

THESIS



M. Emin Arslan

2019

Budapest Metropolitan University

THESIS

Germany-Turkey Diplomatic Crisis and German-Turks'
Media: A Macro Discourse Analysis

Supervisor:
Bódis Krisztina

Author:
M. Emin Arslan
Communication
and Media Master
Programme

Budapest
2019

Abstract

Turkey has been governed by a parliamentary system of monarchical and republican regimes for more than 150 years, has been conducting membership negotiations with the European Union for over 50 years and is a country that has been a member of NATO for more than 60 years. In 2017, the Government of Turkey took a decision to switch to a presidential system by holding a referendum and this decision has had a major impact on both domestic politics and foreign policy. The referendum process particularly caused a significant tension in bilateral relations between Turkey and Germany. This thesis aims to investigate the reasons for the differences between the perspectives of the two countries' media, the discourse of the politics and the inner aspects of the tensions between the two countries during the referendum period. In this study, 5 experts were interviewed. In the part of the discourse analysis of the media, *Der Spiegel* and *Deutsche Welle* have been taken as a source of German mainstream media. In the other step of the comparison, *TRT World* and *Daily Sabah* newspapers have been chosen as a source of discourse analysis which are parts of the mainstream Turkish media. In the research, information about the parliamentary system and the presidential system was given, as well as the analysis of the diplomatic crisis between the two countries and the analysis of the discourses. In addition, the main theories of the media's role of creating public opinion, controlling the agenda and creating perceptions have been examined. The aim of the thesis is to discover the social-political climate in the two countries and the way this climate is reflected in the media.

Key Words: referendum, discourse analysis, Germany-Turkey relations, media, politician speech

Most important sources:

DIJK, T. A.: Structures of News in the Press. In DIJK, T. A.: *Discourse and Communication*. Berlin, Germany, De Gruyter, 1985

DIJK, T. A.: *News Analysis*. New Jersey, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers, 1988

FAIRCLOUGH, N.: *Analysing Discourse Textual Analysis for Social Research*. New York, Routledge, 2003

Table of Contents

1. INTRODUCTION.....	1
2. METHODOLOGY.....	4
2.1. Research Question	4
2.2. Sampling	5
2.3. Discourse and Discourse Analysis	7
3. MEDIA THEORIES	13
4. APRIL 2017 TURKEY'S PRESIDENTIAL REFERENDUM PROCESS AND THE TURKISH-GERMAN DIPLOMATIC CRISIS	16
4.1 An Overview of the Parliamentary System and the Presidential System.....	16
4.2 Chronology of Diplomatic Crisis Between Germany and Turkey	20
4.3 Highlights in Turkish-German Relations from the Referendum to Today.....	33
5. MACRO DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF GERMAN AND TURKISH MEDIA	34
5.1 Analysis of Der Spiegel's Headlines and Leads.....	36
5.2 Analysis of Deutsche Welle's Headlines and Leads	45
5.3 Analysis of Daily Sabah's Headlines and Leads	53
5.4 Analysis of TRT World's Headlines and Leads	61
6. CONCLUSION.....	69
7. BIBLIOGRAPHY	74

1. INTRODUCTION

Turkey's Presidential Constitutional Amendment Referendum of 16 April 2017 has changed the country and its wide regions in every aspect, especially politically and economically, in a fundamental way. More than 4 million Turkish citizens residing abroad have a direct effect on the referendum. During the propaganda process, the ruling party in Turkey asked for permission to engage in propaganda in European countries with large Turkish urban populations but the authorities of these countries saw the rally as abuse of their sovereignty and tried to prevent it, in many cases quite successfully. Some leaders of European countries even called upon citizens of Turkish origin living in the country not to vote in the referendum to be held in Turkey. The issue that we address in the present thesis is not only the analysis and interpretation of the political problem between countries but also the reaction of Turkish visual and printed media to the political crises between the countries involved through publications. It is investigated how the Turkish public is directed and controlled by the media which has strong ties with politics. The other part of the thesis is to examine the reactions of German visual and printed media to the political crisis between these countries. The parallels and differences between Turkish media discourse and German media discourse are the subject of analysis including the background of media companies. In order to have a clearer idea about the research, the topic of the thesis has been limited to Germany due to the fact that this country has the biggest Turkish population in Europe.

Turks living abroad have been examined with a critical approach and reactions to the diplomatic crisis have been analyzed as they appeared in the news media. The diplomatic tension between the two countries that is based on the Turkish government's (AK Party) use of this tension in domestic politics makes the reactions of the Turks living abroad to their homeland more special and significant. During the same period, in 2017, Germany's general elections were mentioned and in the campaign period President Recep Tayyip Erdogan made his ideas clear about the German parties. He told Turkish people living in Germany which parties they should not vote for.

Due to the presence of Turkey in the accession process to the European Union, political issues in Turkey and in Europe has the potential to affect each other such as Brexit, Dutch and German

elections. Boris Johnson and other politicians who are pro-Brexit have used the following argument during the Brexit campaign in 2015: “If you vote ‘no’ in the Brexit then you will live with Turkish people in European Union”¹ The other significant political issue which partly shaped by external relations with Turkey was the Dutch general elections in March 2017. Geert Wilders' far-right Party of Freedom, who appeared at the top of the polls, lost the election to the current government because of the Dutch prime minister's act of tough intervention to prevent Turks of Dutch citizenship from welcoming the Turkish minister in Amsterdam. Mark Rutte's party gained some right-wing votes by this reaction. The third event might not seem to be directly linked to Turkey and yet it is necessary to mention it. About 4 million Turks living in Germany and the fact that Turkey was involved in the German federal elections shows the necessity of mentioning the results of the German elections. The extreme right-wing party, Alternative for Germany increased its votes by 168% compared with the 2013 general elections just after the German-Turkish diplomatic crisis that took place in March and April 2017. It got into the German Bundestag the first time. It proves how much influence Turkey and the Turkish people have on the European domestic political arena and the process of voting for an important segment of society. For this reason, the Turkish-German diplomatic tension that is analyzed in this study is a momentous issue. The integration process of the communities is also thought of playing a significant role in the understanding of the subject matter being investigated. However, considering the problems between Turkey and Germany and the results of the Turkish Constitutional Referendum, it is clear that the result of integrating the non-German population in Germany is a huge failure. Therefore, the news of Germany's most widely read news portals about the diplomatic crisis is one of the areas that was analyzed to understand the point of view of the German public which exposed the differences in the ways of thinking between Germans and German Turks. At the same time, news published during the diplomatic crisis on Turkey's most popular news portals was analyzed. During the analysis of the German and Turkish publications, it is examined how the news is presented by specific media organizations, as well as the rhetoric of Turkish and German politicians. The fact that the media is the most advanced means of influencing and controlling the public, for example through agenda setting and framing, is one of the main reasons to study the media as a significant tool to understand the

¹ BLACK, PHIL: Brexit Campaign Stirs up Fears of Turks. May 24, 2016. *CNN*.
<https://edition.cnn.com/2016/05/23/europe/turkey-brexit/index.html> Retrieval date: 01.08.2018

masses' mentality. On the other hand, one of the things that deepens the diplomatic crisis is the statements made by politicians to media organizations.

The European adventure of Turkish people started in 1962 and now has a history of more than 50 years. Nevertheless, the integration process, social, political, economic, and homeland relations of these people have not been the subject of much research. The number of academic studies on Turkey's Presidential Referendum in 2017 is even fewer. The population growth trend of the people of Turkish origin living in Europe has been blurring the borders between countries increasingly because of the globalized world. With the development of technology, Turkish population living in Europe has also been part of the political process in Turkey due to ease of transportation, increased communication speed and plenty opportunities for people to interact with each other. As a neighbouring country of the European Union and being one of the largest partners of Europe as well as the continuation of Turkey's full membership process reveal the necessity of this research. "Political legitimacy has become an integral part of international relations in the 21st century. It is impossible to implement a policy that does not stand on legitimate grounds in a globalized system. In cases where there is lack of legitimacy, crises are inevitable and the cost is often too high. International public opinion has become a key point."² Kalin's above thought about the importance of 'legitimacy and international public opinion' is the explanation of the purpose of the thesis. The Venice Commission and some EU members have also questioned the legitimacy of the referendum and that made the issue a hotly debated topic. "Turkey's actions have long been interpreted through the lens of Western perceptions as a result of Turkey's NATO membership and EU integration process. With Turkey's increasing influence on, and attention to, the Middle East, the Balkans, the Caucasus and Central Asia, the West has deemed critical its questions of how Turkey will handle its new international position. In this emerging international system, Turkey burgeoning economy, growing population and strategic geo-political location created opportunities to form new alliances that could rival Turkey's relationship with the West."³ This idea which supports that Turkey is now not only a

² KALIN, İ.: Soft Power and Public Diplomacy in Turkey. *Perceptions Journal Of International Affairs*, Volume: XVI, No:3, Autumn, 2011, pp.5-6, http://sam.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/2012/07/Autumn_2011.pdf Retrieval Date: 01.09.2018

³ KÜÇÜKCAN, T., & KÜÇÜKKELEŞ, M.: *European Perceptions of Turkish Foreign Policy*. Ankara, SETA | Foundation for Political, Economic and Social Research, No: 10, April, 2012, p.22. https://file.setav.org/Files/Pdf/20121128152200_seta-european_perceptions_of_turkish_foreign_policy.pdf Retrieval date: 01.09.2018

regional but also an international actor of politics and able to create balance in external relations is still a topic of debate in the field of international relations.

The general view in the academic world and in the media is that the media plays a key role in democracies. The media is an element of pressure on the government for the benefit of society. However, the argument that is advocated in this thesis is that the media which does not try to understand every part of society and does not build empathy will lead to polarization in society. The difference of each society's understanding of democracy is the main reason for this polarization.

2. METHODOLOGY

The methodology of this thesis is the so-called Critical Macro Discourse Analysis systematized and theorized by Teun Van Dijk. The comparison of the discourse analysis of German and Turkish media, which is one of the main elements of the thesis, was done by using the critical discourse analysis method on a macro scale. The news was analyzed using the two main tools of the macro analysis method. The headlines and lead paragraphs of various pieces of news were examined. The direct and indirect messages that the headlines and lead paragraphs of the analyzed sources wanted to transfer to the reader were determined and the political positions of these media organizations were stated. By using the inductive method, the stance of the media organizations and the structure of the communities they belong to have been inferred. The statements of politicians in the headlines and in the lead paragraphs of the news also allowed the analysis of the discourses of politicians. As a result, based on the discourse analysis of the selected media organizations, the structure of the media, the public opinion and the stance of the states were appraised.

2.1. Research Question

The thesis is a combination of 4 different topics: the German-Turkish diplomatic crisis, a parliamentary system/presidential system analysis, the review of media theories and the triangle of media, society and politics, and finally the German-Turkish media discourse analysis. Therefore, although the research question is a single question, multiple minor questions are

analyzed within the text. The main research question is as follows: How much does the discourse of the media shape society and political life?

The effect of the discourse of the media of the two countries on the diplomatic crisis is one of the specific facts which is investigated. By putting this question into focus, we can understand that ways in which the media changes the perception of any particular case through its discourse. To understand that process, a review of media theories and macro discourse analysis is needed. Besides, the discourse analysis of the German media and the Turkish media in Turkey shows the similarities and differences between the two countries' media structure. Considering that the discourse of the media is shaped according to the readers of a particular country and politics is the art of convincing and controlling people, the discourse analysis of the two countries' media contributes to making inferences about the political and social structure of these countries. The media-community-politics triad is analyzed using the macro discourse analysis method.

2.2.Sampling

Two media establishments from both the German and Turkish media were selected for the thesis. The most important factor to consider when making these selections is the national and international popularity of the selected resources. For this reason, all of the selected sources are part of the mainstream media. Another reason is that an English version of the original content of these media organizations is available. English as a global language is the dominant language of the study has provided greater accessibility to the content of this study both for the and for academics who may benefit from this study.

As a result of the combination of these factors, *Der Spiegel* and *Deutsche Welle* from the German media were selected. *Deutsche Welle*'s presence in Turkey and its publication and broadcast system in Turkish is another significant reason in the selection of this establishment.

The establishment selected from the Turkish media is *TRT*, which is the first and only radio and television broadcaster of Turkey between 1964-1993^{4,5}, and *Sabah* which is a major newspaper of the country. Both organizations have a great percentage in the domestic media market, *TRT* is the public media organ of the country, the *Daily Sabah* newspaper has great influence on

⁴ About TRT. *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/about>. Retrieval date: 04.11.2018

⁵ About TRT. *TRT*, <https://www.trt.net.tr/Kurumsal/Tarihce.aspx>. Retrieval date: 04.11.2018

society because it owns plenty of TV channels and radio stations and finally, both organizations have an English version option which is not easy to find in the Turkish media sector.

Der Spiegel is Germany's weekly political magazine with the highest circulation. The magazine, which was founded in 1947, is also one of the largest magazines in Europe. The magazine, which had a circulation of around 1.1 million in 2003, decreased to 845 thousand in 2017 due to the loss of power of the traditional media and with the development of technology and the increased use of online platforms instead of paper-based products⁶. This decline is actually not too dramatic compared to other printed newspapers and magazines in the world. *Der Spiegel* is still the leader compared with other magazines in Germany. *Der Spiegel* publishes in the liberal line and has a critical perspective. It is one of the most influential representatives of investigative journalism.

Deutsche Welle (DW) is a media company broadcasting in 30 different languages from the cities of Bonn and Berlin via radio, television and the Internet. The radio and internet service is seated in Bonn. *DW* was known as 'The Voice of Germany' during the Cold War⁷. Turkish broadcasts of the organization started on 1 July 1962. *DW* still continues to broadcast radio and Internet service in Turkish under the direction of journalist Baha Güngör. *NTV Radio*, which is one of the biggest Turkish media companies in Turkey, has a broadcasting partnership with *DW*. Recently, *NTV* has been frequently connected to the Turkish section of *Deutsche Welle* by video calling and receives news about Germany from Istanbul. In addition, other Turkish media organizations frequently consult the *Deutsche Welle* Turkish service on German and European issues.

Sabah newspaper which has Turkey's highest circulation after *Daily Hurriyet*⁸ newspaper started publication in 1985. The newspaper, which has undergone many changes over the years, has been publishing in the conservative-right line for the last 10 years. President Recep Tayyip Erdogan's son-in-law, Berat Albayrak, now the Minister of Finance and Treasury of Turkey was

⁶ About DER SPIEGEL. *EUROTOPICS* <https://www.eurotopics.net/en/148789/der-spiegel> Retrieval date: 04.11.2018

⁷ STACK, CHRISTOPH: Deutsche Welle marks 65th anniversary. June 06, 2018 *DW*. <https://www.dw.com/en/deutsche-welle-marks-65th-anniversary/a-43591961> Retrieval date: 04.11.2018

⁸ *Daily Hurriyet* is not chosen in this study due to its impractical website and lack of archives.

the General Manager of the Çalık Group which was the owner of the *Sabah* newspaper in 2007. *Sabah* newspaper is also published in Frankfurt, just like *Hürriyet*.

Turkey Radio and Television Corporation (*TRT*), was established as an autonomous legal entity by a special law. With the constitutional amendments in 1972, *TRT* was defined as a neutral state-owned entity. Television broadcasts were performed every day of the week in 1974, while publications were consumed by 55% (19 million) of the country's population and 28% of the country's surface area (210,861 km²).⁹ Today *TRT* broadcasts in Turkey and the world via 14 television stations, 14 radio channels and www.trtvotworld.com web sites in 41 languages and there are 5 magazines.

After these four selected newspapers, the date range of the news to be analyzed was also determined. The propaganda campaign for the 16 April 2017 presidential referendum was expected to start on 1-2 March 2017, and continue until the referendum day, while the diplomatic crisis continued after the referendum. Therefore, the date range was determined as from March 1 to April 17. However, due to the continuation of the crisis in bilateral relations, the President of Turkey Recep Tayyip Erdogan said to people of Turkish origin living in Germany which party they should not vote in the German federal election in 18th of August, 2017. Therefore, the news published on that date is also included in the analysis.

2.3. Discourse and Discourse Analysis

Macro (semantic) discourse analysis was used as the methodology in this thesis. According to Drabble's book, *The Oxford Companion to the English Literature*, there are several descriptions of discourse. "Discourse is a linguistic or rhetorical term with a multitude of senses, ranging from a single extended speech to the whole realm of language in practical use."¹⁰ The other definition of discourse is "In linguistics, 'discourse analysis' is a formal study of the ways in which sentences are connected into larger units of speech or writing."¹¹ In discourse studies the

⁹ About TRT. *TRT*. <https://www.trt.net.tr/Kurumsal/Tarihce.aspx> Retrieval date: 04.11.2018

¹⁰ DRABBLE, M.: *Oxford Companion to the English Literature*. Oxford, Oxford University Press, New York, USA, 2000, http://ebooks.bharathuniv.ac.in/gd1c1/gd1c4/Arts_and_Science_Books/arts/english/Literature/Books/The%20Oxford%20Companion%20To%20English%20Literature.pdf p.284 Retrieval date: 01.09.2018

¹¹ DRABBLE, M.: *Oxford Companion to the English Literature*. Oxford, Oxford University Press, New York, USA, 2000, http://ebooks.bharathuniv.ac.in/gd1c1/gd1c4/Arts_and_Science_Books/arts/english/Literature/Books/The%20Oxford%20Companion%20To%20English%20Literature.pdf p.284 Retrieval date: 01.09.2018

word discourse refers to a specific way of using language in a specific context for a specific purpose, “a cluster (or formation) of ideas, images and practices, which provide ways of talking about forms of knowledge and conduct associated with, a particular topic, social activity or institutional site in society”¹² This statement of Hall is the equivalent of discourse analysis, the main methodology of the thesis. As the author points out, the concept of discourse relates to the use of language. Social sciences have been identified as a study area.

The word ‘discourse’ began to be widely used in Western academic circles after the 1970s. According to Mills, Foucault has played a critical role in choosing the word 'discourse' instead of 'ideology'.¹³

“Discourse analysis may, broadly speaking, be defined as the study of language viewed communicatively and/or of communication viewed linguistically. Any more detailed spelling out of such a definition typically involves reference to concepts of language in use, language above or beyond the sentence, language as meaning in interaction, and language in situational and cultural context.”¹⁴ As Trappes-Lomax points out, the strong link between the concept of discourse and language makes this definition important for this research. These two important features mentioned by the authors, namely ‘language above and beyond of the sentences’ and ‘cultural context’ are important explanations of the analysis performed in the macro discourse analysis section.

“The first definition, ‘language above the sentence’, comes from linguistics, and is closer than the others to the dictionary definition quoted above, ‘a connected series of utterances, a text.’”¹⁵ Deborah Cameron and Ivan Panovic’s description was evaluated in the thesis due to politicians’ statements that are considered to be serious speeches and as such they were analyzed in the macro analysis chapter. In addition, media companies’ publications are expected to be serious pieces of writing as well. “In this general sense, it incorporates both the spoken and written

¹² HALL, S.: *Representation: Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices*. London, UK, SAGE Publications, 1997, p.6

¹³ DALDAL, ASLI: Power and Ideology in Michel Foucault and Antonio Gramsci: A Comparative Analysis. *Review of History and Political Science*, American Research Institute for Policy Development, Vol:2, No:2, June, 2014, p.165

¹⁴ TRAPPES-LOMAX, H.: Discourse Analysis. In DAVIES, A. & ELDER, C.(EDS): *The Handbook of Applied Linguistics*. Oxford, United Kingdom, Blackwell Publishing Ltd., 2004, p. 134.

