ama artık son 1 buçuk sene içerisinde, sektörün, müzik dünyasının içerisinde, birbabaindie bir yön verici konumuna geldi. Yani ben bir şey yazarsam bu bir şeye etki ediyor. Dolayısıyla ben artık buradaki yazıları, topluma hizmet edecek, bilgi verecek yazılara dönüştürmek zorundayım. Şayet müzik basını diye bir şey varsa, tamamen hastalıklı bir durumda. "X'in albümü çıktı Y, Z şarkıları var" diye yazıp yayınladığın zaman müzik yazarı olabiliyorsun, eğer müzik yazarlığı buysa."

not played it. This also is not the right attitude, in other words, we know that it takes a lot of effort to make that bad album as well, but we could not say that it indeed was bad.

However we need to explain why they are bad. We also need to know more about the performance of music. Musicians also need to criticize each other."¹²²

In that sense, it is possible to say that, in the field of music journalism, there are successful initiatives that are able to generate an understanding of music. However, the success comes from creating an audience, rather than creating aesthetically knowledgeable, and relatively objective articles.

On another topic, regarding the transformative affects of the independent music, Polat's remarks can be mentioned again. He claims that the independent musicians are starting to become the new popular music of Turkey. Because of the latest incidents, the numbers of international musicians' concerts has been diminished. That is why the mainstream now is focusing on the music that is local. This, says Polat, is an opportunity. Düzgünsoy's remarks upon this subject also support Polat's claims. He said that the mainstream "has woken up" in a sense. They are now aware of the environment that independence music grew in. They are continuing through concerts, not album sales. They are more active. Thereby it is possible to see the transformative affects of initiatives such as Müzik Hayvanı, on the mainstream.

The last emphasis that can be mentioned is Polat's indications on the schools of music that feeds the independent music scene, and the mainstream at the same time:

"At the beginning of the 00s, three very important music schools were opened in this country. From here, the sector has seen a new generation of musicmakers, in terms of technician, in terms of performer, composer, and regulator. These are the music department of Bilgi, the music department of YTÜ, and ITÜ MİAM . These schools have solved the

¹²² "Zaten çok az grup var, emekliyorlar, niye kötü eleştiri yapalım, zar zor kayıt yapmışlar, kırmayalım, gibi hep motive etmek üzerine bir anlayışımız var. Ben mesela çok eleştiri alıyorum "sen de her şeyi beğeniyorsun" diye. Artık çok üretim var, bir şeylere "kötü" diyebilmeye başlamamız lazım. Bizim tavrımız hep şu oldu, yok saydık yani, kötüyse adını anmadık. Yazmadık, çalmadık. Bu da doğru bir tavır değil aslında yani, biliyoruz ki o kötü albümü yapmak için de bir sürü emek harcanıyor, biz de ona kötü diyemiyoruz bir şekilde. Ama niye kötü olduğunu da izah edip yazmamız gerekiyor. Biraz da icra bilmemiz gerekiyor. Müzisyenler de birbirlerini eleştirmeli."

quality issues that we have been complaining about for a long time. Very good recording technicians and producers started to come out. Hence, with these technological developments, it is at this point that the major companies have no difference in reaching music or sharing music." ¹²³

However on a last note, it is interesting that Polat sees the axis of the discussions that are related on musicians' struggle of existence in Turkey, within the relationships of musicians themselves. Putting aside all of the problems of sector/piyasa, musicians have very fundamental problems, he claims. Even though it is possible to see small islands of solidarity, in general, musicians always have the problem of gossiping. For this very reason Polat sees the main problem as the jealousy, and intolerance within the musicians themselves. However, solidarity is definitely needed in order to be able to act together, and create something.

Concluding this chapter, and findings in general, it is possible to say that a realistic picture was reached in the end. In the first subcategory, the new forms of obstructions were analyzed in a detailed manner. After that the conditions of the music scene in general were analyzed, in order to understand the frames that limit the mainstream as well. Thirdly the alternative scene of Kadıköy, and the atmosphere that it created was introduced, in order to determine the position of the independent musicians within the culture life of Istanbul, and Turkey. And in the last subcategory, the forms of resistance, and interactions was analyzed, whilst trying to locate nonsystematic roots of problem.

