

**İSTANBUL BİLGİ UNIVERSITY
INSTITUTE OF SOCIAL SCIENCES
CULTURAL MANAGEMENT MASTER'S DEGREE PROGRAM**

**UNESCO CREATIVE CITIES NETWORK
AND
PRACTICES IN TURKEY**

**ÖZLEM ÖRÇEN
111677005**

ASSOC. PROF. DR. SERHAN ADA

**İSTANBUL
2018**

UNESCO Yaratıcı Kentler Ağı ve Türkiye'deki Uygulamaları

UNESCO CREATIVE CITIES NETWORK
AND
PRACTICES IN TURKEY

Özlem Örcen

111677005

Tez Danışmanı: Doç. Dr. Serhan Ada
İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi
Jüri Üyesi: Doç. Dr. Nevra Ertürk
Yıldız Teknik Üniversitesi
Jüri Üyesi: Doç. Dr. Gökçe Okandan
İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi

Tezin Onaylandığı Tarih: 26 Haziran 2018.....

Toplam Sayfa Sayısı: 130

Anahtar Kelimeler (Türkçe)

- 1) Yaratıcılık
- 2) Kültür
- 3) Yaratıcı Endüstriler
- 4) Yaratıcı Kent
- 5) UNESCO Yaratıcı Kentler Ağı

Anahtar Kelimeler (İngilizce)

- 1) Creativity
- 2) Culture
- 3) Creative Industries
- 4) Creative City
- 5) UNESCO Creative Cities Network

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First of all, I present my whole hearted thanks to my supervisor, Associate Professor Serhan Ada. This work which started with his encouragements, would have never taken shape without his patience, diligence, motivations and valuable contributions.

Besides her attention and her constant support, by making me realize that this study itself is a "healing," Associate Professor Gökçe Okandan has helped me gain a life lesson which will always remain in my memory. Associate Professor Nevra Ertürk made significant contribution stormy thesis with her valuable comments and suggestions. I would like to express my deepest gratitude to them.

I pay my sincere thanks to all the people I met within the scope of this study, especially to Ahsen Erdoğan (cultural manager), Hayrettin Özmen (Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality Design Department), Ebru Yılmazlar (Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality Design Department), Sylvie Fontana Yılmaz (Gaziantep Metropolitan Municipality), Hacer Eriş (Zafer Development Agency), and Ömer Faruk Çelebi (Hatay Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality) for their interest and the valuable information they provided.

And of course, I am also thankful to my dear friends, Serhan Şahin (who is my brother now), Şengül Arslan, Elif Karlı, Ceylan Esen, Canan Kızıltoprak, Serap Kılıç, Derya Acuner, Slavka Karakusheva, Vivian Makowka, Pınar Tekin and Miray Çakıroğlu who have always been there for me. And I would like to thank to Fatih Sel, Resul Geyik and Aslı Koç for giving me the time to breath me with their help when I am stuck.

I know the words are in adequate to express my gratitude to my family and especially to my brother, Cihan Örçen for always supporting me.

To Zekya, Dapira Fat, Yazilf and Golala Zerin...

ABSTRACT

Due to the rapid social, political and economic changes in the 21st century, populations of cities are rapidly increasing. Sustainable development strategies are being developed in order to address the social and economic problems which develop in parallel with the urban population density. Among these strategies, creativity and culture-oriented approaches are becoming increasingly commonplace. The UNESCO Creative Cities Network (UCCN), established in 2004 within UNESCO, is a platform that aims to bring together different levels of cities in order to link local cultural richness with creative industries by sharing knowledge and experience. Four cities from Turkey participated in the UCCN network, which evaluates cities based on seven themes (literature, music, film, media arts, crafts and folk art, design, gastronomy). The aim of this study is to investigate the structure of the networks in the framework of the UCCN's aims and objectives, as well as to study the practices in Turkish cities in the UCCN grounded in a "creative city" approach.

In the first chapter, main concepts of this study such as creativity, innovation, creative industries and creative city are investigated. The second chapter dwells on the missions and goals determined around these concepts by UCCN, and the criteria for creative cities. The third chapter discusses the role of culture in sustainable development of cities in Turkey through certain documents. The circumstances of cities joined to UCCN from Turkey are discussed based on the criteria of UCCN and the data of membership monitoring reports throughout the fourth chapter, and the conclusion chapter presents several suggestions considering the UCCN as a sharing platform.

Keywords: Creativity, creative industries, creative city, culture, UNESCO Creative Cities Network

ÖZET

21.YY'da sosyal, siyasal, ekonomik alanda yaşanan hızlı değişimlerin etkisiyle günümüzde kentlerin nüfus sayısı hızla artmaktadır. Kentlerin nüfus yoğunluğuna paralel olarak gelişen sosyal ve ekonomik problemlerin çözümüne yönelik sürdürülebilir kalkınma stratejileri geliştirilmektedir. Bu stratejiler arasında yaratıcılık ve kültür odaklı yaklaşımların giderek daha fazla gündeme geldiği görülmektedir. Söz konusu yaklaşımdan hareketle 2004'te UNESCO bünyesinde kurulan UNESCO Yaratıcı Kentler Ağı (UCCN), yerel kültürlerin zenginliğini yaratıcı endüstrilerle birleştirmeyi amaçlayan farklı düzeydeki kentleri bilgi ve deneyim paylaşımı yoluyla biraraya getiren bir platform konumundadır. Kentleri yaratıcı endüstriler alanında belirlenen yedi temaya (edebiyat, müzik, film, medya sanatları, zanaat ve halk sanatları, tasarım, gastronomi) göre değerlendiren UCCN'ye Türkiye'den dört kent dahil olmuştur. Bu çalışmanın amacı; UCCN'nin amaç ve hedeflerinden hareketle ağ yapısını ve Türkiye'den UCCN'ye katılan kentlerin uygulamalarını "yaratıcı kent" yaklaşımı ekseninde incelemektir.

Birinci bölümde yaratıcılık, yenilik, yaratıcı endüstriler, yaratıcı kent gibi çalışmanın dayandığı temel kavramların açıklanmasına yer verilmektedir. İkinci bölümde UCCN'nin bu kavramlar etrafında belirlediği misyon ve hedefleri ile yaratıcı kent kriterleri üzerinde durulmuştur. Üçüncü bölümde ise Türkiye'de kültürün kentlerin sürdürülebilir kalkınmadaki rolünün ne olduğu çeşitli belgeler üzerinden belirtilmiştir. Dördüncü bölümde Türkiye'den UCCN'ye dahil olan kentlerin durumları UCCN kriterlerine göre ve üyelik izleme raporları verilerine göre ele alınmış, sonuç bölümünde UCCN'in bir paylaşım platformu olduğu değerlendirmesinden hareketle çeşitli öneriler sunulmuştur.

Anahtar sözcükler: Yaratıcılık, yaratıcı endüstriler, yaratıcı kent, kültür, UNESCO Yaratıcı Kentler Ağı

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS.....	iii
ABSTRACT.....	iv
ÖZET.....	v
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	vi
IMAGE LIST.....	viii
TABLE LIST	ix
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....	x
INTRODUCTION.....	1
1. Research Objectives.....	1
2. Framework of the Study.....	2
3. Methodology.....	3
1. CREATIVITY, CITY and CULTURE: THE CONCEPT of CREATIVE CITY.....	6
1.1. The Concept of Creative City	9
1.2. From Creative Class to Urban Depression.....	12
1.3. Creative Industries and Creative Economy.....	19
1.4. The Concept of Brand City and Discussions.....	26
1.4.1. International Programs for City Branding.....	32
1.4.1.1. Programs within the Framework of UNESCO.....	33
1.4.1.2. Cittaslow	34
1.4.1.3. Agenda 21 for Culture Pilot Cities.....	35
2. UNESCO “CREATIVE CITIES” NETWORK.....	36
2.1. General Premise.....	36
2.1.1. The UNESCO Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions (2005)	38
2.1.2. 2030 Sustainable Development Goals and Creative Cities.....	43

2.2. Missions and Activities.....	44
2.3. UNESCO's Criteria for "Creative Cities"	46
2.3.1. Criteria for the City of Literature	47
2.3.2. Criteria for the City of Media Arts.....	48
2.3.3. Criteria for the City of Music.....	49
2.3.4. Criteria for the City of Film.....	50
3. CULTURAL POLICIES IN TURKEY AT URBAN SCALE.....	52
3.1. About Culture and Cultural Policies.....	52
3.2. Culture in the Urban Strategical Plans of Turkey.....	55
3.2.1. The Activities of Development Agencies.....	55
3.2.2. The Tourism Strategy of Turkey (2023)	58
3.2.3. The 10 th Development Plan (2014 - 2018)	60
3.2.4. Action Plan for Sustainable Cultural Development (2016)	61
3.2.5. 3 rd National Cultural Council (2017)	63
4. UNESCO CREATIVE CITIES PROGRAM IN TURKEY.....	66
4.1. UNESCO Criteria for the City of Gastronomy and the Case of Gaziantep.....	66
4.1.1. Gaziantep as Creative City of Gastronomy.....	73
4.2. New "Creative Cities" (2017)	78
4.2.1. Hatay as Creative City of Gastronomy.....	78
4.2.2. UNESCO Criterias for Creative City of Crafts and Folk Art.....	81
4.2.2.1. Kutahya as Creative City of Crafts and Folk Art.....	86
4.2.3. UNESCO Criterias for Creative City of Design.....	88
4.2.3.1. Istanbul as Creative City of Design.....	92
5. CONCLUSION.....	100
6. REFERENCES.....	108

IMAGE LIST

Image 1: Creative Cities of Gastronomy	68
Image 2: Creative Crafts & Folk Arts Cities	82
Image 3: Creative Design Cities	89



TABLE LIST

Table 1: Delineation of the cultural & creative sector	24
Table 2: Development Agencies 2016 Implementations of the Regimented Project Support	57
Table 3: Creative Cities of Gastronomy	69
Table 4: Characteristics of the Creative Cities	104



LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

AMA: American Marketing Association

BAKKA: Batı Karadeniz Kalkınma Ajansı

CIS: Creative Industries Styria LLC

CMDP: Cazibe Merkezlerini Destekleme Programı

CLG-MEWA: United Cities and Local Governments Middle East and West Asia Section

COD: UNESCO Cities of Design

DCMS: Department for Culture, Media and Sport

GBB: Gaziantep Metropolitan Municipality

GDCO: Global Design Cities Organization

ICCB: The Istanbul Creative City Platform

ISTKA: Istanbul Development Agency

IDIC: Istanbul Design and Innovation Center

ISCID: International Council of Societies of Industrial Design

İSMEK: Lifelong Learning Center

UCCN: UNESCO Creative Cities Network

UCLG: United Cities and Local Governments

UGNLC: UNESCO Global Network of Learning Cities

UNCTAD: United Nations Conference on Trade and Development

UNESCO: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization

YEKON: Creative Industries Council Association

WDC: World Design Capital

WTO: World Tourism Organization

INTRODUCTION

1. Research Objectives

The rate of urbanization and the population in the urban spaces have recently increased worldwide. In 2008, it is confirmed that the number of people who live in the cities are more than the ones living the rural regions for the first time. According to the data of the United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD), it is predicted that two third of the world population will live in the cities in 2050 if this increase continues (UNCTAD, 2018). This fact requires the cities to develop effective strategies for resolving the social, political, economic and cultural problems recently faced by the cities.

United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO) emphasizes that culture and creativity focused policies might be effective on the solution of the mentioned problems. From the point of view considering creativity as a tool of local development, and cultural diversity, culture and creative industries as the momentum of this development, UNESCO Creative Cities Network (UCCN) is established in 2004. UCCN evaluates cities within the frame of its determined criteria in line with the themes of craft and folk arts, design, cinema, gastronomy, literature, music, and media arts. It suggests that new economies shaped by creativity and creative industries are crucial in terms of sustainable development strategies of the cities, and this might be possible through the cooperation which will be developed both at the local level and among cities and countries. Determining criteria which support the access to cultural products and services in terms of production and consumption, and, especially, the development of participatory cultural policies, it encourages the cities in this context.

The main objective of this study is to investigate the creative cities in Turkey in terms of the activities which are already done and planned to be done through the data obtained by carrying out a situation analysis on the activities and interactions

of the cities joined to the UCCN within the scope of the criteria determined by the UCCN. To provide suggestions in regard to especially the development of participation and creativity for the cities is another objective of this study.

2. Framework of the Study

In line with the above framed objectives, the first chapter discusses the creativity as a concept and the discourse of creative city within the context of creative industries, the new economy, and city branding strategies. It is emphasized that certain city branding strategies have been developed for cities through a process including the shift from cultural industries to creative industries. Revisiting Charles Landry and Richard Florida's approaches on cities, the current stage of Florida's creative class theory is emphasized.

The second chapter dwells on the justification of the UCCN' establishment and investigates what kind of programs have been since carried out, what needs are taken into consideration in determining the criteria, and what cities have done in conjunction with the data acquired from periodic reports. It is highlighted that collaborations, partnerships, local and international programs, and the cities' dynamics have an impact upon the determination of the criteria.

The third chapter, first, introduces a general review on culture and cultural policies, and, then, investigates the status of culture in Turkey through development agencies, urban strategic plans, national council meetings, and the governments' development plans and programs.

In the fourth chapter, the activities carried out in Gaziantep, the first city from Turkey join the UNESCO Creative Cities Network with the theme of gastronomy in 2015 are analyzed within the frame of the Network's criteria for the city of gastronomy, and the negotiations. Also, a situation analysis on Istanbul, Hatay and Kütahya as the cities joined to UCCN in 2017 is conducted considering the criteria for their themes and the activities carried out in the other member cities.

In the final chapter of the dissertation it is discussed whether the UCCN has created changes in the aforementioned cities and the degree of changes varying by the cities if there is any.

3. Methodology

Within the scope of this study, it is applied to the qualitative research methodology has been adopted as. The literature on creativity, creative industries, creative economy, creative city and brand cities is reviewed, and the theoretical framework of the discussions on creative city is formed in the light of the data acquired from the literature review. In addition, a wide range of articles published by UNESCO Creative Cities Network and two dissertations were consulted. These articles and dissertation mentioned are briefly explained in the following paragraphs.

In his article entitled “A Suggestion for the UNESCO Creative Cities Network: Bitlis the City of Gastronomy,” Prof. Kenan Arınç from the Geography Department of Atatürk University’s Faculty of Arts investigates Bitlis in terms of UCCN’s criteria for the city of gastronomy. In this article, it is argued that Bitlis is not in a position to be able to apply UCCN because it does not have a sufficient education and the required infrastructures even though it has a rich gastronomical culture, and certain suggestions are brought forward on this issue. The article has an approach for the development of the gastronomic tourism.

In the article entitled “An Evaluation of the Potential of the City of Antalya to Become Part of UNESCO’s Creative Cities Network” published by Assoc. Prof. Beykan Çizel and Edina Ajanovic from the Tourism Management Department of Akdeniz University Faculty of Tourism, the UCCN is analyzed based on the discussions about creative tourism and certain suggestions are brought forward for the city of Antalya. These suggestions promote Antalya to join to the UCCN as a “City of Film.”

In their article entitled “Gaziantep within the Scope of the UNESCO Creative Cities Network: An Evaluation in the Context of the Existing Reports,” two

research associates from the Department of Business Administration of İzmir Katip Çelebi University Faculty of Economics and Administrative Sciences, Nisa Akın and Barış Bostancı, bring forward certain suggestions on how the “membership monitoring report” of Gaziantep that joined UCCN with the theme of gastronomy will need to be prepared in 2019 after the four-year process is completed. These suggestions have been formulated by examining the monitoring and self-evaluation reports of cities, which are already part of UCCN.

From Mardin Artuklu University, School of Tourism and Hotel Management, Semra Gürbüz, Gülseren Özaltaş Serçek and Lokman Toprak published an article entitled “Stakeholders Opinion Concerning the Possibility of Mardin Being ‘City of Gastronomy’ in UNESCO Creative Cities Network” in 2017. This study, the authors argue that Mardin has a significant potential in the field of gastronomy, this potential can be utilized in the field of gastronomic tourism, and that can be possible if it becomes a member of the UCCN, and the actors of the city work in cooperation. They make this evaluation in the wake of the interviews with the selected stakeholders in the city.

The urban planner Ahmetcan Alpcan conducted a master’s thesis entitled “Evaluation of Haliç as a Cultural Valley in Context of Creative City Criteria” at the Institute of Science and Technology, Mimar Sinan Fine Arts University in 2010. In the mentioned research, the potential changes predicted to happen in Haliç in the following years are evaluated through the theory and practices of study cultural and creative industries. Although the research has similarities with this study in terms of the evaluation on criteria for creative cities and cultural policies, it differs due to its urban planning-based approach.

In his PhD dissertation entitled “Evaluation of İzmir in the Context of UNESCO Creative Cities Network City of Design Criteria” at the Architectural Design Program of the Department of Architecture at Istanbul Technical University Institution of Science and Technology in 2016, Hasan Cenk Dereli investigates the activities carried out in İzmir between 2009 and 2016 in the context of

UCCN's criteria for the city of design. Developing a methodology for İzmir's design potential to be utilized, Dereli employs an observation and survey study regarding the impacts of this method. In the light of the data acquired through this methodology, he argues that İzmir can be a city of design, and puts forward suggestions in this context.

Throughout this study, examining the reports of experts and self-evaluation reports that cities joined to UCCN are expected to prepare in four years, a research is conducted on these documents and a situation analysis is carried out in line with the data collected through the research.

In order to comprehend how the process of UCCN is performed in the cities, a range of interviews were conducted. These interviews were carried out with the executives who perform the process of UCCN in related institutions such as UNESCO National Commission of Turkey, Gaziantep Metropolitan Municipality, the Department of Foreign Affairs, Hatay Municipality, Kütahya Municipality, Kütahya Development Agency, Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality and the Directorate of Urban Design. Even though it was planned to conduct a survey study in the beginning of the interviews, the technique of in-depth interview was preferred to be used in their natural flow rather than asking the listed questions. The technique of participant observation is, also, utilized within the scope of this study.

This study shares similarities with the above-mentioned existing research in terms of methodology and the techniques applied. While it is benefited from the mentioned research in establishing the framework, this study dwells on UCCN and aims to bring forward certain suggestions through evaluating the member cities from Turkey.

Due to the bureaucratic obstacles met throughout the research, some data could not be reached. The application proposals and certain details which might be evaluated in regard to the process have not been shared by the cities since they are considered as related to be confidential.

CHAPTER ONE

1. CREATIVITY, CITY AND CULTURE: THE CONCEPT OF CREATIVE CITY

The concept of creativity which is described as “the state of being creative, the ability of creating and an imaginary inclination to create things taken granted for each humanbeing” (TDK, 2006) was first employed in philosophy. Creativity has been invented through the Latin word *creare*¹ and scrutinized by various disciplines in their own concerns in the course of time; today it becomes an interdisciplinary study itself.

Innumerable descriptions of creativity have been examined and categorized by scholars. The frame developed by Taylor, and designated by Rhodes earlier, is considered as significant in order to specify the boundaries of the concept of creativity within the scope of this study. The given frame classifies creativity as “*the creative persona*,” “*the creative process*,” “*the creative product*” and “*the ambience*” (as cited in Ajanovic, Cizel, 2015, p.2). As one of the scientists who contextualize creativity through personality characteristics, Lowenfeld defines creativity as “a characteristic that each individual has variable amount of, and which is suitable for emerging circumstantially; an individual potential power which requires appropriate conditions to manifest itself; an instinct carried by each humanbeing inherently that makes humans human; an instinct that we utilize

¹ In Etymology Turkish dictionary (Etimoloji Türkçe Sözlük), the word *create* is defined as: quoted from the French word *création* “creation, creating.” The French word is quoted from the Latin word *creatio* which has the same meaning. This word derives from the Latin verb *creare*, *creat-* “(plant or animal) giving birth, growing, nurturing” with the suffix *+tion*. The Latin verb has been evolved from the form of **krē-ya-* which has the same meaning in Indo-European language without any written example. (Kreasyon, n.d.)

*This form has been derived from the base of **ker-* “growing or raising” without any written example in Indo-European language. It seems that the word *culture* which is derived from the Latin word *colere* (doing agriculture, cultivating) is semantically related to this word. (Culture, n.d.)

in order to survive and to solve our problems related to our lives” (as cited in Onur and Zorlu, 2017, p. 1540).

From the perspectives which define creativity as a process, while individuals are producing solutions for the problems, they go through certain phases. These phases progress as altering the proposed ideas and solutions, and bringing a new dimension to them (Gürol, 2006, p.39).

In the studies which investigate creativity through its relation with the product, there is a consensus in that creativity is the capability of individuals to produce new, diversified, useful, deviant and authentic products (Torrance, 1968; Takala, 1993). In these types of descriptions, creativity’s relation with the new constitutes a focal point. “The reconstituted and reinterpreted creative product leads us to the beyond of the ordinary. One should bring unknown realities to life by focusing on the new in order to achieve an authentic product. This creative product must cause an excitement on individuals who have the ability of perceiving of it (as cited in Onur and Zorlu, 2017, p. 12). The relation between “the new” and “the creativity” constitutes the major line of creative economy which will be discussed in the following section.

In addition to the classification through categorization mentioned above, it seems that there are studies which consider creativity as the interaction between these processes. The characteristics mentioned in each description reveal different dimensions of creativity. One who questions and does research, changing and progressing process, and as a result the product itself flourish with intellectual accumulation and experiences. In this respect, creativity might be described as “a natural ability which might be expressed more or less depending on the atmosphere and the conditions, which is owned by each human being and occurs with the relational integrity of senses, emotions, awareness, intellectual and cognitive abilities used in the stage of thinking” (Onur and Zorlu, 2017, p. 1547).

Besides the conceptual descriptions –in relation with the given descriptions and approaches-, there are current approaches which consider creativity as the fundamental dynamic of economy. According to Richard Florida who qualifies creativity as a kind of capital from the economic point of view and calls it “creative capital,” what is important to create new ideas, technologies, operating models, cultural forms and industries is human ability by definition (Florida, 2011, p. 72). Also, Florida makes some other comments on creativity:

One of the greatest fallacies of modern times is that creativity is limited to a small group of people with particular talents. Most people, the belief goes, don't want to be creative, couldn't do it if asked, and would be very uncomfortable in an environment where creativity was expected of them. This belief is false. The single most overlooked -and single most important- element of my theory is the idea that every human being is creative.² By our very nature, each and every person is endowed with an incredible capacity for innovation, a by-product of the innate human capability to evolve and adapt. Creative capital is thus a virtually limitless resource. Human beings are creative in many different ways, and in many different fields that go beyond acquired skills. (Florida, 2011, p. 34)

As the founder of the model of creative cities, Charles Landry mentions that creativity is not a destination but a journey, not a state but a process; that creativity is the precedence of innovation; that innovation is the actualization of a new idea in practice by going through a creative thinking process. Landry, who stands with the approach considering creativity as a process, suggests that innovation comes to exist through passing an actual test, and creative idea is not enough per se (Landry, 2000, p. 14-15).

In another study Landry conducted with Bianchini, he defines the test, which innovation undergoes, through three criterions. These criterions are introduced as

²The theory mentioned in the quotation from Richard Florida's book entitled “The Flight of the Creative Class: The New Global Competition for Talent” will be discussed in details in the section of “Richard Florida and from the Creative Class to the New Urban Depression.”

price, efficiency and popularity, and enable the suitability of the proposed idea with innovation to be evaluated (Landry and Bianchini, 1995, p. 20).

1.1. The Concept of Creative City

Charles Landry, who argues that development of creative economies might be possible with creative cities, considers the source of a sustainable economy as creative cities. He highlights the importance of a creative environment in the progress of modern cities and regions' creativity (Landry, 2000).

In this regard, how might cities' level of creativity be increased? According to Landry, cities' level of creativity might be increased if the groups with different goals meet on a common ground; if private sector develops works which provides social benefits; different sectors develop cooperation; and public sector becomes more enterprising (Landry, 2007, p. 7).

In this vein, Landry suggests a “toolbox” to city managers who would like to center themselves within the global competition and to develop creative processes for this purpose. For Landry, creative cities need a new and creative basis which varies as hard, soft and mental substructure. While hard infrastructure addresses to a technical basis including buildings, urban roads and sewerage system, soft infrastructure includes flexible labor power with a high skill level, effective communication channels and entrepreneurship culture. On the other hand, mental infrastructure refers to the solution processes which are developed by residents of the city in the face of problems, and the authentic environment of the city (Landry, 2000, p. 164-172).