¹⁵ CAMERON, D. & PANOVIC, I.: *Working with Written Discourse*. SAGE, Los Angeles, USA, March 01, 2014 p.4 <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/af85/feda714d0be81a543d6c9896a4bfbad928d8.pdf> Retrieval date: 13.04.2019

modes although, at times, it is confined to speech being designated as ‘a serious conversation between people’ (ibid). This restriction is also implied in the word when it is used as a verb.”¹⁶ “Language and ideological system are concepts which interact and effectuate each other in a circular structure. Whereas symbolic order is enunciated through language in significations of ideology, analysis of discourse which is formed by usage of language presents data to understand dynamics of social order. Discourse plays a crucial role in formations of ideologies and social power is reproduced by discourse. Discourse provides a starting point for uncovering the content and strategies which are the constituents of the structure of media texts, especially news as a narrative form.”¹⁷ The link between language and ideology established by Karaduman, the relationship between discourse analysis and social structure, and the fact that discourse analysis reveal the meaning of the sentences of the media proves that the right methodology of this study is discourse analysis. The purpose of examining the headline and lead paragraphs of the news is to find out what the sentences actually mean like Karaduman and Trappes-Lomax pointed out. “The term discourse – in what is widely called ‘discourse analysis’ – signals the particular view of language in use – as an element of social life which is closely interconnected with other elements. But, again, the term can be used in a particular as well as a general, abstract way.”¹⁸ Fairclough, one of the most important representatives of the concept of Discourse Analysis, emphasized that this concept is closely connected with social life. This shows that the discourse analysis of the media is consistent with the understanding of Fairclough if the media is accepted as a significant part of a social life. Van Dijk, defined the concept of Discourse Analysis more specifically: “Discourse may be described at various levels of *structure*. These structures are variously accounted for in for example syntax, semantics, stylistics and rhetoric as well as in the study of specific genres such as those of argumentation and story telling.”¹⁹ Teun Van Dijk's, who is the founder of the critical discourse analysis, definition of discourse is prominent because it explains the content of the discourse analysis. Van Dijk's descriptions form a roadmap for the research methodology of the thesis. According

¹⁶ DRID, T.: Discourse Analysis: Key Concepts and Perspectives. *ResearchGate*, No:1, January, 2010, pp. 20-21. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/282184078_DISCOURSE_ANALYSIS_KEY_CONCEPTS_AND_PERSPECTIVES Retrieval date: 02.08.2018

¹⁷ KARADUMAN, S.: Perspective and Contribution of Critical Discourse Analysis to Critical News Research. *Maltepe Üniversitesi İletişim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 2017, December 01, p. 32, <http://dergipark.gov.tr/download/article-file/386936> Retrieval date: 03.08.2018

¹⁸ FAIRCLOUGH, N.: *Analysing Discourse Textual Analysis for Social Research*. New York, Routledge. 2003, p.3.

¹⁹ DIJK, T. V.: *Discourse as Interaction in Society*. Thousand Oaks, CA, US, SAGE Publications, 1997. p.2

to the same book by Van Dijk, discourse have other dimensions as well which are practical, social and cultural phenomenon. “To Fairclough and other critically minded discourse analysts, discourse is not only a product or reflection of social processes but is itself seen to contribute towards to production (or reproduction) of these processes.”²⁰ As it can be seen in this sentence in which Teo summarizes the quotations of other researchers, discourse analysis is not only concerned with the outcome of events but also how it contributes to events.

“Discourse analysis is the systematic study of naturally occurring (not hypothetical) communication in the broadest sense, at the level of meaning (rather than as physical acts or features.”²¹ In addition to a definition of the concept of discourse, it is important to know what fields it is related to. “What distinguishes discourse analysis from sentence grammars is that discourse analysis in practice focuses specifically on phenomena beyond the sentence. Obviously, uttered words or sentences are integral parts of discourse. Since, empirically speaking, the meaning of discourse is a cognitive structure, it makes sense to include in the concept of discourse not only observable verbal or non- verbal features, or social interaction and speech acts, but also the cognitive representations and strategies involved during the production or comprehension of discourse.”²² In the above, Van Dijk elaborated on the connection to the discourse analysis concept by analyzing the way to speak a language, the words used, and the actual meaning of the sentences. In this way, the limits of what can be done in the macro discourse analysis section are drawn.

Foucault's discourse definition argues that the concept of discourse is much more than words and speeches such as Van Dijk's and Fairclough's definitions. “Of course, discourses are composed of signs; but what they do is more than use these signs to designate things. It is this more than renders them irreducible to the language (*langue*) and to speech. It is this ‘more’ that we must reveal and describe.”²³

²⁰ TEO, P.: Racism in the News: A Critical Discourse Analysis of News Reporting in Two Australian Newspapers. *Discourse & Society*, Thousand Oaks, CA, US, SAGE Publications, Vol. 11, No. 1, 2000, p. 11. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/240705919_Racism_in_the_News_A_Critical_Discourse_Analysis_of_News_Reportin Retrieval date: 02.09.2018

²¹ BAVELAS, J., KENWOOD B. C., PHILLIPS, B.: Discourse Analysis. In KNAPP, M., DALY J. (Eds.): *Handbook of Interpersonal Communication*. Thousand Oaks, CA. SAGE Publications, 3rd ed, 2011, p.102 <http://web.uvic.ca/psych/bavelas/2002discourse.pdf> Retrieval date: 01.09.2018

²² DIJK, T. A.: Social Cognition and Discourse. In GILES, H. & W. ROBINSON (Eds.): *Handbook of Language and Social Psychology*. Hoboken, New Jersey, US, John Wiley & Sons Ltd., 1990. pp. 163-164.

²³ FOCAULT, M.: *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. Paris, France, Éditions Gallimard, 1969, p.38

»The starting point is a concern with the role of power and knowledge in society, identifying patterns of language, demonstrating how they constitute aspects of society and establishing how and why the language available to us sets limits on what it is (and is not) possible to think, say and do (Shaw & Bailey, 2009)«²⁴ »At the macro-level, the analyst considers intertextual relationships, trying to understand the broad, societal currents that are influencing the text being studied (Fairclough, 1989) «²⁵ This thought cited by Eghlidi describes the content of the Macro Discourse Analysis. This definition corresponds to the definition of the discourse of other authors who are mentioned above. As Fairclough pointed out, macro analysis aims to understand the event in general.

Critical discourse analysis is a form of discourse analysis which was elaborated by Van Dijk. According to Wodak, 'critical' means not taking things for granted, opening up complexity, challenging reductionism, dogmatism and dichotomies and through these processes, making opaque structures of power relations and ideologies manifest. ""Critical", thus, does not imply the common sense meaning of "being negative"—rather "skeptical"». ²⁶ "It is an interdisciplinary approach that investigates questions like how and why the interaction in society created the textual structure." ²⁷ According to Van Dijk, critical discourse analysis should take macro and micro structures separately. At the top of the macro structure there is a headline, followed by the lead input, located at the top of the macro structure. According to Van Dijk, the most important element in thematic analysis is the hierarchical structures. "These are; top title, title, subtitle, spot, lead paragraph, news, stories, events." ²⁸ In schematic analysis, contingency and interpretations are given, while story or plot structure is evaluated. Information about contingency is given. The date of the news, the way the news is handled, the background and

²⁴ SHAW, S. & BAILEY, J.: Discourse Analysis: What Is It and Why Is It Relevant to Family Practice? cited by: EGHLIDI, M.: Critical Discourse Analysis of 'People's Son' Story: A Micro and Macro-Levels Analysis. *Journal of Applied Linguistics and Language Research*, Volume 3, No: 5, 2016, p. 58.

²⁵ FAIRCLOUGH, N.: Language and Power. London, Longman, 1989 cited by: EGHLIDI, M.: Critical Discourse Analysis of 'People's Son' Story: A Micro and Macro-Levels Analysis. *Journal of Applied Linguistics and Language Research*, Volume 3, No: 5, 2016, p. 58.

²⁶ KENDALL, G.: What Is Critical Discourse Analysis? May, 2007. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, <http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/viewArticle/255/561> Retrieval date: 01.11.2018

²⁷ WIDUNA, I. A.: The Function of CDA in Media Discourse Studies. *Journal of English Educators Society*, No:3(1), 2018, April 04, p.119 https://www.researchgate.net/publication/324251628_The_Function_of_CDA_in_Media_Discourse_Studies Retrieval date: 02.09.2018

²⁸ DIJK, T. V: *Macrostructures: An Interdisciplinary Study of Global Structures*. Hillsdale, New Jersey, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers, 1980, pp.26-27

the information about the field are discussed. “By the thematic structure of a discourse, we understand the overall organization of global topics a news item is about. Such a thematic analysis takes place against the background of a theory of semantic macrostructures. These are the formal representation of the global content of a text or dialogue, and therefore characterize part of the meaning of a text.”²⁹ Macrostructure, as mentioned above, is the main part of the methodology used in the thesis. This method, which is dominated by the qualitative method, aims to understand the general theme of the research topic and each chapter’s topics. “The interpretation stage reveals the hidden power relations and the purpose of this stage is to establish whether the verbal cues in the text contain certain assumptions or other hidden elements that are not obvious at a first glance.”³⁰ The direct and indirect meanings of the sentences were examined while examining the headlines and lead paragraphs of the news selected from the German and Turkish media. “Without a theory of macrostructures we would be unable to account for the special properties of headlines and leads, which subjectively summarize the rest of the news report. Because topics have such an important role, and since topical (macrostructural) analysis can also be applied to larger corpora, I usually recommend starting with such an analysis. It provides a first, overall, idea of what a discourse or corpus of texts is all about and controls many other aspects of discourse and its analysis.”³¹ »And finally, macrostructures explain why most readers usually only remember the main toposes, that is, the higher levels of the macrostructure of a news report (Hóijer & Findahl, 1984; van Dijk, 1987e).«³² This quote shows that the headlines and the lead paragraphs in the macro analysis section of the study can explain the general belief of a society about a specific issue.

²⁹ DIJK, T. A.: *Structures of News in the Press*. In DIJK, T. A.: *Discourse and Communication*. Berlin, Germany, De Gruyter, 1985, p. 69.

³⁰ FAIRCLOUGH, N.: *Language and Power*. Longman, London, UK. 1989, p.129

³¹ DIJK, T. V. Multidisciplinary CDA: a Plea for Diversity. In WODAK, R. & MEYER, M. (Eds.): *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis*. London, Thousand Oaks, New Delhi, SAGE Publications, 2001, p. 102

³² HÓIJER, B. & FINDAHL, O.: *Nyheter, firsidelse, och minne*. Stockholm, Studentlitteratur, cited by: DIJK, T. A.: *News Analysis*. New Jersey, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers, 1988, p.14

3. MEDIA THEORIES

Following a review of the literature on the concepts of discourse, discourse analysis and critical discourse analysis, the following review of media theories is to clarify the position of the media and its place in society. It seemed necessary to include media theories due to the analysis of the media's discourse and the way politicians use the media, as well as how the media compiles, collects and edits the political statements. Interpretive Journalism, Agenda Setting, Framing, Encoding/Decoding and Propaganda Model were included to the thesis.

»The interpretive style empowers journalists by giving them more control over the news message. [...] The descriptive style places the journalist in the role of an observer. The interpretive style requires the journalist to act also as an analyst. The journalist is thus positioned to give shape to the news in a way the descriptive style does not allow. (Patterson, 2000a: 250)

«³³ It is shown by Patterson that interpretive journalism has features different from the descriptive style such as comments and implications. In addition to this, responsibilities of an interpretive reporter involve informing the public and widening the masses' view by stating the background and a possible effect of a fact. However, interpretive journalism is a "risk" for the journalist. Journalists' tendency to understand the background of the issue and report it as a whole to the audience could be "a danger" for power holders. That is why a journalist must be ready for any kind of accusation and action.

»Journalists appear as experts in studio interviews, or as commentators interpreting political reality to their audience. Taking on the role of ombudsmen of the public, journalists advocate the presumed interests and needs of the public/audience. (Djerf-Pierre and Weibull, 2008: 209)

«³⁴ The authors of this research explained the key points of interpretive journalism and mentioned some of German media companies such as Bild. To this end, this article has suggested not only a non-normative conceptualization of interpretive journalism, but also variables that can be used to investigate the extent to which news journalism is interpretive. The

³³ PATTERSON, T.: The United States: News in a Free-market Society. 2000, cited by: SALGADO, S., & STRÖMBÄCK, J.: Interpretive Journalism: A Review of Concepts, Operationalizations and Key Findings. *Journalism*, No:2, February 01, 2012, p. 146.

³⁴ DJERF-PIERRE, M. & WEIBULL, L.: From Public Educator to Interpreting Ombudsman. Regimes of Political Journalism in Swedish Public Service Broadcasting, 1925–2005, 2008, cited by: SALGADO, S., & STRÖMBÄCK, J.: Interpretive Journalism: A Review of Concepts, Operationalizations and Key Findings. *Journalism*, No:2, February 01, 2012, p. 146

concept of interpretive journalism that the authors have explained in their study and the necessity and negative sides of it are very beneficial for this thesis in terms of the analysis of media companies' way of making the news that has been analyzed in the thesis.

“While the mass media may have little influence on the direction or intensity of attitudes, it is hypothesized that the mass media set the agenda for each political campaign, influencing the salience of attitudes toward the political issues.”³⁵ This work by McCombs and Shaw has been one of the most valuable works in the field of media theories and has been cited thousands of times. The theory, which was introduced by these two who introduced the concept of agenda setting and defined it as a function of the mass media, maintains that the most important effect of the mass media is to intellectually set an order and organize the world for us. According to this approach, the media has no power and influence on what to think, but what to think about.

“Public opinion often depends on how elites choose to frame issues. For example, citizens’ opinions about a Ku Klux Klan rally may depend on whether elites frame the event as a free-speech issue or a public safety issue.”³⁶ Framing is another important media theory. This theory is strongly connected with the agenda setting theory. The strength or perceived persuasiveness of a given frame is not the same as its effectiveness or influence on individuals’ opinions, because effectiveness depends on the context in which frames are encountered. “Agenda setting [sic] looks on story selection as a determinant of public perceptions of issue importance and, indirectly through priming, evaluations of political leaders. Framing focuses not on which topics or issues are selected for coverage by the news media, but instead on the particular ways those issues are presented.”³⁷ As Price and Tewksbury noted above, agenda settings and framing are similar to each other, although framing has sharper lines. “Some authors, led by Maxwell McCombs, have argued that framing is equivalent to the second level of the agenda-setting

³⁵ MCCOMBS, M. E., & SHAW, D. L.: The Agenda-Setting Function of Mass Media. *The Public Opinion Quarterly*, Vol. 36, No. 2, 1972, p. 177. https://www.academia.edu/13123517/The_Agenda-Setting_Function_of_Mass_Media Retrieval date: 03.08.2018

³⁶ CHONG, D., & DRUCKMAN, J. N.: A Theory of Framing and Opinion Formation in Competitive Elite Environments. Framing in Discourse. *Journal of Communication*, Evanston, US, 2007, p. 99. <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/0291/fc2e4262a979e3bd4d485b4c2ba0763c946c.pdf> Retrieval date: 03.08.2018

³⁷ PRICE, V., & TEWKSBURY, D.: News Values and Public Opinion: A Theoretical Account of Media Priming and Framing. *Progress in the Communication Sciences*, Vol:13, New York, US, ABLEX, 1997, p. 184. https://www.researchgate.net/profile/David_Tewksbury/publication/304834087_News_values_and_public_opinion_A_theoretical_account_of_media_priming_and_framing/links/577681dc08ae4645d60d7a4e/News-values-and-public-opinion-A-theoretical-account-of-media-priming-and-framing.pdf?origin=publication_detail Retrieval date: 03.08.2018

theory, and have proposed the integration of both models. McCombs, Llamas, López-Escobar and Rey considered that framing is a natural extension of the agenda-setting model.”³⁸

Another media theory that we need to consider is encoding / decoding. “This model has been criticized for its linearity – sender/message/receiver – for its concentration on the level of message exchange and for the absence of a structured conception of the different moments as a complex structure of relations.”³⁹ This is a theory that argues against readers and listeners passively accepting what they read or hear is true. Yet readers and listeners are actively interpreting the media content and accept as truth what makes sense for them. Cultural background and experience play an important role in interpreting media content by the reader / audience. For instance, the great numbers of German and Dutch citizens of Turkish descent showed negative reactions to the countries they were part of during the diplomatic tension. But not everybody. Nevertheless, the social events in these countries and the influence of the Turkish and German media on these events are within the thesis field.

Another work that is considered as a source is the Propaganda Model, which is the work of Noam Chomsky and Edward Herman. The propaganda model focuses on the inequality of wealth and power and its multilevel effects on mass-media interests and choices. It traces the routes by which money and power are able to filter out the news fit to print, marginalize dissent, and allow the government and dominant private interests to get their messages across to the public. “The essential ingredients of our propaganda model, or set of news “filters,” fall under the following headings: (1) the size, concentrated ownership, owner wealth, and profit orientation of the dominant mass-media firms; (2) advertising as the primary income source of the mass media; (3) the reliance of the media on information provided by government, business; (4) “flak” as a means of disciplining the media; and (5) “anticommunism” (*Today, the argument of anticomunism has been replaced by arguments of Islamophobia and anti-immigration.*) as a national religion and control mechanism. These elements interact with and reinforce one

³⁸ ARDÈVOL-ABREU, A.: Framing Theory in Communication Research. Origins, Development and Current Situation in Spain. *Revista Latina de Comunicación Social*. 2015. No:70, p.426 https://www.researchgate.net/publication/282843054_Framing_theory_in_communication_research_Origins_development_and_current_situation_in_Spain Retrieval date: 03.08.2018

³⁹ HALL, S.: Encoding/Decoding. In DURHAM, M. G. & KELLNER, D. (Eds.): *Media and Cultural Studies*. Malden, MA, USA, Blackwell Publishing Ltd., 2006, p.165

another.”⁴⁰ The materials that are meant to be explained in this long quote show that it is necessary to use this theory in the thesis because it has entered the social sciences literature and has become one of its main theories. The thesis is very strongly tied with the propaganda model due to its proximity to politics. The discourse of the politicians, the positions of the two countries during the diplomatic crisis, the voices of dissidents and the accusation of the ruling wing and claims are in the field of this unique theory created by Noam Chomsky and Herman.