¹²³ "2000lerin başında, bu ülkede çok önemli 3 tane müzik okulu açıldı ve buradan sektöre hem teknisyen anlamında, hem icracı anlamında, hem de kompozitör, ve düzenlemeci anlamında çok kalifiye yeni bir jenerasyon geldi. Bunlar Bilgi'nin müzik bölümü YTÜ'nin müzik bölümü bir de İTÜ MİAM. Bu okullar sektörde önceden çok şikayetçi olduğumuz kalite mevzusunu giderdi. Çok iyi kayıt teknisyenleri ve prodüktörler çıkmaya başladı. Dolayısıyla, bu teknolojik gelişmelerle de birlikte, müziğe ulaşmak da, müziği paylaşmak da farklılaşınca majör firmaların hiçbir farkı kalmadı bu noktada."

VI. Conclusion

In the chapter of conclusion, it is possible to mention about a couple of problems regarding the execution of this research. One of the most problematic parts of the research was arranging the interviews. Through the use of technology, it was quite convenient to arrange the interviews in this manner. However, even though the advantages were obvious considering the physical effortlessness, arranging an interview through Skype, did not generate a sense of importance, which resulted in late interviews. Other than this situation, even though Becker's approach to his work was inspiring, the implementation of his approach to this study, through narrative interviews was quite hard. Ultimately, a realistic picture was acquired indeed, however, it was also seen that considering the methodology of the research, participatory research methods would be more fruitful, since it would also enable the observation regarding the interactions between different parties.

Other than that one of the plausible choices of this research was to focus on the contemporary independent scene of Turkish music. When solely looked upon protest music, it is possible to see that, the obstructions of musical expression, shows difference regarding the difference of the discourse of the artist. If the research would solely be based on protest music's struggle of existence, it would not have been possible to locate nuances of new forms of obstruction. The protest groups who preserve their discourse of the 80s get the same treatment today. In that sense, it is possible to say that there is still a requirement of democracy in an institutional framework in Turkey, considering the sameness of different ideologies' implementations. This lack of foundation results in arbitrary use of law regarding the obstruction of artistic expression. Ultimately every ruler ideology of a given time, puts pressure upon the elements of society, that is not

The positive side regarding the usage of the theory of Becker, and the methodological approach through narrative interview, can be located within the spectrum of knowledge that was acquired. It was hard to fix the ideas, and comments of people who were from different backgrounds, however with the use of "themes" that helped to make these ideas interact with each other, a clear picture of the alternative music scene of Turkey was achieved. Ultimately, (1) the link between the traditional folk music and protest music in Turkey, (2) the struggle of the artists within the harsh atmosphere of Turkish politics,

(3)the usage of organizations as an instrument of oppression, (4) detrimental affects of the uneducated personnel in the field of culture, (5) alternative means to create and convey artistic experections in Turkey, (6) transformative features of independent music scene in Istanbul, has been explained and exemplified through this research.

The "piyasa"s, and governments' actions also verify the analysis of Fisher regarding the instintcal adaptiveness of big labels. However the findings of the thesis also indicate that it is indeed possible to create an authentic artistic environment where people are not bound by the imaginational limits of capitalist realism.

Other possibilities to conduct this kind of research can be found within Abreu's work. An historical background of "*Turkish Music Production Scene*" can be an interesting topic for a future researcher. Considering the lack of literature regarding the relations between the occidentalist elite and Anatolian peasent (the literature interests itself mostly on the *implementations* of the national elite, rather than the *interactions* between them), Abreu's approach would be a valuable guide.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Abreu, Paula. "The Phonographic Industry and the Recorded Music Market: A Long Misunderstanding." *RCSS* 85 (2009): 1-23.

Ahıska, Meltem. "Occidentalism: The Historical Fantasy of the Modern." *The South Atlantic Quarterly* 102 (2003): 351-379.

Attali, Jacques. *Noise: The Political Economy of Music*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2009.

Ayangil, Ruhi. "Western Notation in Turkish Music." *Journal of the Royal Asiatic Society* 18, no. 4 (2008): 401-447.

Balkış, Lale Babaoğlu. "Defining the Turk: Construction of Meaning in Operatic Orientalism." *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 41, no. 2 (2010): 185-193.