Landry emphasizes that each individual in society –who might be a laborer and/or engineer- should be included in creativity without associating it only to a certain group of people such as artists or scientists (Landry, 2000). In this way, creativity level of the city might be increased by promoting the production of cultural goods

and services. He also mentions that a city must have environmental policies which are able to protect its cultural heritage and structure to be creative (Landry, 2000). Moreover, creative cities must be able to develop solutions to their everyday problems such as educational system, transportation and refuse collection system (Enlil and Evren, 2011, p. 23).

Enlil and Evren explain that there are approaches which consider creativity as two different areas such as culture-based and economy-based within discussions on the concept of creative city. The approaches based around culture consider cities as the space of art and cultural diversity, and lay emphasis on the values which cannot be economically calculated. On the other hand, economy-based approaches regard cities as a tool of economic development; in other words, they approach to the creative city as the space of creative sectors, faculties and economic inventions (Enlil and Evren, 2011, p. 642).

According to the cultural researcher, Peter Hall who conducts studies on creative cities and economic development, creative cities are spaces which provide significant changes through shaping their residents' social relations, and their values and thoughts on environment. Hall argues that conservative and immobile societies can not build creative spaces (Hall, 1999, p. 642).

Landry and Bianchini state that creativity has historically been the heart of the city and arisen in the cities where people are in interaction with each other: "They have mostly been the places where races and cultures mix and where interaction creates new ideas, artifacts and institutions. And they have been the places which allow people room to live out their ideas, needs, aspirations, dreams, projects, conflicts, memories, anxieties, loves, passions, obsessions and fears" (Landry and Bianchini, 1998, p. 11).

It requires three factors to enable creative cities to be occurred. These are respectively defined as concentration, diversity and instability. Concentration

refers to the multiplicity of communication and interaction between a certain number of people who locate in a certain place. By diversity, it is referred to both socio-economic diversity of the residents of a city and its elements such as architectural structure of the city. The third factor defined as instability refers to the possibility of a simple event which might provide an urban development within a short span of time. In chaos or complexity theory, this phenomenon has been referred to as the "butterfly effect" (Hospers, 2003, p. 149-151).

Hospers classifies creative cities as technological-innovative, cultural-intellectual, cultural-technological and technological-organizational (Hospers, 2003, p. 147-148). Technological-innovative cities are defined as leading cities to technological developments and being distinct with this aspect. Detroit is seen as an example of this kind of cities. Cultural-intellectual cities are distinct with their artists, scientists, philosophers and intellectuals, and their creations. London (theatre), Paris (art), Vienna (science and art) in the 17th century and Berlin (theatre) in the 20th century have been the examples of this type of cities. Cultural-technological cities are defined as spaces that concentrate culture and technology simultaneously, and had been considered as cultural industries in the past. Hollywood (film industry), Bombay (Bollywood), Memphis (music), Paris and Milano (fashion), Toronto (multimedia), Hamburg (entertainment and new media) might be seen as the examples of this kind of cities. On the other hand, technological-organizational cities are distinguished with their innovative solutions to the problems which are faced in the urban life. Baltimore and Philadelphia (urban renewal via private sector), Antwerp-Belgium (invigoration of port area) and Paris (transit system combining trams, light rail system and motor buses) might be given as examples of this type of cities (Hospers, 2003, p. 147-148).

Besides these definitions and classification of creative cities, Landry mentions that the meaning of ownership, belonging and citizenship has changed; and that there is a need for "spaces for empathy" where people can encounter and

communicate with each other; find an inspiration, share their experiences and arouse a sense of belonging. In addition to these, Landry emphasizes that cities transform in consequences of certain factors such as migration, inequality, digitalization, changing social and political systems, environmental problems. He also suggests that there is a need for creative-bureaucratic solutions in struggling with these problems; and cities need a structure called “civic society” in which their citizens participate in decision processes by taking responsibility.³ Landry presents the meanings of “civic society” as:

Being civic is about more than voting or volunteering or associational life or formal civic participation projects or community development initiatives. It is an attitude of respecting the other too, it is about getting closer and yet keeping distance without being distanced. It cuts across class and income..... The goal is to make better cities by creating a culture of civility. The civic is the texture of successful urban life. Behind it and civic city lies a vast reservoir of fragile agreements about collective living... (Landry, 2017, p. 204).

Landry points out that “civic city” might be possible with effective public policies and applications in public space, and considers Chicago as one of the well-known examples besides Vancouver, Melbourne, Portland, Bilbao, Malaga and Nice (Landry, 2017, p. 204-213).

1.2. From Creative Class to Urban Depression

Landry defines the spaces where creative economy rises through creative cities. According to Florida, creative sectors as the source of creative economy might become functional by means of the “creative class” which is comprised of the educated and skilled individuals. For him, cities need to construct the potentialities and the environments which might operate the creative class in order to enable them to make a difference and to develop with their creative and

³ These statements of Charles Landry were compiled from the interview Assoc. Prof. Serhan Ada did with him. (Interview with Charles Landry, 2018)

innovative aspects within the increasingly competitive environment. Florida argues that cities can develop new industries and models of society through bringing the creative energy with the technological and artistic innovations (Florida, 2005, p. 1).

Florida's conceptualization of the creative class includes two different groups as the super-creative core and the creative professionals. The super-creative core consists of individuals who make contributions with their creativity to the environment which they locate (ones who work in such fields as art, science, education, sports, media and entertainment). Creative professionals, on the other hand, are the ones who work knowledge intensive industrial sectors (e.g. health, high technology, finance, law, business management etc.) (Florida, 2012).

Gabe et al. comments on Florida's conceptualization of creative class and considers what contributions individual make as related to this classification rather than the schools these individuals are educated in or graduated from. In this respect, Gabe et al. states: "In contrast to the educational-based human capital measure, the Creative Class occupational typology takes into account what people actually do (and related skill requirements) in their current jobs, rather than the amount of schooling they have completed" (Gabe et al., 2012, p. 3).

Florida argues that a city needs to have three characteristics called 3T such as technology, talent and tolerance which enables the creative class to be won over in order to be able to strengthen its creative aspects and to develop its economy (Florida, 2003, p. 10-13). By talent, he refers to the creative class which has educated and talented characteristics or to the groups having a potential to be the creative class. While explaining tolerance as one of these aspects, Florida highlights that cities need to have a structure which is inclusive of diverse opinions, gender, identities and cultures. In addition to these, there must be a technological infrastructure which might render the cities dynamic within the fierce competition environment and transform the creative energies. The creative

class would solely prefer the cities having all these three characteristics together (Florida, 2003).

Florida emphasizes that cities having each of technology, tolerance, talent and a creative core can potentially increase their capacity of competition with other cities in the sense of economics. Moreover, he argues that the capacity of preferability would increase not only within the environments which have the set of developed technological or physical infrastructures but also within the ones having an intensive cultural diversity. The preferability of the cities as creative centers is also associated with their cultural possibilities and high standards of living (Pratt, 2008, p. 112).

In his book "*The Flight of the Creative Class*," Florida emphasizes that the U.S. has the most connected, far-reaching/inclusive and productive city system among the countries all around the world -from its global and cosmopolitan centers of finance, entertainment and high technology to its quality life communities, industry centers and university towns- and that it provides different economic possibilities and alternative life styles (Florida, 2011, p. 239). Even though these aspects enable US to attract the creative potential in various regions, it seems that the aforementioned potential's and, thus, the creative class' focal point have started to become the cities in Japan or European countries in the course of time – especially after the September 11 attacks- (Florida, 2011). Therefore, Florida highlights the necessity of new policy implementations laying emphasis on the diversity in particular.

By agreeing with the findings of a research on the influences of diversity in the economic growth which was conducted in the U.S. by Garry Gates in 2004, Florida states that "He found diversity to be significantly related to economic growth. Particularly, he found that communities with higher levels of diversity in the form of ethnic and racial minorities, gays, immigrants, higher levels of integration, and higher levels of bridging social capital tended to have better

growth rates.” In parallel with this, he argues that the central point stands beyond the diversity per se, as a cultural or moral issue (Florida, 2011, p. 74).

This conceptualization of the creative class, leading by Florida, as the driving force of the economic growth has been criticized from its various aspects. According to Enlil and Evren, he is criticized due to the fact that “Florida has an elitist point of view regarding all the programs of the cities as strategies to winning the class, so to speak, considering cities as a “bourgeois playground.” (Enlil and Evren, 2011, p. 23). With reference to Scott’s point of view on “Creative Cities,” Enlil and Evren make another criticism: “In fact, even though reducing the economic growth to only one factor –the creative class- render this conceptualization simple as well as popular, it brings about the ignorance of production processes working as the real driver of economic growth, and of working class as the enabler of these processes” (Enlil and Evren, 2011, p. 23). Scott criticizes Florida’s ideas on the concentration of creativity in a certain region of the city: “...(C)reativity is not something that can be simply imported into the city on the backs of peripatetic computer hackers, skateboarders, gays, and assorted bohemians but must be organically developed through the complex interweaving of relations of production, work, and social life in specific urban contexts” (Scott, 2006, p.15).

Some scholars have argued that the ideas and practices formulated by Florida have served the rich and mostly white middle class, caused fuel and property speculations; and lead the problems which had bothered the city centers and replaced by fetishized bohemians to the suburbs. Hence, Florida stated that he “repented of” some points in his theory – e.g. its ignorance of the service industry, and the workers within this sector - and highlighted that there is a need for new and more inclusive regulations. (Everything is gentrification, 2017)

These regulations are discussed by Florida in his book entitled “*The Urban Crises*” (Florida, 2017). In this book, Florida firstly defines the new urban crisis,

and he, then, explores a new method under the title of “urbanism for all.” Differently from the earlier crises, the new urban crisis, he states, has been influence on all the segments of society, and extensively effected on the “sustainable” economies which had been able to survive with energy, tourism and real estate markets. He lays emphasis on the five dimensions of the new crisis arising from the urbanization itself.

First dimension is the increasing gap between the small number of “superstar” cities such as New York, London and Paris as well as the world’s leading technology and information centers, and the other cities. Only six metropolitan areas -San Francisco Bay Area, Washington DC, Boston, Seattle, San Diego and London- give rise to “winner-take-all” urbanism attracting the half of the investments in advanced technologies in the world. "The rise of this *winner-take-all urbanism* creates a new kind of inequality between cities, with the economic gulf growing wider and wider between the winners and the much broader ranks of other cities that have lost their economic footing as a result of globalization, deindustrialization, and other factors” (Florida, 2017, p.13).

The second dimension is described as the crisis of success. He emphasizes that the mentioned winners have faced with the unaffordable property prices and the levels of inequality. Under these circumstances, Florida mentions that not only musicians, artists and creative workers but also economically advantaged intellectual workers have been concerned about their potential failure to build a future for their families. Moreover, he argues that the groups who will face with the worst economic consequences are the blue-collar workers and service employees as well as the poor and the culturally disadvantaged people. These groups of people are resettled out the “superstar” cities and deprived of the economic opportunities, the public services, the social benefits and the increasing mobility provided in these cities (Florida, 2017, p. 13).

According to Florida, The New Urban Crisis' third dimension, which is quite problematic in many aspects, refers to the disappearance of the middle class (*disappearing middle*). He mentions that the middle class of the times American Dream was physically embodied have become to disappear with their neighborhoods. He argues that a new social pattern called "Patchwork Metropolis" where the small privileged spaces and the big spaces of poverty are intersected has replaced with the class discrimination as "the poor cities versus the rich suburbs."

"The fourth dimension of the New Urban Crisis is the burgeoning crisis of the suburbs, where poverty, insecurity, and crime are mounting, and economic and racial segregation are growing deeper" (Florida, 2017, p. 13). Florida emphasizes that more people live in the suburbs due to the fact that the displaced groups prefer to live in the suburbs because of the low prices there, and the increasing number of people who left their bonds with the middle class because of the job losses and the increasing prices of the properties. Florida also mentions that the suburbs have recently been in a position in which they can compete with the cities in terms of inequalities although they are used to be the richest communities in the U.S. for a long while (Florida, 2017).

Explaining the fifth and the last dimension as the crisis of urbanization, Florida argues that urbanization does not bring about the economic growth, an increase in the living standards and the growing middle class as much as before, rather it has a decreasing potential to make change in the living standards (Florida, 2017, p. 43-51).

While emphasizing that the New Crisis is shaped by the fundamental contradiction brought on by urban clustering, Florida states that on the one hand, the urban clustering, today, drives the innovation and the economic growth forcities. On the other hand, he explains, it results in deep disintegrations and inequalities because it is concentrated in limited areas and cities. Even though the

biggest fifty metropolises contain only the seven percent of the world population, they, however, manage the forty percent of the global economy.

Florida argues that it is possible to resolve the New Urban Crisis with more urbanization rather than the less, and suggests a method called “Urbanism for all” consisting of seven layers:

1. “Reform zoning and building codes, as well as tax policies, to ensure that the clustering force works to the benefit of all.
2. Invest in the infrastructure needed to spur density and clustering and limit costly and inefficient sprawl.
3. Build more affordable rental housing in central locations.
4. Expand the middle class by turning low-wage service jobs into family-supporting work.
5. Tackle concentrated poverty head-on by investing in people and places.
6. Engage in a global effort to build stronger, more prosperous cities in rapidly urbanizing parts of the emerging world.
7. Empower communities and enable local leaders to strengthen their own economies and cope with the challenges of the New Urban Crisis” (Florida, 2017, p.15).

Hereby, while emphasizing that the formation of welfare cities need to be supported and strengthened, Florida suggests a new method which is supposed to be inclusive of all segments of society by persisting the mission that he has already assigned to the creative class without ignoring its negative consequences. Even though Florida argues that this method might be influential in the fight against the New Urban Crisis, he overlooks that the states with different administrative structures have various authorities due to the fact that he lays a burden on the local in his study limited with U.S. and England. In other respects, his tendency to socially group people as the creative and the non-creative is found problematical by a number of scholars. Also, some of his ideas which consider this class as the driving force of economy, and ignore the working class and the workers of service industries have been found elitist and inadequate (although he

refers to these groups in “The New Urban Crises”). (The New Urban Crises, 2017)

1.3. Creative Industries and Creative Economy

With the impact of the big and rapid change in the mode and the relations of production over the last century, the key industrial sectors economies rely on have deflected their focus from a product-based area to an information-indexed direction featuring the creativity and innovation. Along with the switch to the neoliberal policies starting from 1980s which is generally called globalism, each state has become to bring the creativity- and the information-oriented economic enterprises toward in their politics. The area of activity this new economic approach based upon is called as “the creative industries.”

Before the discussion on the creative industries, it is significant to briefly touch the concept of culture industry developed by Adorno and Horkheimer. Horkheimer argues that the culture industry considers cultural products as the products that can be bought and sold, commodities (Adorno and Horkheimer, 2010) "In all its branches, products which are tailored for consumption by masses, and which to a great extent determine the nature of that consumption, are manufactured more or less according to plan" (Adorno, 2014, p. 109). Adorno explains that “he employs the concept of culture industry to refer to the standardization of cultural properties and the rationalization of distribution techniques rather than directly to production process itself” (Çelik, 2011, p. 113).

With the shift from the culture industries to the creative industries, discussions on culture industries have continued in another ground. “True believers in a technological liberation from corporate domination argue that the concept of the cultural industries is outmoded not because all industries are cultural but because postindustrialized societies have seen an efflorescence of the creative sector via

small businesses” (Miller, 2009, p. 94-95). In the light of this argument of Miller, one might say that the idea of creative industries based on small business enterprises does not epistemically take precedence of the idea of culture industries which maintain the mass production under corporate dominance (Erman, 2014, p. 99). In his article entitled “*Culture Industry and the Administration of Terror*,” Ray emphasizes that the criticism of culture industry is significant in a sense and states that “... (T)he discourse of creative industries is premised on a neutralizing appropriation of Adorno’s critical category of ‘culture industry’” (Ray, 2011, p. 168).

The creative industries which first merged in the Anglo-Saxon countries in 1990s are related to the information society. According to Hartley, the evolution of information society follows this order: infrastructure, network, content and creativity. While infrastructure establishes new networks for sharing the information, networks provides the production of infinitely many contents. These might be possible only with creativity (Hartley, J. 2005). “According to the writer, what is important is to be light and to produce innovations in the period of this ‘new economy’.... While providing an opportunity for the local cultures and enterprises, the new economy enables enterprises to become independent of infrastructure and space through resting upon the life style choices like the digital game industry” (In Demir, E. M., 2014, p. 90). Therefore, it is mentioned that the entrepreneurial environments and states have focused on creative industries.

Castells mentions that the ground of the new economy is prepared by information technology emerged in the last decade of the 20th century and arrays three aspects of this economy:

It is informational because the productivity and competitiveness of units or agents in this economy (be it firms, regions, or nations) fundamentally depend upon their capacity to generate, process, and apply efficiently knowledge-based information. It is global because the core activities of production, consumption, and circulation, as well as their components (capital, labor, raw materials, management, information, technology,

markets) are organized on a global scale, either directly or through a network of linkages between economic agents. It is networked because, under the new historical conditions, productivity is generated through and competition is played out in a global network of interaction between business networks (Castells 2005, p. 77).

According to Castells, the emergence of the new economy in the U.S. in 1990s is not a coincidence. He highlights that the new economy has emerged in the environment of information technology and financial sectors where biotechnology was shining on the horizon as a result of institutional, cultural, economic and technological factors strengthening each other. A flexible, individualistic and multiethnic society structure constitutes the components of these new sectors and the U.S. (Castells, 2005, p. 185-186). Uçkan also makes a comment which might be discussed in relation to this issue. Uçkan mentions that knowledge economy promotes entrepreneurship, and a society consisting of skilled, flexible and creative individuals in addition to effective usage of information. He also states that creative industries have singly become network economies:

There is a kind of “convergence” between creativity, culture, economy and technology. Among these, a multilayered interface is formed with network effect and the dynamics of globalization. As information has become the most important input, intellectual capital, technological innovation which became the driving force of economy as the dynamics of creativity, network economy and transboundary cultural interaction co-creates a universe of values. As the focal spots, the tangles of global economy, urban economics interconnect with each other (Uçkan, 2011, p. 33-34).

From this point of view, Uçkan describes cities respectively as specialized sources of information, and highlights that urban economy is entirely a focus of information economy. However, some cities go ahead of some others. These “gate-away cities” which connect with the world through their airports, other transportations and especially information-communication networks, and they have intense global integration and high economic concentrations. Cities are the spaces as a focus of innovation which is the leading dynamics of the economy of global information. Due to the fact that these tangles are the spaces where the

software is developed enabling the function of network, they have a crucial competitive edge (Uçkan, 2011, p. 34).

In the body of literature, the birth of creative industries as the sources of new economy is conceptually identified with the establishment of the Creative Industries Unit in England in 1997 within the Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport (DCMS). DCMS defines and categorizes creative industries as advertisement, architecture, art and antique markets, handicrafts, design, fashion, film and video, interactive entertainment software, music, performing arts, radio and television, and publishing and software industries (Department for Culture, Media and Sport 2011, p. 6).

“These cultural industries are produced in specific places and times and, like the cognitive cultural economy as a whole, are inherently urban-based and at the vanguard of a new economy” (Donald et al., 2013, p.4). According to Creative Industries Task Force, the creative industries have the following four characteristics:

1. "imply activities whose origin lies in individual creativity, skills and talent;
2. have potential to create wealth and jobs through the generation and exploitation of intellectual property rights;
3. use creative intangible inputs that add more economic and social value than the one added within traditional manufacturing processes;
4. comprise and gather traditional cultural industries (such as the performing arts) and cultural industries and information intensive communication of the new economy (Ivanovici and Mândruleanu, 2009, p.128)."

Galloway and Dunlop emphasize that the differences between cultural and creative industries are not always clear and that these industries are

interchangeable. That is why they argue firstly that the complexity of these two concepts must be clear, and secondly: “...(I)t must also be recognized that cultural creativity is distinct from other types of creativity, and is more than simply one further knowledge economy asset -an understanding of this point is essential if we are to recognize and develop the distinctive aspects of the cultural sector” (Galloway and Dunlop, 2007, p. 29). There are still ongoing discussions on this issue.

UNESCO defines cultural industries in the document of *The Global Alliance for Cultural Diversity*(2006).According to document the term cultural industries refers to industries which combine the creation, production and commercialization of creative contents which are intangible and cultural in nature. The contents are typically protected by copyright and they can take the form of a good or a service. Cultural industries generally include printing, publishing and multimedia, audiovisual, phonographic and cinematographic productions as well as crafts and design. The term creative industries encompasses a broader range of activities which include the cultural industries plus all cultural or artistic production, whether live or produced as an individual unit. The creative industries are those in which the product or service contains a substantial element of artistic or creative endeavor and include activities such as architecture and advertising (UNESCO, 2006).

Table 1 shows another classification on the relationality of cultural and creative industries. It is also crucial to mention that this categorization,which creative industries present a wide frame for,is not a description having a consensus on.

Table 1. Delineation of the cultural&creative sector

CIRCLES	SECTORS	SUB- SECTORS	CHARACTERISTICS
CORE ARTS FIELD	Visual arts	Crafts Paintings – Sculpture – Photography	• Non industrial activities. • Output are prototypes and "potentially copyrighted works" (i.e. these works have a high density of creation that would be eligible to copyright but they are however not systematically copyrighted, as it is the case for most craft works, some performing arts productions and visual arts, etc).
	Performing arts	Theatre - Dance – Circus - Festivals.	
	Heritage	Museums – Libraries - Archaeological sites - Archives.	
CIRCLE 1: CULTURAL INDUSTRIES	Film and Video		• Industrial activities aimed at massive reproduction. • Outputs are based on copyright.
	Television and radio		
	Video games		
	Music	Recorded music market – Live music performances – revenues of collecting societies in the music sector	
	Books and press	Book publishing - Magazine and press publishing	
CIRCLE 2: CREATIVE INDUSTRIES AND ACTIVITIES	Design	Fashion design, graphic design, interior design, product design	• Activities are not necessarily industrial, and may be prototypes. • Although outputs are based on copyright, they may include other intellectual property inputs (trademark for instance). • The use of creativity (creative skills and creative people originating in the arts field and in the field of cultural industries) is essential to the performances of these non cultural sectors.
	Architecture		
	Advertising		
CIRCLE 3: RELATED INDUSTRIES	PC manufacturers, MP3 player manufacturers, mobile industry, etc...		• This category is loose and impossible to circumscribe on the basis of clear criteria. It involves many other economic sectors that are dependent on the previous "circles", such as the ICT sector.

: "the cultural sector"
 : "the creative sector"

Source: European Commission, (2006), 'The Economy of Culture in Europe', p.3

While some approaches have an effort to define the scopes of creative industries and their main characteristics, the most commonly used categorizations have

developed by UNCTAD and Howkins. According to UNCTAD's categorization, these are classified as: cultural heritage (traditional and archaeological areas including art, craftwork, festivals, and cultural areas such as museums, libraries etc.), arts (visual arts including painting, sculpture, photography and antiques, and performing arts such as live music, theatre, dance, opera, cirques and puppetry), media (publishing, printed media and audiovisual media), functional creations (interior design, graphic, fashion, jewellery, toy making and new media including softwares, computer games and digital creative contents) in conjunction with creative services (architecture, advertising, creative R&D, and digital and other creative services) as a subgroup (UNCTAD, 2010).

On the other hand, Howkins lays emphasis on that classifications of creative industries might vary from countries to countries by suggesting a classification through markets. According to Howkins, each individual who participates in any phase of production is a part of economy. For instance, the person who writes a book is a part of economy as much as the one who perform it on the stage (Howkins, 2013, s. 6-7). Howkins addresses creative industries under 15 categories: advertising, architecture, art, craftwork, design, fashion, film, music, performing arts, publishing, R&D, software, play and playthings (excluding computer games), TV and radio, and computer games (Howkins, 2013).

Richard Caves defines creative industries "as the industries providing goods and services which have cultural, artistic or leisure values including book and journal publishing, visual arts (painting and sculpture), performing arts (theatre, opera, concerts, dance), audio records, cinema and TV films, as well as fashion, and play and playthings (In Esen Ü. B and Atay Ö, 2017, p. 6).

As it might be seen in the table and definitions above, there is no definition of creative industries everyone agrees with. However, it seems that it is crucial to keep creative industries' scope wide in terms of development of and supporting creative economies. Underlining the importance of creative economies in

development, the United Nations Creative Economy Report (2010) and the Motion for European Union Creative Industries (2010) might be seen as the examples as they present the frame of this support and the dimensions of its content.