4. APRIL 2017 TURKEY'S PRESIDENTIAL REFERENDUM PROCESS AND THE TURKISH-GERMAN DIPLOMATIC CRISIS

4.1 An Overview of the Parliamentary System and the Presidential System

The Turkish nation was governed by a monarch for centuries. However, as Europe underwent a transformation following the 1789 French Revolution, the wind of transformation also hit the Ottoman Empire. New concepts such as freedom, nationalism, free will of the people were welcomed in societies and certain states such as France, the British Empire, the Ottoman Empire, etc. began to change in many ways. In the Ottoman Empire, in 1876, the Constitutional Monarchy was declared as a result of a revolution with legislative authority in the parliament and the executive power vested in the king. The establishment of the Republic of Turkey and the collapse of the Ottoman Empire took place through the announcement of a parliamentary system. In other words, the concept of the parliamentary regime, which entered Turkish political life in 1876, continued its existence until the April 2017 Referendum, even if it was attacked dozens of times in about 150 years.^{41,42,43}

⁴⁰ HERMAN, E., & CHOMSKY, N.: A Propaganda Model In Manufacturing Consent: The Political Economy of the Mass Media. In DURHAM, M. G., KELLNER, D. (Eds): *Media and Cultural Studies*. Malden, MA, USA, Blackwell Publishing Ltd., 2006. p 257

⁴¹ PIKE, JOHN: 1980 – *Evren Coup*, July 30, 2013. GlobalSecurity, <https://www.globalsecurity.org/military/world/europe/tu-military-coup-1980.htm> Retrieval date: 01.11.2018

⁴² PIKE, JOHN: 1971 – *Communique Coup*. July 30, 2013. GlobalSecurity, <https://www.globalsecurity.org/military/world/europe/tu-military-coup-1971.htm> Retrieval date: 01.11.2018

⁴³ DEWDNEY, J. & YAPP, MALCOLM: *The Military Coup of 1960*. Encyclopedia Britannica, <https://www.britannica.com/place/Turkey/The-military-coup-of-1960> Retrieval date: 01.11.2018

In a parliamentary system, the legislative, executive and judiciary are three separate powers. The legislative duty of the state's most exalted institution belongs to the Grand National Assembly of Turkey. The executive duty belongs to the President who has symbolic authority and the Prime Minister/the Council of Ministers who have executive powers. The judiciary duty belongs to the judges and prosecutors. The Assembly has the power to monitor the Prime Minister and the Council of Ministers. Governments have to get a vote of confidence from the assembly to be established. The ministers have to answer (verbally or in a written form) to the questions of the deputies. Deputies have the right to interpellation to ministers or the government. The President's bailiwick is limited and represents the integrity of the state. "Parliamentary government is the form of constitutional democracy in which the executive emerges from the legislature and is responsible to it."⁴⁴

Turkey adopted a model different from the above and accepted it by referendum on April 16, 2017. "The duties of the prime minister would be subsumed under the office of the president, and the prime ministry would be abolished, transforming the parliamentary system into a presidential one. Unlike under the current system, the president would not have to be neutral—above politics and representing the whole nation."⁴⁵

According to *Daily Sabah*, people who run the YES campaign, the campaign held by Erdogan's party in order to ensure the success of "Yes" in the referendum, "Voters may respond by not electing many deputies from the President's party. Even if members of a given political party control the Presidency and have a majority in Parliament, it will be the people's decision."⁴⁶

In addition, with the presidential system, parliamentary elections will be reformed. Elections for the Grand National Assembly of Turkey and the Presidency shall be held on the same day in every five years. A deputy whose term of office expires is eligible for re-election.

"He/she gives message to the Assembly about domestic and foreign policy of the country. He/she appoints and dismisses Vice-Presidents and ministers. He/she appoints and dismisses

⁴⁴ TURAN, D. D.: Parliamentarism or Presidentialism? *Ankara University Journal*, No:1, 1993 p.155 <http://dergiler.ankara.edu.tr/dergiler/42/454/5148.pdf> Retrieval date: 03.08.2018

⁴⁵ K. K., EKIM, S: *The Turkish Constitutional Referendum, Explained*. Washington DC., US, The Brookings Institution, April 13, 2017. p.2 <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/order-from-chaos/2017/04/13/the-turkish-constitutional-referendum-explained/> Retrieval date: 03.08.2018

⁴⁶ DAILY SABAH CENTRE FOR POLICY STUDIES: *The 2017 Constitutional Referendum in Turkey*. Istanbul, Daily Sabah Centre for Policy Studies. No:1 2017, Istanbul, p.16

high level State officials, and regulates the procedures and principles relating to the appointment of these, by presidential decrees. He/she determines the national security policies and takes the necessary measures.”⁴⁷

“The 2017 amendment not only ensured the transition to a presidential system, but also weakened the position of the parliament vis-à-vis the executive by abolishing some of its powers and changing others, thus ending the checks and balances role of the legislature.”⁴⁸ For example granting veto power to the President of the Republic.

Another issue, which has been widely debated and is still being debated, is the influence of the President on the judiciary. Three members of the Constitutional Court are appointed by the Assembly and 12 members are appointed by the President.⁴⁹ The Venice Commission report prepared for the April 16 referendum was protested by Turkey. The Prime Minister of the period, Binali Yıldırım, stated that the report prepared by the Venice Commission was political.⁵⁰ Opponents of Erdogan support the idea that the new system will allow the president to elect 12 of the 15 members of the Constitutional Court, giving the president undue power over one of the branches of state, violating the principle of separation of powers. However, the ‘yes’ block supports that it is technically impossible for a single president to pick each and every member of the Constitutional Court, as they will be elected for a term of 12 years and the president will serve no longer than 10 years. Additionally, as court members will serve at different intervals, it is impossible for a single president to pick each member before he or she leaves office. However, the main objection of the people who are against the change of the constitution is not the numerical rate or working time of the elected judges but the fact that it is thought that the judiciary will be politicized because the president can be an active member of a political party.

⁴⁷ Constitution of The Republic of Turkey Article 104 (As amended on January 21, 2017; Act No. 6771) Ankara, p.49

⁴⁸ YAZICI, S. : Constitutional Amendments of 2017: Transition to Presidentialism in Turkey. *Hauser Global Law School Program, New York University School of Law*, New York, US, October 2017, p.2, http://www.nyulawglobal.org/globalex/2017_Turkey_Constitution_Amendments.html Retrieval date: 04.09.2018

⁴⁹ Venice Commission: *Unofficial Translation of the Amendments to the Constitution*. Venice, Italy, Council of Europe, 2017.

⁵⁰ UÇRAK, UTKU: Yıldırım: Venedik Komisyonu'nun Raporu Siyasi, Herkes Haddini Bilsin. [Yıldırım: The Report of Venice Commision is Political. Everyone Must Know Their Line.] March 14, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703141027635584-binali-yildirim-venedik-komisyonu-raporu/> Retrieval date: 03.09.2018

The section that approved and defended the constitutional amendment does not share the thoughts of the no-bloc and they look at the case from a different perspective. Namely “The executive and the legislative branches will become stronger in the system of executive presidency. In this regard, the likelihood of government crises stemming from political designs through interwoven executive and legislative bodies, ambiguity, double-headedness of the system, and the expectations of favoritism will diminish.”⁵¹

In other words, the fundamental differences in views of the two blocks are linked to judicial independence, over-authorization anxiety and the health of democracy. According to opponents of presidential system with the presidential government system, the parliament becomes de facto dysfunctional. This would damage democracy. “As a result of my research, it is understood that the political stability problem in Turkey doesn’t result from the current government system. The case in point cannot be solved by the change of the government system and application of the presidential system in Turkey would lead to dangerous consequences.”⁵²

According to the ruling party and, of course, the yes-block, this system is a system in which the separation of powers is much more precise. “The AKP’s official referendum campaign—as run by the party leaders and supported by Erdoğan—highlighted a number of issues. A presidential system would alleviate the uncertainties associated with the parliamentary system.”⁵³ As a result of the changes, Turkey has brought the stability of governing to the forefront and left behind the coalition discussions. Turkish politics, which gained the opportunity to make fast decisions, also accelerated the economic development of the country. Since the president is elected by the people and received the permission and authorization directly from the people, this is a schema that the people want to see. It is also the desire and wish of the people that the majority of The Great Assembly belongs to the president’s party, and this shows the strength of democracy.

⁵¹ GÜLENER, S.: Constitutional Framework of Executive Presidency In Turkey. *SETA*, No:29, 2017, p. 29. <https://setav.org/en/assets/uploads/2017/04/ExecutivePresidency.pdf> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

⁵² GÖNDER, H.: Presidential System and Its Applicability to Turkey. *Bilecik Şeyh Edebali University Journal of Social Sciences Institute*, 2017, Vol:2, No:1, May 23, p. 170.

⁵³ ESEN, B., & GÜMÜŞÇÜ, Ş.: A Small Yes for Presidentialism: The Turkish Constitutional Referendum of April 2017. *South European Society and Politics*, Vol:22, No:3, 2017, October 11, p. 5 <http://yoksis.bilkent.edu.tr/pdf/files/13125.pdf>, Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

4.2 Chronology of Diplomatic Crisis Between Germany and Turkey

From the start of Turkey's European Union membership process in 1963 until the beginning of 2000s Germany supported Turkey to join the European Union and was the spokesman of Turkey within the European Union. The AK Party government that came to power in 2002 and the German Chancellor Angela Merkel maintained this traditionally good relationship for a long time. There are almost 3 million people of Turkish origin in Germany⁵⁴, there is extensive trade between the two countries, as of 2017, Turkey's largest export partner is Germany, and Turkey is member of the NATO. These are some of the reasons for these two countries to conduct good relations. "In the long-run, Germany's relationship with Turkey could be even more fraught than the country's relationship with Russia — not least because there are around 2.9 million Germans of Turkish origin, of whom 1.5 million residents hold Turkish passports. Germany's need for good relations with Turkey was further underlined by the "refugee deal" to control flows of migrants from Syria that Germany struck with the government of President Erdogan."⁵⁵

Due to the Syrian Civil War, the problem of the refugee crisis reached its peak and Germany holding a leading position in the European Union started to work closely with the Turkish government for the purpose of keeping refugees in Turkey. Merkel visited Turkey many times.⁵⁶ A refugee agreement was signed between the European Union and Turkey led by Merkel. According to this agreement, the European Union provides 6 billion euros and Turkey maintains Syrian refugees in the country. In return, Turkey will be made part of the Schengen area.⁵⁷ Nowadays, the requirements of this agreement are still not met. Turkey has used the refugee treaties against Germany and other European Union countries as a diplomatic trump card.⁵⁸ "For

⁵⁴ AYDIN, YASAR: The German-Turkey Migration Corridor; Refitting Policies For a Transnational Age. *Transatlantic Council on Migration*, February, 2016, <https://www.migrationpolicy.org/research/germany-turkey-migration-corridor-refitting-policies-transnational-age> Retrieval date: 03.09.2018

⁵⁵ RACHMAN, G.: Multilateralism in One Country: The Isolation of Merkel's Germany. *Transatlantic Academy*, No:6, April, 2017, p.5, <http://www.gmfus.org/publications/multilateralism-one-country-isolation-merkels-germany> Retrieval date: 06.08.2018

⁵⁶ KAYNAK, M.: Merkel Türkiye'de. [Merkel is in Turkey] Feb 02, 2017. DW <https://www.dw.com/tr/merkel-t%C3%BCrk%C3%BCyede/a-37379969> Retrieval date: 03.09.2018

⁵⁷ For the text of the agreement, see "EU-Turkey statement," European Council, March 18, 2016, <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/press/press-releases/2016/03/18/eu-turkey-statement/>

⁵⁸ BBC: Erdoğan'dan AB'ye mülteci krizi tepkisi: Alnımızda enayı yazmıyoruz. [Erdogan's response to the EU about refugee crisis: We are not fool.] BBC https://www.bbc.com/turkce/haberler/2016/02/160211_erdogan_omer_celik_multeciler_aciklama Feb 11, 2016. Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

the European Union, there is a short- and long-term calculus. Reliant as they are on Turkey for its acceptance of a huge burden of Syrian migrants, the evidence is that European leaders, from Merkel to May, are all too aware of how dependent they are on Erdogan right now. If they liberalize the visa situation for Turks, future migration may well come from many of those who will be voting against the proposals on 16 April.”⁵⁹ Angela Merkel has never supported Turkey’s full membership to the European Union but has embraced the idea of a privileged partnership.⁶⁰⁶¹ This has led to a fragility in the two countries’ relations.

The reason for the first big tension was the acceptance of the ‘Armenian Genocide’⁶² law in the German Parliament. The law draft presented by Cem Ozdemir, a person of Turkish origin and the co-leader of the Green Party was overwhelmingly accepted in the vote which Angela Merkel did not attend.⁶³ Due to the fact that the German Empire was an ally of the Ottoman Empire in World War I, Germany’s act was evaluated as conflicting behavior and was seen as a cyclical political act by Turkey. Even if Angela Merkel emphasized the strong relations with Turkey after the acceptance of the law, Tayyip Erdogan stated that relationship with Germany would seriously be affected due to the law.⁶⁴ In addition, Recep Tayyip Erdogan accused German politicians of Turkish descent as being of “dirty blood” and “extension of terrorist organization”

⁵⁹ KISSANE, B.: What is at Stake in the Turkish Constitutional Referendum? *The Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions*, Oxford, UK, No:1, 2017, p. 6. http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/72835/1/Kissane_What%20is%20at%20stake%20in%20the%20Turkish%20constitutional%20referendum_published_2017%20LSERO.pdf Retrieval date: 05.08.2018

⁶⁰ ROBINSON L.: Turkey Will Never Become EU Member, Says Angela Merkel. Sep 03, 2017, *The Independent*, <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/turkey-german-chancellor-angela-merkel-eu-member-president-recep-erdogan-nato-a7927861.html> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

⁶¹ SAHIN, T.: Turkey’s EU Relations During Angela Merkel’s Rule as Chancellor. Oct 18, 2017, *TRT WORLD* <https://www.trtworld.com/turkey/turkey-s-eu-relations-during-angela-merkel-s-rule-as-chancellor-11452> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

⁶² Armenian Genocide: Turkey calls it the ‘So-called Armenian Genocide.’ It is the name given to the death of 1.5 million Armenians as a result of the ‘Relocation (Immigration) Law’ of 1915 introduced by the Ottoman Empire’s ruling party called Ittihad and Terakki. Turkey argues that the number of casualties was much lower and there was no extermination in a systematic way. Turks also died during this migration and this claim must be studied by historians. Armenians, on the other hand, have lobbied to the world’s states in order to make them accept the genocide allegations.

⁶³ SMALE, A.: German Parliament Recognizes Armenian Genocide, Angering Turkey. June 02, 2016, *NY TIMES*, <https://www.nytimes.com/2016/06/03/world/europe/armenian-genocide-germany-turkey.html> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

⁶⁴ BBC: Almanya Parlamentosu 'Soykırım Tasarısı'nı Onayladı. [German Bundestag has approved the Armenian Genocide Law.] June 02, 2016, *BBCTURKCE*, https://www.bbc.com/turkce/haberler/2016/06/160602_almanya_soykirim_oylama Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

because of voting for the law.⁶⁵ This led to major debates in the German Republic. *Kanal D* which is one of Turkey's largest national broadcaster terminated its more than 10-year old partnership with the German channel *ZDF* after these events.

Another problem was that the Turkish government did not allow German authorities to visit the Incirlik Air Base. Three weeks after the acceptance of the Armenian Genocide Law, German Defense Ministry Deputy Secretary, Ralf Brauksiep wanted to visit the Incirlik Air Base in Adana, Turkey and also the NATO base. However, Turkey did not allow it because of the Armenian Genocide Law.⁶⁶ This case had a great impact on the German public and caused controversy.⁶⁷ The Turkish officials of the ruling political party stated that the presence of German soldiers as a part of the international coalition against ISIS in Incirlik was wrong. A few days later, German Defense Minister Ursula von der Leyen visited the Incirlik Base without journalists.⁶⁸ But tensions with Turkey and the German public debate were not over. Following the visit of the German minister on 1 July 2016, German MPs visited the Incirlik base in October as well.⁶⁹ However, due to the coup attempt of 15 July, Turkey started to feel a great distrust towards Germany and prohibited visits to Incirlik again. The problems between the two countries continued to grow after a failed coup attempt, and Turkey prohibited the German Parliament visiting the NATO military base in the city of Konya for the same way as it had been in İncirlik. Permission could be obtained after Germany asked NATO authorities to mediate.⁷⁰

⁶⁵ BULBUL, Y.: Erdoğan: Bunların Kanı Testten Geçirilmeli. [Their blood should be tested.] June 05, 2016, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201606051023175147-erdogan-almanya-soykirim-kan-testi/> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

⁶⁶ ALTAN, A.: Türkiye ile Almanya Arasında İncirlik Krizi. [Incirlik crisis between Germany and Turkey.] June 23, 2016, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/tr/t%C3%BCrkkiye-ile-almanya-aras%C4%B1nda-incirlik-krizi/a-19349465> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

⁶⁷ ERIKAN, I.: Alman Siyasetçilerden İncirlik Tepkisi: Hesaplanmış Provokasyon. [Incirlik Response from German Politicians: Planned provocation.] June 23, 2016, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201606231023518798-almanya-turkiye-incirlik-tepki/> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

⁶⁸ TINAZAY, T.: İncirlik Izni Alamayan Almanya'nın Bu Kez Savunma Bakanı Geliyor. [This time Germany's the Minister of Defense is coming where could not get permission of Incirlik.] June 26, 2016, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/savunma/201606261023566546-incirlik-izin-almanya-savunma-bakani-leyen/> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

⁶⁹ SCHWARZ, T.: İncirlik'i Ziyaret Eden Alman Vekil: Ankara'nın Tavrı Misafirperver Değildi. [A MP who visited Incirlik: Ankara's attitude was not hospitable.] Oct 06, 2016, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201610061025172817-incirlik-ziyaret-almanya-turkiye/> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

⁷⁰ BEKTAS, Ü.: Alman Vekil Konya'daki NATO Üssü'ne Yaptığı Ziyareti Anlattı. [German MP described his visiting to NATO Base in Konya.] Sep 10, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201709101030074803-alman-vekil-konya-nato-ziyareti-anlatti/> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

At the end of this incident, the German Parliament moved its troops to Jordan which is not a NATO member.⁷¹

The third hit on the Turkish-Germany relationship was much more serious than the previous events, i.e. the event of escaping of suspected people to Germany after the 15th of July the coup attempt. Many people thought to be members of the Gulenist movement that is considered a terrorist organization called FETÖ in Turkey fled to Germany and Germany met very harsh reactions by Turkey due to accepting these people to the country.⁷² “Relations deteriorated further in the aftermath of the 15 July 2016 failed coup attempt in Turkey. Ankara complained that European leaders were too slow in condemning the coup and its perpetrators. While Merkel clearly excoriated the coup attempt and emphasized the urgent need to re-establish the rule of law in Turkey.”⁷³ After the allegations which came to light in December 2016 that imams of the Turkish-Islamic Union of Religious Affairs (DITIB), which is under the rule of German NGO laws working in Germany, were collecting pieces of information about Gulenists in Germany and shared that with the Turkish intelligence and other official institutions of Turkey, Ankara-related espionage allegations in Germany appeared.⁷⁴⁷⁵ The statement of the Organization for the Protection of the Constitution in March 2017 reported a striking increase in the Turkish government's intelligence activities in Germany. Chief of Intelligence, Hans-Georg Maaßen stated that monitoring of people who were opposed to President Erdogan, trying to influence them and propaganda and disinformation campaigns were among the activities directed by Ankara.⁷⁶ Discussions became more intense with the emergence of a list of over 300 people and

⁷¹ OZBEK, C.: Almanya İçin İncirlik'in Alternatif Neden Ürdün? [Why Incirlik's alternative is Jordan for Germany?] June 05, 2017, DW, <https://www.dw.com/tr/almanya-i%C3%A7in-incipirlikin-alternatif-neden-%C3%BCrd%C3%BCn/a-39116467> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

⁷² SCF.: Erdogan's Aide: Germany Backs Gülen Movement, Trump Administration Works on Gülen's Extradition. March 19, 2017. STOCKHOLMCF, <https://stockholmcf.org/erdogans-aide-germany-backs-gulen-movement-trump-administration-works-on-gulens-extradition/> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

⁷³ PAUL , A., & SCHMIDT, J.: Turkey's relations with Germany and the EU: Breaking the Vicious Circle. *European Policy Centre*, No:1, October 2, 2017. p. 2 http://www.epc.eu/documents/uploads/pub_7973_turkey-germany-eu.pdf Retrieval date: 07.08.2018

⁷⁴ DW TURKCE: DİTİB'e Casusluk Suçlaması Genişliyor. [The Espionage charges are expanding.] Feb 03, 2017, DW, <https://www.dw.com/tr/ditibe-casusluk-su%C3%A7lamas%C4%B1-ge%C5%9Fliyor/a-37405085> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

⁷⁵ DW TURKCE: İstihbarat: 13 DİTİB İmami Gülen Yanlılarını İhbar Etti. [Intelligence: 13 DİTİB Imams informed against Gulenists.] Feb 09, 2017, DW, <https://www.dw.com/tr/istihbarat-13-ditib-imam%C4%B1-g%C3%BCn%C4%9Fliyor/a-37484914> Retrieval Date: 06.09.2018