Bates, Eliot. "Music, Mobility, and Distributed Recording Production in Turkish Political Music." In *The Oxford Handbook of Mobile Music Studies*, edited by Sumanth Gopinath and Jason Stanyek, 339-360. New York: Oxford University Press, 2014.

Bauer, Martin. "The Narrative Interview: Comments on a Technique for Qualitative Data Collection." *LSE Methodology Institute's Discussion Papers*, no. 1 (1996): 1-19.

Becker, Howard S. *Art Worlds*. California: University of California Press, 1982.

Bennett, Andy. "Consolidating the Music Scenes Perspective." *Poetics* 32 (2004): 223-234.

Bourdieu, Pierre. *Practical Reason: On the Theory of Action*. California: Stanford University Press, 1998.

Brown, Timoth S. "Music as Weapon? "Ton Steine Scherben" and the Politics of Rock in Cold War Berlin." *German Studies Review* 32, no. 1 (2009): 1-22.

Creswell, John W. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. London: Sage Publications, 2007.

Creswell, John W. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches*. London: Sage Publications, 2009.

Damodaran, Sumangala. "Protest and Music." *Oxford Research Encyclopedia of Politics* (2016): 1-17. Accessed April 5, 2017. doi: 10.1093/acrefore/9780190228637.013.81.

Denisoff, R. Serge. "Protest Movements: Class Consciousness and the Propaganda Song." *The Sociological Quarterly* 9, no. 2 (1968): 228-247.

Doğan, Emrah, and Banu Mustan Dönmez. "Türkiye'de Altmış Sekiz Kuşağı Dünya Algısının Popüler Müziğe Yansıması." [Reflection of Sixty-Eight Generation World Perception to Popular Music in Turkey]. *İnönü University Journal of Culture and Art* 2, no. 1 (2016): 45-75.

Dönmez, Banu Mustan. "Törensel (Cem) ve Dünyasal Türk Halk Müziği Performansı İçinde Âşıklık Geleneğinin Konumu." [The Position of Anatolian Minstrelsy Tradition in the Ritual (Cem) and Non-Ritual Turkish Folk Music Performance]. *C. Ü. Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi* 34, no. 1 (2010): 33-37.

Efe, Diler Özer. "Music, Politics and Freedom: Barriers to Musical Expression in Turkey." *British Journal of Arts and Social Sciences* 13, no. 1 (2013): 15-24.

Ergür, Ali, and Yiğit Aydın. "Patterns of Modernization in Turkish Music as Indicators of a Changing Society." *Musicae Scientiae* Special Issue (2005-2006): 89-108.

Erol, Ayhan. "Music, Power and Symbolic Violence: The Turkish State's Music Policies During the Early Republican Period." *European Journal of Cultural Studies* 15, no. 1 (2012): 35-52.

Fisher, Mark. *Capitalist Realism: Is There No Alternative?* Winchester: Zero Books, 2009.

Gedik, Ali C. "Reflections on Popular Music Studies in Turkey." *Journal of the International Association for the Study of Popular Music* 2 (2011): 51-56.

Günay, Yiğit. "Turkey: The Coup Still Continues for the Art Scene." In *Turkey: The Freemuse Files on Censorship of the Arts*, edited by Ole Reitov, 5-14. Copenhagen: Freemuse, 2016.

Hanley, Teresa. "And the "beat" Goes On: Censorship in Turkey." In *Music Will Not Be Silenced*, edited by Maria Korpe, 36-42. Istanbul: Ömür Matbaası, 2007.

Karahasanoğlu, Songül, and Gabriel Skoog. "Synthesizing Identity: Gestures of Filiation and Affiliation in Turkish Popular Music." *Asian Music* 40, no. 2 (2009): 52-71.

Kayhan, Aslı. "Musical Changes of Rural to Urban in Popular Culture. A Case Study: Türkü Bars in Istanbul." *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 45, no. 1 (2014): 149-166.

Kutschke, Beate. "Protest Music, Urban Contexts and Global Perspectives." *International Review of the Aesthetics and Sociology of Music* 46, no. 2 (2015): 321-354.

Labinjoh, Justin. "Fela Anikulapo-Kuti: Protest Music and Social Processes in Nigeria." *Journal of Black Studies* 13, no. 1 (1982): 119-134.