1.4. The Concept of Brand City and Discussions

The concept of brand is defined as "name, term, design, symbol, or any other feature that identifies one seller's good or service as distinct from those of other sellers" by American Marketing Association (AMA), and, today it is described as a concept within the field of marketing. (Brand, n.d.)The given concept has been used also for cities as they have become the space of economic and cultural development.

As the settlement areas, cities have socially, politically, culturally and economically more complex and multidimensional aspects as distinct from rural settlement areas. They have a more heterogeneous structure especially in terms of cultural diversity. As a well-known researcher with his studies on cities, Ruşen Keleş describes cities as “a place which already reach to the conditions of certain magnitude, heterogeneity and integration where the nonagricultural production is made, the control functions are concentrated” (Keleş, 2006, p. 24). The conceptualization of city as “industrial city” by virtue of the industrial revolution leading to mass production, specialization and division of labor in economy has replaced with new conceptualizations along with the effects of globalization starting from 1980s.

The given conceptualizations are generated by being associated with the manner of contextualization of globalization. One of the important scholars in social sciences, Antony Giddens, argues that globalization has four dimensions including the capitalistic world system, the nation-state system, the world military order and international division of labor. Giddens mentions that nation-states are

the principle actor within the global political order and corporations within the world economy (Emre, 2015, p. 11). Beyond the economic concentration of the states, in other words, the development of an economically dependent relationship in a narrow sense, globalization refers to a socially, politically and culturally broader transformation (Giddens, 2000, p. 41-42). On the other hand, Habermas highlights that globalization has increased the inequalities between countries and regions, and has caused insolvably big problems in various fields including education, environment, communication and technology along with increasing poverty (Habermas, 2005, p. 14-15).

With the visibility of the mentioned inequalities, cities have come to the forefront in the struggle with these inequalities rather than the countries themselves. This situation has speeded up the competition between cities. States have become to pursue a strategy rising through urban economy and urban development. Cities have become the center of global economic activities. Saskia Sassen who has important studies on urban science refers to this type of cities as “*global city*”(Sassen, 2000, p. 4).

Considering globalization as the globalization of capitalism, Nilgün Tatal highlights that the most effective trump that countries aiming to be incorporated into this is the powerful cities in terms of history, culture and economy in order to be successful. Tatal describes the changes in cities as that:

"With the societal, economic and cultural changes –with the innovation, acceleration and diversification of transportation, and the mobility of commodities and individuals,- cities have become to transform into metropolises. Transforming into the centers of culture, entertainment and tourism rather than the industrial cities are three milestones of the new postmodern (post-industry) cities’ articulation within the global market. These transformations require redefining the city including the different components of its historical and cultural heritage: A new type of sense of city emerges, and this type of cities is shaped within a process in which intangible wealth is reproduced and revalued, in other words, commoditized in accordance with the market (Tatal, 2018, p. 9)."

Immaterial factors creating cities have become the determining elements of economy within this process through transforming into commodities. Lévy explains that this transformation in the new type of cities as follows “Besides the physical and material heritage of a city, the heritage which is accumulated as its human capital (education, health and culture), scientific heritage (knowledge, universities and research centers), and environmental heritage (climate, nature and their landscapes) have become to characterize the urban constructions which are used to be defined as only historical and cultural heritage” (Lévy, 2006, p. 61-75).

David Harvey mentions that cities are established as a result of geographical concentration of social surplus production (Harvey, 2003, p. 198). In his book entitled “*The Condition of Postmodernity*,” Harvey grounds that cities are associated with the development of capitalism as the spaces where surplus is produced and distributed, and investigates the relation between human actions and the space in terms of the concepts of force and power (Harvey, 2016). He investigates how cities with their aspects have transformed into the sources of surplus. With reference to Harvey, Tatal interprets this transformation in a way that “while the memory and heritage of different cultures, ethnic and religious identities which have been carried by cities throughout the centuries increase in commodity value within the capitalism of post-fordist reproduction, they transform into the irreplaceable surplus sources of the tourism sector” (Tatal, 2018, p. 11).

Another urban sociologist, Henri Lefébvre argues that cities have been transformed into a commodity-space which might be bought and sold with their accumulated information, culture and institutions in the course of time (Lefébvre, 2010).

In accordance with the above-stated arguments on urban analyses, cities have become to be considered as products in the course of time, and this has brought

with research on “the brand and branding” for cities as well. The approaches on brand city have emerged with the adaptation of research on brand to cities.

The approaches to brand city which consider cities as a product and point out the activities carried out for enriching these products practice same strategies, developed by marketing field (in conjunction with the disciplines of public relations and advertising), for cities as well. Simon Anholt who does research on prestige and identity of spaces, and develops the concept of the branding of cities states that “Whether they like it or not, countries and cities and regions in the age of global competition all need to market themselves: the most effective methods for doing this may owe little to the art of selling consumer goods, yet the challenge is precisely the same,” and highlights that marketing has become a necessity for cities in the course of time (Anholt, 2011, p. 18).

In this respect, cities are supposed to develop effective marketing strategies. Kotler suggests six strategies for cities to stay strong and to survive within the increasing competitive environment:

1. Attract tourists and visitors to its businesses
2. Attract business from elsewhere
3. Maintain and extent existing business
4. Promote small business and help create new ones
5. Expansion of its exports and its investments of abroad
6. Expansion of its population or change in its population’s distribution

(Deffner and Liouris, 2005, p.3-4).

Almost all of these strategies are related to business development processes. The given strategies might be practiced through taking joint action with all the actors generating the city within the decision-making processes. From another perspective, urban managers and public opinion primarily need to make a

consensus on the city's identity and core values for marketing the city effectively (Zhang and Zhao, 2009). Zhang and Zhao state that "One crucial strategy within city branding is the creation of the city's identity, which should be developed from a range of contextual variables such as history, demography, economy, politics and policies. A city usually has certain identifiable images or core values perceived by its people." To exemplify, they mention that Paris is perceived as romanticism; Milano as fashion; New York as diversity and mobility; Washington as power; and Tokyo as modern.

In terms of developments shifting from city marketing to city branding, first research on marketing are considered in the frame of place branding. Kavaratzis and Ashworth mention that place branding might be easily defined as the applications of product branding on places; however it would not be an adequate description accepted by everyone because of the potential new questions that it might bring with (Kavaratzis and Ashworth, 2006, p. 185). In place branding, characteristics of a certain place are brought forward by taking the target groups into consideration. For instance, Glasgow where music has played a historically important role brings its music-focused features forward in its branding activities in order to attract musicians and music consumers from England and different regions of the world. When the multidimensional structure of a city is socially, culturally and economically considered, city branding necessitates much more extensive marketing strategies.

They, also, dwell on three methods of city branding used for various purposes: Geographical nomenclature, co-branding and place management (Kavaratzis and Ashworth, 2006, p. 190). Geographical nomenclature refers to brandization of a place's name by a product's name. For instance, "champagne" is named after the place where it is produced (a region in France). Co-branding represents identification of a product's and its space's specifications. For instance, Devrek, a district in Zonguldak, might serve as an example of this situation due to the fact that it is identified with its canes well-known with both its artistic elements used

within the production process and durability. Place management refers to a management process for changing people's perception on a place (Kavaratzis and Asworth, 2006, p. 190-192).

City branding process necessitates also a comprehensive communication strategy. Kavaratzis separates this process as intentional and unintentional communications. Unintentional communication mainly refers to the external factors (e.g. environmental strategies, infrastructure projects, organizational structure and city behaviors). On the other hand, intentional communication includes communication activities such as public relations, promotion strategies, advertisement, graphic design and logo (Kavaratzis, 2004). In order to present a broader frame, city branding is considered under eight categories named as "Vision and Strategy, Inner Culture, Local Communities, Synergy, Infrastructure, Urban Extension and Gates, Opportunities and Communication." (Kavaratzis, 2009, p. 33).

According to Kotler and Gertner, it is crucial to determine the expectations and the needs of different groups such as residents, visitors and business people in branding process of a place. The points taken into consideration in the process of city branding are specified, by Kotler and Gertner, as:

1. "Designing the provided services and defining the particular characteristics of the city
2. Defining motives for the potential buyers of its goods and services
3. Efficient distribution of its products
4. Promotion of its image and values so that the potential buyers know its distinctive advantages (Kotler and Gertner, 2002, p. 4)."

By presenting the characteristics of the city, it seems that the given steps are suitable to develop these characteristics and their related tools for identifying the target group.

On the other hand, İlgüner and Asplund, in their book “*Brand City*,” lay emphasis on the major factors of the city and describe the essential elements of being a brand city as:

1. "Cultural heritage: All artifactual and tangible things passing through generations with heritage, all intangible characteristics, customs and traditions,
2. Natural structure-environment: Owned natural attraction and attention to the environment.
3. Authentic outputs: Typical products in the region and products originated from natural sources
4. Intrinsic ability: An ability passing from the past and best-known occupation of a region (İlgüner and Asplund, 2011)."

In addition to the comments on the brand city above, Anholt argues that nations can have brands just like their prestige, and states that even though it is important for development of countries, a country (a city or a region) can not be branded in a way that a firm brands a product: “In the 15 years since I first started working in this field I have not seen a shred of evidence a single properly researched case study, to show that marketing communications programmes, slogans or logos, have ever succeeded, or could ever succeed, in directly altering international perceptions of places” (Anholt, 2011, p. 8-9).

On the one hand, discussions on the city branding are currently continued; on the other hand, it seems that a great variety of international programs are developed through cities. These programs will be briefly discussed in the following sections.

1.4.1. International Programs for City Branding

One of the first programs developed on city branding is the World Design Capital Program (WDC). The World Design Organization (WDO), ^{TM4}previously known

⁴ With the decision of the general board in 2015, ISCID's was changed as World Design Organization. In January 1, 2017, ISCID has become WDO TM. (WDO, n.d)

as International Council of Societies of Industrial Design (ISCID), promote cities to effectively utilize design in their economic, social, cultural and environmental development. WDO has members from the design organizations in different regions of the world. China, Hong Kong, Germany, Italy, India, Singapore, Morocco, Australia, New Zealand, Malaysia, South Korea, Russia Federation and Turkey might be given as examples of these cities. Brands like Microsoft, Tupperware and BMW are jointly included. Besides the board of management, cities such as Torino, Seoul and Helsinki have been elected as the World Design Capital while the recent elected city is Mexico City in 2018. The key criterion of ISCID is cities' available equipments and capacities in the field of industrial design. Istanbul's previous two applications have been rejected by WDC.

As another design-focused city practice, the Global Design Cities Organization (GDCO) aims to make a change for safe, sustainable and healthy cities by transforming streets. (Global Street Design Guide, 2015) It was established by urban planners, strategists and designers.

As a program of the non-profit-making National Association of City Transportation Officials (NACTO), GDCO has more than 150 members from 42 different cities.

1.4.1.1. Programs within the Framework of UNESCO

UNESCO Creative Cities Network (UCCN), UNESCO Global Network of Learning Cities (UGNLC) and UNESCO World Book Capital are the other brand city programs within UNESCO. Among others, UCCN will be discussed in more detail in the following sections.

UGNLC is coordinated by UNESCO Institute for Lifelong Learning. First regulations on UGNLC began with the Convention of Beijing 2013. It reflects that sustainable development might be possible with individual empowerment, social

interaction, economic and cultural welfare; and, this might be possible with promoting lifelong learning by planning its programs in this direction (UGNLC, 2017). The Network supports the achievement of all seventeen Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), in particular SDG 4 ('Ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong learning opportunities for all') and SDG 11 ('Make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable') (UGNLC, n.d.)

As a program focused on reading and books, UNESCO World Book Capital is operated by UNESCO right after the World Book and Copyright Day in 1996. In the General Conference dated November 2, 2001, Madrid was elected as the World Book Capital and it was decided on that a city will be elected as the book capital for each year.

1.4.1.2. Cittaslow

In addition to the abovementioned programs, Cittaslow Unity emerged with a different understanding might be considered among brand city applications. Rather than production, consumption-based life does not bring happiness and peace, and people, therefore, are in search of a different life-style. All of these facts have brought the Cittaslow movement to light. The Cittaslow philosophy⁵ argues that life must be lived at an enjoyable speed. (Cittaslow, n.d.) It is established with a purpose that cities where people can communicate and socialize with each other, which are self-supporting, sustainable, protective of their craftworks, nature, customs and traditions; do not have infrastructure problems; use renewable energy sources; and utilize the benefits of technology might be a realistic alternative. In this regard, the candidates are expected to be compatible with the Cittaslow philosophy and to have a population less than 50.000. From

⁵Cittaslow is an international union of municipalities established in 1999. Cittaslow is constituted through the Italian word "Città (City)" and the English word "Slow". It is currently used in the meaning of "Slow City".

Turkey, fourteen residential area including Akyaka (Muğla), Eğirdir (Isparta), Gökçeada (Çanakkale), Şavşat(Artvin), Seferihisar (İzmir), Halfeti (Şanlıurfa), Perşembe (Ordu) and lastly Gerze(Sinop) in 2017 have been found appropriate for being *Cittaslow*.

In the first Cittaslow in Turkey, Seferihisar, it has been carried works including exploration of local foods, protection of local seeds, promoting organic farming, reactivating of the excavations in the ancient city of Teos, improvements of historical buildings and streets, protecting localities and creating awareness on localities. (Cittaslow Seferihisar, n.d.)

1.4.1.3.Pilot Cities of the Agenda 21 for Culture

Another application for development of cities through culture is the program of the Agenda 21 for Culture Pilot Cities. (Agenda for Culture, n.d.) The Agenda 21 for Culture is the first international document laying emphasis on the importance of systematic relations between culture, citizenship and sustainability. This document approved by United Cities and Local Governments (UCLG) in 2015 with the participation of city representatives from all around the world in the meeting located Bilbao includes a range of commitments on the role of culture in sustainable cities. These commitments are listed as: 1. Cultural rights, 2. Heritage, diversity and creativity, 3.Culture and education, 4. Culture and environment, 5. Culture and economy, 6. Culture, equality and social inclusion, 7. Culture, urban planning and public space, 8. Culture, information and knowledge, 9. Governance of culture.

Each commitment listed in the Agenda 21 for Culture include a list of guiding actions for the operations, and promote the processes of self-assessment for the actualization of public policies and strategies. (Culture 21, 2015)

CHAPTER TWO

2. UNESCO “CREATIVE CITIES” NETWORK

As it is briefly mentioned above (see p. 33), the UCCN established in 2004 within the scope of UNESCO has carried out various projects in order to develop a cooperation in the field of creative industries among cities from different socio-economic levels which consider creativity as one of the tools for sustainable economic development. (Dereli, 2016)

The given projects aim to develop an international cooperation enabling creativity and creative industries to be the focus of development plans and strategies. The UCCN conducts projects on seven creative fields listed as: artisanship and handicrafts, media arts, film, design, gastronomy, literature and music. (UCCN, n.d.)

The Creative Cities Network is considered as an exclusive partner of UNESCO, and constituted not only to show creativity's role in development but also to establish a space for action and creativity for achieving the goals specified in the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development. (UCCN, n.d.) Moreover, the UCCN is a program which supports the projects on diversity of cultural expressions carried out by UNESCO.

As a program including 180 member cities from 72 countries, the UCCN's justifications, purposes and goals will be discussed in more detail in the sections titled “2.1. General Justification” and “2.2 Missions and Activities.”

2.1 General Premise

The UCCN declares its justification for establishment in terms of the relation between city, culture and creativity. Within the scope of *2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development* which will be discussed later the UCCN clarifies this relation as that:

The crucial role of cities in promoting sustainable development focused on people and the respect of human rights is to ‘make cities and human settlements inclusive, safe, resilient and sustainable’ and identifies culture and creativity as one of the essential levers for action in this context. (UCCN, n.d.)

As distinct from the other programs on cities, the UCCN takes culture as a primary issue. It indicates that public institutions need to support a more sustainable urban development in collaboration with private sector and civil society in accordance with local needs. The UCCN highlights that public policies should make differences by promoting citizenship and cultural involvement and supporting creative industries and innovation. In this regard, developing creative solutions, collaboration, and sharing experiences and information have a crucial role in order to operate leverage for new urban development and to overcome common difficulties. The UCCN provides opportunities to cities to enable them to properly use their entities, to benefit from the projects based on co-learning processes and collaboration, and to use these as base for an economic, cultural, sustainable, inclusive and balanced development.(UCCN, n.d)

The approach regarding the Creative Cities Network has found its current form through transforming within UNESCO’s culture and cultural fields in the course of time. UNESCO explains that its cultural projects have aimed to contributing to the sustainable peace, the promotion of creativity, the development of open and participatory societies, and the sustainable development. (UCCN, n.d.) To this end, UNESCO grounds on three fundamental approach in its projects: the first approach refers to creating an awareness on culture’s importance and role in development; the second one is to support developments of protection policies about heritage (tangible and intangible cultural heritage), and legal instruments collaborating with local and central authorities; the third one is to promote development of participatory societies strengthening creative industries. The conventions formed within this scope are acted as a platform enabling collaboration between countries. “These international treaties endeavor to protect

and safeguard the world's cultural and natural heritage including ancient archaeological sites, intangible and underwater heritage, museum collections, oral traditions and other forms of heritage, and to support creativity, innovation and the emergence of dynamic cultural sectors.” (UCCN, n.d.)

UCCN's projects might be considered within the scope of the third approach (in connection with other two). It constitutes the general working principle to promote sustainable social development by strengthening creative industries.

From its establishment, UNESCO has formed twelve conventions regarding the cultural fields. The six of these are considered as fundamental cultural conventions.⁶ The UCCN's projects are typically associated with the principles of the Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions (2005) and 2030 Sustainable Development Goals. Therefore, it is crucial to briefly touch upon these two documents in terms of the UCCN's mission and goals which will be discussed in the following sections.

2.1.1. The UNESCO Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions (2005)

As culture has become a current issue being one of the fundamental dynamics of sustainable development (along with economic development, social inclusion and viable environment), the efforts in this field have been promoted through paving the way for international cooperation with a great variety of conventions. As one

⁶ The mentioned conventions are 1- Convention for the Protection of Cultural Property in the Event of Armed Conflict (1954), 2- Convention on the Means of Prohibiting and Preventing the Illicit Import, Export and Transfer of Ownership of Cultural Property (1970), 3- Convention on the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage (1972), 4- Convention on the Protection of the Underwater Cultural Heritage (2001), 5- Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (2003), 6- Convention for the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions (2005). Turkey is a party of the four conventions (1, 2, 3 and 5 numbered conventions). In March 1, 2017, Turkey also ratified 2005 Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions. (2005)

of the conventions, United Nations Millennium Declaration⁷ (Birleşmiş Milletler Binyıl Bildirgesi, 2000) and the principles of UNESCO Universal Declaration on Cultural Diversity have formed a basis for the “Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions” (Convention 2005).⁸

In the General Conference held on the 2nd of November 2001, the Declaration included five principles specified as: “Identity, Diversity and Pluralism, Cultural Diversity and Human Rights, Cultural Diversity and Creativity, and Cultural Diversity and Global Solidarity.” (Convention, n.d.) With regard to these principles, it is mentioned the importance of protection and securement of cultural diversity relating with the fundamental human rights, identity, cultural pluralism and creativity. From this aspect of the Declaration, Ada states that:

“We can easily say that the content of the Declaration places the emphasis on the aspect of culture related to political identities and rights which is based on the broadest definition and understanding of culture (with a capital ‘C’); in other words, if one may be permitted the expression, on the ‘hard’ aspect of culture” (Ada, 2015, p. 14).

Ada also emphasizes that while the Convention 2005’s fundamental principles on identities and rights are preserved, it has a “soft” characteristics referring to the content of culture (with a lower-case letter ‘c’) which finds its expression through products, services and activities in comparison with 2001 Cultural Diversity Declaration (Ada, 2015, p. 14).

Besides the abovementioned two documents, Convention 2005’s principal sources are also based on some other conventions ratified by UNESCO. Among the

⁷ The Declaration was published as a result of a meeting held between 6th and 8th September, 2000 which was participated by 189 representatives from its member countries. In this document, the total eight goals that the countries have promised to reach by 2015 were determined. These goals are specified as: Values and Principles; Peace, Security and Disarmament; Development and Poverty Eradication; Protection Our Common Environment; Human Rights, Democracy and Good Governance; Protecting the Vulnerable; Meeting the Special Needs of Africa; Strengthening the United Nations.

⁸ It is approved in the 33rd General Conference organized by UNESCO in 2005.

conventions related to the protection of tangible and intangible heritage, “1972 Convention on the Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage⁹” and “2001 Convention on the Protection of the Underwater *Cultural* Heritage¹⁰” are devised for the protection of tangible cultural heritage.

Within the context of the aims of 2003 Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage, “the intangible cultural heritage” is defined as follows:

“The ‘intangible cultural heritage’ means the practices, representations, expressions, knowledge, skills – as well as the instruments, objects, artifacts and cultural spaces associated therewith – that communities, groups and, in some cases, individuals recognize as part of their cultural heritage. This intangible cultural heritage, transmitted from generation to generation, is constantly recreated by communities and groups in response to their environment, their interaction with nature and their history, and provides them with a sense of identity and continuity, thus promoting respect for cultural diversity and human creativity.”¹¹

In the same convention, the fields determined by intangible cultural heritage in the 2nd article are specified as follows:

- a) Oral traditions and expressions, including language as a vehicle of the intangible cultural heritage;
- b) Performing arts;

⁹ The Convention on the *Protection of the World Cultural and Natural Heritage* is approved during the 17th session of the United Nations held between October 17 and November 22, 1972, in Paris. Considering the fact that cultural and natural values are common heritage of humanity, it was approved within the frame of a series of decisions collected under the eight major headings. (UNESCO, 2003)

¹⁰ The Convention on the *Protection of the Underwater Cultural Heritage* is approved during the 31st session of the United Nations held between October 15 and November 3, 2001, in Paris. (UNESCO, 2001)

¹¹ The Convention for the Safeguarding of the *Intangible Cultural Heritage* is approved during the 32nd session of the United Nations held between September 29 and October 17, 2003, in Paris. In the Convention includes references to the available documents in the field of human rights, especially 1948 Universal Declaration of Human Rights, 1966 International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights, and 1966 International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights. (UNESCO, 2003)

- c) Social practices, rituals and festives;
- d) Knowledge and practices concerning nature and the universe;
- e) Traditional craftsmanship (UNESCO, 2003)

In this sense, it might be said both that this convention has determined the frameworks of “Craftsmanship and Handicrafts,” as one of the essential fields of the UCCN (2004) which will be discussed in the following sections of this study, “Gastronomy,” “Music” and “Literature;” and that it has formed a basis for the content of cultural industries with UNESCO Convention 2005.

On the other hand, 2005 Convention contains articles concerning the facilitation of the circulation of cultural products and services. It aims to encourage the protection of the diversity of cultural expressions by promoting the productions in cultural and creative industries. When considered that it has been shifted from culture industries to creative industrial processes, and that culture has become a substantial factor of the total sustainable development in terms of societies, developing countries, minorities and local societies, Convention 2005 might be considered as an opportunity with its promotions for developing countries and regulations paving the way for international cooperation. It also seems that Convention 2005 contains certain articles for provisioning for cultures and countries which can not find the chance of circulation besides the monopolized countries in this field such as U.S. and Japan. Moreover, Convention 2005 includes some other articles promoting regulations which support civil society, improve the status of artists, and provide their mobility.

By containing several regulations which contracting parties are obliged to adapt to, the Convention motivates its contracting parties to cooperate for the emergence of a dynamic cultural sector especially in developing countries (Article 14). The given motivation works through supporting cultural industries in developing countries, building and strengthening their cultural production and distribution capacities (Article 13 and Article 18), enabling artists’ mobility by supporting

creative efforts (Article 18), and providing cooperation in the fields of music and film between developed and developing countries (Article 12 and Article 16).

From this point of view, Singh highlights that culture and cultural expressions need to be considered with an emancipatory ethical approach which enables diversity, pluralism and freedom (Singh, J. P., 2011, p. 99).

It seems that the below-stated articles of 2005 Convention corroborate the UCCN's approach on diversity and pluralism in cities:

Article 7 – Measures to Promote Cultural Expressions

1. Parties shall endeavour to create in their territory an environment which encourages individuals and social groups:

(a) to create, produce, disseminate, distribute and have access to their own cultural expressions, paying due attention to the special circumstances and needs of women as well as various social groups, including persons belonging to minorities and indigenous peoples;

(b) to have access to diverse cultural expressions from within their territory as well as from other countries of the world.