⁷⁶ BBC: Turkey 'Spied' On pro-Gulen Opponents in Germany. March 28, 2017, BBC. <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-39416954> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

over 200 organizations considered to be involved in the Gulenist Movement. The list was given by Turkish Intelligence Chief Hakan Fidan to German Foreign Intelligence Service BND's leader Bruno Kahl at the Munich Security Conference in February. Today, however, the German government still does not accept that FETÖ is the responsible for the coup. The president of the Organization for Protection of the Constitution (BFV), Hans-Georg Maassen declared that not only did they not believe that FETÖ was the responsible for the coup but also no organization did believe it either except Turkey.⁷⁷ The list of suspect members of FETÖ in Germany was given to German authorities, yet the German authorities warned the people in the list against Turkish intelligence rather than working in coordination with Turkish intelligence. "Germany also approved asylum for two high-ranking Turkish generals wanted by Turkey for alleged involvement in the coup attempt, a decision that stirred further recriminations in Ankara."⁷⁸ There were also some risk factors for Germany that did not stand by Turkey after the failed coup attempt. It was very important for Germany to keep the refugee crisis away from the European Union. The anti-democratic behaviours of Turkey according to the German Government created a dilemma for Germany due to the necessity to cooperate with Turkey. "Finally, there is the challenge posed by Erdogan's Turkey. Merkel is uncomfortably dependent on the increasingly erratic and dictatorial Turkish president to control the flow of refugees into the EU. The large number of Germans of Turkish origin also makes relations with Turkey a highly sensitive domestic issue. And yet Merkel cannot ignore the erosion of human rights and press freedom in Turkey — or the flow of offensive insults the Turkish government has directed towards Berlin."⁷⁹

Another issue that deeply harmed diplomatic relations between Germany and Turkey was the arrest of Deniz Yücel who is a German-Turkish citizen and a reporter on Turkish affairs of *Die Welt* which is one of Germany's most important newspapers, due to 'spreading terrorist

⁷⁷ AFP: Germany To Investigate Claims of 'Intolerable' Spying by Turkey. March 28, 2017, *The Guardian*. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/mar/28/germany-accuses-turkey-of-intolerable-spying-on-gulen-supporters> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

⁷⁸ EPPEL, A.: Making Sense of Rising German-Turkish Tensions. *Istituto Affari Internazionali (IAI)*, No: 17|08 August, 2017, p. 4, <http://www.iai.it/sites/default/files/iaicom1708.pdf> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

⁷⁹ RACHMAN, G.: Multilateralism in One Country: The Isolation of Merkel's Germany. *Transatlantic Academy*, No:6, April, 2017, p. 9, <http://www.gmfus.org/publications/multilateralism-one-country-isolation-merkels-germany>, Retrieval date: 06.08.2018

propaganda' and 'incitement to hatred and enmity' claims.⁸⁰ Journalist Yücel was detained after he went to the police station in Istanbul to testify to the investigating teams about the news that he published about hacker attacks on Minister of Energy Berat Albayrak's private email address. This event was a heavy blow on the relationship between the two countries and Turkey's prestige in the world. The arrest of a Turkish-German citizen journalist was perceived as an attack on the freedom of press in Germany, other EU countries and in the United States as well, and Turkey came under pressure in the diplomatic field.⁸¹⁸² Deniz Yucel stayed in prison for 1 year and 20 days. Erdogan also commented on this event in person. On 14 February 2017, President Recep Tayyip Erdogan said on Tgrt TV: "Deniz Yucel will not be extradited. He will not be released in any condition as long as I'm in this position"⁸³ And he argued that Yucel was a spy and a terrorist.⁸⁴ German Chancellor Angela Merkel demanded from President Recep Tayyip Erdogan to release the detained journalist Deniz Yucel.⁸⁵⁸⁶ However, this demand was not fulfilled while the issue of visiting the Incirlik Base became even more problematic. German Foreign Minister Sigmar Gabriel said that the prisoner Deniz Yucel, *Die Welt*'s journalist is Turkey's 'hostage'.⁸⁷ Gabriel said that they could use economic and diplomatic tools to have him released. Gabriel pointed out that President Recep Tayyip Erdogan will be shown less attention

⁸⁰ Reuters: Journalist for German Newspaper Arrested in Turkey. Feb 27, 2017, *The Guardian*, <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/feb/27/journalist-for-german-newspaper-arrested-in-turkey> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

⁸¹ SHAHEEN, K.: 'Assault on Freedom of Expression': Die Welt Journalist's Arrest in Turkey Condemned. Feb 28, 2017, *The Guardian*, <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/feb/28/formal-arrest-of-die-welt-journalist-deniz-yucel-in-turkey-condemned-german> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

⁸² GALL, C.: Turkey's Effort to Repair Relations Trips Over Its Crackdown. Feb 16, 2018, *NY TIMES*, <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/02/16/world/europe/deniz-yucel-germany-turkey.html> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

⁸³ BURACK, C.: Erdogan Rules Out Releasing German-Turkish Journalist Yucel 'As Long As I Am In Power'. April 14, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/erdogan-rules-out-releasing-german-turkish-journalist-yucel-as-long-as-i-am-in-power/a-38424975> Retrieval date: 10.09.2018

⁸⁴ GRUNAU, A.: How Deniz Yücel's Year in Prison Affects German-Turkish Relations. Feb 14, 2018, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/how-deniz-y%C3%BCcel-s-year-in-prison-affects-german-turkish-relations/a-42555983> Retrieval date: 10.09.2018

⁸⁵ SCF: German Chancellor Merkel Meets with Wife of Jailed Turkish Journalist Deniz Yücel. Oct 25, 2017, *STOCKHOLMCF*, <https://stockholmcf.org/german-chancellor-merkel-meets-with-wife-of-jailed-turkish-journalist-deniz-yucel/> Retrieval date: 10.09.2018

⁸⁶ HUGGLER, J.: Merkel Demands Turkey Release Arrested German Journalist Amid Pressure over Erdogan Visit. March 02, 2017, *The Telegraph*, <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2017/03/02/merkel-demands-turkey-release-arrested-german-journalist-amid/> Retrieval date: 10.09.2018

⁸⁷ SCHINDLER, K.: Erdogan Hoped to Swap Journalist Yucel for Generals Fled to Germany After Coup. July 20, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://sputniknews.com/middleeast/201707201055715697-turkey-germany-journalist-exchange-soup/> Retrieval date: 10.09.2018

in the future and said "For a long time we tried to show a reasonable attitude towards him, sometimes it is better not to consider too much of him.". ⁸⁸

One year after Deniz Yucel's arrest, Prime Minister of the Republic of Turkey, Binali Yildirim met his German counterpart Angela Merkel in Germany and offered positive messages about Yucel at a joint press conference. Deniz Yucel was released just 1 day after this meeting. ⁸⁹ After the releasing of Yucel, it is appeared that the German government gave approval to 31 agreements related to the export of weapons to Turkey between December 18, 2017 and January 24, 2018. ⁹⁰ ⁹¹

Five months after the July 15, 2016 failed coup attempt, Turkey started to discuss the presidential system on the agenda through the proposal of the opposition Nationalist Movement Party (MHP) leader, Devlet Bahceli. "The 'Yes' bloc was primarily composed of the ruling AKP and the ultra-nationalist MHP with some support from a few fringe parties, namely the ultra-nationalist Islamist BBP (Büyük Birlik Partisi - Great Unity Party) and the Kurdish-Islamist Hüda-Par (Hür-Dava Partisi - Free Cause Party)"⁹². Because of the total number of deputies of the ruling AK Party and the Nationalist Movement Party are not enough to make a constitutional amendment bill in the Turkey Great National Assembly with the biggest opposition party Republican People's Party and the People's Democratic Party representing Kurds against this constitutional change, the proposal was taken to a referendum. The

⁸⁸ SCF: German FM Gabriel Says Journalist Deniz Yücel is Turkey's Hostage. Aug 18, 2017, STOCKHOLMCF, <https://stockholmcf.org/german-fm-gabriel-says-journalist-deniz-yucel-is-turkeys-hostage/> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

⁸⁹ ALTAN, A.: Yıldırım: I hope that Deniz Yucel will be free as soon as possible. Feb14, 2018, SPUTNIKNEWS. <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201802141032245437-binali-yildirim-angela-merkel-deniz-yucel/> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

⁹⁰ DW TURKCE: Yücel'in Tahliyesi Oncesi Türkiye'yle Silah Anlaşmalarına Onay. [Approved of arms agreement before release of Yucel.] Feb 23, 2018, DW, <https://www.dw.com/tr/v%C3%BCcelin-tahliyesi-%C3%B6ncesit%C3%BCrkiyeyle-silah-anla%C5%9Fmalar%C4%B1na-onay/a-42721295> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

⁹¹ BIA: Deniz Yucel: I Don't Want Freedom by Favor of Dirty Deal. Jan 17, 2018, BIANET, <https://bianet.org/english/human-rights/193388-deniz-yucel-i-don-t-want-freedom-by-favor-of-dirty-deal> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

⁹² ESEN, B., & GÜMÜŞÇÜ, Ş.: A Small Yes for Presidentialism: The Turkish Constitutional Referendum of April 2017. *South European Society and Politics*, Vol. 22, No: 3 October 11, 2017, pp.306 <http://yoksis.bilkent.edu.tr/pdf/files/13125.pdf> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

propaganda process of the referendum which was agreed to be done on April 16, 2017, brought diplomatic relations between Germany and Turkey to the breaking point.⁹³

Following the adoption of the referendum on the constitutional amendment, the high-level officials of the AK Party wanted to conduct propaganda work in various European cities. The fact that 1.5 million of the more than 3 million people of Turkish origin in Germany have the right to vote in the referendum made it important to convince these people to use the yes vote for the AK Party. But the crisis of genocide law with Germany, the crisis of access to military bases, the crisis of 15 July, and finally the arrest of Deniz Yucel caused Recep Tayyip Erdogan and other party officials to be seen as unwanted persons in Germany. For this reason, the AK Party officials' propaganda programmes prompted a big discussion whether to approve or decline rallies in Germany. Only the President of the AK Party and Prime Minister Binali Yildirim had a rally, but even this rally created an outrage in Germany.⁹⁴ In his statement to the *Kölner Stadt-Anzeiger* daily, Rainer Schmelzter, the Minister of Integration in the State of North Rhine-Westphalia, said that if President Erdogan held a rally in the province, the State Government should forbid it.⁹⁵ Sahra Wagenknecht, Left Party Federal Parliamentary Group Head, saying that Merkel must prevent the rallies of Turks, stated that the rally was a continuation of German Chancellor Merkel's gesture that was bowing down to Turkey's President Erdogan. Wagenknecht emphasized that Germany needed to make efforts to release the dissidents arrested in Turkey, journalists and the detained correspondent of *Die Welt* newspaper, Deniz Yucel, instead of this. Green Party Co-Chairperson Cem Ozdemir told the *Saarbrücker Zeitung* that the Social Democratic Party (SPD) and the Christian Unity Parties (CDU / CSU) had called for measures against Erdogan supporters. Internal Party spokesperson, Stephan Meyer (CSU), speaking to the *Bild* newspaper, argued that the arrest of Deniz Yucel

⁹³ AFP: German Politicians Line Up Against 'Anti-Democratic' Turkish Referendum Campaign. March 03, 2017. *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/german-politicians-line-up-against-anti-democratic-turkish-referendum-campaign/a-37797622> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

⁹⁴ DW TURKCE: Alman Siyasetçilerden Oberhausen Mitingine Tepki. [Reacts to the Oberhusen Rally from German Politicians.] Feb 19, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/tr/alman-siyaset%C3%A7ilerden-oberhausen-mitingine-tepki/a-37622860> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

⁹⁵ Dw TURKCE: Almanya'da Erdoğan Endişesi. [Erdogan concern in Germany.] Feb 20, 2017. *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/tr/almanyada-erdo%C4%9Fan-endi%C5%9Fesi/a-37628075> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

was an arbitrary practice, and said that a president who would allow such a thing should not come to Germany.

Then, in Germany, the Minister of Justice Bozdag's speech about the referendum was canceled due to lack of infrastructure⁹⁶ and the municipality did not provide a hall for the event that Economy Minister Nihat Zeybekci would attend in Cologne, Germany.⁹⁷ "I say very clearly, it cannot be explained by democracy. Karayilan [the leader of PKK terrorist organization] who is head of terrorists in Germany were allowed to express his thoughts. Terrorists have the right to express themselves, but a minister of a democratic country is not allowed to express his views."⁹⁸, said by Bekir Bozdag. Economy Minister Nihat Zeybekci found another hall after that and even said that "It's the time of the war. Victory belongs to Allah".⁹⁹ However, the event's hall reservation made by Minister of Economy Nihat Zeybekci was canceled by the company operating in the Frechen district near Cologne. Speaking about the cancellation of the event in which the Minister of Justice Bekir Bozdag would speak about the referendum in Germany, German Foreign Minister Sigmar Gabriel said that decision-making authority belonged to local administrations and the federal government and state governments were not authorized to decide on the event whether a meeting is a risk to public safety or not.¹⁰⁰ In his speech, Gabriel also stated that the arrest of Deniz Yucel was unlawful. On the same day, Minister of Justice Bekir Bozdag replied to Gabriel and stated that these decisions were scandalous and that the municipality had exceeded its decision-making power.¹⁰¹ Merkel recalled the arrest of *Die Welt* reporter Deniz Yucel in continuation of her speech "I think it is our right to criticize restrictions

⁹⁶ AFP: Turkey Summons German Ambassador Over Rally Cancellations. March 02, 2017, *DW*, Retrieval date: 07.09.2018 <https://www.dw.com/en/turkey-summons-german-ambassador-over-rally-cancellations/a-37782761> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

⁹⁷ AFP: Third German Town Cancels Turkish Referendum Rally Amid Yucel Spat. March 03, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/third-german-town-cancels-turkish-referendum-rally-amid-yucel-spat/a-37803173> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

⁹⁸ CORUM S.: Almanya'dan Bozdağ ve Zeybekci'ye Miting Engeli. [Rally Barriers from Germany to Bozdağ and Zeybekci,] March 02, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201703021027462308-almanya-gaggenau-bekir-bozdag/> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

⁹⁹ FRASER, S.: Turkish Minister: German 'Deep State' Working Against Vote. March 03, 2017, *AP*, <https://www.businessinsider.com/ap-turkish-minister-german-deep-state-working-against-vote-2017-3> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

¹⁰⁰ AFP: Turkish PM Says Merkel Talk 'Productive,' But Spat Goes On. March 04, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/turkish-pm-says-merkel-talk-productive-but-spat-goes-on/a-37809998> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

¹⁰¹ KARADENIZ, T.: Turkey Accuses Germany of Double Standards Over Meeting Cancellation. March 03, 2017, *The Star*, <https://www.thestar.com.my/news/world/2017/03/03/turkey-accuses-germany-of-double-standards-over-meeting-cancellation/> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

on freedom of the press.¹⁰²¹⁰³ German Justice Minister Heiko Maas wrote to Bozdağ and stated that he was disappointed that the bilateral meeting had not taken place by citing Bozdag's cancellation of his bilateral meeting with his German counterpart.¹⁰⁴ In his letter, he criticized the arrest of *Die Welt* reporter Deniz Yucel and drew attention — just like Merkel and Gabriel — to the disproportionate decision of the arrest warrant.¹⁰⁵ Turkish Foreign Minister Mevlut Cavusoglu stated that if Germany wanted to work with Turkey they should learn how to behave towards Turkey.¹⁰⁶ Reacting to the cancellation of activities in Germany, President Erdogan said, "They don't allow my ministers. They're blocking me from attending a video-conference rally. But they connect Cemil Bayik there from Kandil." and described the arrested *Die Welt* reporter Deniz Yucel as a 'German agent'.¹⁰⁷ Erdogan made a statement and said that Germany's practices did not differ from the past Nazi practices.¹⁰⁸ Subsequently, there were many reactions to the Turkish government.¹⁰⁹¹¹⁰¹¹¹ During these events, the German intelligence said that the

¹⁰² SPUTNIK: Berlin, Ankara Clash Over Arrests in Turkey and Rally Cancellation in Germany. March 03, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://sputniknews.com/europe/201703031051244045-berlin-ankara-erdogan-clash/> Retrieval date: 29.10.2018

¹⁰³ AP: Germany's Merkel Rejects Turkish Criticism After Meeting Bans. March 03, 2017, *RFERL*, <https://www.rferl.org/a/turkey-germany-double-standards-bozdag/28344947.html> Retrieval date: 29.10.2018

¹⁰⁴ ANADOLU AGENCY: Adalet Bakanı Bozdağ, Alman mevkidaşıyla randevusunu iptal etti. [Justice Minister Bozdag canceled his appointment with his German counterpart] March 04, 2017. *SPUTNIKNEWS* <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703041027488236-adalet-bakani-bozdag-alman-mevkidasi/>, Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

¹⁰⁵ KARADENIZ, T.: Turkey Accuses Germany of Providing Succor to Its Enemies. March 03, 2017, *REUTERS*, <https://uk.reuters.com/article/uk-turkey-security-germany/turkey-accuses-germany-of-providing-succor-to-its-enemies-idUKKBN16A1F1> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

¹⁰⁶ AFP: Turkey's Cavusoglu accuses Germany of 'systematic antagonism'. March 07, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/turkeys-cavusoglu-accuses-germany-of-systematic-antagonism/a-37841018> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

¹⁰⁷ AFP: Erdogan says Yucel was a PKK plant with German support. March 03, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/erdogan-says-yucel-was-a-pkk-plant-with-german-support/a-37806928> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

¹⁰⁸ BULBUL, Y.: Erdoğan'dan Merkel'e: Nazi Uygulaması Yapıyorsun. [From Erdogan to Merkel: You are doing Nazi Practise.] March 19, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703191027704266-erdogan-ilim-yayma-vakfi/> Retrieval date: 29.10.2018

¹⁰⁹ BENSCH F.: Almanya Dışişleri Bakanlığı: Erdoğan'ın Deniz Yücel Hakkındaki Açıklamaları Mesnetsiz. [German Foreign Ministry: Erdogan's accusations to Deniz Yucel are meaningless,] March 04, 2019, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201703041027488948-almanya-disileri-bakanligi-erdogan-mesnetsiz/> Retrieval date: 29.10.2018

¹¹⁰ TSUNO, Y.: Hollanda Başbakanı Rutte: Erdoğan, Nazi İfadesiyle Cizgiyi Fazlasıyla Aştı. [Dutch Prime Minister Rutte: Erdogan surpassed the line with Nazi expressions.] March 11, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201703111027593667-rutte-erdogan-nazi-cizgiyi-asti/> Retrieval date: 29.10.2018

¹¹¹ AP: Denmark Warns Turkish PM to Postpone Visit As Germany Mulls Legal Options. March 12, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/denmark-warns-turkish-pm-to-postpone-visit-as-germany-mulls-legal-options/a-37911650> Retrieval date: 29.10.2018

increase of Turkey's espionage activities on German soil had created even more tension between the two countries. The *Bild* newspaper sent a message to Turkish nationals living in the country by making full-page news with the headline "Atatürk would say no" in March 27, 2017.¹¹²

"To receive the support of the diaspora voters, the AKP government organized rallies in number of European countries, most of which cancelled the events due to security concerns. Meanwhile, the Dutch government denied access to Turkey's Foreign Minister, Çavuşoğlu, and declared the Minister of Family and Social Affairs Fatma Betül Sayan Kaya *persona non grata* after expelling her to Germany along with her aides, when she tried to enter the country via the German-Dutch border."¹¹³ "These conflicting pressures make it extremely hard for the Merkel government to strike the balance between the national interest and the support of fundamental values. However, public opinion in Germany means that no Berlin government can afford to look like it is being pushed around by Erdogan. That means that Merkel cannot be seen to make compromises on fundamental values to appease Erdogan."¹¹⁴