Markoff, Irene. "The Ideology of Musical Practice and the Professional Turkish Folk Musician: Tempering the Creative Impulse." *Asian Music* 22, no. 1 (1990): 129-145.

Meriç, Murat. "A Boycott Story and TRT Supervisory Board." In *Turkey: The Freemuse Files on Censorship of the Arts*, edited by Ole Reitov, 35-36. Copenhagen: Freemuse, 2016.

Mutlu, Fulya Açıksöz. "Prohibition of Traditional Turkish Music "Alaturka" On Radios In Early Turkish Republic and Its Reflections On Press." *European Journal of Research on Social Studies* 1 (2014): 115-120.

O'Connell, John Morgan. "Fine Art, Fine Music: Controlling Turkish Taste at the Fine Arts Academy in 1926." *Yearbook for Traditional Music* 32 (2000): 117-142.

O'Connell, John Morgan. "In the Time of *Alaturka*: Identifying Difference in Musical Discourse." *Ethnomusicology* 49, no.2 (2005): 177-205.

Pohlit, Stefan. "Musical Life and Westernization in the Republic of Turkey. Schismogenesis and Cultural Revisioning in Contemporary Music." *Proceedings of Europa in Opera, Celsius ("Europa Nova")*, Porto, September 24-25, 2010.

Rosenstone, Robert A. "'The Times They Are A-Changin'": The Music of Protest." *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 382 (1969): 131-144.

Schumann, Anne. "The Beat that Beat Apartheid: The Role of Music in the Resistance against Apartheid in South Africa." *Wiener Zeitschrift für kritische Afrikastudien* 14 (2008): 17-39.

Signell, Karl. "The Modernization Process in Two Oriental Music Cultures: Turkish and Japanese." *Asian Music* 7, no. 2 (1976): 72-102.

Stokes, Martin. "East, West, and Arabesk." In *Western Music and Its Others: Difference, Representation, and Appropriation in Music*, edited by Georgina Born and David Hesmondhalgh, 213-233. California: University of California Press, 2000.

Stokes, Martin. "Music, Fate and State: Turkey's Arabesk Debate." *Middle East Report* 160 (1989): 27-30.

Stokes, Martin. "Voices and Places: History, Repetition and the Musical Imagination." *The Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute* 3, no. 4 (1997): 673-691.

Sullivan, Jessica R. "Skype: An Appropriate Method of Data Collection for Qualitative Interviews?" *The Hilltop Review* 6 (2012): 54-60.

Tekelioğlu, Orhan. "The Rise of a Spontaneous Synthesis: The Historical Background of Turkish Popular Music." *Middle Eastern Studies* 32, no. 2 (1996): 194-215.

Way, Lyndon C. S. "Spaces of Protest in Turkish Popular Music." In *Relocating Popular Music*, edited by Ewa Mazierska and Georgina Gregory, 27-43. Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2015.

Way, Lyndon C. S. "Visuals in Turkish Pop: The Subversive Role of Cultural Hybrids." *Visual Communication* 15, no. 2 (2015): 147-165.

Yazıcıoğlu, E. Taçlı. "Contesting the Global Consumption Ethos: Reterritorialization of Rock in Turkey." *Journal of Macromarketing* 30, no. 3 (2010): 238-253.

Yurdatapan, Şanar. "Turkey: Censorship Past and Present." In *Turkey: The Freemuse Files on Censorship of the Arts*. edited by Ole Reitov, 1-81. Copenhagen: Freemuse, 2016. Originally published in *Shoot the Singer! Music Censorship Today*, edited by Maria Korpe (London: Zed Books, 2004).

Uncu, Ülker. Interview by author. Skype call recording. Siegen, March 30, 2017.

Topsakal, Erdem. Interview by author. Skype call recording. Siegen, April 1, 2017.

Erdoğan, Fırat. Interview by author. Skype call recording. Siegen, April 9, 2017.

Güvenç, Mehmet Sinan. Interview by author. Skype call recording. Siegen, April 11, 2017.

Polat, Tayfun. Interview by author. Skype call recording. Siegen, April 13, 2017.

Düzgünsoy, Eray. Interview by author. Skype call recording. Siegen, April 14, 2017.