2. Parties shall also endeavour to recognize the important contribution of artists, others involved in the creative process, cultural communities, and organizations that support their work, and their central role in nurturing the diversity of cultural expressions (Basic Texts, 2017, p. 9).

Recognition of different cultures and identities along with realization of regulations enabling these groups to culturally express themselves are closely related to the right and the access to culture. According to Ada, 2005 Convention's approach overlaps the aims of the United Nations and UNESCO. "The 2005 Convention is perfectly aligned with the founding principles of the United Nations, and UNESCO in particular, which aim to establish worldwide peace and emphasize dialogue, understanding and stability among cultures and

civilizations, whether they are close to or distant from another” (Ada, 2015, p. 13).

2.1.2. 2030 Sustainable Development Goals and Creative Cities

One of the basic foundations of the UCCN on cities is the matter of sustainability. In this sense, the UCCN and 2030 Sustainable Development Goals have overlapping approaches.

Convening between 25th and 27th September 2015, in New York, state representatives adopted a set of 17 main goals to end poverty and to ensure prosperity for all, and planned to achieve each goal over the next 15 years, by 2030. They are specified as follows: “No Poverty; Zero Hunger; Good Health and Well-being; Quality Education; Gender Equality; Clean Water and Sanitation; Affordable and Clean Energy; Decent Work and Economic Growth; Industry, Innovation and Infrastructure; Reduced Inequalities; Sustainable Cities and Communities; Responsible Consumption and Production; Climate Action, Life below Water, Life on Land; Peace, Justice and Strong Institutions; and Partnerships for the Goals.” (Sustainable Development Goals, n.d.)

It might be said that the given goals have been shaped through comprehensively updating the Millennium Development Goals adapted before to struggle with extreme poverty, inequality, injustice and changing climate conditions. However, these negative conditions have continued as a result of the increasing social inequality, political instability, economic crisis and environmental problems. Since these problems are mostly faced in cities, it is necessary to take urgent and sustainable precautions. Therefore, all the actors including central and local administrations, NGOs, private sector, artists and artistic organizations, universities and scientists have made efforts to organize governance-oriented meetings and to develop solutions binding all.

Besides the aforementioned documents, a result document entitled the “Quito Declaration on Sustainable Cities and Human Settlements for All” was published right after the United Nations (UN) Habitat III Conference held in Quito, the capital city of Ecuador, between 17th and 20th October 2016. For the purpose of solving the problems of inequality, poverty, migration and environment, it was made binding decisions for cities (New Urban Agenda, 2017). (The New Urban Agend, 2017)

The UCCN is considered as one of the programs developed based on all these given developments, but especially in line with the national realization of 2030 Sustainable Goals. As the headings of 2030 Sustainable Development Goals, “innovativeness and infrastructure,” decreasing inequalities,” “gender equality,” “sustainable city and living spaces,” “qualified education” and “cooperation for the objectives” overlap with the criteria determined for the cities by the UCCN regarding the promotion of creativity and creative industries. The expressions regarding the participation of the disadvantaged groups including women and disabled individuals, the promotion of the processes which promote new experiences within the frame of the determined theme, the existence of infrastructure services including education on the related issues, the criteria for cooperation and governance might be considered as the effective tools to achieve the mentioned goals.

2.2. Missions and Activities

The program of the UCCN suggests that sustainable local development might be possible through the improvement of creativity and creative industries, and aims to enable development strategies and plans to give a wider place to these industries. It carries out activities for providing an international interaction by developing cooperation between cities with different cultural and historical backgrounds. In its mission document, the UCCN explains its aims as follows:

“Strengthen international cooperation between cities that have recognized creativity as a strategic factor of their sustainable development;

Stimulate and enhance initiatives led by member cities to make creativity an essential component of urban development, notably through partnerships involving the public and private sectors and civil society;

Strengthen the creation, production, distribution and dissemination of cultural activities, goods and services;

Develop hubs of creativity and innovation and broaden opportunities for creators and professionals in the cultural sector;

Improve access to and participation in cultural life as well as the enjoyment of cultural goods and services, notably for marginalized or vulnerable groups and individuals;

Fully integrate culture and creativity into local development strategies and plans (Mission Statement, n.d.)"

In these expressions of the UCCN referring to the articles in its previous conventions, it seems that it has an approach caring about the participation of all groups and the cooperation for sustainable development. Especially the expressions on supporting disadvantaged groups and individuals settled in cities to access to cultural life are determinative for participation which is one of the main dynamics of sustainable urban development.

In accordance with the mentioned aims, cities joined the UCCN carry out activities enabling experience and information sharing both at the local and the international levels. They devise pilot projects which might develop cooperation between the public, private sector and civil society; enable experts and artists to participate in exchange programs and diverse communication network; arrange trainings, conduct research and make arrangements on the experiences of creative cities. Also, these cities develop communication studies which have a potential to create awareness on their activities by producing policies on sustainable urban

development. Cities included by the UCCN share their successful practices with each other. Developing cooperation which promotes creativity and cultural industries, they increase the rate of participation. Moreover, they integrate culture into their urban development plans. (UCCN, n.d.)

2.3. UNESCO's Criteria for "Creative Cities"

While applying the UCCN, a city should meet certain criteria determined within the applied field in terms of its aims and objectives.

During the processes before and after the application at the local levels, these cities are observed. A certain mode of working requiring cooperation along with central administration, NGOs, and the related actors and organizations is considered as the general criteria by the UCCN. Membership and applications are realized at three certain steps. In the first step, related stakeholders are determined; a candidacy committee for the creative city is created; related background check is conducted; and the current members are consulted. In the second step, creative values and programs are checked; concerns are determined; the city's potential contribution to the UCCN is formulated; and the mayor's approval is received. In the third step, national professional organizations are reviewed by the National Commission for UNESCO; other members of the UCCN are asked for their letters of support; and the application process is completed. (UCCN Call for Applications, 2017)

Throughout the process, the city is expected to work being in contact and cooperation with the public, private and civil society sectors. As another criterion, the city needs to have potentials of performing the UCCN's mission, making material and intellectual contributions, and developing international projects with other cities. In the application process, the reasons for admission, the expectations from the UCCN, the city's characteristics' suitability with the UCCN must be clearly and consistently represented.

Depending on their preferred fields, cities in the application form clarify what projects they plan to do in their regions, what projects they would like to cooperate with other cities, and how they will enrich the UCCN.

Cities need to have cultural entities suitable for the theme which they plan to apply. Besides the mobility of cultural sphere, it is expected the theme to have an importance in the cities' history and the current economy, and different groups to gather around the theme. Along with fairs, conferences and national/international activities for the professionals, festivals and large scale events for the inhabitants of the city organized in accordance with the theme in the last five years are also considered as the criteria of UNESCO. In terms of education and awareness-raising, the tools promoting culture, creativity, courses have a significant role.

Besides the aforementioned general criterion of the UCCN, there are prescribed and respective criteria for each theme. In the sections numbered 2.3.1, 2.3.2, 2.3.3 and 2.3.4, the criteria for the cities of literature, music, and media will be discussed.¹²

2.3.1. Criteria for the City of Literature

Cities applying for the UCCN's field of literature must have certain qualifications as follows:

- quality, quantity and diversity of editorial initiatives and publishing houses
- quality and quantity of educational programs focusing on domestic or foreign literature in primary schools as well as universities
- urban environment in which literature, drama and/or poetry play an integral role

¹²Since the criteria for City of "Gastronomy," City of "Design," City of "Crafts and Folk Art" will be discussed in the fourth chapter entitled "Creative Cities in Turkey," they are detailed in this chapter.

- experience in hosting literary events and festivals aimed at promoting domestic and foreign literature
- libraries, bookstores and public or private cultural centers dedicated to the preservation, promotion and dissemination of domestic or foreign literature
- active effort by the publishing sector to translate literary works from diverse national languages and foreign literature;
- active involvement of media, including new media, in promoting literature and strengthening the market for literary products (Dublin Annual Report, 2011)

At this point, Edinburgh (U.K.), Baghdad (Iraq), Barcelona (Spain), Bucheon (Republic of Korea), Dublin (Ireland), Durban (South Africa), Granada (Spain), Krakow (Poland), Ljubljana (Slovenia), Milan (Italy), Sydney (Australia), Utrecht (Netherlands) and Ulyanovsk (Russian Federation) might be seen as the examples of cities joined the UCCN with this theme. Besides their long-standing literary tradition, these cities of literature have common characteristics such as having literary knowledge, experience and atmosphere in which they might cooperate with other cities.

Among the given other cities, Edinburgh which is accepted as the first city of literature has hosted the long-standing Edinburgh International Book Festival. When considered the activities carried out by cities since they included in the UCCN, it seems that more than thirteen cities have been motivating other cities to be involved in the UCCN, and have improved the cooperation between the cities through developing international projects (Edinburgh Monitoring Report, 2017).

2.3.2. Criteria for the City of Media Arts

Referring to the artistic works produced by combining the new media technologies and diverse artistic methods, Media Arts has been getting more wide spreading. The criteria for the cities of Media Arts are determined as: the development of cultural and creative industries triggered by digital technologies;

providing successful media arts which lead the improvement of urban life; the growth of electronic art forms supporting civil society participation; enabling a wider access to the culture through digital economic development; developing lodgment programs and other studio atmosphere for media artists (UNESCO, 2017).

Lyon (France), Dakar (Senegal), Kwangju (the Republic of Korea), Linz (Austria), Tel Aviv-Jaffa (Israel), York (the United Kingdom), and Austin (the United States of America) are examples of the cities involved in the UCCN within the theme of media arts. As one of these cities, Lyon joined the UCCN in 2008. The city declares its main purpose as formulating a digital culture policy, and its efforts, thus, have focused on the projects combining artistic and cultural activities, and digital fields. As one of the first fundamental projects, a digital dance platform, Numeridanse, is established by The Digital Library of Lyon (NUMELYO) and *Maison de la Danse*.(Numelyo, n.d.)

As the biggest event of the city, Fête des lumières (the Festival of Lights) annually brings a lot of people from different areas such as lighting designers, cinematographers, architects, graphic artists, visual artists, street theatre performers, etc. together, and hosts more than 3 million visitors each year. (Fête des lumières, n.d.)

It is also mentioned that the city invests in the developments of digital economy and creative industries with 7000 firms and 42.000 employees.(Lyon, n.d.)

2.3.3. Criteria for the City of Music

From the cities applying the UCCN's music theme, it is expected to be a well-know center of music production and activities; to be experienced in organizing national and international music festivals and events; to promote all the forms of music industry; to have music-oriented schools, conservatoires, academies and

higher education councils besides the informal structures including amateur choruses and orchestras for music education; to host local or international platforms dedicated to certain genres and/or other countries' music; to provide cultural spaces for making and listening to music.

Seville (Spain), Bologna (Italy), Glasgow (U.K.), Ghent (Belgium), Bogota (Colombia), Brazzaville (Congo), Hamamatsu (Japan), Hanover (Germany), Kingston (Jamaica) and Varanasi (India) are the examples of cities which have joined the UCCN.

As noted above, Glasgow has the second biggest music economy after London as an international music center. Joining UCCN in 2008, Glasgow has a historical background in which musical productions have come to the forefront. The biggest five of six Scottish companies and more than half of music employment in the country are located in Glasgow. Hosting important organizations like the Royal Conservatoire of Scotland, Glasgow is well-known with its capacity for providing a qualified music education.

Hosting diverse ethnic, social and cultural groups, Glasgow became the European Capital of Culture in 1990 as also a result of its developed creativity-centered policies and strategies to solve economic problems. Besides the Scotland's biggest multicultural music festival, the *Glasgow Mela*, the *Glasgow International Jazz Festival*, the *World Pipe Band Championships*, and the *Merchant City Festival* are some of the events held in Glasgow. (Glasgow City of Music report, 2016)

2.3.4. Criteria for the City of Film

Criteria for being a City of Film is determined as follows: having cinema industry-related infrastructures including film studios and spaces for cinema; a settled or proved network with movie production, distribution and trade; experience of organizing events including festivals, and collaborative initiatives at

the local, regional and international levels; heritage of cinema in the forms of archive, museum, private collection and/or film industry; film schools and education centers; efforts to distribute films/cinematographic works which are locally or nationally produced; initiatives promoting information sharing on foreign movies.

Bradford (U.K.), Sidney (Australia), Busan (South Korea), Galway (Ireland) and Sofia (Bulgaria) are some examples of the cities which have joined the UCCN.

Sidney joined the Network through being a city of film in 2010 and currently produces more than 60% of the screen production in Australia. Sidney's natural beauties appear in movies as a natural live stage. Having the largest sound stage in the Southern Hemisphere *Fox Studios Australia*, it emphasizes its characteristics based on cultural diversity by hosting a great number of events such as the *Sydney Film Festival*, the *Arab Film Festival*, the *Flickerfest International Short Film Festival*, *Queer Screen Film Festival* and *Tropfest Film Festival*. UNESCO City of Film Award founded in 2016 awards cities with 10.000 U.S. dollars in order to promote new and distinctive productions in this field¹³ (UCCN Sydney Monitoring Report, 2017).

In the light of the progresses and justification which prepared the establishment process, the criteria determined by UCCN for the cities are investigated above. When considered the criteria for the four of seven determined themes (cities of music, cinema, media arts and literature), it might be seen that the given criteria and the aims and objectives of UCCN overlap with each other. One might say that the criteria is towards realizing the intangible and tangible cultural potential of the cities, and enable cities to create awareness on their own potentials. With their different and similar accumulations and levels of awareness, the cities are expected to carry out activities for developing them within the process.

¹³ In 2016, Lynette Wallworth was awarded with her movie named *Collisions*. In 2017, Leah Purcell was awarded with her adaptation of *The Drover's Wife*.

CHAPTER THREE

3. CULTURAL POLICIES IN TURKEY AT URBAN SCALE

In this chapter, I will investigate how culture is considered within the culture policies in Turkey and where culture is positioned within these policies besides the practices of culture policies in cities and the studies about these issues which have been conducted in Turkey.

3.1. About Culture and Cultural Policies

Taking a part of several areas in everyday life, culture appears as a concept which might have numerous meanings with its multidimensional structure. Like the concept of creativity, the concept of culture has been defined in the scopes of almost all disciplines.

While discussing the definitions regarding the concept of creativity in the Chapter I, it was mentioned that the concept of culture which has been historically defined in various ways with the development of societies and civilization is derived from the Latin word *colere* which means protection, cultivation and habitation (see p. 6). Even though the concept had been employed with various meanings regarding agriculture, animal care and humanitarian development by the early years of the 19th century, it has been used as a synonym of civilization since the 19th century.

Raymond Williams emphasizes that culture is used in three other meanings besides the aforementioned meanings. The first one is an abstract word used for referring to the intellectual and aesthetical development starting from the 18th century. The second one is used to represent a society's life style and the last one is an abstraction to signify artistic activities and artistic products (music, literature, painting, sculpture, theatre, film etc.). Williams highlights that although the concept of culture had been used to refer to the aesthetical development in the beginning, it has become to refer to the productions emerged as the outcomes of this development (Williams, 1993). As gaining different meanings in specific

periods, the concept of culture is interpreted also as a process in which people make their lives meaningful through individually and collectively communicating each other (Eagleton, 2011).

Culture is described by UNESCO as “...(T)hat in its widest sense, culture may now be said to be the whole complex of distinctive spiritual, material, intellectual and emotional features that characterize a society or social group. It includes not only the arts and letters, but also modes of life, the fundamental rights of the human being, value systems, traditions and beliefs...” (UNESCO, 1982, p. 41). In sum, the concept of culture which has been shaped with its material and immaterial dimensions in the course of time “might be considered as a range of events about artistic and cultural heritage, the life style of a community, and a dynamic process of acculturation” (Pascual, 2011, p. 23).

While emphasizing the relation between culture and politics, Eagleton states that “Culture is more the product of politics than politics is the dutiful handmaiden of culture” (Eagleton 2000, p. 60). He draws attention to the point that the relation between these two concepts might be defined depending on politics. Culture has currently become one of the fundamental arguments in the policies of countries in relation to that it has become to be considered as one of the fundamental dimensions of the sustainable development through enabling the quality of this relation have a different dimension –as mentioned in the previous chapters-. On the other hand, cities are defined as “new countries” through the fields included within the scope of creative industries such as design, film, music industry etc. and this makes the current state of the relationship between cities and culture more clear (Okandan, 2016, p. 1).

The conceptual usages of culture, its material and immaterial dimensions and all of the fields that it finds meaning are included in the scope of culture policies. Culture policies are defined as “a multidimensional and extensive area which includes a wide range of fields from the history of culture industries to the cultural heritage, from the legal regulations regarding the culture to art production and the

conditions influencing the artist, from the cultural diversity to cultural rights and cultural participation” (Kutlu, 2011, p. 13).

While culture policies’ dimensions such as the access to culture, the right to culture and cultural diversity define their aspects regarding the human development and the social inclusion, as it is mentioned above, considering them as a means of development emphasizes their economic and societal aspects.

Agreeing with the argument suggesting that culture constitutes the fourth step of the sustainable development, Hawkes mentions argues that the inclusion of culture in the public policies have a significant role in terms of its below mentioned results:

- governments’ usage and understanding of culture in their planning, service delivery and evaluation activities have been limited and counterproductive;
- carefully planned cultural action is essential for the achievement of sustainability and wellbeing;
- the engines of cultural production would operate most effectively through a singular and co-ordinated setting within government management structures;
- the development of a cultural framework through which all public planning can be evaluated is an essential step;
- active community participation in arts practice is an essential component of a healthy and sustainable society (Hawkes, 2001, p.2).

As it might be seen in the statements above, an effective planning and implementation regarding the culture is determinative for the sustainable development. The spaces that these plans and implementations are practiced are the cities. In the Chapter I, it was discussed that the transformations of cities with the globalization process and how they have become a marketing factor (see p. 26-32).

In this chapter, it will be briefly investigated how culture and cities are considered in the strategic documents developed in respect to the planning of culture policies in Turkey.

3.2. Culture in the Urban Strategic Plans of Turkey

There have been diverse developments regarding the culture's role in cities' sustainable developments in Turkey, and it seems that the scope and content of this role are limited with tourism in the approaches of public policies. The below mentioned activities and documents determine the frame of this approach.

3.2.1. Activities of the Development Agencies

“Development Agencies” which were established in 2006 based on the Ministry of Development as 26 different units have formed cooperation enabling the development of regions they are founded, and have conducted activities for planning, strategy and analysis. By having impacts on the development processes of their regions through diverse supports in terms of entrepreneurship, advertisement, finance and technique, it seems that these agencies have practices for developing the cultural structure of their regions (the Ministry of Development, 2016).

The activities conducted within the scope of the Supporting Program for Attraction Centers (SPAC) might be considered as the examples of the given activities. Within the scope of this program, it is aimed to provide the economic development of cities with strategic supports within the underdeveloped regions, and to keep the migration within the given region by enabling this economic development to spread around. “Within this framework, SPAC have included the cities of Adana, Elazığ, Erzurum, Gaziantep, Malatya, Mardin, Mersin, Sivas, Şanlıurfa and Van following Diyarbakır where the first pilot program is conducted in 2008. Within the scope of SPAC, the mentioned cities are subsidized by the Ministry of Development with 343 million TL.” (Report of Development Agencies, 2016, p.33)

Another program called “Regimented Treatment Projects” is designed to provide a direct support and includes activities considered as “special quality pilot projects.” What distinguish the treatment of regimented projects from the other financial support programs is that the framework of the project is determined by the agency and stakeholders, and the projects are carried out under the guidance of the agency itself (the Activity Report, 2016, p. 45-46).

The first activity in the table below is a project carried out by the Western Black Sea Development Agency (BAKKA). Within the scope of the “Devrek Cane Sales Center, Museum and Cultural Nature Park” project, it is planned to build spaces such as cane sales center, museum, cane house, local product marketplace, historical Devrek houses and taste restaurant. Complementary cultural and social spaces, and some other service areas for the mentioned plans are also included in the project (the Activity Report, 2016, p. 47). In the first chapter of this study, Devrek canes are emphasized under the title of city branding (see p. 30).

Table 2: Development Agencies 2016 Implementations of the Regimented Project Support

Agency Name	Project Name	Practice Area of Project	Practice Time (month)	Amount of the Support (TL)	Co-financing-included Amount of the Support(TL)
BAKKA	Devrek Cane Sales Center, Museum and Cultural Nature Park	ZONGULDAK-Devrek	24	4.000.000	5.700.000
IKA	“Health Accompanying Organic Olive, Olive for Pickling on the Tables” Project	KILIS-Center of the City	19	3.000.000	4.000.000
IKA	Developing (ARBİM) the Smart Reference Building Innovation Center	GAZIANTEP-Sahinbey	19	1.000.000	1.350.063
ISTKA	Istanbul Development of Mechanismsfor Commercialization and Research of Information	ISTANBUL-Fatih	24	4.495.733	5.995.110
KUDAKA	Bayburt Agricultural Site	BAYBURT-Center of the City	24	4.500.000	9.830.774
ORAN	Erciyes Bank for Cord Blood and Tissue	KAYSERİ-Talas-Melikgazi	24	3.448.852	4.598.469
SERKA	Iğdır, Industry is Improving Its Infrastructure and Turning Towards Production-Based Export	IGDIR-Center of the City	24	1.500.000	2.000.000
SERKA	Sarıkamış Project for Boosting Tourism	KARS-Sarikamis	24	1.500.000	3.296.387
SERKA	Project for Bringing Çıldır Lake to Tourism	KARS-Arpacay	24	1.500.000	3.529.257
TOTAL				24.944.585	40.300.060

Source: Activity Report of Development Agencies, 2016, p. 47.

Taking into account the information in the table, it seems that the Development Agencies have project-oriented contribution in the implementations of the culture policies at the urban or regional scale. In addition to the project supported by BAKKA, SERKA's support to two projects for boosting tourism in Kars might be considered as an example of these contributions.

3.2.2. The Tourism Strategy of Turkey (2023)

Tourism Strategy of Turkey 2023 and the Action Plan 2013 (Republic of Turkey Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2007) are comprised of a range of strategy and action step in regard to the enhancement of tourism income in Turkey through developing alternative tourism methods. The plan has been prepared along the line transforming Turkey's natural, cultural and historical values into "attraction centers" which might make contribution to the tourism without damaging them.

The document of Turkey's Tourism Strategy 2023 lays emphasis on the importance of the strategic planning approach which have flexible, transparent, participatory and sustainable development qualifications within the management and implementation fields of the planning stage (Republic of Turkey Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2007).

In the part of investment, it includes the standardization of companies within diverse categories through decreasing the Value-Added Tax (VAT) and the arrangement of promotions with regard to the qualification of the project.

In the part entitled "Organization" of the document of Strategy 2023, it includes guidelines for constituting national, regional and city-scaled councils, and units in the ministry such as research and education (Republic of Turkey Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2007, p. 2).

While the practices regarding advertising campaigns, brandization and image are included in the part of "Promotion and Marketing," it is emphasized that the

Ministry of Culture and Tourism needs to play an effective role in enabling the education within the tourism sector to have calculable results, the qualifications of the actors within the sector to improve through education, and the instruction of the tourism education in terms of quality and quantity at the upper scale decisions (Republic of Turkey Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2007, p. 14-16).

In the document of the Tourism Strategy of Turkey 2023, city-scaled works are considered as part of brand city works focusing on tourism, and a range of strategy was presented for planning to turn the cities into the attraction centers for tourists through developing the cultural tourism. By the reason of the fact that Istanbul is 2010 European Capital of Culture and has a unique cultural structure, it is suggested that the tourism potential of Istanbul as well as of Izmir and Antalya might be increased with the cultural and artistic areas, and the city-scaled regulations to be held in the context of Turkey. To mention some of the 2023 goals might enable the given instrumentalization to be more explicit: “... to constitute brand cities of culture through cultural tourism in the provinces of Adıyaman, Amasya, Bursa, Edirne, Gaziantep, Hatay, Konya, Kütahya, Manisa, Nevşehir, Kars, Mardin, Sivas, Şanlıurfa and Trabzon, and to declare a city as “the city of cultural tourism” each year; to restore the structures and the ruins having historical, cultural and architectural characteristics; to conduct the local activities in accordance with the international standards; to build performance centers and exhibition spaces; to raise awareness in the matter of safeguarding tangible and intangible cultural heritage at the local level...” (Republic of Turkey Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2007, p. 33).