The crisis that spread to the Netherlands continued to grow and Dutch Prime Minister Mark Rutte opposed the Turkish ministers' coming to Holland for campaigning and also declared that they did not want a rally in Rotterdam.¹¹⁵ However, Turkish Foreign Minister Mevlut Cavusoglu stated that he would not bow to racists and fascists while emphasized his coming.¹¹⁶

This crisis between the Netherlands and Turkey was even more crucial because it coincided with the general elections in the Netherlands. Dutch politics became completely unified and stood up

¹¹² TM: German daily Bild says Atatürk Would Vote 'No' In Referendum If He Were Alive. March 27, 2017, TURKISHMINUTE, <https://www.turkishminute.com/2017/03/27/german-daily-bild-says-ataturk-vote-no-referendum-alive/> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

¹¹³ ESEN, B., & GÜMÜŞÇÜ, Ş.: A Small Yes for Presidentialism: The Turkish Constitutional Referendum of April 2017. *South European Society and Politics*, Vol:22, No:3, 2017, October 11, p.308, <http://yoksis.bilkent.edu.tr/pdf/files/13125.pdf> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

¹¹⁴ RACHMAN, G.: Multilateralism in One Country: The Isolation of Merkel's Germany. *Transatlantic Academy*, No:6, April, 2017, p. 9. <http://www.gmfus.org/publications/multilateralism-one-country-isolation-merkels-germany>, Retrieval date: 06.08.2018

¹¹⁵ AFP: Turkey Hits Out As Netherlands Blocks Foreign Minister's Flight. March 11, 2017, DW, <https://www.dw.com/en/turkey-hits-out-as-netherlands-blocks-foreign-ministers-flight/a-37903534> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

¹¹⁶ AP: Turkey's Foreign Minister Vows Revenge After Netherlands Turn Away Plane. March 11, 2017, DW, <https://www.dw.com/en/turkeys-foreign-minister-vows-revenge-after-netherlands-turn-away-plane/a-37906966> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

against Turkey's wish to do the campaign in the Netherlands. After these developments, Tayyip Erdogan said that the Netherlands was a Nazi remnant and fascist and also claimed that the feeding of terrorists would come back to the Netherlands negatively.¹¹⁷ With this statement, Erdogan had made a Nazi analogy to another NATO ally and EU member state. After this statement Angela Merkel stated that the Nazi analogies had to stop.¹¹⁸ Turkish Foreign Minister Cavusoglu said that Turkey did not accuse the German government being Nazi but the German press and the public called Erdogan a dictator and added that these practices of Germany against the Turkish government had not been seen since the Nazi period.¹¹⁹ Cavusoglu clearly referred to the right-wing Geert Wilders as a Nazi.¹²⁰ German Foreign Minister Sigmar Gabriel declared after the rally crisis that the Nazi analogy was a red line that should not be exceeded. In response, Cavusoglu stated that the pressure of Germany against Turkish citizens and systematic opposition to Turkey would not be suitable for friendship between the two countries.¹²¹ He also stated that Germany should not attempt to lecture on issues such as democracy and human rights to Turkey.¹²²

The European Commission urged Turkey to refrain from excessive rhetoric and action which may make the situation worse with the Netherlands and other EU countries.¹²³ Afterward, Minister of Foreign Affairs Mevlut Cavusoglu spoke to Becky Anderson from *CNN*. He

¹¹⁷ AYDIN, E.: Erdogan: Nazizmin Almanya'da Bittiğini Zannediyordum, Meğer Devam Ediyormuş. [Erdogan: I thought that Nazism was over in Germany. However, it still continues.] March 05, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703051027499796-erdogan-almanya-nazizm/> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

¹¹⁸ BENSCH, F.: Merkel'den Türkiye'ye: Bu Provokasyon Yarısında Yer Almaya Niyetim Yok. [Merkel to Turkey: I do not intent to be in this race of provocation.] March 17, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201703171027679419-merkel-bu-provokasyon-yarisinda-yer-almaya-niyetim-yok/> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

¹¹⁹ AKTAS, M.: Çavuşoğlu: Yönetime Nazi Demiyoruz, Uygulama O Döneme Benziyor. [Çavuşoğlu: We do not call Nazi to administration. However the practise seems like that era.] March 09, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703091027558900-cavusoglu-almanya-nazi-uygulama/> Retrieval date 30.10.2018

¹²⁰ AKTAS, M.: Çavuşoğlu: Bizde Hollanda'daki Gibi Faşist Bir Hükümet Yok. [Çavuşoğlu: We do not have a fascist government like in Holland.] March 13, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703131027613124-cavusoglu-hollanda-fasist/> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

¹²¹ AFP: Germany's Gabriel Hopes to Rebuild Turkish Friendship, Without Nazi Comparisons. March 08, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/germany-s-gabriel-hopes-to-rebuild-turkish-friendship-without-nazi-comparisons/a-37847691> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

¹²² ANADOLU AGENCY: Dışişleri Bakanı Çavuşoğlu'ndan Almanya ve Hollanda'ya Tepki. [Response from Foreign Minister Çavuşoğlu to Holland and Germany.] March 05, 2017, *HABERTURK*, <https://www.haberturk.com/dunya/haber/1414590-disisleri-bakani-cavusoglundan-almanya-ve-hollandaya-tepki> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

¹²³ CHAN, S.: E.U. Warns Turkey in Escalating Dispute Over Constitutional Referendum. March 13, 2017, *NY TIMES*, <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/03/13/world/europe/eu-turkey.html> Retrieval date: 20.10.2018

evaluated the crisis with the Netherlands. "I'm the minister of foreign affairs of Turkey, not a terrorist" said Cavusoglu.¹²⁴ Turkish Family and Social Policy Minister Betul Kaya, who was declared persona non grata by the Netherlands and who was deported to Germany after being detained said that if she would not receive an order from the president that she should now return to Ankara, she would die there and not leave from there.¹²⁵ The minister also said that all these cancellations and obstacles were done because Turkey was getting more powerful.¹²⁶

At the referendum held on 16 April 2017, 'yes' votes won by 51.41%. 'Yes' collected 25 million 157 thousand vote. The gap between 'yes' and 'no' was only 1.3 million. So this means that approximately 650 thousand more people voted 'yes'. That is why the will of the voters living abroad had a direct impact on the results of the referendum. The results in Germany, the Netherlands, and Austria where Turkey experienced most problems during the referendum process were critical. The total number of Turkish voters in Germany is 1,429,492. The total number of votes was 660,666. The participation rate was 46,22% which is about 30% more than at the 2015 elections. 412,139 people approved the constitutional amendments which is 63,07%. 241,353 people disapproved the changes which is 36,93%. The total number of Turkish voters in the Netherlands is 252,680. In the Netherlands, about 83 thousand yes votes were recorded as opposed to 33 thousand 'no' votes. This means yes by 71%.¹²⁷

The fact that while half of Turkey did not approve of the constitutional change but the rate of approval is about 70% in Europe, shows that the diplomatic crisis had mobilized people living

¹²⁴ ANDERSON, B.: Turkish Foreign Minister Addresses Controversy. March 13, 2017, *CNN*, <https://edition.cnn.com/videos/world/2017/03/13/tensions-rise-between-turkey-and-the-netherlands.cnn> Retrieval date: 20.10.2018

¹²⁵ ÖZKAN, B.: Bakan Kaya: Cumhurbaşkanımız 'Artık donebilirsin' Demeseydi, Orada Ölecektim. [Minister Kaya: I would die there if our president would not tell me 'you may come home'.] March 14, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703141027619833-bakankaya-cumhurbaskanimiz-artik-donebilirsin-olecektim/> Retrieval date: 20.10.2018

¹²⁶ SCF: Minister Kaya Says Dared to Die in Netherlands, Returned Upon Erdogan's Call. March 14, 2017, *STOCKHOLMCF*, <https://stockholmcf.org/minister-kaya-says-dared-to-die-in-netherlands-returned-upon-erdogans-call/> Retrieval date: 20.10.2018

¹²⁷ BREITENBACH, D.: Why many Turks in Germany voted 'yes' in Erdogan's referendum. April 18, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/why-many-turks-in-germany-voted-yes-in-erdogans-referendum/a-38472130> Retrieval date: 20.10.2018

abroad to vote 'yes' rather than not to vote because of the tensions with the European Union, Germany, the Netherlands, the Venice Commission, and other international factors.¹²⁸

4.3 Highlights in Turkish-German Relations from the Referendum to Today

The diplomatic relations deteriorated due to various events and that constituted a crisis during the referendum process and it continued after the referendum as well. After the election, Erdogan indicated that.¹²⁹

Deputy Chairman of the Union of European Turkish Democrats (UETD), Fatih Zingal stated that people who lived in Germany and approved the reforms in Turkey chose to be silent due to their fear of pressure and social exclusion and that such a situation might negatively affect their work. The German public in this process took a more sensitive attitude towards Turkey and Turks.¹³⁰ They now want to remove the dual citizenship rights of the Turks and end the accession negotiations.¹³¹ Throughout the process, German Foreign Minister Sigmar Gabriel stated that they showed a lot of patience to Turkey and claimed that Turkey was moving away from the European Union and NATO values.¹³² The Presidential Office stated that Turkey strongly condemns Gabriel's explanation.¹³³ According to Kenan Kolat, who has been representative of

¹²⁸ IZGI, A.: 'Hollanda ile kriz AK Parti seçmenini 'Evet'e yöneltti'. [The crisis with the Netherlands led the AK Party voter to vote yes.] March 25, 2017, SPUTNIKNEWS, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/analiz/201703251027796692-hollanda-ile-kriz-akparti-secmenini-evete-yoneltti/> Retrieval date: 20.10.2018

¹²⁹ SEZER, M.: Erdoğan: Merkel'in Henüz Aramaması Suçluluk Psikolojisi. [Erdogan: The reason for Merkel not to call me to congratulate is the psychology of guilt.] April 20, 2017, SPUTNIKNEWS, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201704201028154763-erdogan-merkelin-henuz-aramamasi-sucluluk-psikolojisi/> Retrieval date: 25.10.2018

¹³⁰ ALDEMIR, H.: Referandum, Almanları ve Türkleri Nasıl Etkiledi? [How did the referendum affect Germans and Turks?] April 21, 2017. SPUTNIKNEWS. <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201704211028181380-referandum-almanlari-ve-turkleri-nasil-etkiledi/> Retrieval date: 25.10.2018

¹³¹ SCHMIDT, A.: Almanlar Türklerle Çifte Vatandaşlığın İptalini İstiyor. [The Germans wants to cancel the dual citizenship right of Turks.] April 21, 2017, SPUTNIKNEWS, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201704211028171840-almanlar-turklere-cifte-vatandasligin-iptalini-istiyor/> Retrieval date: 25.10.2018

¹³² BENSCH, F.: Almanya Dışişleri: Türkiye'ye Çok Sabır Gösterdik. [German Foreign Ministry: We Showed too much Patience to Turkey.] July 20, 2017. SPUTNIKNEWS, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201707201029362403-almanya-disisleri-turkiye-almanya-sabir/> Retrieval date: 25.10.2018

¹³³ GURUN, E.: Cumhurbaşkanlığı: Almanya'nın Açıklamalarını Şiddetle Kınıyoruz. [Presidency: We strongly condemn Germany's statements] July 20, 2017. SPUTNIKNEWS.

Turkey's main opposition party since 2002¹³⁴, anti-Turk sentiments and opposition to Turkey had been growing in Germany and that it was becoming a real Turcophobia. President of UETD, Zafer Sirakaya stated that Turks were seen as patients who needed treatment.¹³⁵

5. MACRO DISCOURSE ANALYSIS OF GERMAN AND TURKISH MEDIA

In this section, the news headlines of *Der Spiegel*, *Deutsche Welle*, *Daily Sabah* and *TRT World* media organizations are examined. The news pieces are from between March 2, 2017 and August 29, 2017. This date range was selected due to the referendum held on April 16, 2017 and diplomatic crisis between Turkey and Germany happened in March. The reason for the review of the news headline in August was the continuation of the effects of the diplomatic crisis created by the referendum. *Der Spiegel* has 16 news items during this date range regarding Turkey's referendum process. 15 of this 16 pieces were selected. The sixteenth one was seen less important than the rest. *Deutsche Welle* has 151 pieces of news during this period regarding Turkey. However, 82 pieces are directly related to the referendum process. 15 of this 82 pieces were selected. The reason for the selection of these 15 items is that some of them are opinion articles and the rest contain statements of politicians during the events of the crisis. *Daily Sabah* has 58 pieces about the tension with Germany and some other European countries. 23 of these items were not selected. 15 news items are selected from the remaining 35 news because they contain the evaluation of the process by the newspaper and also politicians' statements. *TRT World* has 17 news pieces during this period regarding Turkey's referendum process. 15 of these 17 pieces of news were selected. Since none of the listed media organizations are in paper format, no information can be given about the page of headlines. These four media organizations presented statements by politicians in a form of news to the reader on the same day of the speech.

»Undoubtedly, the most prominent feature of news discourse is the headlines. They subjectively

<https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201707201029365390-ibrahim-kalin-almanya-tepki/> Retrieval date: 25.10.2018

¹³⁴ About Kenan Kolat: Board of Directors. http://chpberlin.de/site_multi/index.php/tr-tr/10-turkce/62-yonetim-kurulu Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

¹³⁵ SUDAGEZER, E.: 'Almanya'daki Türkler 'Erdoğanı Mısın' Diye Sorgulanır Hale Geldi' [The Turks in Germany were started to questioned by asking a question 'are you supporter of Erdogan?'] July 27, 2017. *SPUTNIKNEWS*. <https://tr.sputniknews.com/columnists/201707271029458479-almanya-turkiye-erdogan-sorgulanir-hale-geldi/> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

express the most important information of the text, that is, the main topic or the top of the semantic macrostructure discussed earlier (van Dijk, 1980a; van Dijk, 1987d) ¹³⁶. As Van Dijk mentioned, the headline is the clearest summary of a story. It is also one of the most significant parts of Dijk's methodology, macro discourse analysis. "Headline has a very specific thematic function: it usually expresses the most important topic of the news item. We see that themes and schemes, macrostructures and superstructures are closely related." ¹³⁷ "In fact, as it was pointed out by several news discourse analysts (including Tuchman, 1978; Cohen and Yung, 1981; Van Dijk, 1983; Bell, 1981) news in the daily press is organized by the principle of relevance or importance, along a dimension of decreasing prominence with respect to the macro-structure. This means that a reader only to glance at the headline or lead to obtain a fairly accurate idea of what the whole report is about." ¹³⁸ The idea that Teo expresses above referring to other academics is in harmony with this thesis. The headline and the lead are enough for the reader to understand the whole news. The reason for this is that the reporter wants to attract the attention of the reader by placing the most interesting elements of the news in the headline and in the lead paragraph. "For example, a headline is the most salient cue to activate certain semantically related concepts in readers' minds; it is thus the most powerful framing device of the syntactical structure." ¹³⁹

"The top of the macrostructure of a news report generally tends to be expressed first; that is, first the headline (the highest macroproposition), then the lead (the top of the macrostructure), and subsequently the lower macropropositions of the report, with details of content and the less prominent schematic categories (e.g., History or Comments) towards the end." ¹⁴⁰ When the introduction paragraph is examined in terms of journalism techniques it is seen that "The importance of the lead or first paragraph in establishing the main point of a news story is clear

¹³⁶ DIJK, T. A.: Macrostructures. Hillsdale, NJ, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1980, cited by: DIJK, T. A.: *News Analysis*. New Jersey, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers, 1988. p.226

¹³⁷ DIJK, T. A.: Structures of News in the Press. In DIJK, T. A.: *Discourse and Communication*. Berlin, Germany, De Gruyter, 1985, p. 69.

¹³⁸ TEO, P.: Racism in the News: A Critical Discourse Analysis of News Reporting in Two Australian Newspapers. *Discourse & Society*, Thousand Oaks, CA, US, SAGE Publications, Vol. 11, No. 1, 2000, p. 13 https://www.researchgate.net/publication/240705919_Racism_in_the_News_A_Critical_Discourse_Analysis_of_News_Reportin Retrieval date: 02.09.2018.

¹³⁹ PAN, Z., & KOSICKI, G. M.: Framing Analysis: An Approach to News Discourse. *Political Communication*, No:1, January, 1993, p. 59, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/248988086_Framing_Analysis_An_Approach_to_News_Discourse Retrieval date: 03.09.2018

¹⁴⁰ DIJK, T. A.: *News Analysis*. New Jersey, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers, 1988, p.15

and has been analyzed earlier. The lead has precisely the same function in news as the abstract in personal narrative. The lead as summary or abstract is obligatory in hard news, where in personal narrative it remains optional.”¹⁴¹ In line with the above, introduction paragraphs of selected news are examined below. Direct and indirect messages of the paragraphs are analyzed. By analyzing these leads, the internal and external policies, societal attitudes of the German and Turkish State may be understood.

5.1 Analysis of Der Spiegel’s Headlines and Leads

No:1 *Headline*: “Tensions Escalate Between Berlin and Erdogan” *Lead*: “Turkey's hardline approach to German journalist Deniz Yucel has created considerable pressure for the government in Berlin, with Erdogan's statements over the weekend further exacerbating the situation. Still, the Turkish leader isn't as strong as he appears to be.”¹⁴²

As it can be seen in the first headline, instead of using the term Germany and Turkey, or Berlin and Ankara, the words Berlin and Erdogan are used. Erdogan was used instead of Ankara. However, Merkel was not used in place of Berlin. So consciously or unconsciously it was expressed that Turkey's foreign policy seems equivalent with Erdogan as a person.

The direct comment of the magazine in the first paragraph is that Erdogan was not as strong as Erdogan's thought. Also, the magazine emphasizes how much Deniz Yucel is significant for bilateral relations.

No:2 *Headline*: “Netherlands Dispute Gives Turkey Perfect Election Fodder” *Lead*: “Ankara is piling on in its dispute with the Netherlands after the country refused to allow key government members to hold political rallies in the country over the weekend. Turkey is calling for retaliation in the “harshest ways” and President Erdogan has found the perfect election issue.”¹⁴³

¹⁴¹ BELL, A.: *The Language of News Media*. Oxford, UK, Blackwell Publishers, 1991, p.20

¹⁴² POPP, M.: Tensions Escalate Between Berlin and Erdogan. March 07, 2017, *Der Spiegel* <http://www.spiegel.de/international/world/tensions-escalate-between-berlin-and-turkey-a-1137734.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

¹⁴³ POPP, M.: Netherlands Dispute Gives Turkey Perfect Election Fodder. March 13, 2017, *Der Spiegel* <http://www.spiegel.de/international/world/erdogan-the-netherlands-and-a-perfect-campaign-storm-a-1138525.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

In the second headline, a sentence indicating an editorial opinion was used instead of a sentence explaining what the news was about. *Der Spiegel* drew a frame and directed their readers in that direction, instead of simply presenting the news to their readers and leave them the option to make inferences on their own. This direction describes that the problems in the diplomatic relations between the Netherlands and Turkey indicate that the referendum will strengthen the hands of the Turkish government propaganda.

In the second lead, the fact that the Netherlands does not give rally permission to the Turkish authorities and that this gives an excellent propaganda tool to the Turkish government is a clear editorial opinion. With this lead, the magazine focuses on the question of ‘who turns the crisis into an opportunity’ and concludes that the ‘Erdogan government will benefit’. The indirect message of the lead is criticism of the Dutch government because of giving this political card to the Turkish government.

No:3 *Headline*: “Turkish Referendum Casts Dark Shadow over Germany” *Lead*: “Turkey is divided ahead of a key constitutional referendum to grant President Erdogan more power. So too is Germany’s Turkish population. Officials are concerned that violence could be the result while ordinary Germans are unable to understand how anyone could support Erdogan.”¹⁴⁴

The third headline in the *Der Spiegel* explains the magazine’s perspective to the referendum in Turkey and its negative effects on Germany. It has been expressed that the social structure of Germany based on multiculturalism has been damaged due to the referendum.