Besides the aforementioned goals which are determined intended for developing the city tourism and expected to be promoted with promotion and marketing, it is also aimed to develop the relationship between central and local administrations in the scope of the general aims of 2023. Local administrations and the private sector are expected to take an active role in providing the diversity of tourism (Republic of Turkey Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2007). The frame of this regulation predicting a new organization is clarified as follows: “...(I)nstitutions

will be generated with the participation of the representatives of public and private sector, and NGOs; these institutions will carry out guiding works in the sector by being responsible for public and private sectors, and civil society. It is aimed that these structures planned to be generated on the national, regional, urban and spot basis will be institutionalized under the title of “Council” (Republic of Turkey Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2007, p. 11).

In the scope of the Action Plan, it is predicted to plan the branding tourism spaces which have the “ability of competing with the world.” To this end, it is aimed to complete the planning and research processes of ten new cities of tourism. The given cities are mentioned below: İğneada - Kilyos (Kırklareli) Eco – City of Tourism, Kilyos (Istanbul) City of Tourism, the Saros Gulf (Canakkale) City of Tourism, Kapıdağ Yarımadası - Avşa - (Marmara Islands) – City of Tourism, Datça (Muğla) Eco – City of Tourism, Kaş - Finike (Antalya) City of Tourism , Anamur (Mersin) Coastal Region City of Tourism, Samandağ (Hatay) City of Tourism Maçka (Tourism) City of Tourism, Kahta (Adıyaman) City of Tourism (Republic of Turkey Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2007, p. 33-34).

Considering the characteristics of the aforementioned settlements, it seems that these places are suitable in terms of nature, ecology, cultural tourism etc.. Consequently, one might say that culture is considered entirely through tourism in the document 2023.

3.2.3. The 10th Development Plan (2014 - 2018)

Including the years between 2014 and 2018, the Plan is adopted in 2013. In the Plan that the government regards as a road map for attaining the 2023 goals of sustainability in tourism, some other goals are set in the areas of culture and art by doing a situational analysis unlike the document 2023. In the given analysis, it is highlighted that, first of all, there have been works about the protection of cultural heritage at the national and international scales; cultural centers have been built; new theatres and museums have been opened; the number of local productions and their audiences have been increased through subsidizing the cinema industry;

social security of the workers in the areas of culture and art has been guaranteed with new regulations (Republic of Turkey Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2013).

Thereafter, the issues of culture and city among the determined goals are specified in the plan: to provide cooperation between private sector and local administration in the areas of culture and art; to protect historical heritage with a planned and integrated approach; to enable the participation in culture to become a vital need; to make contribution to global culture without losing the local cultural aspects; to give effective supports for sustaining traditional arts; to give support to the presentation and economy of the country's and national values by cultural industry; to present historically and culturally important persons, events and values through documentaries, series and animation movies; to promote film industry to treat the national values; to give supports for branding Turkish cinema all around the world; to protect historical urban regions and to utilize them for cultural and artistic events etc.. (The 10th Development Plan, 2013) As a remarkable point, it is highlighted that cultural texture needs to be paid regard in the urban transformation implementations.

The given expressions emphasized in the 10th Development Plan reveal that the approach to culture is considered with a “nationally and locally” ideological view of point and a tourism-oriented approach. Developments in the film industry provide us to evaluate that the importance of creative industries –at least at the level of cinema- are realized. Apart from that, certain goals for providing the participation of actors from other private and civil groups within decision making processes are included, so one might say that this situation create an awareness on this issue –at least at the level of approach.-

3.2.4. The Action Plan for Sustainable Cultural Development (2016)

The Action Plan for Sustainable Cultural Development published by the 64th government in 2016 has similarities with the aforementioned plans in terms of its

emphasis on “national” and “local culture.” However, this plan includes goals for action plans about cultural economy and creative industries as distinct from the framework of Tourism Strategy of Turkey 2023 and the 10th Development Plan. Moreover, it includes some strategies for taking steps on the issues of cities’ cultural developments and cultural policies with certain programs such as “human-centered culture-oriented urban renewal and protection” program along with the programs for “Urban Culture Management Planning” and “Cities of Culture in Turkey.”¹⁴ Furthermore, it predicts the creation of cultural and artistic events with the projects of “Lifelong Participation to Culture in My Neighborhood,” “Artist and Space Support” and “Culture Card” in addition to new regulations regarding the access to and participation in the given events which never had examples before.

In the action plan entitled “supporting cultural economy and entrepreneurship,” it is aimed to provide the youth access to cultural and artistic activities, and to commercialize traditional products through revaluating with an innovative approach within the scope of the Project for Supporting Cultural Entrepreneurship and Industry.” The 64th Government strategy of creating the “Cultural Economy Action Plan” for creative industries is important due to the fact that it reveals the awareness of this area’s significance.

As a long-term goal, to achieve economic benefit from redesigning traditional products from a creative perspective with the “Turkish Design Award Project” is positioned for providing economic support to creative economy. In the Plan, “Planning cultural employment” and “configuration of capacity project” include a range of action for planning the labor force which will be used in cultural and artistic areas. (Davutoğlu, 2015)

This strategy lost its activity after the 64th Government resigned.

¹⁴ Gaziantep is one of the cities included in the city of culture program. This issue will be touched upon in Chapter IV.

3.2.5. The 3rd National Cultural Council (2017)

After the rapid changes within social, political, economic and cultural areas in Turkey, the first National Cultural Council is held in 1982, the second one in 1989 and the third one between March 3 and 5, 2017.

As distinct from the previous congresses, 17 different commissions are established in the diverse areas of culture and art entitled “culture policies,” “cultural economy,” “cinema, theatre and television,” “music,” “visual arts,” “language and literature,” “media and culture,” “city and culture” and “local administrations and culture.” In these commissions, written reflections were demanded from specialists, academicians, researchers and politicians, and then the recommendations were made by gathering with the commission. (The 3rd National Cultural Council Final Report, 2017)

When considered that the 3rd National Cultural Council was held only one year after the 64th Government’s Action Plan for Sustainable Cultural Development, it might be interpreted that the emphasis on culture has gradually increased

The commission of cultural policies is one of the important commissions in accordance with the framework of this study. In the given commission, it is highlighted that the state needs to consider cultural policies with an approach beyond the sense of “nation-state;” to have a leading and supportive role rather than a repressive and prohibitory one (Cultural Policy Commission Report, 2017). Also, certain regulatory recommendations are constituted with regards to cultural and artistic areas:

- "To develop city-oriented cultural-artistic plans in cooperation and coordination with the actors of culture and art from public and private sectors, and civil society,
- To form platforms and opportunities which might gather content producers in relation to our cultural diversity and wealth,

- The Ministry of Culture and Tourism to have the right to comment on the planning of cities where historical artifacts are intensely located, and on the activities for protecting the general aesthetics of cities,
- To adopt a cultural management model establishing a relationship between art and culture,
- To enable Turkey's diverse tangible and intangible cultural heritage to be protected, known and interpreted, and to strengthen the access to these sources (Report of Cultural Policy Commission, 2017)."

In the commission of cultural economy, it is discussed about the issues related to promoting creative economy and creative industries, and certain suggestions regarding these areas are developed. These suggestions' relation with cities might be summarized as follows:

- To launch a cultural fund which enables the ministry and related state institutions and organizations to buy goods and services with cultural and artistic qualifications directly from the private sector, and might be used for financing cultural industries,
- To promote the sponsorships through the tools like tax exemptions and exclusions,
- To promote the exportation of products which have cultural and artistic qualifications by the public,
- To set a course for branding in order to have our own world brands,
- To promote talented individuals and entrepreneurs; for this, to develop "incubation" programs and to build "creative economy parks" throughout the nationwide and the developing regions of Istanbul in particular (Report of Cultural Economy Commission, 2017, p. 11).

It might be seen that especially the suggestions in the last section are related to Florida's approach of creative class discussed in the first chapter (see p. 12-18).

In the commission of culture and city, it is emphasized that the problems related to cultural areas are mostly occurred in cities and frequently connected with urbanization policies; and improper practices damage the cultural texture. In the same commission, they develop recommendations to solve these problems through city planning. Among the given recommendations, it is stressed on designing cities in the manner of representing the “national culture;” currently holding inventory of tangible and intangible cultural heritage through opening “Urban Research Centers;” exhibiting written and oral works by building a “City Museum” in every cities; establishing “city schools” in cities which culturally have potentials; developing practical methods for ensuring the NGOs’ active participation in decision making processes; raising the number of mediums in which city-dwellers can have face-to-face communication with each other by increasing the common life spaces (Report of Culture and City Commission, 2017). Even though especially the last two subjects regarding the participation of civil society and the urban spaces need to be more concrete, they are crucial in terms of the objective of this study.

Although the 3rd National Cultural Council seems as developing a more comprehensive approach through establishing commissions in almost all of the issues which might be considered in the scope of culture policies as distinct from the meetings held beforehand, it appears as a expanded and updated program of the 64th Government’s Action Plan for Sustainable Cultural Development.

CHAPTER FOUR

4. UNESCO CREATIVE CITIES PROGRAM IN TURKEY

Gaziantep is the first city to join UCCN from Turkey. After Gaziantep received the title of creative city with the theme of “Gastronomy” in 2015, Hatay (gastronomy), Istanbul (design) and Kütahya (crafts and folk arts) are joined in 2017. In this way, the number of cities which received the title of creative cities from Turkey increased up to four. Laying emphasis on the mentioned cities within the frame of the criteria of their joined themes, we will try to analyze the implementations which have already been done and are planned to be done in the cities associating to the aims and objectives of UCCN in the following sections.

Cities joined to the UCCN are held responsible for preparing membership monitoring reports. Besides these reports which are needed to be prepared in every four years, cities, themselves, prepare a self-evaluation report which evaluates their activities and the process. In this chapter, the cities received the title from Turkey will be investigated in the light of the findings emerged as a result of the investigation of the membership monitoring and self-evaluation reports prepared by other cities which joined to the UCCN.

4.1. UNESCO Criteria of the City of Gastronomy and the Case of Gaziantep

Gastronomy which was added to UCCN after the other themes (crafts and folk arts, literature, design, music, film/cinema, and media arts) appears as one of the fields of intangible cultural heritage and as a result of the interaction of locally grounded heritage with history, space and nature¹⁵. It is remarkable that

¹⁵ Gastronomy is included in the scope of intangible cultural heritage defined as “knowledge and practices concerning nature and the universe” in the second article of the UNESCO Convention for the Safeguarding of the Intangible Cultural Heritage (2003). In the second chapter of this study, the mentioned convention and its content are emphasized (see p. 42-43).

gastronomy is considered as one of the industries within the scope of cities' sustainable development:

" ... (A)nchored with creativity and innovation, gastronomy spans from the production phase all the way to consumption, a process during which new ideas and inspiration arise. The emergence of gastronomy-centered creative market manifests not only in such fields as film and television, publications, advertising, the Internet and animation, it also paves the way for creative potential to be translated into actual products (Xiaomin, 2017, p. 57-58)."

As Xiaomin states, gastronomy has been considered as a creative and cultural area, and it hence paves the way of entrepreneurial activities in this field as an integral part of creative economy. Also, the number of cities joining to the UCCN has gradually increased in this area. To be able to receive the title of "city of gastronomy," cities must comply with the below-mentioned criteria:

- "Well-developed gastronomy that is characteristic of the urban centre and/or region;
- Vibrant gastronomy community with numerous traditional restaurants and/or chefs;
- Endogenous ingredients used in traditional cooking;
- Local know-how, traditional culinary practices and methods of cooking that have survived industrial/technological advancement;
- Traditional food markets and traditional food industry;
- Tradition of hosting gastronomic festivals, awards, contests and other broadly-targeted means of recognition;
- Respect for the environment and promotion of sustainable local products;
- Nurturing of public appreciation, promotion of nutrition in educational institutions and inclusion of biodiversity conservation programmes in cooking schools curricula." (The Creative Cities Network, n.d.)

Considering the criteria listed above, it seems that having a developed gastronomy is not solely enough for a city but also the quality of its relations with all the areas regarding a city's development such as education, health, environment and

industry is crucial. This situation requires the cities joined to the UCCN to have an understanding caring about an active communication and cooperation between gastronomy and other areas which have an impact upon the social and economic development.

Up to this point in time, 26 cities have joined to the UCCN as the “Creative Gastronomic City.” It seems that the cities which have joined to the UCCN by now are from a wide range of geographies and have different socio-economic social structures. The table showing the geographical distribution of the cities in the world below reveals that the cities predominantly center upon the Southeastern Asia and South America; however, there are some cities also from the regions of North America, Europe and Africa.¹⁶ In Europe, the cities are predominantly located in Italy and Spain, namely Mediterranean region. Lebanon and Turkey might be added to this region as well.

Image 1. Creative Cities of Gastronomy



Source: UNESCO Creative Cities Network, <https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/home>

¹⁶ As the only city from Africa, Zhale(Lebanon) joined to the UCCN as the “Creative Gastronomic City.”

Some of the cities joined to the UCCN within the theme of gastronomy are listed in the table below with their membership dates. As the table shows, the number of “Creative Cities of Gastronomy” increased mostly between 2015 and 2017. In comparison with the previous years, the increase of the number of the cities of gastronomy results from the impact of the activities within the scope of the aims and objectives of the UCCN, and the applications of other cities for benefiting from the implementations of the cities already joined to this network and being involved in this interaction.

Table 3. Creative Cities of Gastronomy

City	Country	Membership Date
Popayán	Colombia	2005
Chengdu	China	2010
Jeonju	Republic of Korea	2012
Zahle	Lebanon	2013
Florianopolis	Brazil	2014
Shunde	China	2014
Tsuruoka	Japan	2014
Belem	Brazil	2015
Gaziantep	Turkey	2015
Ensenada	Mexico	2015
Phuket	Thailand	2015
Rasht	Iran	2015
Tucson	United States	2015
Buenaventura	Colombia	2017
Cochabamba	Bolivia	2017
Hatay	Turkey	2017
Macao	China	2017
Panama	Panama	2017
Paraty	Brazil	2017
San Antonio	United States	2017

Although it is not possible to treat the aspects of all the cities listed as “Creative Cities of Gastronomy,” it is crucial to briefly touch on the activities of Popayán which already sent the membership monitoring report to UNESCO and Chengdu

which published its self-evaluation report in order to comprehend what has been done in the field of gastronomy.

As the first city of gastronomy of UCCN, Popayán located in the southwestern Colombia with its 300.000 population joined to the program in 2005 with its traditional cuisine which has been formed with the influences of African and Spanish cultures before Christopher Colombus. It is considered within the scope of Intangible Cultural Heritage in 2009 not only with its cuisine but also its diverse traditions with its characteristics of cultural heritage such as representations, ceremonies, rituals, epics etc. survived until today with the impacts of different cultures. (Popayán, n.d.) Popayán has certain characteristics showing that it meets the criteria for being the city of gastronomy including protecting its gastronomic heritage comprised of soups, salads, spices, chicha (fermented corn drink) and local pastry, producing a body of literature on this issue (e.g. “Platos De Las Abuelas/My Grandmother’s Meals”), promoting certain cooking methods (desamargados-fruit- cooking etc.) to be industrialized, having a suitable climate for the production of lately integrated foods including mint, onion and broccoli as well as local products. Popayán fulfills the criteria of UCCN also because it is a university town and SENA (gastronomy school) is located there with its libraries, archives and research centers, in other words, it has an academic infrastructure which is suitable for the scientific improvement of gastronomy.

Popayán Gastronomic Society created by Popayán Municipality and various institutions and organizations has reach a lot of people at the national and international levels through annually organizing panels, workshops, concerts etc. within the frame of “Congreso Gastronomico de Popayán¹⁷” since 2002. (Popayán Gastronomy Congress, n.d.) Among the projects planned to be developed in the long term, Popayán aims to provide a digital platform to all of the cities joined to UCCN with the activities promoting the traditional cuisine, the project entitled “Patoja” Secret Gastronomy Cuisine, and projects for developing the crafts through enabling people from 8 local ethnic and 3 African groups (in cooperation

¹⁷ The event which will be held this year between 6th and 9th September for the 16th time.

with Florianopolis and Hondarribia). (Popayán Monitoring Report, 2015) It seems that these projects which will be organized by Popayán will contribute to making the activities within this area sustainable by providing new experiences to the city and the other cities of UCCN.

As another gastronomic city, Chengdu (China) joined to the UCCN in 2010. It is mentioned that the city, as the center of Sichuan cuisine, overlaps with the life style based on Chinese philosophy and its gastronomic culture. In addition to the gastronomy, it has made contributions to more than 60.000 restaurants with a developed catering sector and to the development of employment with more than 2.200 chefs and masters, and it is ranked as the fifth city within the country. It has become one of the important gastronomic tourism centers through the developments including establishment of the first beer factory in China, and the openings of the tea cultural center and the food museum. “Chengdu was recognized by the World Tourism Organization (WTO) and the China National Tourism Administration as one of the Best Tourist Cities in China, and was granted membership to the World Center of Excellence for Destinations” (CED). (Chengdu, n.d.)

Chengdu makes active efforts through taking responsibilities such as hosting annual meetings for enabling UCCN to work effectively, examining the membership reports of the other cities, and developing communication and cooperation between the cities together with Edinburgh, Bradford, Bologna, Saint-Étienne and Shenzhen. “Representatives from the city participated in Niigata’s biggest food event Shukuno-Jin and Creative Cities of Gastronomy Network Symposium in February 2015 and actively promoted ‘Niigata International Food Award,’ being present in Macau Creative Gastronomy Cities Forum in November 2016, visiting Vic to help with the preparation for joining in UCCN” (Chengdu Monitoring Report, 2017).

Chengdu has participated in almost all of the international events in the field of gastronomy including Chengdu) Jeonju Bibimbap Festival and UNESCO Creative

City Forum (2013), UNESCO Creative Cities Jeonju Forum (2016). Developing cooperation between the cities, Chengdu carried out activities for the promotion of the trade and tourism activities between the cities through sharing information and experience in the field of gastronomy. Along with “exchange program on cuisine culture with San Francisco (USA),” the first “Chengdu Cuisine Promotion Centre” is established in San Francisco, in November 2016. As a 10 days event, “2016 San Francisco-Chengdu food culture festival” organized by the administrations of these two cities is held as well (Chengdu Monitoring Report, 2017).

Besides the international events, Chengdu aims to support the city to achieve the goals for sustainable development through the activities organized at the local level and planned to be done. It is aimed to increase the recognition of these places by broadening the scope of Chengdu Gourmet & Tour Festival which was organized in 2017 for the 14th time. With another project called “Gastronomy city demonstration project,” it is planned to create “gourmet spaces” which gather different groups in a certain region located in the city center.

The aims of the mentioned project overlap with Florida’s conceptualization of “creative clusters.” It is discussed that these kinds of clustering might get negative results in the previous chapters (see p. 12-18).

Apart from this project, Chengdu aims to carry out activities that the participants might have interactive experiences with a series of programs under the title of “Traditional diet culture boost action.” These activities might be exemplified as establishing the “Sichuan Cuisines Museum” (events for tasting, smelling and cooking experiences), promoting food organizations and institutions for the “Expansion of Chengdu Traditional Diet Culture,” and developing the program of “Promote life - nourishing diet and green culture diet” with the cooperation of Chengdu University of TCM (Chengdu Monitoring report, 2017).

One might say that the activities held in Popayán and especially Chengdu have created a value providing new experiences, enabled an effective communication

by providing a cooperation between local and central administrations, and NGOs, made contributions to the development of gastronomy education by providing a source for generating a data through conducting researches, and been influential on the transformation of the cities into tourism centers by increasing their “brand” value. The mentioned reports might be criticized from various aspects. It cannot be reached any data pointing the participation of the actors in the city. One might criticize the representation insufficiency and the decontextualization of the diversity in the implementations of the cities which are distinct with their cultural diversity, and the limitations of the active participation of the urban citizens.

The implementations in Gaziantep so far and the activities planned to be done in Hatay joined to the UCCN in 2017 will be investigated in the following sections.

4.1.1. Gaziantep as a City of Gastronomy

Besides that Gaziantep is the first city of Turkey joined to the UCCN in 2015, it is the first city received the title of city of gastronomy from Turkey. The city is defined as the “City of Culture” within the scope of the programs begun with the 64th Government with its history hosting various civilizations; its accumulation in the fields of artisanship and handicrafts; and its oral traditions and folkloric characteristics (see above p. 61-62).

Gaziantep located on the way of Silk Road has a position attracting attention in terms of especially cultural tourism with its historical places and museums including Zeugma and Dülük ancient cities, Gaziantep Castle and Greek Castle, Zeugma Ancient Museum, Coppersmith Bazaar, Medusa Glass Art Museum, and Emine Göğüş Culinary Museum. Moreover, it has cultural heritage which still maintains its importance in the fields of handicrafts and artisanship such as coppersmith, silverworks, Antep rug weaving, mother of pearl inlay and, hand-printed head scarf making. Hıdırellez,¹⁸ Gaziantep folk dances, “Wool

¹⁸ Hıdırellez took place in the UNESCO Representative List of the Intangible Cultural Heritage of Humanity in 2016 in cooperation between Turkey and Macedonia. (Hıdırellez, n.d.)

Scouring,”and “Dowry” are some examples of oral traditions and folkloric elements which are still surviving.

Gaziantep located in Mesopotamian region where humanity first began to do agriculture and stockbreeding has a cuisine influenced by its historical background in which different cultures has lived and interacted with each other. It is mentioned that Gaziantep cuisine gastronomically has three main characteristics. Variety of agricultural products (grains, local herbs, spices, Gaziantep pistachio, legumes etc.), variety of cooking methods (fruits, vegetables, pulses, meat products etc. are cooked with various sauces and dairy products) and variety of consumption methods (daily and fresh consumption, summer and winter drying, pickling etc.). (Gaziantep Mutfağı, n.d.)As the most known desert of the city, “Antep Baklava” was put under protection by achieving the geographical marker of European Union in 2013. (Gaziantep Baklavası, n.d.)

Some of the gastronomic activities done by Gaziantep before its membership in UCCN which paved the way of its application process might be listed as follows:

- Gaziantep University set up the Vocational Culinary College (2001) and the Department of Gastronomy and Culinary Arts (2010), and students began to have education on both local and Gaziantep cuisines in these departments.
- Between 2010 and 2012, experts in the fields of gastronomy, handicrafts and artisanship, literature and music had been invited to Gaziantep from Scotland, and enabled to conduct research in these fields. This research which conducted within the scope of Leonardo Da Vinci Program were held as 10 days periods, and the researchers visited Gaziantep and its neighbor cities (Diyarbakır, Siirt, Şanlıurfa etc.) with the members of FOCUH (Friends of Cultural Heritage). Throughout the mentioned visits, related projects had been investigated on site and their relations with the sustainable development had been evaluated.

- Culinary Arts Education Center (MUSEUM) established in 2013 has provided an education on Gaziantep cuisine through periodic three-month-courses in cooperation with Gaziantep Şehitkamil Public Education Center.
- Within the scope of Gaziantep Metropolitan Municipality's Art and Technical Courses (GASMEK), it has been provided education on both fields of handicrafts and artisanship, and world cuisine cookery. (Orgutlenme, n.d.)
- Emine Göğüş Culinary Museum was established by Gaziantep Metropolitan Municipality in 2008 as the first gastronomy museum of Turkey, and the visuals of foods, which are used to be consumed, are exhibited with the ingredients special to Gaziantep cuisine.
- The complex built up in 1937 as "Pistachio Station" has developed solutions for the problems in the field of pistachio farming since 1974. (Pistachio Research Institute, n.d)
- There have been implementations for especially the professional development and social security of chefs by Gaziantep Gastronomy and Chefs Association (GASDER) and Turkey's Chefs Union's Gaziantep branch.
- "The Craftsmen of the Silk Road Project" which was developed by Gaziantep Board of Trade in 2010, and implemented in Gaziantep, Adıyaman and Kilis aims to transform these three cities into the centers of destination through boosting the tourism sector. With the aim of the continuity of the production of 10 handicrafts and touristic products in the fields of artisanship and handicrafts, there are certain implementations which might strengthen the network of these products' promotion and marketing. (The Craftsmen, n.d.)

Along with the festivals such as International Antep Pistachio Culture and Art Festival held in 2017 for the tenth time, Islahiye Grape, Pepper and Culture Festival, Oğuzeli Pomegranate and Culture Festival, Gaziantep Youth Festival,

Children Folk Dances Festival, Zeugma Film Festival, International Mosaic Festival, International Shira Festival, the fairs on industry and food are some of the activities which show that the city has information and experience of large-scaled organizations.