In the third lead, the message is more indirect. It was said that no German would approve of Erdogan’s policy in any way and this would evolve into a problem full of violence because of the Turkish population living in Germany. In other words, what is said in the indirect message is that each individual living in Germany who supports Erdogan is on the way to being isolated from the society and the source of possible violence is Erdogan.

No:4 *Headline*: “Coup in Turkey Was Just a Welcome Pretext” *Lead*: “German intelligence doesn’t buy Turkish President Erdogan’s claims that last year’s coup attempt was backed by the

¹⁴⁴ SPIEGEL STAFF: Turkish Referendum Casts Dark Shadow over Germany. March 14, 2017, *Der Spiegel* <http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/erdogan-and-turkish-referendum-divides-german-society-a-1138272.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

Gülen movement. BND chief Bruno Kahl, 54, speaks with SPIEGEL about Turkey, possible Russian interference in German elections and what to expect from Islamic State.””¹⁴⁵

The fourth headline is a much more concrete headline in the sense of summarizing *Der Spiegel*'s editorial perspective. *Der Spiegel* does not only express its perspective on Turkey and Erdogan's government but also reveals the point of view of the German bureaucracy. The sentence in the headline is German Intelligence Chief, Bruno Kahl's. The magazine made a lot of interviews with Kahl and used his sentence about Turkey in the headline. A media organization is of course not liable for what a person says or what a person does. However, a media organization in a way makes its stance clear by choosing their particular interviewees and their sentences which is also a way to present the news to the reader. Therefore, it is very important for *Der Spiegel* to show the position of the magazine by taking this sentence from an interview since the subject of this sentence is one of the most important causes of diplomatic troubles between Turkey and Germany.

The fourth lead is about German intelligence chief's comments about various events. However, the sharpest comment of him is about Turkey according to *Der Spiegel*. The journal states that there is no possibility to believe Turkey's claim by Bruno Kahl.

No:5 *Headline*: “The Demise of the Anatolian Tiger” *Lead*: “Turkey's economy is suffering badly amid the country's political uncertainty. Investors have lost confidence, tourists are staying away and the lira is rapidly losing value. President Erdogan hasn't grasped the severity of the situation.”¹⁴⁶

The fifth headline can be examined from two angles. It could be understood that the article releases an analysis examining Turkey's economy in the middle of the propaganda's most intense period during the referendum process. Or one can focus on the use of a very strong word, demise, which has no light of hope. In addition, the use of the phrase Anatolian Tiger means that the Turkish economy was strong in an old period. In other words, the headline of ‘The

¹⁴⁵ KNOBBE, M.: 'Coup in Turkey Was Just a Welcome Pretext'. March 20, 2017, *Der Spiegel*, <http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/german-intelligence-chief-bruno-kahl-interview-a-1139602.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

¹⁴⁶ POPP, M.: The Demise of the Anatolian Tiger. March 31, 2017, *Der Spiegel* <http://www.spiegel.de/international/business/turkish-economy-heading-toward-crisis-under-erdogan-a-1141363.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

Demise of Anatolian Tiger' states that the once powerful Turkish economy died due to the Turkish government. This headline also contains definitive judgment like other titles.

In the fifth lead, Turkey's economic situation (which is controlled by Erdogan) is analyzed and the condition of the industry, tourism and foreign capital was explained. It is also stated that Erdogan did not understand the seriousness of the situation.

No:6 *Headline*: "Pro-Erdogan Sites Take Aim at Critics in Germany" *Lead*: "Websites like the Ottoman Generation and Muslim Mainstream have become gathering points for supporters of Erdogan in Germany. But they are also being used to incite hatred against the Turkish president's critics."¹⁴⁷

The sixth headline relates to the part of the people of Turkish origin living in Germany who supported Erdogan suggesting that the supporters of Erdogan living in Germany did not behave in the democratic way, that they did not respect free thinking and did not tolerate criticism.

The sixth lead is the lead that includes some concern about the Turkish population in Germany. It states that Turks who live in Germany damage free speech atmosphere by targeting Erdogan's critics.

No:7 *Headline*: "How Erdogan's Referendum Gamble Might Backfire" *Lead*: "As the date of Turkey's referendum on whether to grant President Recep Erdogan sweeping presidential powers approaches, even long-time supporters are wavering. The country's leader may have overplayed his hand -- and a defeat could spell trouble."¹⁴⁸

The seventh headline is the description of *Der Spiegel*'s position without any doubt because it focuses on the possible negative scenarios for Erdogan. It is stated in the headline that it is a great gamble for Erdogan to take his country to the referendum and there are some ways for this gamble to backfire. In other words, *Der Spiegel* stated that it was not easy for Erdogan because it might bring unwanted results.

¹⁴⁷ DJAHANGARD, S.: Pro-Erdogan Sites Take Aim at Critics in Germany. April 07, 2017, *Der Spiegel* <http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/pro-erdogan-sites-take-aim-at-critics-in-germany-a-1141994.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

¹⁴⁸ CAYLAN, E.: How Erdogan's Referendum Gamble Might Backfire. April 10, 2017, *Der Spiegel* <http://www.spiegel.de/international/world/erdogan-faces-problems-as-turkey-referendum-approaches-a-1142719.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

The seventh lead interprets Erdogan's recent status in the referendum process. The opinion of the journal is that Erdogan and his supporters are not far away from political defeat and the existence of the possibility of defeat is accepted. Another interpretation of the magazine is that Erdogan has forced his chance too much and can lose what he has.

No:8 *Headline*: "The Bizarre Behavior of Turkish-German Voters" *Lead*: "A clear majority of Turkish voters in Germany cast ballots in favor of Erdogan's presidential system -- many out of spite for the country. The development reveals how far immigrants from Turkey still have to go before they will be integrated at the center of society."¹⁴⁹

The eighth headline was written by Hasnain Kazim, a correspondent of *Der Spiegel*, after the 16 April 2017 Presidential Referendum. The most striking part of the headline is of course the word 'bizzare.' Kazim criticized the choice of Turkish citizens living in Germany in the referendum after the victory of Erdogan. Even just by looking at the headline, we can deduce that *Der Spiegel* did not see the referendum compatible with German values and could not make sense of it and also found it strange to approve of those values by the pro-Erdogan living in Germany.

The eighth lead belongs to an opinion article written immediately after the 16 April referendum. Here the main subject is the collapse of the process of integration with the Turks in Germany. The reason is the approval of the constitutional referendum which will never be accepted in Germany. It is defined as anti-democratic by the people living in Germany and managed by German laws.

No:9 *Headline*: "It's Time To Break Off EU Membership Talks with Turkey" *Lead*: "Turks have voted to give their autocratic president even more power, with few checks and balances. By doing so, they have cast their ballot against the values of the European Union. It's time for the EU to take action by ending membership talks with Turkey."¹⁵⁰

¹⁴⁹ KAZIM, H.: The Bizarre Behavior of Turkish-German Voters. April 18, 2017, *Der Spiegel* <http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/referendum-in-turkey-the-bizarre-behavior-of-turkish-german-voters-a-1143735.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

¹⁵⁰ BECKER, M.: It's Time To Break Off EU Membership Talks with Turkey. April 18, 2017, *Der Spiegel* <http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/opinion-it-is-time-to-stop-eu-membership-talks-with-turkey-a-1143698.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

In the ninth headline, *Der Spiegel* expressed the editorial point of view very clearly once again and the journal urged the termination of Turkey's membership negotiations with the European Union. The headline of this news published immediately after the referendum expresses that the results of the referendum kept Turkey away from European values.

The ninth lead proposes to terminate negotiations with Turkey. Just like the eighth lead. The proposal has the potential to affect all parts of Europe, Eurasia and the Middle East if it is considered that one of the main goals of Turkey is EU membership. Of course there have been instability between the EU and Turkey. However, officially, Turkey always considers the goal of EU full membership as its priority.

No:10 *Headline*: “Erdogan Leads His Country into the Abyss” *Lead*: “Recep Tayyip Erdogan emerged victorious from last Sunday's referendum, but his slim margin of victory may actually have weakened his rule. Opposition to the Turkish president's power grab is forming and the EU can do little other than stand aside and watch.”¹⁵¹

The tenth headline shows that *Der Spiegel*'s strong stance against Erdogan continued. The word 'abyss' was used in this headline. Just like in 'demise' the fifth headline, this word is also very negative without expressing any hope. The use of this word shows that the magazine's management did not see any progress regarding Erdogan's Turkey and would not expect to see any in the future. Also another important element of the headline is *Der Spiegel*'s view according to which Erdogan is responsible for Turkey's march toward the abyss. Instead of 'Turkey is heading towards the abyss' 'Erdogan is taking Turkey into the abyss' headline is used.

The tenth lead contains several different comments, including direct and indirect ones. *Der Spiegel* argues that Erdogan's referendum, which he won by a small margin, weakened him due to this minor difference. This is a direct inference of the magazine. In the second part of the paragraph, it was stated that the European Union was not able to show any other reaction than watching these series of mistakes which was autocratic according to *Der Spiegel* and indirectly criticized the EU. According to *Der Spiegel*, as it was a subject of the previous article, the EU must take a stand against Turkey.

¹⁵¹ BELLİ, O.: Erdogan Leads His Country into the Abyss. April 21, 2017, *Der Spiegel* <http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/referendum-in-turkey-reveals-erdogan-vulnerabilities-a-1144296.html>
Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

No:11 *Headline*: “Trump Wasn't Only Problem at NATO Summit” *Lead*: “Germany's conflict with Turkish leader Recep Tayyip Erdogan is escalating following his government's refusal to allow members of parliament to visit German armed forces in the country. But it is unlikely to cause a major breach -- because NATO needs Turkey.”¹⁵²

The eleventh headline stated that Erdogan was a problem at the NATO summit alongside Trump. In every stage of the Turkish-German diplomatic relations, *Der Spiegel* did not hesitate to reveal their discomfort with Erdogan.

The eleventh lead accuses Erdogan to be the reason for unhealthy relations between the two countries. Besides, the magazine makes an inference about the possible consequences of Turkey's act and NATO membership.

No:12 *Headline*: “Turkey Against the World” *Lead*: “On the eve of the G20, Turkish President Recep Tayyip Erdogan showed no signs that he is interested in reconciliation with Germany. But he has driven away many of his other former allies as well.”¹⁵³

The twelfth headline is the clearest headline among the fifteen topics examined. The headline emphasizes Turkey's failed diplomatic relations to the world. This headline also points out Turkey's isolation in international politics.

Two different messages can be understood from the twelfth lead. The first is that Erdogan's harsh attitude to Germany separates him from other allies as well. Because other countries take sides with Germany against Turkey. The second is that Erdogan's harsh attitude is not only against Germany. It is wider and that is why allied countries have driven away from Turkey. But there is one certain message in the lead that is Turkey being isolated.

No:13 *Headline*: “Germany Debates Tougher Stance Against Turkey” *Lead*: “The recent arrest of German human rights activist Peter Steudtner marks a turning point in relations between Germany and Turkey. In an election year, the center-left Social Democrats want to see a

¹⁵² GEBAUER, M.: Trump Wasn't Only Problem at NATO Summit. June 01, 2017, *Der Spiegel* <http://www.spiegel.de/international/world/irascible-erdogan-trump-wasn-t-only-problem-at-nato-summit-a-1149707.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

¹⁵³ POPP, M.: Turkey Against the World. July 06, 2017, *Der Spiegel* <http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/g-20-erdogan-and-merkel-with-plenty-to-discuss-a-1156320.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

tightening of sanctions, but Angela Merkel has declined. She wants to save the refugee deal the EU has made with Ankara.”¹⁵⁴

It is seen in the thirteenth headline that some of the people in the German public think that the German government does not take hard enough stand against Turkey. *Der Spiegel* advocates the implementation of tougher policies against Turkey.

In the thirteenth lead there are several messages. The importance of Peter Steudtner’s arrest in Turkey is emphasized. Nevertheless, the most important message of this lead is Merkel’s inability to take a hard stand against Erdogan due to the refugee agreement which was signed between the European Union and Turkey in 2015. Although other German parties demand the hardening of relations with Turkey, Merkel is unable to do so due to the agreement, an assumption included in the lead.

No:14 *Headline*: “Can the German-Turkish Relationship Be Saved?” *Lead*: “In recent months, relations between Germany and Turkey have reached a new low. After a series of escalating spats, tourism and investment in the country have collapsed. Will it finally drive Turkish President Erdogan to change course?”¹⁵⁵

It is said in the fourteenth headline that diplomatic relations between Turkey and Germany are in need of the rescue. Also the health of the diplomatic relations is questioned.

The fourteenth lead has an assertive claim made by *Der Spiegel*. It claims that because of unstable relations with Germany, Turkey’s tourism and investment sectors have collapsed. The magazine also says that this economic hardship may convince Erdogan to make his speech about Germany softer.

No:15 *Headline*: “Erdogan Supporters Attack Turkish-German Politicians” *Lead*: “German politicians with Turkish roots are often insulted and berated on the campaign trail. But

¹⁵⁴ NEUKIRCH, R.: Germany Debates Tougher Stance Against Turkey. July 21, 2017, *Der Spiegel*, <http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/germany-debates-tougher-stance-against-turkey-a-1159138.html> Retrieval date: 03.10.2018

¹⁵⁵ SAUGA, M.: Can the German-Turkish Relationship Be Saved? August 10, 2017, *Der Spiegel*, <http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/a-1162037.html> Retrieval date: 03.10.2018

xenophobes aren't always to blame. Supporters of Turkish President Erdogan see them as traitors and try to intimidate them.”¹⁵⁶

The last headline, similarly to the sixth, is a criticism of Erdogan's supporters. It is stated that the people who support Erdogan are disturbed to Turkish origin who are involved in politics in Germany.

In the first sentence of the fifteenth lead, *Der Spiegel* states that German people of Turkish origin harshly criticize German politicians of Turkish descent. And in the last sentence, the magazine reveals the reasons for the criticism. According to *Der Spiegel*, the reason is the Turkish community's internal problems besides xenophobia.

When the lead paragraphs of *Der Spiegel*'s news are examined, it is seen that most of the leads indicate subjective opinions. *Der Spiegel* is a magazine who has adopted the policy of presenting the editorial analysis to the reader as well as presenting the news to the reader. The magazine has clearly published the news in its own interpretation which is one of the ways in journalism. Examination of these leads are beneficial to understand the journalism style of the German media. Mainstream media readers in Turkey expect to read the news without any interpretation by the newspaper. Turkish readers prefer to read interpretation by reading columnists. However, in *Der Spiegel* interpretation is within the news. It can be understood that *Der Spiegel* sees Erdogan as a dangerous man. The possibility of seeing positive news about Erdogan is almost impossible. *Der Spiegel* thinks that Turkey's constitutional referendum is undemocratic and that the rhetoric of Turkish politicians damages Germany and harms Turks in Germany. Despotic Turkey is shifting away from the European Union. According to *Der Spiegel*, the behavior of German people of Turkish origin must be in harmony with German society. Otherwise, the health of society would get wounded.

¹⁵⁶ ELGER, K.: Erdogan Supporters Attack Turkish-German Politicians. August 25, 2017, *Der Spiegel*, <http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/erdogan-supporters-attack-turkish-german-politicians-a-1164560.html> Retrieval date: 03.10.2018

5.2

Analysis of Deutsche Welle's Headlines and Leads

No:1 *Headline*: "Turkey's Cavusoglu accuses Germany of 'systematic antagonism'" *Lead*: "Turkey's foreign minister - speaking from the Hamburg consulate after his rally was called off - has again lambasted Germany. Ankara accuses Berlin of "meddling" in its controversial push to broaden presidential powers."¹⁵⁷

In its first headline *Deutsche Welle* uses part of a statement by Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Turkey. Cavusoglu accused to Germany by doing systematic hostility to Turkey. Cavusoglu's accusations to Germany is one of the damaging factors in bilateral relations. This is a statement that the diplomatic crisis with Germany is not periodic.

When the first lead is evaluated it is understood that the editorial commentary is limited due to Cavusoglu's statement is the main topic of it. However, the harsh criticism of the Turkish side against the German authorities has taken its place in the paragraph.

No:2 *Headline*: "Opinion: Red card for Erdogan" *Lead*: "Turkey's government has been using increasingly rough tactics to force campaign appearances in Europe. Now, the Netherlands have barred Turkish ministers from holding events. The right reaction, says DW's Kerstin Knipp."¹⁵⁸

In the second headline, a definite judgment is made by *Deutsche Welle*. It is stated that Erdogan has been warned. Another important issue here is that Erdogan is being warned, not Turkey. The distinction between Erdogan and Turkey is significant to mention. In that case, "Red Card for Erdogan" rather than "Red Card for Turkey".

The second news is a review of the *DW* and the paragraph is completely composed of the organization's political perspective. In this paragraph, it is stated that the Turkish authorities' behavior during the process was very harsh and this was a tactic. The fact that The Dutch government does not want the Turkish ministers in the country is approved by *DW*.

¹⁵⁷ AFP: Turkey's Cavusoglu accuses Germany of 'systematic antagonism'. March 07, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/turkeys-cavusoglu-accuses-germany-of-systematic-antagonism/a-37841018> Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

¹⁵⁸ KNIPP, K.: Opinion: Red card for Erdogan. March 12, 2017, *DW* <https://www.dw.com/en/opinion-red-card-for-erdogan/a-37910744> Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

No:3 *Headline*: “Turkey's Cavusoglu: Netherlands is 'capital of fascism'” *Lead*: “Turkey's Foreign Minister Mevlut Cavusoglu has warned of "repercussions" against the Netherlands after Dutch authorities blocked his referendum rally in Rotterdam. Cavusoglu spoke at a rally in Metz, France.”¹⁵⁹

The third headline is about the fact that a rare claim in diplomacy was stated by Cavusoglu and used by *DW* in the headline. Cavusoglu's description of Holland as the capital of fascism has severed diplomatic relations with the Netherlands. Cavusoglu's criticism of the Netherlands as a minister of foreign affair shows the extent of the diplomatic crisis.

The third lead is a part of speech of Turkish Foreign Minister. *DW* publishes the lead without adding any comments. Cavusoglu means that the relations between two countries will be worse.

No:4 *Headline*: “Turkish referendum threatens formal divorce with EU” *Lead*: “Turkey's EU accession process may be temporarily suspended if Erdogan is granted sweeping powers next month. The deterioration in the rule of law in Turkey is moving the country away from Europe.”¹⁶⁰

The fourth headline contains the editorial interpretation of *Deutsche Welle*. *DW*'s comment is that results of the referendum may break Turkey's ties with the European Union which indicates that *DW* stands against the referendum. It is argued that the new constitutional system of Turkey does not comply with European Union standards.

The fourth lead paragraph is a review of *DW* which is the effect of the referendum in Turkey-European Union relations. In this paragraph, *DW* defends that if yes wins Turkey might be far from EU's values and the relationship between the two might be broken.

¹⁵⁹ AFP: Turkey's Cavusoglu: Netherlands is 'capital of fascism'. March 12, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/turkeys-cavusoglu-netherlands-is-capital-of-fascism/a-37910611> Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

¹⁶⁰ WINTER, C.: Turkish referendum threatens formal divorce with EU. March 15, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/turkish-referendum-threatens-formal-divorce-with-eu/a-37951498> Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

No:5 *Headline*: "What you need to know about the Turkish-German row" *Lead*: "Turkish-German relations have arguably reached a historic low point. *DW* explains what's behind the conflict over the Turkish president's accusations of "Nazi practices" in Germany."¹⁶¹

The fifth headline which has top headline 'Germany and Turkey - A Difficult Relationship' describes how *Deutsche Welle*'s publication management sees the bilateral relations from their perspective.

In the fifth paragraph, *DW* states how serious the events were by using an expression which is "*arguably reached a historic low point*"

No:6 *Headline*: "Turkey's AKP cancels campaign rallies in Germany" *Lead*: "Turkish politicians have abandoned plans for more campaign events on German soil ahead of the April referendum, says the ruling AKP party. Previously, Angela Merkel threatened to ban such events over Nazi insults."¹⁶²

The news of the cancelled meeting of Turkey's ruling party in Germany is the topic of the sixth headline. This news is, of course, important for a German media organization and it carries the value of news. The headline does not contain any subjective comments, only the news.

The topic of sixth lead is cancellation of AK Party's rallies in Germany. First half of the lead is just information. However, *DW* adds another issue which emphasize the consequences of Erdogan's 'Nazi' accusation.

No:7 *Headline*: "What you need to know about the Turkish referendum" *Lead*: "Turks are voting on whether to change the country's constitution and hand President Recep Tayyip Erdogan more power. The referendum has opened up deep rifts both inside and outside Turkey. Here's the lowdown."¹⁶³

¹⁶¹ DW: What you need to know about the Turkish-German row. March 21, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/what-you-need-to-know-about-the-turkish-german-row/a-38021950> Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

¹⁶² AFP: Turkey's AKP cancels campaign rallies in Germany. March 21, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/turkeys-akp-cancels-campaign-rallies-in-germany/a-38050660> Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

¹⁶³ CHASE, J.: What you need to know about the Turkish referendum. April 08, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/what-you-need-to-know-about-the-turkish-referendum/a-38353168> Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

The seventh headline includes the editorial viewpoint of *Deutsche Welle*, just like the fourth and fifth headlines. This headline includes the interpretation and stance of *DW* about the referendum process. In addition, the elements mentioned in the fifth headline are valid for this title as well.

The seventh lead is subjective comments of *Deutsche Welle*. Firstly, Erdogan does not accept that the new system gives him more power. He advocates that parliament will be more powerful than the previous system and 'separation of powers' is way more sharp than the past. The second comment which is about domestic and international effects of the referendum proves the necessity of this thesis.

No:8 *Headline*: "Opinion: Turkish referendum must be a wake-up call for Germany" *Lead*: "A large majority of Turks here in Germany voted in favor of extending Erdogan's authority. Germany needs to respond by taking a good, honest look at its sense of itself as an immigration country, says DW's Ines Pohl." ¹⁶⁴

The eighth headline is a headline based on editorial opinion that reflects the corporate perspective of *Deutsche Welle*. The news was published one day. According to *DW*, Germany must emphasize that the reconsideration is needed in the relations with Turkey. As can be understood even if it is not used in the headline. The reason for this is that more than half of the Turks living in the country approved the constitutional change.

The eighth lead contains a call from *DW* to Germany. *DW* stated that the fact that the majority of Turkish citizens living in Germany took a stand against German values should be examined with great honesty and "grasp the nettle".

No:9 *Headline*: "Germany holds Erdogan 'personally' responsible for Turkey's referendum" *Lead*: "The German government has voiced concern over the narrow result of Turkey's referendum to expand the president's powers. Amid widening protests, analysts have warned that social unrest may spread following the vote." ¹⁶⁵

¹⁶⁴ POHL, I.: Opinion: Turkish referendum must be a wake-up call for Germany. April 17, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/opinion-turkish-referendum-must-be-a-wake-up-call-for-germany/a-38455736> Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

¹⁶⁵ AP: Germany holds Erdogan 'personally' responsible for Turkey's referendum. April 18, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/germany-holds-erdogan-personally-responsible-for-turkeys-referendum/a-38461369> Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

The ninth headline is a news report which was published immediately following the referendum. This headline summarizes the attitude of Germany and *Deutsche Welle* to the referendum as well. The Turkey-Erdogan distinction, which was highlighted in *Der Spiegel*, should be again emphasized here. Germany connects political, social and economic events in Turkey not to the Turkish people or the Turkish political institution, but to Erdogan himself.

The ninth lead mentions the statement of German Government about Turkish Constitutional Referendum. Germany has no doubt that the new system is antidemocratic. In addition, *DW* writes the possibility of widening discomfort of Turks after the result of referendum.

No:10 *Headline*: “Why many Turks in Germany voted 'yes' in Erdogan's referendum” *Lead*: “Hundreds of thousands of expat Turkish citizens in Germany voted in favor of giving sweeping new powers to the office of the Turkish president. Many Germans, and Turks who voted "no," are taken aback.”¹⁶⁶

The tenth headline concerns *Deutsche Welle*'s questioning of the yes vote of the Turks living in Germany. The first thing that stands out in this headline is what is thought to be investigated by *DW* is that why the Turks voted yes rather than no. It is understood that the normal attitude for *Deutsche Welle* is to vote 'no', which can be seen many times in the previous headlines of *DW* and *Der Spiegel*. A Turkish citizen living in Germany who approves the constitutional change is an abnormal issue and needs to be investigated by *DW*. Also 'Erdogan's referendum' is used rather than 'Turkey's referendum'. As it was mentioned with regard to the previous headlines it is a very clear evidence of the 'Erdogan – Turkey' distinction.

The tenth lead is a paragraph similar to eighth lead. It states that the majority of Turks in the country has given much power to Erdogan and few Turks who oppose it remain in the background.

No:11 *Headline*: “Worse than the referendum itself' is Turkey's tragic polarization” *Lead*: “Although the opposition fared well at the Turkish referendum, fear is growing in Turkey.

¹⁶⁶ BREITENBACH, D.: Why many Turks in Germany voted 'yes' in Erdogan's referendum. April 18, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/why-many-turks-in-germany-voted-yes-in-erdogans-referendum/a-38472130> Retrieval date: 20.10.2018

Making art is extraordinarily difficult, says German author and playwright Moritz Rinke - but critical voices are needed there.”¹⁶⁷

The eleventh headline is quoted from the interview with author Moritz Rinke. As stated in the first and third news of *Deutsche Welle* and also the fourth headline of *Der Spiegel*, it provides an understanding of the publication policy by deciding which sentences are cited and mentioned in the headline. It is also important to consider who they interview. It is a noteworthy that the claim that the social polarization was worse than the referendum in Turkey appears in the headline.

The eleventh lead paragraph contains praise for the opposition in Turkey and despite that fact the difficulty of art and the existence of fear has increased.

No:12 *Headline*: “Rapporteur: The EU's apathy enables Erdogan's repression” *Lead*: “The European Parliament's rapporteur says EU inaction betrays Turks suffering under Recep Tayyip Erdogan. She wants a freeze of Turkey's accession process if the president implements further anti-democratic measures.”¹⁶⁸

The twelfth headline includes an analysis of the European Parliament's rapporteur. This title contains several opinions. Firstly, Erdogan is described by the rapporteur of the European Parliament as a repressive leader. Secondly, it can be understood that the shape of the European Union's Turkey affair has an effect on Erdogan's policy. In this headline of *DW* it can be said that the European Parliament is not in a very close relationship with Erdogan (but not Turkey).

The twelfth lead consists of critical review of the sentences of the European Union's rapporteur on Turkey. The most important of these is the statement that The Turks, who suffered under the rule of Erdogan, were betrayed by the EU due to not taking any steps against Erdogan's growing repressive attitude. *DW* supports the fact of Erdogan-Turkey distinction's claim with the EU rapporteur's opinion by giving this sentence in the lead paragraph such as *Der Spiegel*.

¹⁶⁷ CORDS, S.: 'Worse than the referendum itself' is Turkey's tragic polarization. April 19, 2017. *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/worse-than-the-referendum-itself-is-turkeys-tragic-polarization/a-38465759> Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

¹⁶⁸ RAPPORTEUR: Rapporteur: The EU's apathy enables Erdogan's repression. June 15, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/rapporteur-the-eus-apathy-enables-erdogans-repression/a-39268817> Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

No:13 *Headline*: “Germany doubles down on Erdogan rally ban during Hamburg G20” *Lead*: “Berlin lawmakers have sought to quash rumors Erdogan still plans to host a rally on German soil during the G20 summit. Such a rally could be used to stoke support for a prospective vote to reintroduce the death penalty.”¹⁶⁹

In the thirteenth headline, it is stated that Erdogan was in Hamburg due to the G-20 summit and possible meetings were banned by Germany. As stated in the other headlines, it can be seen that Germany is distant to Erdogan both officially and socially. The reason for using the word ‘double’ is that extra measures are taken in order to prevent the process of March 2017 from happening again.

The thirteenth lead is about the concern of German deputies regarding possible Erdogan’s rally in Germany. It can be understood from the following part of the lead that *Deutsche Welle* has no tolerance to death penalty and the broadcaster does not want to Turkish community in Germany to hear and get influence from this issue.

No:14 *Headline*: “'You belong here,' Foreign Minister Sigmar Gabriel tells Germany's Turks” *Lead*: “Germany's Turkish diaspora has been assured that it is part of the fabric of the nation despite difficult relations between Berlin and Ankara. A letter by Germany's foreign minister has been published in a newspaper.”¹⁷⁰

The fourteenth headline is a quote from the Foreign Minister, Sigmar Gabriel. This sentence shows that the political preferences of the citizens of Turkish origin who made a big impact on the German public after the referendum are considered as odd were also on the agenda of one of the highest authorities of the German state. Gabriel's statement “You belong here”, means that he needs to remind people of Turkish origin of this fact. It also shows that the German society is highly influenced by the referendum and has taken sides.

¹⁶⁹ AFP: Germany doubles down on Erdogan rally ban during Hamburg G20. July 04,2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/germany-doubles-down-on-erdogan-rally-ban-during-hamburg-g20/a-39530180>
Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

¹⁷⁰ AFP: 'You belong here,' Foreign Minister Sigmar Gabriel tells Germany's Turks. July 22, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/you-belong-here-foreign-minister-sigmar-gabriel-tells-germanys-turks/a-39800501>
Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

The fourteenth lead is the statement of Germany's Foreign Minister. *Deutsche Welle* does not add any kind of interpretation. Sigmar Gabriel emphasizes the importance of integration process with Turkish community in Germany.

No:15 *Headline*: "Sigmar Gabriel: 'Turkey will never join EU' under Erdogan" *Lead*: "In an interview with Germany's Bild newspaper, Foreign Minister Sigmar Gabriel offered damning criticism of President Recep Tayyip Erdogan's government. Gabriel has warned Germans to use caution when traveling to Turkey."¹⁷¹

The fifteenth headline, which is the last headline, again quotes Foreign Minister Sigmar Gabriel. His statement which is the topic of the headline, contains very strong judgements, like the one Turkey's Foreign Minister Cavusoglu usually makes. The German Foreign Minister's statement indicates that the diplomatic relations between the two countries are permanently broken. The fact that Gabriel connects Turkey's EU membership to the situation of Erdogan's ruling clearly supports the claim about the "Erdogan-Turkey distinction" as it was mentioned in the previous headlines.

In the fifteenth lead which is the last one of *DW*, German Foreign Minister Sigmar Gabriel also condemned Erdogan and his party even proposed German citizens not to go to Turkey.

When the lead paragraphs of *Deutsche Welle* is examined in general, it is possible to understand what the broadcasting policy is and the political perspective of the publisher. Of course, in general, the purpose of convey the news to the reader with its own reality is in the frontline. However, especially in *DW*'s review news, the news was presented to the reader as of how the *DW* interpreted the process. It can be seen that *Der Spiegel* and *Deutsche Welle*'s broadcasting policy is similar. Style of analyzing the issues and dates of news shows parallelism. Another important issue is similarity of chosen news. It is mentioned below that which issue is seen as an important and necessary to publish beside of how the issue is published. This can indicate the media companies' policy well.

¹⁷¹ LYNEHAM, C.: Sigmar Gabriel: 'Turkey will never join EU' under Erdogan. Aug 25, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/sigmar-gabriel-turkey-will-never-join-eu-under-erdogan/a-40236026> Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

5.3 Analysis of Daily Sabah's Headlines and Leads

No:1 *Headline*: “Germany’s dangerous gambit with Turkey” *Lead*: “If you thought 2016 was a bad year for Turkish-German relations, then think again. Only eight weeks into the new year, Germany already accused Turkish imams of espionage, hosted events by the PKK, an armed group that both Ankara and Berlin consider a terrorist organization and alienated Turkish officials by using the phrase "Islamist terrorism" in a press conference with the Turkish president in attendance.”¹⁷²

The first headline is of the editorial report of *Daily Sabah*. It is a remarkable indication for the clear understanding of the publisher's perspective. In this headline, the *Daily Sabah* stated that Germany has taken a stand against Turkey. While this troublesome dual relationship is determined, an assertive word is used: *gambit*. In other words, the newspaper argues that Germany is in a meaningless conflict. Undoubtedly, it is unlikely that a foreign policy of a state will be managed with the luck factor, but this is the newspaper's claim.

Since most of the *Daily Sabah* news formats do not have lead paragraphs, and directly pass to the main text of the news after the headline, the first paragraph of the main text of the news has been examined as a lead paragraph.

In the first lead, the newspaper states that Germany's charges against Turkey have paralyzed the bilateral relations. In addition, the claim that Germany hosted the members of the PKK is one of the important points of the first paragraph considering the fact that PKK is also recognized as a terrorist group by there, but the claim is not accepted by Germany.

No:2 *Headline*: “Danger of creeping fascism in Germany” *Lead*: “Turkey is counting down the days to the constitutional reform referendum. The some 3 million Turkish citizens living in Germany will play a critical part in the outcome of the vote. Naturally, Turkish politicians of all

¹⁷² E. BOARD: Germany’s dangerous gambit with Turkey. March 03, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, <https://www.dailysabah.com/editorial/2017/03/03/germany-s-dangerous-gambit-with-turkey>, Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

stripes want to campaign in Germany to persuade their compatriots to vote to support them. This is actually the root cause of the recent deterioration of ties between Turkey and Germany.”¹⁷³

The second headline contains editorial opinion such as the first headline. This title is as hard and assertive as the first title. The newspaper claims that fascism has risen in Germany. Thus, the newspaper took the political position of the Turkish government without any doubt.

In the second lead, the newspaper informs that it is a natural desire for Turkish politicians to want to make a political campaign in Germany and the rejection of this request by Germany is the main reason for the deterioration of relations.

No:3 *Headline*: “Fascism consuming Europe” *Lead*: “A Swiss newspaper set aside its entire first page to address the Turkish community in Switzerland, urging them to back the “No” campaign amid bans on Turkish government officials trying to meet with Turks to promote the “Yes” campaign.”¹⁷⁴

The third headline's subject is the discourse of fascism such as the second title. This time, the claim of fascism was used not only for Germany but for all of Europe.¹⁷⁵

The third lead is a criticism of the Swiss newspaper because of the full page news of the newspaper calling for no votes. This paragraph claims that even though the 'yes' campaign was banned, the Turks have been called to vote no and *Daily Sabah* has found it wrong.

No:4 *Headline*: “Europe, calm down, it is a Turkish referendum, not yours” *Lead*: “The 7-million-strong Turkish diaspora across Europe is a hugely important constituency that all political parties in Turkey are trying to woo before the April 16 referendum on constitutional

¹⁷³ E. BOARD: Danger of creeping fascism in Germany. March 08, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, <https://www.dailysabah.com/editorial/2017/03/08/danger-of-creeping-fascism-in-germany> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

¹⁷⁴ E. BOARD: Fascism consuming Europe. March 12, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, <https://www.dailysabah.com/editorial/2017/03/12/fascism-consuming-europe> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

¹⁷⁵ EU AFFAIRS: Swiss paper urges Turks to vote ‘no’ in referendum, calls Erdogan dictator. March 13, 2017, *Daily Sabah* <https://www.dailysabah.com/eu-affairs/2017/03/13/swiss-paper-urges-turks-to-vote-no-in-referendum-calls-erdogan-dictator> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

changes. Politicians who are campaigning against the changes received full freedom to drum up support to attract voters in European countries.”¹⁷⁶

The fourth headline is the editorial opinion just like the other *Daily Sabah* headlines. The meaninglessness and extremism of European's interest in the Turkish Presidential Referendum is specified in the headline. According to *Daily Sabah*, the position of the referendum on the European agenda is meaningless. The need for reminding of this meaninglessness is the main point of the newspaper.

The fourth paragraph is the lead paragraph of an opinion piece which repeats the same double standard applied by Europe as in the third lead. In this paragraph, it is stated that those who oppose the referendum changes have found all kinds of free environment in Europe, but supporters of 'yes' are prevented by prohibitions. So, the message is that Europe is not behaving as democratic.

No:5 *Headline*: “Surrendered to populism, Germany increases anti-Turkey sentiment” *Lead*: “As the German state pursues supporting any anti-Turkish propaganda, the tension between the two countries will continue to escalate”¹⁷⁷

The fifth headline is an editorial interpretation, like the other headlines. In this interpretation, Germany performs populist acts against Turkey and shows populist attitude to increase anti-Turkish stance in the country. Although *Daily Sabah* changed the accusation from fascism to populism and softened its rhetoric, it did not withdraw its accusations to Germany. In addition, it can be understood from this topic that the German administration has increased its anti-Turkish attitude in a systematic way.

The fifth lead is an editorial criticism. *Daily Sabah* thinks that there are no suitable conditions to end the crisis. The source of the crisis is Germany.

¹⁷⁶ RACHMAN, I.: Europe, calm down, it is a Turkish referendum, not yours. March 14, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, <https://www.dailysabah.com/op-ed/2017/03/14/europe-calm-down-it-is-a-turkish-referendum-not-yours> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

¹⁷⁷ YERKEL, S.: Surrendered to populism, Germany increases anti-Turkey sentiment. March 19, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, <https://www.dailysabah.com/op-ed/2017/03/20/surrendered-to-populism-germany-increases-anti-turkey-sentiment> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

No:6 *Headline*: "Justice minister slams West for 'protecting terrorists'" *Lead*: "Justice Minister Bekir Bozdağ criticized Western countries on Tuesday for "protecting terrorists and putschists" despite reciprocal agreements ordering their extradition."¹⁷⁸

The sixth headline is Turkey's Justice Minister's statement. Minister of Justice Bekir Bozdag did not specify a specific location, did not use a country name, and made a general accusation. The Justice Minister has accused the western world of being hostile to Turkey.

The sixth lead is again an accusatory lead to Germany. In this paragraph, it was claimed that the Germans are supporters of the enemy of the Turks despite legal relations with Turkey.

No:7 *Headline*: "German politician Ozdemir meddles in Turkish politics, urges 'No' vote" *Lead*: "The leader of Germany's Green party has urged Turkish citizens in Germany and Turkey to vote "No" in the upcoming referendum in Turkey while German officials impose bans on "Yes" meetings and rallies of Turkish ministers on the grounds of meddling with the country's internal affairs."¹⁷⁹

The seventh headline is an opinion headline about a specific case. The headline is presented in a way that tells the reader in which frame he/she will evaluate the news. The subject of the headline is Cem Ozdemir. Ozdemir is a German citizen of Turkish origin. However, this is not mentioned in the headline. The newspaper argues that the referendum is held in Turkey and it is none of Ozdemir's business. The situation that Ozdemir calls people to vote no is considered impertinent by *Daily Sabah*.

The seventh lead is the critique of Germany's claim to be a part of the referendum, just as in the other leads. Despite the prohibition of pro-'yes' politicians' rallies, the call of the leader of the German Green Party to the Turks to vote 'no' was seen as a double standard and criticized.