Within and after the application process to the UCCN, it is mentioned that the cooperation between a team comprised of NGOs actively working in the city, universities and public sector representatives, civilian population, and food critics and chefs under the leadership of the GMM Mayor (Fatma Şahin) and GMM's related departments (Gaziantep Metropolitan Municipality Head of Foreign Relations Department) (Sylvie Yılmaz, Personal Interview, May 2018).¹⁹ Despite the difficulties of working as a group of people from different sectors, this cooperation is formed in Gaziantep (Sylvie Yılmaz, Personal Interview, May 2018). The Union of Historical Towns, the Governorship of Gaziantep, Gaziantep Chamber of Commerce and Industry, and Silk Road Development Agency are some other institutions held in the mentioned activity. "In addition to this, GMM and GASTURDER (Gastronomy Promotion Association) entered into an agreement in order to improve cultural and gastronomic potentials of the city."²⁰

Activities which have been carried on after it received the title of UCCN City of Gastronomy are briefly listed as follows:

- Within the scope of the aforesaid agreement, "Sustainable Professional Gastronomy Education" programs were started at the Culinary Arts Education Center in cooperation with GMM and GASTURDER. Certain activities for strengthening the infrastructure, including the professionals working in this area, and meeting the future needs of employees. (MUSEM, n.d.)

¹⁹Sylvie Fontana Yılmaz works as UA and Projects Expert at Gaziantep Metropolitan Municipality Department of Foreign Affairs. She is coordinator for Gaziantep Creative City of Gastronomy.

²⁰ These are cited from the information published by GMM regarding its application process to the UCCN.

- Within the scope of the activities which will enable disadvantaged groups to express themselves stated in the aims and objectives of UCCN, the project of the “Atelier without Obstacles” is put into practice in Gaziantep. The project aims to increase the social inclusion through the educational courses for disadvantaged and vulnerable individuals (women, children, refugees, migrants etc.), and disabled individuals.
- Cooperating with other cities joined to the UCCN, an atelier entitled “Research: History of Food Culture Based Relations on the Silk Road” was organized in Gaziantep between 5th and 7th December, 2017. During the atelier participated by experts, academicians and local representatives from 10 cities including Chengdu and Shunde from China, Rasht (Iran) and Jeonju (Republic of Korea), certain information, experience and the best implementations were shared. Within the frame of atelier, Gaziantep was introduced through organizing visits to Ottoman caravanserais and old townhouses. The atelier was suitable for the purpose of learning together with other member cities of the UCCN.
- The International Gastronomy Festival which aims to bring also the other Creative Cities of Gastronomy together was organized for information and experience sharing, and know-how. (Gaziantep, n.d.)
- UCLG-MEWA (United Cities and Local Governments *Middle East and West Asia* Section) Committee on Social Inclusion and Migration, Culture and Gastronomy Summit was held between 18th and 21st April, 2016.
- An ERASMUS project entitled “Youth4Food” festival might be seen as one of the organizations for sharing the best implementations. (Youth4food, n.d.)

In the activities which have been carried on, it is aimed to contribute to the development of intercultural dialogue with different cuisines. To proceed sustainable social and cultural actions in relation to gastronomy is considered as another long-term goal. Apart from these, certain conservation plans regarding the

climate changes and environment protection, and projects for the establishment of an eco-park have been developed. Also, two other projects have been developed for the usage of Antep pistachio shells in the industrial areas and dwellings with the methods of sustainable energy generation.

With its developed industry, Gaziantep where Hasan Kalyoncu University and Sanko University as well as Gaziantep University is selected as the most competitive seventh city by the World Bank's Competitive Cities Knowledge Base (CCKB). The city where 60% of the population is employed and 49% of the employment sector is based upon foods (spices, dried fruits, grains etc.) has an active tourism sector in the fields such as industrial tourism (fairs etc.) gastronomic tourism, and cultural tourism shaped through its historical and cultural heritage. One might say that Gaziantep has made contributions to the emergence of the new platforms through the activities –especially experience and information sharing due to the international cooperation- carried out as a result of its membership in the UCCN with the theme of gastronomy. To develop the traditional methods with innovative processes might enable Gaziantep to be one of the most effective cities in terms of sustainable development.

4.2. New “Creative Cities” (2017)

In the process following Gaziantep, Hatay joined to UCCN in 2017 with the theme of gastronomy as well. Along with Hatay, Istanbul and Kütahya joined to UCCN in the same year respectively with themes of design, and crafts and folk art as mentioned in the previous chapters.

4.2.1. Hatay as a Creative City of Gastronomy

With a historical background, it is known that the life in Antakya began in the Paleolithic Era. The city which took part of Turkey with a decision of the autonomous parliament formed in 1938 had been an autonomous yet client state in Turkey between 1938 and 1939 (Ada, 2005). The city which still bears the traces of various civilizations has a large number of tangible and intangible cultural

heritage assets. As a city having a rich cuisine culture, Hatay joined to UCCN in 2017 with the theme of gastronomy.

It seems that the city meets the criteria determined by the UCCN in the field of gastronomy. Hatay has an experienced position in certain fields such as especially festivals, and local and international organizations. Along with the events including the International İskenderun Tourism and Cultural Festival, the International Arsuz Culture and Art Festival, and the International Samandağ Silk Festival, certain organizations for promoting and branding the local products are carried out at the local and regional levels (Künefe, 2017).²¹ Besides these, the local organizations including the İskenderun Fish in Bread Festival, the Erzin Olive and Olive Oil Festival organized in Erzin, and Akçalı Egg Day draw attention to the local products and bazaars. The “Local Products Fair” lastly held between 18th and 23rd April 2017, the “Local Appetizers Competition” (2017), the “Local Tastes Competition” (2017), and the “Local Soups Competition” (2017) bring the interest on the local spaces into view.²²

The active institutions and NGOs related to gastronomy and culinary arts located in the city are significant in terms of taking part of the participation and decision making processes together with the sectoral development. As one of the stated institutions, the Hatay Research Institution of Olive Cultivation is established in Hatay, where olive has been grown for the first time in the world, in 2011 in order to organize research, education and production for enabling the production to be sustainable. Olive oil produced in Hatay does not only satisfy 87% of the city’s need of olive oil but it is also sold in the domestic and foreign

²¹ In the last Hatay Künefe Festival held between 21st and 23rd July 2017, the city was brought into view through making and distributing a 78-meter-long “künefe” as well as concerts and events for the participation of youth and children were organized.

²² The Eastern Mediterranean Development Agency (DOĞAKA) has worked for Hatay to gain geographical markers in conjunction with Mustafa Kemal University and the Governorship of Hatay. The geographical marker of “künefe” was received in 2007, and the efforts to have the markers of the “salted yogurt” and “mould cottage cheese (sürk)” which are products specific to Hatay are currently continuing with MKÜ and TOBB for this year.

markets(Kurumsallaşma, n.d.).²³ Manufacturers, the chambers of artisans and institutions carrying on activities in the food sector of Hatay are the structures which might be related to gastronomy. Moreover, organizations such as the All Chefs and Pastry Cooks Confederation (TAŞPAKON), the Hatay Chefs and Pastry Cooks Association (HAŞPADER), and Mustafa Kemal University's Tourism, Travel and Gastronomy Community organize activities in the related fields. With a sustainable tourism approach along with nutrition, organic agriculture, food safety, food industry, they organize promoting and branding activities, courses and ateliers on the issues such as gastronomic tourism, cultural tourism etc. (Kurumsallaşma, n.d.)

On the other hand, the Hatay Vocational Center (HAT-MEK) established within the body of the Hatay Metropolitan Municipality (HMM) in 2015 provides especially women and disabled individuals with education of “local cookery” and “local pastry.” These projects have the purpose of enabling disadvantaged groups to participate in social and economic life, and the local cuisine to survive.

It is mentioned that the city in which the predicted activities has been at the stages of planning and organization since it was selected as the City of Gastronomy by UCCN follows a participatory method. “The Gastronomy Council's technical commissions are established for an innovative and prospective development of the refreshments sector in the city. With 4 different committees which have 150 members, and bring local dynamics, NGOs, academic world and its partners in the refreshments sector together, these commissions have begun to work (Ömer Faruk Çelebi, Personal Interview, May 2018).²⁴ These commissions are named as “the Commission for the City's Gastronomic Identity, Planning, Design, Culinary Arts and Festivals,” the Commission for Informatics and Marketing,” “the Commission for Natural and Ecological Agriculture,” and “the Commission for the

²³ It will be applied to receive the geographical markers of olive and olive oil as well as dib roman and red onion as the local products.

²⁴Ömer Faruk Çelebi, BSc., MSc., DIC., EXPO2021 Hatay Coordinator, Hatay Unesco Gastronomy Focal Point, Mayor's Advisor

Gastronomy Social, Education and Youth Platform.” It is predicted that a workshop and the “Hatay International Symposium” will be organized at the end of each three month following the activities carried out by the commissions. It is aimed to form a 4-year plan and then a 30-year master plan for the city’s gastronomy after the symposium.

In addition to meeting the UCCN’s criteria for gastronomic cities, Hatay will need to internalize gastronomy with the urban processes through creative processes by bearing the current state of the city beyond tourism. The potential cooperation which will be developed between the UCCN’s cities of gastronomy and other creative cities both from Turkey and abroad might be effective on the development of applicable projects in the long term.

4.2.2. UNESCO Criteria for Creative City of Crafts and Folk Art

In the simplest term, artisanship is defined as “A work which is done for fulfilling material needs of human beings, and requires experience, skills and dexterity along with education; works requiring handicraft and manual dexterity” (TDK, 2018). Handicrafts are identified as “all works which is done by using an auxiliary tool on workbenches” (TDK, 2018). The usage of these two terms together is related to the meaning transformations that art and artisanship have been undergone within the historical process.

Apart from agriculture and livestock, artisanship which is the fundamental mood of production in the preindustrial era has replaced with industrial products due to the mechanization of production. Although its importance has declined in the course of time, it has regained significance today since it is considered as a local cultural and economic element. As a cultural value, artisanship areas which became some sort of marketing instrument have become a brand strategy especially for cities through the design by being related to the creative sectors. Crafts and artisanship included in the List of Intangible Cultural Heritage by UNESCO have been made into a theme for cities within the frame of UCCN (see p. 44).

In addition to the criteria such as having settled handicrafts and artisanship in the city, a large number of traditional plants in its production and an effective artisan community, and using materials unique to the region in productions, UCCN requires the cities to meet the criteria mentioned below:

- “Educational institutions working on the occupations related to crafts and folk arts,
 - Making an effort for promoting crafts and folk arts,
 - Existence of the related museums and crafts shops, and having information and experiences of organizing local art fairs, festivals, competitions etc..
- (The Creative City Network, n.d).”

There have been 37 cities already joined to the UCCN through meeting the above mentioned criteria. The image below shows the geographical distribution of these cities. Although there are cities from various regions of the world, it seems that these cities predominantly center upon Asia and Europe. Kanazawa (Japan), Incheon (Korea), Hangzhou (China), Fabriano (Italy), Santa Fe (USA), Aswan (Egypt), Esfahan (Iran), Gabrovo (Bulgaria), Baguio City (Philippines) are some examples of these cities.

Image 2. Creative Cities of Craft & Folk Arts



Source: <https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/home>

Due to the fact that it is not possible to investigate the characteristics of all the cities within the scope of this study, it is crucial to lay briefly emphasis on the implementations of Santa Fe (USA) and Aswan (Egypt) which are the first cities joined to the UCCN within the theme of crafts and folk arts –since they already submitted their membership reports.

Aswan is the first city received the title of the City of Crafts and Folk Arts. The city located by Nile River and having the Pyramids has a significant historical and cultural heritage. The influences of the Nubian civilization might be recognized in all the cultural texture of the city. The city is known also with the productions in the fields of crafts and folk art. Along with the works made of palm and ceramic, the needlecrafts and beadworks attract attention in the field of traditional handicrafts. In other respects, the local culture actively continue its existence through more than fifty local groups of folk dance, and musician groups as well as the wedding and funeral ceremonies, and the traditional dresses used for these ceremonies which might be considered within the scope of the oral cultural heritage.

Aswan Museum and Nubia Museum carry out certain activities for providing the sustainability of the local culture. The International Sculpture Symposium held on stone carving and Aswan Folk Troupe reveal that the city has an experience of organizing activities such as festivals, symposiums etc. As a “city of crafts and folk arts,” Aswan clarifies its implementations’ aims as promoting the development of local cultures, carrying on works for developing capacities for craftspeople, and developing cooperation with the other cities of UCCN in the field of handicrafts as well as other fields (Aswan, n.d.).

When considered the activities carried on between 2005 and 2006, it is remarkable that the Nubian House is established on the purpose of developing artisanship and handicrafts through organizing educational programs, and sharing experience and information. With this implementation, it is also aimed to provide

disadvantaged groups such as women and girls who are not sent to schools with occupation. It is mentioned that the works done at the Nubian House have attracted attention of tourists and made an economic contribution to the city as well as its promotion (Aswan Monitoring Report, 2016).

Within the scope of another project entitled “Ecotourism Development Project for Gharb Sehel Village,” it is aimed to preserve the natural and cultural environments, to enhance the living standards of local people, to produce high-quality ecotourism products as well as “Producing cultural benefits to the country of Egypt, as regards generating foreign - exchange, good business for tourism-related activities and generating new jobs” (Aswan Monitoring Report, 2016).

With the Nile Museum Project as one of the future projects planned to be done, it is planned to develop projects relating to the Nile River. Within the scope of this objective, it has been planned to exhibit antiques and to include photographs which show the development of the irrigation techniques since the Ottoman period (Aswan Monitoring Report, 2016).

Through the “Project for Traditional Nubian Crafts,” it is planned to carry out activities for development of heritage, handicrafts and local industry. Therefore, it is mentioned that group of villages will be selected around the Upper Egypt, and Nubian House will be established also in these villages for the development of artisanship and handicrafts through education and experience sharing. It is aimed to obtain both economic and social benefit through including local people in these activities.

In the report of Aswan, there is not any clear statement regarding what kind of changes the activities have created except for the emphasis on the increase in tourism between 2005 and 2016.

Another city Santa Fe joined to the UCCN in 2005. As the fairs organized in Santa Fe, El Camino Real and Santa Fe Trail participated by Native Americans and Mexicans are considered among the organizations showing that the city has an active local market. Santa Fe International Folk Art Market, Traditional

Spanish Colonial Market and Indian Market are three big events organized in the city. In other respects, it is emphasized that certain elements of cultural heritage such as pots, textiles, jewelries and dances which are produced with the traditional methods of Native Americans are still an important part of the local culture. In the city where the effects of Spanish colonial art might be seen in the fields like folk dances, straw appliqué and tin craft, there more than 250 galleries, and a large number of performing arts companies and museums (Santa Fe, n.d.).

In the city, there are certain legislative regulations for promoting artistic and cultural events. For instance, 1 % of the taxes customers pay is used for contributing to art organizations, artists and tourism. 2% of the revenue of public infrastructure and buildings is set aside for the artistic activities and organizations in the city. It is mentioned that Santa Fe University of Art and Design which is a member of Laureate Network makes contributions to the development of creative economy with the students educated at the university. In other respects, The New Mexico School for the Arts is established for pre-high school students who are talented in the field of art in 2010 with the aim of integrating education and creativity into local development strategies and plans. The school is currently maintaining the education (Santa Fe Monitoring Report, 2016, p. 4).

In the activities carried out in Santa Fe, it is aimed to develop collaborations which might contribute to the development of creative tourism and pilot projects, to make a contribution to the development of cultural and creative spaces through cooperating with the other member cities of UCCN, and to carry out works of research and education regarding culture and creative industries in the regional development.

After the Santa Fe International Conference on Creative Tourism, A Project of the UNESCO Creative Cities Network held in 2008, it is mentioned that the program developed on creative tourism by Santa Fe Arts Commission have had positive impacts on the city. Through the program which provides content producers with new opportunities in the cultural sector, a guide website was designed for creative

tourism workshops, and cultural and artistic events.²⁵ Under the favor of this website, 230 workshops and more than 500 events are organized by more than 200 artists since 2015 (Santa Fe Monitoring Report, 2016, p. 5). In 2012, a webinar entitled “Creative Tourism: Continuing the Global Conversation” was organized enabling discussions on creativity and tourism. Also, certain opportunities for cooperation with the firms carrying out activities in foreign countries are created in 2014 through the international trade atelier organized by the Santa Fe Global Trade Initiative (SFGTI) and the Quality of Life Committee. As one of the projects already and still carried out, the Santa Fe Arts and Creativity Center have planned to conduct activities for promoting creativity and entrepreneurship.

It might be said that Santa Fe considers the characteristics of its intangible and tangible cultural heritage including pots, ceramics, textiles and folk dances with their all aspects, and organizes the activities in the city in this direction. However, in the activities which focus on creative tourism, it has not shown any data explaining the participation level of the city people, and what kind of activities organized for disadvantaged groups, etc.

4.2.2.1. Kütahya as Creative City of Craft and Folk Art

Kütahya is the first city of Turkey which has joined to the UCCN with the theme of crafts and folk art. The city well-known with its ceramics and porcelains joined to the UCCN in 2017. When the criteria of UCCN is considered, the city located in the region which is used to be in the buffer zone between Byzantine and Ottoman empires for a long while has a historical and cultural heritage formed with the influences of these two cultures.

Along with ceramics and porcelain, the city where the folk art is quite dynamic in the fields of carpet and rug weaving, diamond and silver works, needlepoint has also folkloric characteristics such as folk dances, weddings and birth customs which might be considered within the scope of intangible cultural heritage.

²⁵ For the mentioned website, visit: <http://www.santafecreativetourism.org/>

In the city, Kütahya Dumlupınar University's Department of Ceramics and Glass and Kütahya Public Training Center hold training courses in these fields, and an education on producing ceramics is provided in a great number of ateliers in the city. Ceramic-tiles and other ceramics are considered as one of the main elements determining the city's social and economic structures. The socio-economic structure of the city is influenced by not only ceramic-tiles but also the other fields of crafts and folk arts. It is mentioned that the city meets the creativity principles of the UCCN with its all characteristics such as NGOs, educational institutions, music and cultural aspects. The city has about 435 ateliers working on crafts and folk arts, and about 15.000 people are employed in this field. "It is estimated that near one fifth of total employment in the city is related with crafts production and marketing" (Kütahya Municipality Report, the 3rd paragraph). It is stated that 17 of the mentioned ateliers are run by women, and about 1.000 people work in this field.

Since the city joined to the UCCN, it is expected that Kütahya ceramic-tiles will be branded, and its popularity and marketing will be increased in this way. In addition to these, to vary and boost the tourism sector, to increase the visibility of the city and to develop collaborations at both the local and international scales, and to transform the city into a brand city are some objectives planned to be attained in both the short and long term (Zafer Development Agency Information Report, 2017).

In the frame of these objectives, it is planned to carry out three projects at the local level: the project entitled the "Usage of Tiles in the Urban Spaces" plans to select 400 different places to exhibit at least 100 ceramic-tile works in every year, and total 400 works in four years. It is predicted that the project will be carried out with a participatory method. With the project of the "Integration of the Generations with Design," it is planned to identify the ceramic-tile works in the city and to make an inventory of the motifs. With the third project entitled "Certification of Environment-Friendly Ceramic-Tile," it is planned to create a center for preserving the certain standards of the stages of ceramic-tile usage. In

this way, it is aimed to carry out activities for creating a ceramic-tile brand. These projects are planned to be actualized in cooperation with Dumlupınar University, the Chamber of Ceramic-Tile Manufacturers, Kütahya Municipality, Zafer Development Agency, the Governorship of Kütahya, and certain NGOs and artisans (Zafer Development Agency Information Report, 2017).

In addition to the abovementioned local projects, it is planned to carry out international activities. The first project entitled “Contributing to Expanding the Network in Africa” includes providing technical support to four cities including Matola city of Mozambique to apply the UCCN in four years. Within the scope of the second project named as “Developing Interdisciplinary Cooperation Portal,” it is aimed to create a portal for developing projects based on seven themes that the artisans from 180 cities joined to the UCCN will participate in. Another project entitled “Cultural Interaction with Art and Language” includes a residence program in which one of 37 cities in this field will be annually selected, and an artist will be sent to the selected city to learn the country’s language, culture and arts (Zafer Development Agency Information Report, 2017).

In the city at the planning stage of these projects, it seems that Zafer Development Agency plays an active role as a central institution. This role is recognizable due to the fact that the Creative City Office and the related workers locate in Zafer Development Agency. However, it is not clearly known how effective the other actors of the city are at the levels of decision making and representation. As regards to the development of creative sectors in the city, it might be crucial to perceive the sustainable development as a whole through supporting the other fields of art and culture.

4.2.3. UNESCO Criteria for Creative City of Design

In 2017, the number of cities received the title of UCCN Design City became 31. In the map below, the geographical distribution of the design cities is shown. It seems that these cities are predominantly in the Northern Europe.

Image 3. Creative Design Cities



Source: <https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/home>

Buenos Aires (Argentina), Graz (Austria), Beijing (China), Bilbao (Spain), Montreal (Canada), Torino (Italy), Berlin (Germany) and Cape Town (South Africa) are some of the cities joined to the UCCN with the theme of design.

As is the case with the other themes of UCCN, there are certain criteria for the field of design. It is important for the cities to have centers where related research might be conducted, to have active and interactive design formations and designers at the local and international levels, as well as to have a settled design industry and educational institutions in the field of design. It is also significant to have a point of view creating new opportunities for the designers who have the ability, information and experience of organizing design-based events such as festivals, exhibitions, conferences and fairs, and turn the natural environment to good account (fashion design, jewelry design etc.). Moreover, developing

strategies promoting the creative industries shaped through the design itself is crucial.

As one of the foremost cities in the field of design, Berlin joined to the UCCN in 2005. After the Berlin Wall fell in 1989, Berlin has undergone crucial structural changes. It currently has 3.4 million population and is quite active in terms of art and culture. It is mentioned that the city has an economic structure mainly based on small and medium sized enterprises, and one of the fundamental elements in this structure is creative economies. It is also emphasized that Berlin has certain characteristics (low rents, good living conditions etc.) promoting young talented people from all around the world to work and live in Berlin (Berlin Monitoring Report, 2016).

It is stated that while the number of companies working in the field of design was 3.500 with 10.600 people in 2009, there were 4.400 companies in 2013 and 12.700 people in 2014 (Berlin Monitoring Report, 2016, p. 5). It is mentioned that the reason behind this increase is the strategy developed by Berlin Senate for Economics, Technology and Research in 2010 for strengthening Berlin's position as a design metropolis through increasing the economic power and the creative potential of the sector. New formats including Hybrid Platform which brings engineers and designers together within the scope of these activities, Industrial Design Campaign organizing various fairs all around the world, and Design Transfer Bonus Program which finances the projects benefiting from design services to develop innovative solutions have been developed. In addition, certain enterprises and industrial collaborations, competitions and workshops (e.g. "Start Your Fashion Business" and "Design and Healthcare Competition") have been supported as well as the international organizations like Berlin's Fashion. Among these, there are some design-focused competitions organized in cooperation with the UCCN. It is stated that Berlin's interdisciplinary collaborations are one of the characteristics of the city, and these collaborations are developed at both local and international levels (Berlin Monitoring Report, 2016).

There are five universities providing art education in the city and more than 5.000 students are educated in design. Along with a large number of private educational institutions financed by the private sector, the quality of education is varied with exchange and cooperative programs. International Creative Conference held in 2012 and Design Conference (within the scope of Design Festival 2014) are the evident showing that there are academic activities on design (Berlin Monitoring Report, 2016, p. 8).

The programs which focus on creativity and cultural entrepreneurship such as designing “Creative City Berlin Website,”²⁶ Coaching Bonus Program (Coaching Vouchers)²⁷, Venture Capital Found, Crowdfunding Platform and Design Transfer Bonus Program might be seen as examples of the local-scaled and effective implementations.

With a range of international projects, Berlin aims to develop the field of design and cultural entrepreneurship. The European Creative Industries Alliance (2012-2015) is constituted for making policies and developing cooperation on creativity and creative industries, and Nantes and Berlin as well as Amsterdam, Barcelona and Helsinki joined to it. (European Creative Industries Alliance, n.d.) Also, more than 350 entrepreneurs from Berlin and Poland were supported with the funds provided by Berlin Senate through the Berlin-Poland (2011-2014) Design Exchange Program.

As the design cities of UCCN, Buenos Aires, Montréal, Nagoya, Kobe, Saint - Etienne, Shenzhen, Shanghai, Seoul, Graz and Berlin established UNESCO Cities of Design (COD) Platform which has actively worked since 2013 (Berlin Monitoring Report, 2016).

Through the briefly mentioned projects above, one might say that Berlin is a quite advanced city in the field of creative sectors. It might be said that the mentioned projects have been actualized with the policies and implementations supported by

²⁶For Creative City Berlin Website visit: www.creative-city-berlin.com

²⁷For Coaching Bonus visit: www.coachingbonus.de/

especially the Senate for Economics, Technology and Research as well as the other actors of the city. The city which might be defined as “cultural-intellectual city” according to Hospers’ classification of cities keeps this characteristics through the cultural and art projects. It might be identified also as a “technological-innovative city” with the impacts of creative processes (see above p. 11).

4.2.3.1. Istanbul as Creative City of Design

Istanbul which joined to the UCCN in 2017 with the theme of design is a city having 8.500 years of history and still bearing the traces and influences of the civilization with a population over 14 million.

With its four historic areas in the list of UNESCO World Heritage, the city has a multicultural structure consisted of a variety of languages, religions, races and identities. It keeps the actuality of its intangible and tangible cultural heritages, and this situation influences the field of design as well as other fields. Since the accumulation and productions in handicrafts such as calligraphy, miniature, marbling art and mother of pearl inlay; and the occupations of artisanship including pottery, leatherworking, coppersmith and ironworking are currently kept going, the mentioned influences gradually increase.

The city, where a large number of events were organized in various fields of culture and art at the local and international levels, had presided the United Cities and Local Governments (UCLG) between 2010 and 2016. As a city hosting a large number of artist initiatives, museums and galleries along with the organized film, theatre and music festivals, and design biennales, Istanbul was proclaimed the European Capital of Culture in 2010.

In Turkey, the sector concentrates predominantly in Istanbul in terms of creative industries. This situation might be related to the city as being “a geography where the capital is accumulated, new thoughts are born, and the production took root” (Enlil and Evren, 2011, p. 25). According to the research conducted by the Association of Creative Industries Council (YEKON), 52.4% of the employees in

creative industries in Turkey live in Istanbul. 74.5% of the endorsement is obtained in the mentioned sectors in Istanbul as well (YEKON Creative Economy Atelier Report, 2012). In other respects, it is emphasized that there are 160 design offices in diverse fields of design (communication, and industrial and interior design) considered among creative sectors in the city (YEKON Final Report, 2014).

Certain commercial activities such as the “Design Week Turkey” held between 8th and 12th November 2017 for the 6th time, “Grafist” (Istanbul Graphic Design Awards)(Grafist, n.d.) held between 16th April and 11th May 2018 for the 22nd time, “Eko Design”, “Fashion Week Istanbul”, “Architectural and Design Summit,” “Turkey Innovation Week,” “IstanbulLight” (Lighting Technologies Exhibition and Congress), “Istanbul Packaging Industry Fair” have been conducted. These activities bring people from diverse groups such as students, professionals and business people together. The information and experience that the city has through these activities shows that it has the quality to meet the criteria of UCCN in this field.

In addition to the abovementioned events, certain activities aiming to develop the awareness of design and to realize the city’s design potential are carried out within the scope of “Istanbul Design Biennale A School of Schools” which will be held between 22nd September and 4th November 2018 for the fourth time.

With this year’s determined theme “A School of Schools,” the biennale program will be organized in six places located in Beyoğlu throughout the year. The Biennale “aims to transform into a productive, process-based education and design platform which provides the opportunities of conducting research, experimenting, and learning from and beyond the city through reinventing itself with what it has added on the heritage of the previous biennales.” (4th Istanbul Design Biennial, n.d.) As a space for critical thinking on design, it “provides an opportunity for questioning of the production and reproduction of design and design education.” The call of biennale is open for the participation of all groups

such as designers, architects, scientists, engineers, chefs, artisans and artists. Moreover, creative talented people are invited to Istanbul from all over the world, and certain activities such as seminars, ateliers and exhibitions are carried out in the fields of art and culture within the frame of the Istanbul International Arts and Culture Festival “İstancool” which has been annually organized by İstanbul74 since 2010. The mentioned activities are expected to make contributions to the mutual learning and development.

Along with the activities carried out in the field of design, it is also crucial that the city has diverse educational institutions providing education in this field in terms of the UCCN’s criteria for the city of design. It might be said that the city has carried out certain activities in this field due to the fact that there are 27 universities providing design-focused education at associate, bachelor and master’s degree levels, 282 departments at the vocational high schools, 235 centers offering free vocational courses within the Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality Lifelong Learning Center (ISMEK) alongside the local administrations arrange design-focused trainings for women and children (YEKON, 2012).

Besides these, there have been design-focused activities within the art and culture-focused ateliers for children organized by certain institutions including Istanbul Modern, SALT, Akbank Sanat, Yapı Kredi Sanat, Pera Museum and Sakıp Sabancı Museum. The Istanbul Development Agency (ISTKA) has also developed projects on design for children and youth. Among the mentioned projects, there have been programs for disabled individuals as well.

Carrying out activities which bring the actors from the milieus like universities, NGOs and local administrations together in the city is a crucial point in terms of the UCCN’s criteria for the city of design. Most of the aforementioned activities are cooperatively conducted. The “İstanbul Creative City Workshop” organized by YEKON between 2012 and 2013, also, brought the actors from diverse groups. (İstanbul Yaratıcı Ekonomi Atölyesi, 2012) Moreover, the project of the Design,

Research and Participation Platform (TAK) entitled “TAKAS” which bring citizens, district municipalities, and local and international designers together, and the project of the Urban Vision Platform named “39 Cities One Istanbul” regarding urban development strategies designed for each district of the city might be considered among the activities which bring the relevant actors together in the city.

It is mentioned that Istanbul’s application process to the UCCN has been managed with a participative and cooperative approach. A working team comprised of the design-oriented actors of the city has held at regular intervals throughout a whole year. It is stated that the program content has been developed through long discussions and exchanges of views, and the programs have shaped with the suggestions made in line with three questions addressed to the participants. The mentioned questions are “how is the history of the city for you? Which kind of frame the programs should have? How should the collaborations be?” (Ahsen Erdoğan, Personal Interview, May 2018).²⁸ The city which will be cooperated with has, also, been selected in accordance with the consultations in these meetings.

The activities planned to be done after Istanbul joined to the UCCN in the field of design are planned to be coordinated by the “Istanbul Creative City Platform” (ICCP). The platform designated as a governance mechanism comprises of the representatives of the actors interested in the field of design including academicians, professional organizations, artisans, designers and institutions conducting research on innovation. (İstanbul City of Design, n.d.) The programs which will be carried out under the guidance of the ICCP are formulated under three headings: 1) the “Istanbul Design and Innovation Center” (IDIC) will be established. IDIC will draw the actors making production in diverse fields of design together, and provide them with a spatial infrastructure which has high technological properties. It is also mentioned that IDIC will annually organize an

²⁸ Cultural Manager. She has been involved in the team which prepared the UCCN application file of Istanbul.

international conference. 2) The “Usta (Master) & Designer” program aims to bring the economic potential of the fields of traditional handicrafts and artisanship as well as their social aspects to light in the long term through combining crafts and design. The project carried out by the Istanbul Modern Platform of Crafts, Art and Design in 2016 might be given as an example of the activities within the scope of this program (Zanaatten Tasarima, n.d.).²⁹ Archiving the good practices, to open them to share is considered as another objective. 3) The objective of the documentation program is to create an inventory which will be regularly updated through combining all the data produced with diverse methods in all the fields included in the scope of crafts, design and creative sectors. (İstanbul City of Design, n.d.)

After the title of “UCCN Design City” is received, the planning and programming which are mentioned above and predicted within the application process are categorized under four headings: 1) Interaction (the Design Summit, Benchmarking Activities, UNESCO Meetings, Media and Advertisement, Support and Exchange Programs), 2) Progress (Documentation, Art&Craft, the Design Center, and the Design Library) 3) Recognition (UNESCO Publicity, Marketing Activities), 4) Participation (the Focus Group Meeting, the Common Sense Conference, Competitions (e.g. Creathon), Researches).

The projects which will be developed in cooperation with Mexico City and Graz as the UCCN’s two other cities of design are among the international activities planned to be done. Besides experiencing the mutual learning through sharing experience and information with the cities joined to the UCCN, it is aimed to promote the cooperation with the cities out of the network with the projects planned to be done between 2017 and 2021. It is stated that Mexico City has similarities with Istanbul in terms of deep-rooted traditions, ethnic diversity, and

²⁹ Within the frame of the project titled “From Crafts to Design,” artisans have produced works using the glass, wooden, mother-of-pearl, bone and copper materials through coming together with artists and designers. Then, the works produced throughout the project were exhibited and sold in Istanbul Modern.

migration, and these similarities have become more apparent during the meetings to develop cooperation.

The project entitled “Cross Creative Learning” which will be organized with Mexico City has been developed as a result of the abovementioned similarities. The project which will be carried out by ICCP and Laboratorio para la Ciudad (LabCDMX) has been developed on the bases of “learning” and “sharing.” It is predicted that the actors of these two cities will prepare an action plan determining the issues such as problems, solutions proposals and similarities through the webinars (think thank sessions) which will be held in the digital environment. The public events are, also, planned to display in the Istanbul Design Biennale. (İstanbul City of Design, n.d.)

It is highlighted that the similarities of two cities determine the quality of cooperation in the selection of the cities which will cooperate with (Ahsen Doğan, Personal Interview, May 2018).

It is also predicted to develop two projects with Graz, Austria. Within the scope of the project titled “Design and Experience Exchange” which will be carried out by the ICCP and the “Creative Industries Styria LLC” (CIS) from Graz together, it is aimed to bring the local producers and firms, and the designers and creative sectors in both cities together (İstanbul City of Design, n.d.). Also, the project titled “Smart City Development and Planning Exchange” which will be carried out in Graz focuses on the concept of “smart city.” It is predicted that the firms from both cities will share information and experience, and cooperate with each other once after the mentioned concept and the technological and innovative approaches developed on transportation and security have approved by the IMM. The project focuses on architecture and green technology as well (İstanbul City of Design, n.d.).

One might say that Istanbul, as a UCCN Design City, has a design approach based on reinterpretation of crafts and folk arts with creative ideas. After Istanbul received the title, its first activity was an exhibition titled “Yesterday-Today-

Tomorrow/ The Adventure of Endeavour” held between 5th January and 25th February 2018. Within the scope of the exhibition including 128 works produced by 83 instructors who work in İSMEK, and 34 students under the supervision of academic designers, it is stated that the traditional products such as “calligraphy, illuminated manuscripts, ceramics and paper filigree” have been reinterpreted with an innovative approach. (Tasarım Şehri, 2018) As another event, the “Creathon City” logo competition held in Istanbul between 17th and 18th February 2018 was developed under two categories including professionals and students with an aim of designing a logo which will internationally represent Turkey.³⁰ Other activities which have been carried out are listed as follows: “Istanbul the Design City Focus Group Meeting, Istanbul the Design City Common Sense Conference, Istanbul Visit of the Board of Graz the Design City, France Visit, Graz Visit, Poland Visit” (IMM Directorate of Design , May 2018).

The ability of Istanbul to make progress in the design sector as well as the other fields of creative industries might find solutions for the problems determined as “lack of competence, inefficacy of product’s quantity and diversity, deficiency of physical infrastructure, consciousness and awareness” through the strategies which will be developed in the fields of production and consumption (YEKON Creative Istanbul Atelier Report, 2012).

It seems that there are differences³¹ between the ways of categorization of the activities carried out before the application to UCCN and the ones after the title of UCCN Design City is achieved. These differences are due to the changes at the administrative levels. After the former mayor of the Istanbul Metropolitan Municipality (IMM), Kadir Topbaş resigned in September 24, 2017, Mevlut Uysal was elected as the new mayor in September 28, 2017. With the new municipality mayor, the team of the Directorate of Urban Design has been substantially changed, and a new team has been organized. It is stated that the

³⁰ For the competition results, see: <http://creathoncity.istanbul/CREATHON-CITY-IST-SONUC-LISTE.pdf>

³¹ After the title was achieved, the activities have been re-categorized under four headings in compliance with what they assumed in the application process.

activities which were planned by the previous team with a participative method have not been changed, and the activities committed in the application form have been currently continued. It is also mentioned that the participative method is still maintained through holding focus group meetings with the persons and institutional representatives who are experts in their fields and have been involved in the former activities even though the number of the participants decreased. It is stated that the related actors in the city (artisans, academicians, industrial design experts, etc.) are informed through organizing a workshop with the participation of about 100 individuals (Ebru Yılmazlar, Personal Interview, June 2018).³² It is mentioned that especially the Industrial Designers Society of Turkey (ETMK), Istanbul Foundation for Culture and Arts (IKSV), Turkey Design Foundation (TTV), Istanbul Development Agency (ISTKA) Republic of Turkey Ministry of Industry and Technology are among the stakeholders.

It is crucial that Istanbul joined to the UCCN as a design city due to the fact that it provides the opportunity of developing cooperation with other cities included in the same or different themes by the network. To explore different experiences and implementations, and to be within a learning process by mutually sharing information and experiences might provide crucial opportunities to solve the above-mentioned problems. In this context, the executives of the process need to shape the activities with a certain awareness and participatory methods. The distinctiveness of the cities with their one or several characteristics is related not only to the development of those aspects but also the city's social, economic and political structures, thereby, its cultural policies. Moreover, it is contracted with a consulting firm for professionally carrying out the activities committed within the application process of IMM. The activities have recently been carried out by the mentioned firm (BİMTAŞ as the consulting firm and InfoLoji as the subcontractor firm) in behalf of the IMM. The firm carries out the activities in coordination with the team carrying out the UCCN process (the head of the IMM Directorate of Urban Design and the administrative team, three scholars who are experts in the

³²The architect in the IMM Directorate of Urban Design has been involved in the team which carries out the UCCN process.

field of design from various universities, and the representative of ETMK who has followed the activities within the application process closely) (Ebru Yılmazlar, Personal Interview, May 2018).



5. CONCLUSION

In the cities where the culture which is considered as the fourth pillar of sustainable development is produced, certain strategies have been developed in order to solve the problems resulting from the increasing population density. It seems that branding strategies which are developed through recognizing the factors distinguishing a city from the other ones are in the forefront. Most of the strategies shaped by the historical and cultural accumulations of the cities consider culture and culture-related factors with a tourism-oriented approach.

With a culture and creativity-focused approach, UCCN was established in 2004 within the scope of UNESCO due to the potential of cities to make a difference in efforts for sustainable development. The cities, which might be convincing in their suitability to the criteria thematically determined by the UCCN for the solution of the problems cities currently and will encounter, have been rewarded with the title of “creative city.” In this study, it is made an effort to investigate what changes will be brought about in the cities with the title of “creative city” with regard to their themes, and what kind of a platform the UCCN constitutes for these with a creative approach focusing on especially culture, diversity and creative industries. In line with this objective, the theoretical framework of creative city is formed by dwelling on the discussions centered upon the concept of creative city. It is analyzed that culture is considered with a tourism-oriented approach in Turkey through the documents of cultural policy and the activities of development agencies. The activities which both have been carried out and planned to be conducted in the cities that joined to UCCN from Turkey are analyzed and discussed within the frame of the criteria for creative cities, and the practices of other cities which have already joined to UCCN from various regions of the world.

One might say that the UCCN is a platform that enables cooperation between the cities with different socio-cultural and economic structures. It is an open platform for knowledge and experience sharing. Within the scope of the study, the cities of

membership monitoring reports examined are in parallel with the other cities making this assessment possible. Chengdu, Popayán and Santa Fe as well as Gaziantep from Turkey are some examples of collaborations with the other cities. These collaborations anticipate the cultural access, participation and so on simultaneously for the cities, as well as encounters which can enable them to carry out particular activities, raise awareness about the possibilities of having knowledge and facilities. These contracts and exchanges can result in mutual learning. Learning through knowledge and experience sharing can create an interaction between the cities with different structures and cities having similar social and economic backgrounds. The ability of cities to transform this interaction into the dynamics of sustainable development in the long run is related to Landry's soft, hard and mental infrastructure implements. In connection therewith, the cities will gain the decisive momentum with the titles to be taken with the help of local cultural policies to be made with innovative participatory and multifaceted perspectives.

However, there is no measurable net data as to whether the UCCN has significant influence on cities. It is regarded as an element of prestige and reputation for the cities rather than economic gain. On the other hand, the collaborations to be created for the developed cities have the potential to turn into long-term economic partnerships. Examples of Berlin's work in the field of design, or Chengdu's projects and achievements in the field of gastronomy could be given as examples. It is understood that the co-operation with the projects to be developed will provide mobility in the tourism area in the long run for the cities. In this respect, the UCCN offers the opportunity of self-assessment, a potential for less developed cities and enable them to improve the assets they already have. On the basis of these evaluations, it can be considered that the UCCN serves as a platform for economic and social opportunities for cities which have a strategic approach.

Before moving on to practices in Turkey, within the scope of this work, it is assessed that the culture has been instrumentalised through tourism. This assessment has been reached after evaluation of work on Development Agencies,

Tenth Development (2014-2018), Sustainable Cultural Development Plan (2016), National Culture Council (2017) and Turkey Tourism Strategy 2023 documents given in chapter three. Works done by the Development Agencies within the Program of Supporting the Centres of Attraction and Guided Support Projects are given as an example.

The works undertook, and future projects of the four cities which received the title of the creative city after applying to UCCN from Turkey were discussed in the fourth section. It was focused on which characteristics of the cities met the criteria determined by the UCCN in regards of themes, which works, or knowledge, skills and infrastructure they possess made them to be found adequate. Suggestions to be developed or general evaluation for the cities in this section will be made according to the table 4 which shows the characteristics of creative cities compiled from the discussions of the creative city in the first chapter. The data are compiled from Landry's, Bianchini, Florida, Hall, Hospers and Pratt's findings of creative cities.

Table 4: Characteristics of the Creative Cities³³

Creative city characteristics	Gaziantep	Hatay	Kutahya	Istanbul
Co-operation between different sectors				
Entrepreneurial public sector				
Existence of creative environment (creative people, creative environments, creative industries)				
Advanced infrastructure (hard, soft, mental)				
Existence of participatory and inclusive policies				
Environmental policies (cultural heritage)				
New and creative solutions to problems				
Access to artistic and cultural facilities				
Good quality of life standards				
Diversity (human diversity and diversity in urban architecture)				
Openness				
Empathy spaces (spaces suitable for communication and interaction)				

The studies carried out by Gaziantep, Turkey's first creative city since 2015, has been examined in chapter "4.1.1. Gaziantep as Gastronomy Creative City". Given the characteristics of the city, an advanced city assessment can be made for

³³Colours used in the table have been chosen randomly. Light colour (burgundy) represents the city has met the given criterion. Dark colour (gray) represents whether the criterion has not been met or the situation is uncertain.

Gaziantep. The existence of an entrepreneurial public sector which was created by the co-operation among local governments, universities, NGOs, private sector, and so on were mentioned. In the field of gastronomy, it is possible to talk about the existence of chefs and experts as well as institutions such as the Culinary Arts Education Centre, where these people are able to assess the creativity. However, it is mentioned that there is no clear planning in the field of creative industries. In Gaziantep [t]he creative industries have not been integrated into the action plan, and this is a field we have been missing" (Sylvie Yılmaz, May 2018). This can be considered as a data on the urban status of the level of awareness of creative industries. Apart from this, openness, access to diversity, artistic and cultural possibilities of participatory and inclusive policies are issues to be addressed on a very large scale, it is fair to say that when the UCCN process is handled with a narrower framework, the work carried out in the city seem to overlap these features. In addition to the general laws at the national level for the protection of archaeological sites (Zeugma Ancient City etc.), protective, tourism-oriented regulations have been developed at the local level. During the first four years of creative city experience, it will be important for the city to continue its collaborations that it has developed especially at the international level and to concentrate efforts to develop creative industrial fields in the future. It is important that the UCCN process is carried out in the municipality with a participatory method with the participation of the mayor, the External Relations Department, a UNESCO expert consultant and various actors in the city, it is important developing more participatory and inclusive policies at the national level.

Hatay - which gained the title of being the second creative gastronomy city of Turkey after Gaziantep – seems like a city established parallels between the targets and goals of UCCN and targets of the city in an early stage. The already existed co-operation among different sectors was made functional in the UCCN application process and making the Gastronomy city project public through different city council committees is to show that participation in process

management is important. Despite mentioning the existence of a culturally sophisticated cultural infrastructure in the field of gastronomy, there is no significant accumulation in the field of creative industries. "Creative industries are the artistic industry that is needed to make handcrafted industry professionally sustainable in the region and to base the development of the region on this thesis" (Ömer Faruk Çelebi, May 2018). Çelebi notes that the gastronomy council can provide this in the long run. Enrichment of the hard, soft and mental infrastructure and encouragement of the entrepreneurship of the public can be among the works to be carried out in the future. It can be said that Hatay can lead the development of creative processes by increasing local and international collaborations through sharing knowledge and experience with other cities. Another of the cities that are still in the beginning of the process is Kütahya, which takes the title of creative city in the field of crafts and handicrafts. Existence of the entrepreneurial public sector is understood from the works done by co-operation between different sectors in the city. It can also be said that the existence of creative industries in the field of tile and porcelain with the presence of craftsmen in the porcelain field. The capacity of the city to develop creative solutions to the living problems can be strengthened by improving the elements of hard, soft and mental infrastructure. This assessment, which may be valid for all cities, would be possible with the public sphere arrangements and social life in which people are communicated and interacted with each other, which is possible for individuals from all walks of life to develop both participatory and inclusive policies at both national and local levels and access to artistic and cultural activities. Without these, it is not possible to talk about the existence of quality standards of integrity for Kütahya and other cities. As mentioned at the beginning, these evaluations about the cities are made in line with the information given by the cities about the UCCN application process. Since Kütahya is a city that is still at the beginning of the process, a similar suggestion which was done for Hatay could be applied to Kütahya. With the emphasis on international experiences, it will be important to transform the city with what to be learned from knowledge and experience sharing. In addition,

the local sector could be opened to international area with the co-operations to be developed.

Regarding Istanbul, it can be assessed that the city is the most suitable city for creative city characteristics and criteria. Guaranteeing participation with working groups established from the beginning of the process, the existence of entrepreneurial private sector and the public are made this evaluation possible. On the other hand, civilian and private sector are more active than local and central actors. In the city, the "creative clusters" of Florida and the existence of the creative class can be directly talked about. In addition, it can be said that the field of creative industries in the city is open to potentials, incentives and developments in terms of many sectors. The necessity of developing participatory and inclusive cultural policies at central and local level is important and necessary in terms of openness and diversity. When the already existing cultural diversity potential with the present historical and architectural texture, it can be evaluated in all respects as a potential. However, various but disorganised creative sectors need to be restored. This process, which started at the field of design with taking the title of the creative city, should be planned to cover other areas with programs to be developed over time.

It can be said, UCCN's social impact to the city rather than the economic dimension for the cities are decisive in Turkey as well as being involved with UCCN is being seen as an element of prestige.

Finally, "[e]ach city already has a prominent cultural side, and UCCN does not give you anything unless it is already there for years" (Ömer Faruk Çelebi, May 2018). It is not related that the talked area is developed in the cities which become prominent with their several features, it is related with the social, economic and political structure of the cities as a whole, and therefore to cultural policies.

REFERENCES

- Ada, S. (2005). *Türk- Fransız İlişkilerinde Hatay Sorunu (1918-1939)*. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları
- Ada, S. (2015). *Istanbul Conference 10 Years of the UNESCO Convention on the Diversity of Cultural Expressions*. İstanbul: Mavi Kare
- Adorno, W. T. (2001). *The Culture Industry*. UK: Routhledge
- Ajanovic, E., Çizel, B. (2015). *An Evaluation of the Potential of the City of Antalya to Become Part of UNESCO's Creative Cities Network*. Mediterranean Journal of Humanities, (1), pp.1-16
- Anholt, S. (2010) *Places Identity, Image and Reputation*. UK: Macmillan
- Castells, M. (2010). *The Information Age Economy, Society, and Culture*. UK: Blackwell Publishing
- Çelik, Ş. A. (2011). *Kültür Endüstrisi: Üç Yanlı Bir Doğru*, İstanbul: Literatür Yayınları
- Defnerr, A., Liouris, C. (2005). *City Marketing: A Significant Planning Tool For Urban Development In A Globalised Economy*. 45th Congress of the European Regional Science Association 23-27 August 2005, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam. pp.1-21
- Demir, E. M. (2014). *Yaratıcı Endüstriler*. Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi İLEF Dergisi 1(2), s.87-107
- Dereli, H.C. (2016). *UNESCO Yaratıcı Kentler Ağı Tasarım Kenti Kriterleri Bağlamında İzmir'in Değerlendirilmesi*. Doctoral Thesis. İstanbul Teknik Üniversitesi, İstanbul. (455395)
- Donald, B., Gertler, M. S., Tyler, P. (2013). *Creatives After the Crash*. Cambridge Journal of Regions, Economy and Society, 6, pp. 3-21
- Eagleton, T. (2000). *The Idea Of Culture*. UK: Blackwell Publishers
- Emre, Y. (2015). *Anthony Giddens ve Uluslararası İlişkiler: Yapılanma, Modernite ve Küreselleşme*. Uluslararası İlişkiler, 11(44), pp. 5-23

- Enlil, Z., Evren, Y. (2011). *Yaratıcı İstanbul Yaratıcı Sektörler ve Kent*, İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları
- Esen, Ü. B. ve Önder, A. (2017). *Ekonominin Yeni Yüzü: Yaratıcı Ekonomi*, Sosyoekonomi, Vol. 25(33), pp. 59-80.
- Florida, R. (2003). *Cities and the Creative Class*. City & Community 2.1: 3–19,
- Florida, R. (2005). *The Flight of the Creative Class*. New York: HarperCollins Publishers
- Florida, R. (2005). *Cities and The Creative Class*. New York: Routledge
- Florida, R. (2007). *The Flight of the Creative Class The New Global Competition For Talent*. New York: Harper Collins Publishers
- Florida, R. (2012). *The Rise of the Creative Class*. New York: Basic Books
- Gabe, T. & R. Florida & C. Mellander. (2012) *The Creative Class and The Crisis*, Cambridge Journal of Regions, Economy and Society, 6, pp.1-17
- Florida, R. (2017). *The New Urban Crisis*. New York: Basic Books[Adobe Digital Editions version]. LCCN 2016057434
- Galloway, S. and Dunlop, S. (2007). *A critique of definitions of the cultural and creative industries in public policy*, International Journal of Cultural Policy, 13(1), pp.17-31
- Giddens, A. (2000). *The third way and its critics*. Cambridge: Polity Press
- Gürol, M. Ali. (2006). *Küresel Arena’da Girişimci ve Girişimcilik*. Ankara: Gazi Kitabevi
- Habermas, J. (2005). “Öteki” Olmak, “Öteki”yle Yaşamak, İlknur Aka (çev.) İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları
- Hall, P. (2000). *Creative Cities and Economic Development*. Urban Studies, 37 (4): pp. 639-649
- Hartley, J. (2005). *Creative Industries*. UK: Blackwell Publishing
- Harvey, D. (2003). *Postmodernliğin Durumu*. Savran, S. (Çev.) İstanbul: Metis Yayınları
- Harvey, D. (2016). *Sosyal Adalet ve Şehir*. Moralı, M. (Çev.) İstanbul: Metis Yayınları

- Hawkes, J. (2001). *The Fourth Pillar of Sustainability Cultures essential role in public planning*, Australia: Common Ground Publishing
- Horkheimer, M. ve Adorno, T. (2010) *Aydınlanmanın Diyalektiği*, N. Ülner (Çev.), E.Ö. Karadoğan(Çev.), İstanbul: Kabalcı Yayınları
- Hospers, G.J. (2003). Creative Cities: Breeding Places in the Knowledge Economy, Knowledge, Technology & Policy, 16(3), pp.143-162
- Howkins, J. (2013). *The Creative Economy: How People Make Money From Ideas*, London: Penguin Books
- Hartley, J. (2005). *Creative industries*. Oxford: Wiley-Blackwell
- Ivanovici, M. and Mândruleanu, A. (2009). *Creative Economy's Gauges. Romania's Case*, Management & Marketing, 4(2), pp.125-150
- İlgüner, M., Asplund, C. (2011). *Marka Şehir*. İstanbul: Marketing Yayınları
- Kavaratzis, M. (2004). *From city marketing to city branding: Towards a theoretical framework for developing city brands*. Place Branding1 (1): 59
- Kavaratzis, M, Ashworth, G.J. (2006). *City branding: An effective assertion of identity or a transitory marketing trick?* Place Branding, Vol. 2, 3, pp.183–194
- Kavaratzis, M. (2009). *Cities and their brands: Lessons from corporate branding*. Place Branding and Public Diplomacy No 5, p.33
- Kaypak, S. (2013). *Küreselleşme Sürecinde Kentlerin Markalaşması ve Marka Kentler*. C.Ü. İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Dergisi, 14(1)
- Keleş, R. (2006). *Kentleşme Politikası*. Ankara: İmge Yayınevi
- Kotler, P., Gertner, D. (2002). *Country as brand, product, and beyond: A place marketing and brand management perspective*. The Journal of Brand Management, 9, pp. 249-261.
- Kutlu, Ü. Z. (2011) *Kültürel Haklar, Kültürel Çeşitlilik ve Katılımcı Kültür Politikaları*, in Sivil Toplum Gözüyle Türkiye Kültür Politikası Raporu Aksoy, A., Kutlu, Ü.Z., İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları
- Landry, C. and Bianchini, F. (1998). *The Creative City*. UK: Demos

- Landry, C. (2000). *The Creative City: A Toolkit For Urban Innovators*. London: Earthscan, pp.164-172
- Landry, C. (2007). *The Creative City*. London:Earthscan
- Landry, C. (2017). *The Civic City in a Nomadic World*. Rotterdam: nai010 Publishers
- Lefe'bvre, H. (2014). *Mekanın Üretimi*. (Işık Ergüden, çev). İstanbul: Sel Yayıncılık
- Lévy, A. (2006). Quel urbanisme aux mutations de la société post-industrielle, *Esprit*, 329, pp. 61-75
- Miller, T. (2009). *From creative to cultural industries*. *Cultural Studies*, 23, pp. 88-99
- Okandan, G. H. (2016). *The Effect of Cultural and Creative Industries on Economic Development of the Cities: A Comparative Analysis of Turkey and UAE*, in *Comparative Political and Economic Perspectives on the MENA Region*, Hershey: Information Science Reference, pp. 320-340
- Onur, D. ve Zorlu, T. (2017). *Yaratıcılık Kavramı ile İlgili Kuramsal Yaklaşımlar*. *İnsan ve Toplum Bilimleri Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 3, pp. 1535-1552
- Pascual, J. (2011). *Kültür Politikaları, Sürdürülebilirlik ve Katılım Üzerine*, in *Yerel Kültür Politikaları El Kitabı: Adımlar, Araçlar ve Örnekler*. Eylem Ertürk(der.) İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2011.pp. 23-45.
- Pratt, A. C. (2008). *Creative Cities: The Cultural Industries And The Creative Class*, *Geografiska Annaler: Series B, Human Geography*, 90(2), pp.107-117
- Raunig, G., Ray, G., Ulf, W. et al (2011). *Culture industry and the administration of terror*, in, *Critique of creativity: precarity, subjectivity and resistance in the 'creativeindustries'*.London: Mayfly, pp. 167-182
- Sassen, S. (2000). *Cities in a World Economy*. California: Pine Forge Press
- Scott, J. A. (2006). *Creative Cities: Conceptual Issues and Policy Questions*, *Journal of Urban Affairs*, vol:28 (1), pp.1-17

- Singh, J.P. (2011). *United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO)*, Creating norms or a complex world, London and Newyork: Routledge Global Institutions
- Takala, T. (1993). *A neuropsychologically based approach to creativity*. Modeling creativity and knowledge based creative design, pp.91-108.
- Torrance, E. P. (1968). *Torrance tests of creative thinking*. Personnel Press, Incorporated
- Tutal, N. (2018). *Boşluğun Gücü*, in Varlık, Kentsel ve Kültürel Dönüşüm. 1326, pp.9-12, İstanbul: Varlık Yayınları
- Uçkan, Ö. (2011) *Yaratıcı Kentler, Yazılım Sektörü ve İstanbul*. in Yaratıcı İstanbul Yaratıcı Sektörler ve Kent. İstanbul: İstanbul Bilgi Üniversitesi Yayınları, pp. 31-35.
- Williams, R. (1993). *Kültür* (Ertuğrul Başer Çev.)İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları
- Zhang, L., Zhao, S. X. (2009). S. X. *City branding and the Olympic effect: A case study of Beijing*. Cities, 26(5), pp. 245-254

Online Sources

- Activity Report of Development Agency.(2016) Retrieved 17 April 2018 from [file:///C:/Users/oem/Downloads/Kalk%C4%B1nma_Ajanslar%C4%B1_2016_Y%C4%B1l%C4%B1_Genel_Faaliyet_Raporu%20\(1\).pdf](file:///C:/Users/oem/Downloads/Kalk%C4%B1nma_Ajanslar%C4%B1_2016_Y%C4%B1l%C4%B1_Genel_Faaliyet_Raporu%20(1).pdf)
- Agenda 21 For Culture.(n.d.) Retrieved 12 February 2018 <http://www.agenda21culture.net/who-we-are/committee-on-culture>
- Antep Fıstığı Araştırma Enstitüsü Müdürlüğü. Retrieved 29 May 2018 from <https://arastirma.tarim.gov.tr/afistik/Sayfalar/AnaSayfa.aspx>
- Aswan.(n.d.). Retrieved 16 May 2018 from <https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/aswan>
- Aswan Monitoring Report.(2016) Retrieved 18 May 2018 from https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/monitoring_reports/Aswan%20the%20creative%20City.pdf

Basic Texts of the Convention on the Protection and Promotion of the Diversity of Cultural Expressions. (2017). Retrieved 20 February 2018 from <http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0026/002607/260710e.pdf#page=33>

Berlin Monitoring Report.(2016). Retrieved 25 May 2018 from http://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/Report_Berlin_UNESCOCREATIVECITIES%20Network_final.pdf

Birleşmiş Milletler Binyıl Bildirgesi.(2000) Retrieved 18 February 2018 from http://www.unicankara.org.tr/doc_pdf/mill_decl_turkce.pdf

Brand. (n.d). Retrieved 1 April 2018 from [https://www.ama.org/resources/Pages/Dictionary.aspx?dLetter=B, \(\)](https://www.ama.org/resources/Pages/Dictionary.aspx?dLetter=B, ())

Cittaslow Türkiye.(n.d.) Retrieved 10 April 2018 from <http://cittaslowturkiye.org/>

Cittaslow Seferihisar. (n.d.) Retrieved 2 April 2018 from <http://cittaslowturkiye.org/cittaslow-seferihisar/>

Convention (n.d.) Retrieved 12 April 2018 from http://www.unesco.org.tr/dokumanlar/kulturel_ifadelerin_cesitliligi/EVRENSEL_B%C4%B0LD%C4%B0RGE.pdf

Chengdu. (n.d.) Retrieved 14 May 2018 from <https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities//node/8>

Chengdu Monitoring Report. (2017) Retrieved 13 May 2018 from https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/monitoring_reports/final_chengdu_mmr_-_nov_2017.pdf

Culture. (n.d) Retrieved 5 December 2017 from

<https://www.etimolojiturkce.com/kelime/k%C3%BClt%C3%BCr>

Culture 21.(2015) Retrieved 15 February 2018 from

http://www.agenda21culture.net/sites/default/files/files/documents/multi/c21_015_tr.pdf

Davutoğlu, A. (2015) *64.Hükümet programı*. Retrieved 23 May 2018 from https://www.aa.com.tr/uploads/TempUserFiles/64.hukumet_programi.pdf

Department of Culture And Sport (2013). Classifiying and Measuring of Creative Industries.

https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/203296/Classifying_and_Measuring_the_Creative_Industries_Consultation_Paper_April_2013-final.pdf

Dublin Annual Report.(2011) Retrieved 16 March 2018 from <https://www.dublincityofliterature.ie/wp-content/uploads/2010-2011-Annual-Report.pdf>

Edinburgh Monitoring Report. (2017) Retrieved 4 April 2018 from https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/monitoring_reports/2017%20-%20UNESCO%20Monitoring%20Report%20-%20EDINBURGH.pdf

European Creative Industries Alliance. (n.d.) Retrieved 27 May 2018 from www.eciapplatform.eu

Everything is Gentrification. (2017). Retrieved 07 February 2018 from <https://www.theguardian.com/cities/2017/oct/26/gentrification-richard-florida-interview-creative-class-new-urban-crisis>

Fête des lumières. Retrieved 10 April 2018 from <http://www.fetedeslumieres.lyon.fr/fr>

Gaziantep. (n.d.) Retrieved 17 May 2018 from <https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/gaziantep>

Gaziantep Baklavası.(n.d.) Retrieved 7 May 2018 from <https://www.ab.gov.tr/49345.html>

Gaziantep Mutfağı'nın Ana Hatları. (n.d.) Retrieved 5May 2018 from <http://www.gastroantep.com.tr/yemek-icecek.php>

Glasgow City Of Music Report (2008-2016) Retrieved 3 May 2018 from https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/monitoring_reports/Glasgow%20Membership%20Monitoring%20Report.pdf

Global Designing Cities Organization. Retrieved 5 April 2018 from
<https://globaldesigningcities.org/about-gdci/>

Global Street Design Guide. (2015) Retrieved 5 April 2018 from
https://nacto.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/08/Skye-Duncan-NACTO_Global-Street-Design-Guide-preview-sm.pdf

Grafist. (n.d.) Retrieved 27 May 2018 from
<http://grafist.org/>

Hıdırellez. (n.d.) Retrieved 1 May 2018 from
<http://basin.kulturturizm.gov.tr/TR,195972/hidirellez-de-artik-unesco-listesinde.html>

Interview with Charles Landry. (02.2018). Retrieved 5 February 2018 from
<https://kpy.bilgi.edu.tr/tr/icerik/soylesiler/charles-landry-ile-soylesi-02-18/30>

İstanbul City of Design (n.d.) Retrieved 02 June 2018 from
<http://www.designcityistanbul.com/SitePage/index/18>

İstanbul Yaratıcı Ekonomi Atölyesi.(2012). Retrieved 1 June 2018 from
<http://www.yekon.org/public/yaratici-ekonomi-atolyesi-raporu.pdf>

Kreasyon. (n.d.) Retrieved 5 December 2017 from
<https://www.etimolojiturkce.com/kelime/kreasyon>

Kurumsallaşma. (n.d.) Retrieved 25 May 2018 from
<http://hataygastronomi.com/en/institutionalization>

Künefe. (2017) Retrieved 20 May 2018 from
<http://www.hurriyet.com.tr/gundem/78-metrelik-kunefe-20-dakikada-tukendi-40528921>

LYON.(n.d.) Retrieved 10 April 2018 from
<https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/node/89>

MUSEM, (n.d.) Retrieved 12 May 2018 from
<https://gantep.bel.tr/etkinlik/musem-gasturder-isbirliginde-profesyonel-gastronomi-egitimleri-devam-ediyor-612.html>

Numelyo. (n.d.) Retrieved 10 April 2018 from
<http://numelyo.bm-lyon.fr/>

Numeridanse.(n.d.) Retrieved 11 April 2018 from
<https://www.numeridanse.tv/en/>

Örgütlenme.(n.d.) Retrieved 05 May 2018 from
<http://www.gastroantep.com.tr/gpgm-orgutlenme.php>

Pistachio Research Institute.(n.d.) Retrieved 07 May 2018 from
<https://arastirma.tarim.gov.tr/afistik/Sayfalar/EN/AnaSayfa.aspx>

Popayán. (n.d.) Retrieved 10 April May 2018 from
<https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities//node/92>

Popayán Monitoring Report (2015). Retrieved 15 April 2018 from
(https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/EVALUATION%20Excel%20-%20Popayan_mis%20en%20page.pdf

Report of Culture and City Commission. (2017). Retrieved 28 March 2018 from
<http://kultursurasi.kulturturizm.gov.tr/Eklenti/50607,komisyoneraporusehirvekultur.pdf.pdf?0>

Report of Cultural Economy Commission. (2017). Retrieved 27 March 2018 from
<http://kultursurasi.kulturturizm.gov.tr/TR,174733/kultur-ekonomisi-komisyonu.html>

Report of Cultural Policy Commission. (2017). Retrieved 27 March 2018 from
<http://kultursurasi.kulturturizm.gov.tr/TR,174659/kultur-politikalari-komisyonu.html>

Santa Fe. (n.d.) Retrieved 20 May 2018 from
<https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities//node/41>

Santa Fe Monitoring Report.(2016). Retrieved 21 May 2018 from
https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/monitoring_reports/Santa%20Fe_UNESCO%20Report%2003%2001%2016.pdf

Sualtı Kültür Mirasının Korunması Sözleşmesi. (2001) Retrieved 21 February 2018 from <http://kumid.net/euproject/admin/userfiles/dokumanlar/K-Sualti-Kultur-Miras%2C-UNESCO%2C-2001.pdf>

Tasarım Şehri.(2018) Retrieved 4 June 2018 from
<https://www.ibb.istanbul/News/Detail/34439>

TDK (2006). *Yaratıcılık* in *Türk Dil Kurumu Online Sözlük* Retrieved 1 December 2017 from:

http://www.tdk.gov.tr/index.php?option=com_gts&arama=gts&guid=TDK.GTS.5b74c03ea7d393.16308738

The Craftsmen of the Silk Road” Project. (n.d.) Retrieved 10 May 2018 from <http://www.ipekyolununustalari.org.tr/index.php?lang=en>

The Creative Cities Network Brochure.(n.d.) Retrieved 25 March 2018 from http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CLT/pdf/Creative_cities_brochure_en.pdf

The Economy of Culture in Europe (2006) Retrieved 10 February 2018 from http://ec.europa.eu/assets/eac/culture/library/studies/cultural-economy_en.pdf

The New Urban Agenda. (n.d). Retrieved 25 February 2018 from <http://habitat3.org/the-new-urban-agenda/>

The New Urban Agenda. (2017). Retrieved 24 February 2018 from <http://habitat3.org/wp-content/uploads/NUA-English.pdf>

The New Urban Agenda.(2017) Retrieved 5 March 2018 from <http://habitat3.org/wp-content/uploads/New-Urban-Agenda-GA-Adopted-68th-Plenary-N1646655-E.pdf>

The New Urban Crises. (2017. Retrieved 5 February 2018 from <https://www.theguardian.com/books/2017/sep/26/richard-florida-new-urban-crisis-review-flawed-elitist-ideas>

The 10th Development Plan.(2013). Retrieved 19 May 2018 from www.resmigazete.gov.tr/eskiler/2013/07/20130706M1-1-1.doc

Tourism Strategy of Turkey. (2023). Retrieved 18 May 2018 from <http://www.kultur.gov.tr/Eklenti/43537,turkeytourismstrategy2023pdf.pdf?0&tag1=796689BB12A540BE0672E65E48D10C07D6DAE291>

UCNN Mission Statement.(n.d.) Retrieved 24 February 2018 from https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/Mission_Statement_UNESCO_Creative_Cities_Network.pdf

UCCN Sydney Monitoring Report. (2017). Retrieved 15 April 2018 from

https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/monitoring_reports/unesco_monitoring_report17_sydney.pdf
 Understanding Creative Industries, UNESCO 2006, retrived from on
<http://www.ico-d.org/connect/features/post/229.php>
 UNCTAD. (2018). Ashiving the Sustainable Development Goals. Retrieved 8 February 2018 from http://unctad.org/en/PublicationsLibrary/aldc2018d4_en.pdf
 UNCTAD. (2010). *Creative economy report*. Retrieved 10 February 2018 from http://unctad.org/en/docs/ditctab20103_en.pdf
 UNESCO Convention For The Safeguarding of The Intangible Cultural Heritage.(2003) Retrieved 22 February 2018 from <https://ich.unesco.org/en/convention>
 UNESCO Creative Cities Network.(n.d.) Retrieved 16 February 2018 from <https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/content/about-us>
 UNESCO Creative Cities Network. (n.d.) Retrieved 17 February 2018 from https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/unesco_uccn_en_2018.pdf
 UNESCO Creative Cities Network.(n.d.) Retrieved 17 February 2018 from <https://en.unesco.org/themes/protecting-our-heritage-and-fostering-creativity>
 UNESCO Creative Cities Network. (n.d.) Retrieved 18 February 2018 from <https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/content/why-creativity-why-cities>
 UNESCO Creative Cities Network. (n.d.) Retrieved 19 February 2018 from https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/unesco_uccn_en.pdf
 UNESCO Creative Cities Network. (n.d.) Retrieved 19 March 2018 from http://www.unesco.org.tr/dokumanlar/yaratıcı_sehirler/uysabs.pdf
 UNESCO Creative Cities Network Call For Applications. (2017) Retrieved 1 April 2018 from https://en.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/2017%20UCCN%20Call_Applicant%20Handbook.pdf
 UNESCO City of Literature. Retrieved 2 April 2018 from https://www.melbourne.vic.gov.au/about-council/committees-meetings/meeting-archive/MeetingAgendaItemAttachments/103/1846/CSC_55_200712110730.pdf

UCCN Creative Cities Brochure. Retrieved 18 May 2018 from http://www.unesco.org/new/fileadmin/MULTIMEDIA/HQ/CLT/pdf/Creative_cities_brochure_en.pdf

UNESCO Creative Cities Strategic Framework. Retrieved 19 April 2018 from https://fr.unesco.org/creative-cities/sites/creative-cities/files/strategic-framework_uccn_eng_20170705_vf_no_budget.pdf

UNESCO Global Network of Learning Cities. Retrieved 9 February 2018 from <http://uil.unesco.org/lifelong-learning/learning-cities>

UNESCO Global Network of Learning Cities.(n.d.) Retrieved 10 February 2018 from <http://uil.unesco.org/lifelong-learning/learning-cities>

UNESCO.(1982). Mexico City Declaration on Cultural Policies World Conference on Cultural Policies Retrieved 21 April 2018 from http://portal.unesco.org/culture/en/files/12762/11295421661mexico_en.pdf/mexico_en.pdf (Retrieved: May 5, 2018)

UNESCO Öğrenen Kentler Küresel Ağı, 2017. Retrieved 9 February 2018 from http://www.unesco.org.tr/Content_Files/Content/Programlar/osabsunum.pdf

UNESCO Somut Olmayan Kültürel Miras Sözleşmesi (2003). Retrieved 18 February 2018 from http://www.unesco.org.tr/dokumanlar/somut_olmayan_km/SOKM_KORUNMASI.pdf

Xiaomin, C. (2017). *City of Gastronomy of UNESCO Creative Cities Network: From International Criteria to Local Practice*, in Social Systems Studies, pp. 55-67. Retrieved 20 May 2018 from <http://www.ritsumei.ac.jp/acd/re/ssrc/result/memoirs/tokusyuugou201707/tokusyuugou201707-08.pdf>

YEKON Creative Economy Atelier Report (2012). Retrieved 30 May 2018 from <http://www.yekon.org/public/yaratıcı-ekonomi-atolyesi-raporu.pdf>

YEKON Final Report (2014) Retrieved 30 May 2018 from

<http://www.yekon.org/public/tasarim-haritasi-atolyesi-raporu.pdf>

Youth4food. (n.d.) Retrieved 18 May 2018 from

<https://youth4food.wordpress.com/>

World Design Organization.(n.d.) Retrieved 4 April 2018 from

<http://wdo.org/about/history/>

Zanaatten Tasarım (n.d.) Retrieved 3 June 2018 from

<https://www.timeout.com/istanbul/tr/etkinlikler/zanaattan-tasarima>

III.Milli K lt r Őurası Sonu  Raporu. (2017). Retrieved 24 May 2018 from

<http://kultursurasi.kulturturizm.gov.tr/Eklenti/50571,raporsurasonucpdf.pdf?0>

2030 Sustainable Development Goals.(n.d.) Retrieved 23 February 2018 from

<https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/sustainable-development-goals/>

XVI Congreso Gastronmico De Papoyan.(n.d.) Retrieved 12 April 2018 from

<http://gastronomico.org.co/>

4th Istanbul Design Biennial.(n.d.) Retrieved 12 June 2018 from

<http://aschoolofschools.iksv.org/en/>