No:8 *Headline*: "EU must accept Erdogan reality: Sabah Columnists' Club panel highlights" *Lead*: "The Sabah Columnists' Club held a panel on Monday in the southern province of Adana to discuss the April 16 constitutional referendum. During the meeting, Sabah and *Daily Sabah*

¹⁷⁸ DAILY SABAH: Justice minister slams West for 'protecting terrorists'. March 21, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, <https://www.dailysabah.com/politics/2017/03/21/justice-minister-slams-west-for-protecting-terrorists> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

¹⁷⁹ DAILY SABAH: German politician Ozdemir meddles in Turkish politics, urges 'No' vote. March 26, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, <https://www.dailysabah.com/politics/2017/03/26/german-politician-ozdemir-meddles-in-turkish-politics-urges-no-vote> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

columnists underlined that the European states will eventually have to accept the "Erdoğan reality" after the disappointment concerning the April 15 referendum."¹⁸⁰

The eighth headline can explain *Daily Sabah*'s political stance, viewpoint and position, as successfully as the opinion news. This headline is about a forum which was organized with the participation of *Daily Sabah* columnists. The fact that the Turkey-Erdogan distinction can often be seen in *Der Spiegel* and *Deutsche Welle*'s headlines has been criticized knowingly or unknowingly by these columnists. They emphasized that the EU should not make a plan about Turkey without accepting Erdogan's existence.

The eighth lead is about the conclusion of *Daily Sabah*'s columnists' panel. The main thought of the columnists is the fact that Erdogan will not lose and if Europe wants to continue the relations with Turkey, they must get used to working with Erdogan. Thus, the message is addressed abroad.

No:9 *Headline*: "Anti-Turkey rhetoric backfires: Turks in Europe vote 'yes'" *Lead*: "Despite the prevention attempts to the 'yes' campaign in contrast to the freedom that was provided to the 'no' campaign, the majority of the Turkish voters that live abroad approved the constitutional changes"¹⁸¹

The ninth headline is the title of the *Daily Sabah* newspaper, with a piece of victory in it. This headline states that Europe's efforts have failed which means that they have lost and Turkey has won. *Daily Sabah* does not make the distinction between Erdogan and Turkey like the German media.

The ninth lead also argues that, as in the other paragraphs, there is a double standard in the propaganda of yes and no. What is meant here is that no matter how much Europe tried, they could not stop Erdogan.

No:10 *Headline*: "Germany's CDU wants restrictions on dual citizenship after Turkey referendum" *Lead*: "The conservative party, Christian Democratic Union of Germany (CDU),

¹⁸⁰ KARAMAN, M.: EU must accept Erdogan reality: Sabah Columnists' Club panel highlights. April 03, 2017, *Daily Sabah* <https://www.dailysabah.com/politics/2017/04/04/eu-must-accept-erdogan-reality-sabah-columnists-club-panel-highlights> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

¹⁸¹ SOLMAZ, M.: Anti-Turkey rhetoric backfires: Turks in Europe vote 'yes'. April 18, 2017, *Daily Sabah* <https://www.dailysabah.com/eu-affairs/2017/04/18/anti-turkey-rhetoric-backfires-turks-in-europe-vote-yes> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

has demanded concrete formulations for changes in the German citizenship law for its electoral program after Turkey voted in favor of a constitutional reform package on April 16.”¹⁸²

In the tenth headline, *Daily Sabah* emphasizes the intention of the German government in the headline. The German government intends to change a law closely related to the citizens of Turkish origin in Germany. The important point is that the intention of this amendment appeared immediately after the referendum as highlighted by *Daily Sabah* in the headline. It shows that the results of the referendum damaged the ties of the two countries and that this was not a surprise for either side.

The tenth lead offers information about the German ruling party’s act about the Turkish community in Germany. From the fact that *Daily Sabah* emphasizes the result of the referendum it can be understood that *Daily Sabah* sees this issue as a punishment.

No:11 *Headline*: “AfD takes to political soapbox in wake of Turkish referendum” *Lead*: “The German far-right Alternative für Deutschland (AfD) has declared that it will use the voting behavior of Turks in Germany as auspices for the proposed abolishment of dual citizenship, a political stance the AfD is taking as part of its election campaign following Turkey’s referendum.”¹⁸³

The eleventh headline demonstrates AfD’s political position against Turkish referendum.

The eleventh lead’s content is similar to that of the tenth. According to *Daily Sabah*, AfD (Alternative for Germany) also sees the voting behavior of Turks in Germany as a threat to both the integration process and German society. Just like Merkel’s ruling party CDU, AfD also wants to cut the tie of Turks in Germany to their homeland.

No:12 *Headline*: “Two-thirds of Germans want Turkey’s EU accession talks to stop” *Lead*: “According to a survey conducted by German state broadcaster ARD, almost two-thirds of

¹⁸² DAILY SABAH: Germany’s CDU wants restrictions on dual citizenship after Turkey referendum. April 19, 2017, *Daily Sabah* <https://www.dailysabah.com/europe/2017/04/19/germanys-cdu-wants-restrictions-on-dual-citizenship-after-turkey-referendum> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

¹⁸³ DAILY SABAH: AfD takes to political soapbox in wake of Turkish referendum. April 21, 2018, *Daily Sabah* <https://www.dailysabah.com/politics/2017/04/21/afd-takes-to-political-soapbox-in-wake-of-turkish-referendum> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

German citizens who participated in the poll, expressed their wish to end Turkey's accession negotiations regarding an EU membership.”¹⁸⁴

The twelfth headline reveals the extent of the impact of the result of the referendum and its destructive influence on German society and politics. The opinion of the German people after the referendum is Turkey does not embrace the values of the European Union.

No subjective comment is seen in the twelfth lead of *Daily Sabah*. The fact that the majority of German society does not want to accept Turkey into the EU is the content of the news.

No:13 *Headline*: “Report: Bundestag communicates with FETÖ, makes Germany a 'Mecca' for cult” *Lead*: “Despite Turkey's numerous warnings following the deadly coup attempt on July 15, the German government continues its involvement with the Gulenist Terror Group (FETÖ), becoming the headquarters of the terrorist organization at the same time.”¹⁸⁵

The analysis of the Germany-Turkey relations, which became almost broken up after the referendum, is the main point of the thirteenth headline. The headline is about how Germany is seen by Gulenists and the resemblance of Germany to Mecca where the holy Islamic sanctuary that Muslims are obliged to visit is located. It is stated that this environment is provided under the supervision of the Bundestag. So *Daily Sabah* claims that Germany has opened its country to the enemies of Turkey who are clearly a terrorist organization.

The thirteenth lead repeats the problem that has still not been solved by the two countries. On 15 July 2016, the coup attempt was condemned by Germany but it was not accepted that the perpetrator was FETO. As the anti-Erdogan climate in Germany increased, FETÖ has had the chance to move more freely in Germany. This is the subject of the *Daily Sabah*'s lead paragraph.

No:14 *Headline*: “Erdogan calls on Turks in Germany to not to vote for 'hostile' parties” *Lead*: “Amid the ongoing diplomatic spat with Germany, President Recep Tayyip Erdogan has called on the Turkish-German community in Germany to not to vote for parties that have a hostile stance on Turkey in the upcoming elections, including German Chancellor Angela Merkel's

¹⁸⁴ DAILY SABAH: Two-thirds of Germans want Turkey's EU accession talks to stop. April 21, 2017, *Daily Sabah* <https://www.dailysabah.com/eu-affairs/2017/04/21/two-thirds-of-germans-want-turkeys-eu-accession-talks-to-stop> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

¹⁸⁵ DAILY SABAH: Report: Bundestag communicates with FETÖ, makes Germany a 'Mecca' for cult. May 30, 2017, *Daily Sabah* <https://www.dailysabah.com/war-on-terror/2017/05/31/report-bundestag-communicates-with-feto-makes-germany-a-mecca-for-cult> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

Christian Democrat Party (CDU) and coalition partner Social Democratic Party (SPD) headed by former European Parliament President Martin Schulz.”¹⁸⁶

The fourteenth headline is the roughest headline among the headlines and statements given so far. It is a statement by President of Turkey Recep Tayyip Erdogan. Erdogan, the first man of the country has told people of Turkish origin in Germany that some political parties of Germany are the enemy of Turkey and they should not vote for them. This discourse is the most explicit proof of Turkey’s intent which does not aim to start a normalization process with Germany.

The fourteenth lead does not have any subjective comments by *Daily Sabah*, just like the twelfth lead. However, the content of the lead paragraph is too sharp.

No:15 *Headline*: “German gov’t united on anti-Turkey rhetoric ahead of federal elections” *Lead*: “Turkish officials say that in order to gain an advantage in the upcoming elections, German politicians are continuing to use Turkey in their rhetoric as if it were a domestic politics issue, regardless of their ideological stances.”¹⁸⁷

The last headline is the editorial headline of *Daily Sabah*. The newspaper claims that the anti-Turkey rhetoric is a useful way to gain votes. It is said in this title that there are no differences of opinion in the German government (CDU-SPD, the Great Coalition) about the matter of anti-Turkey rhetoric.

The fifteenth lead mentions Turkish officials’ thoughts. According to Turkish officials, taking a stand against Turkey is a profitable act for German politicians on account of gaining votes in the Bundestag election.

All of the headlines of *Daily Sabah* try to explain how unfair Germany is in the diplomatic crisis. According to the headlines, there are several actors who would like to see Turkey as powerless such as Merkel, Cem Ozdemir, AfD and all the West. Because the headlines are full of editorial opinion, they are easy to analyze. *Daily Sabah*’s lead paragraphs are generally paragraphs that contain subjective political opinion. The newspaper does not only intend to present the news,

¹⁸⁶ DAILY SABAH: Erdogan calls on Turks in Germany to not to vote for ‘hostile’ parties. Aug 18, 2017, *Daily Sabah* <https://www.dailysabah.com/eu-affairs/2017/08/18/erdogan-calls-on-turks-in-germany-to-not-to-vote-for-hostile-parties> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

¹⁸⁷ DAILY SABAH: German gov’t united on anti-Turkey rhetoric ahead of federal elections. Aug 29, 2017, *Daily Sabah*. <https://www.dailysabah.com/eu-affairs/2017/08/30/german-govt-united-on-anti-turkey-rhetoric-ahead-of-federal-elections> Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

but to base it on the relative reality by stating who is right and who is wrong. This is reflected in the lead paragraphs as well. In general, the thematic macrostructure analysis of *Daily Sabah* reveals that the newspaper does not have a title or lead paragraph that Erdogan would be uncomfortable with reading. *Daily Sabah* does not use reporter journalism, in this case the style of interpretive journalism is the way to present the processes in its headlines and lead paragraphs to its readers. The newspaper shows the reader how to interpret the agenda starting from the first elements of the news.

5.4 Analysis of TRT World's Headlines and Leads

No:1 *Headline*: “Germany's decision to cancel Turkish ministers' rallies causes outrage” *Lead*: “Top Turkish government officials slam decision of Gaggenau and Cologne city authorities to revoke permission for scheduled rallies by Justice Minister Bekir Bozdag and Economy Minister Nihat Zeybekci to address the Turkish community in Germany.”¹⁸⁸

The first headline is the conclusion of the *TRT World* editorial team based on the statements of the Turkish minister. The message in this title is the wrongness of the German State's attitude and Germany is responsible for the problem.

In the first lead, the reactions of Minister of Justice Bekir Bozdag and Economy Minister Nihat Zeybekci about the cancellation of rallies is the main subject.

No:2 *Headline*: “Turkey accuses Germany of "double standards"” *Lead*: “Turkish Foreign Minister Mevlut Cavusoglu criticized Germany after two German towns stopped Turkish ministers from holding meetings with supporters of President Erdogan. The spat appears to have triggered a bomb hoax on Friday.”¹⁸⁹

The second headline is Foreign Minister Mevlut Cavusoglu's statement which is presented to the reader without further comment by the editor. The important point of this headline is that

¹⁸⁸ TRTWORLD: Germany's decision to cancel Turkish ministers' rallies causes outrage. Mar 2, 2017, *TRTWORLD* <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/germany-s-decision-to-cancel-turkish-ministers-address-causes-outrage-308613>, Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

¹⁸⁹ TRTWORLD: Turkey accuses Germany of "double standards". Mar 3, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/turkey-accuses-germany-of-double-standards--5493> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

Turkey does not accuse Merkel or the Great Coalition but the German State. Furthermore, it is clearly seen in the headline reviews of the other three media sources that the German media and the Turkish media have a different perspective on analyzing issues. Also, the hypocrisy accusation of Germany by Cavusoglu is the demonstration of Turkey's opinion.

In the second lead, as it has been often expressed, the double standard accusations by Turkish politicians are included. As mentioned in the previous paragraphs, a media organization may not express its political stance and general attitude to the reader directly. Events selected by the organization as news and the summary of these events in the lead paragraph is a way to send messages indirectly to the reader. *TRT World* has not given any subjective ideas in this paragraph but the accusation of double standard has been quoted in the title. It means *TRT World* sees it as a significant claim.

No:3 *Headline*: “Erdogan compares Germany's actions to those of 'Nazi period'” *Lead*: “The statement comes in reaction to two German towns' cancellation of resident Turks' meetings in support of President Erdogan ahead of April's referendum.”¹⁹⁰

The third headline is not commented by *TRT World* editors, just like the previous one. The important point of this headline is the analogy made by Turkey's highest authorized person, Erdogan describing Germany as a Nazi state. In other words, due to the fact that the word Nazi is a taboo for Germans and the common memory of humanity, it did not surprise anyone that this analogy dramatically damaged the bilateral relationship. Erdogan's evaluation, however, is that the fact that Turkish authorities could not get the permission to meet the Turks living in Germany is anti-democratic.

The third lead explains why Erdogan charged Germany with Nazi accusations. The background and basis for the Nazi accusation is stated to the reader.

¹⁹⁰ TRTWORLD: Erdogan compares Germany's actions to those of 'Nazi period'. Mar 5, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/turkey/erdogan-likens-german-actions-to-those-of-nazi-period-310703> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

No:4 *Headline*: “Germany rejects Erdogan's "Nazi era" comparison” *Lead*: “A spokesman for German Chancellor Angela Merkel calls for calm, as diplomatic row between Turkey and Germany escalates over ban on Turkish rallies in German towns.”¹⁹¹

The fourth headline was published only one day after the third title and it covers the answer from Germany. There are no editorial comments on this topic like in the other headlines. However, it shows that the editorial team of *TRT World* respects the right of reply.

The fourth lead is information about Angela Merkel's statement. The statement was made by Angela Merkel during Turkey's rally crisis with Germany. It can be understood that Merkel does not want to involve the harsh discussion.

No:5 *Headline*: “Turkey- Germany relations in stalemate” *Lead*: “The only agreement seems to be disagreement, as President Erdogan and Chancellor Merkel acknowledge the two countries have deep-seated differences.”¹⁹²

The fifth headline contains the opinion of *TRT World*. However, due to the fact that there are no sharp claims or any accusation, it can be called objective. The purpose of *TRT World* by using stalemate is that it wants to emphasize the conflict between the two countries and the failure of diplomacy at this point.

In the fifth lead, *TRT World* summarized the process in one sentence and this sentence is an interpretation that can be accepted by Erdogan and Merkel.

No:6 *Headline*: “7 things to know about the diplomatic row between Turkey and Germany” *Lead*: “Relations between the NATO allies have been strained after a series of events following last year's attempted coup in Turkey.”¹⁹³

¹⁹¹ TRTWORLD: Germany rejects Erdogan's "Nazi era" comparison. Mar 6, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/germany-rejects-erdogan-s-nazi-era-comparison-5545> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

¹⁹² TRTWORLD: Turkey, Germany relations in stalemate. Mar 9, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/turkey-german-relations-in-stalemate-313475> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

¹⁹³ TRTWORLD: 7 things to know about the diplomatic row between Turkey and Germany. Mar 10, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/7-things-about-the-diplomatic-row-between-turkey-and-germany-314013> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

The sixth headline is an example of how the editor's own perspective is given within the framework drawn by the organization itself just like *Deutsche Welle*'s fifth and seventh headlines. In this headline, *TRT World* has provided a piece of news which is about diplomatic problems between Turkey and Germany in *TRT World*'s own interpretation. As mentioned above, these headlines are very useful for understanding the policy, ideology and position of media organizations.

In the sixth lead, *TRT World* has used the July 15, 2016, Coup Attempt as the beginning of the tense relations between the two countries.

No:7 *Headline*: "Erdogan says "spirit of fascism" reigns in Europe" *Lead*: "Turkey's president accuses the Netherlands of massacring over 8,000 Bosnian Muslims at Srebrenica as tensions between Turkey and the EU peak after Turkish ministers were stopped from holding rallies in two EU member states."¹⁹⁴

The seventh headline is the continuation of the third one. There is no comment by *TRT World* in this headline just like in the third headline. The two headlines are made up of Erdogan's statements, and Erdogan, who used the Nazi analogy referring to Germany, did not back down this time and continued his criticism with the same tone. Insomuch that Europe has been used instead of Germany means that the Netherlands, Switzerland and other European countries which have reacted to the rallies during referendum in a similar manner are included in the criticism of the statement.

In the seventh lead, Erdogan criticized the Netherlands' stance in the Srebrenica Massacre during the diplomatic crisis with the Netherlands and the European Union. The president wants to emphasize that the Netherlands is not a democratic country.

¹⁹⁴ TRTWORLD: Erdogan says "spirit of fascism" reigns in Europe. Mar 15, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/erdogan-says-spirit-of-fascism-reigns-europe-317576> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

No:8 *Headline*: “Turkey says Germany supports terrorism” *Lead*: “Turkey slammed German authorities for allowing a demonstration by supporters of the PKK, considered a terrorist organisation by the EU, US and Turkey, and banned in Germany.”¹⁹⁵

The eighth headline does not include any editorial commentary, such as most of the headlines of *TRT World*. A claim of Turkey addressing Germany has been moved to the headline. However, this claim is a very grave claim. By this claim, Turkey expresses that Germany exhibits a hostile attitude towards them and violate human rights.

The eighth lead’s content is accusation of Germany by Turkey. The following lead explains why Turkey’s accusation is fair by giving information about the legal status of PKK.

No:9 *Headline*: “Turkey and Germany continue spat” *Lead*: “Turkey's president repeated his "Nazi" allegations on Sunday, prompting a retort from the German chancellor and the threat of a blanket ban on Turkish politicians seeking to campaign in Germany.”¹⁹⁶

The ninth headline does not specify any editorial comments. The headline is based on objective foundations. The *TRT World* team has identified the latest situation between Turkey and Germany. *TRT World* uses the word 'spat' which means *TRT World* wants to state that both sides have used the right of reply offensively.

The ninth lead contains both leaders' (Erdogan and Merkel) harsh comments to each other. *TRT World* publishes the story without adding editorial opinion.

No:10 “President Recep Tayyip Erdogan says it's up to the people to decide the future of accession talks.” *Headline*: “Turkey may hold referendum on EU membership”¹⁹⁷

The tenth headline includes a piece of President Tayyip Erdogan’s statement. There are no other editorial additions in this headline, like in most of the other *TRT World* headlines. It can be

¹⁹⁵ TRTWORLD: Turkey says Germany supports terrorism. Mar 18, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/turkeys-says-germany-supports-terrorism-319304> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

¹⁹⁶ TRTWORLD: Turkey and Germany continue spat. Mar 20, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/germany-and-turkey-continue-spat-320653> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

¹⁹⁷ TRTWORLD: Turkey may hold referendum on EU membership. Mar 25, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/turkey/turkey-may-hold-referendum-on-eu-membership-5944> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

understood from Tayyip Erdogan's statement that the process of full membership to the European Union needs to get Turkish society's trust back. In addition, he indirectly states that Turkey is not obliged to the EU or especially to Germany.

The tenth lead is the statement of Erdogan which is about a possible EU referendum in Turkey.

No:11 *Headline*: "Erdogan hints at referendum on Turkey's EU accession" *Lead*: "Turkish-EU relations have been strained over differences regarding Turkey's shift to an executive presidential system following its approval in a referendum on Sunday."¹⁹⁸

There is no editorial addition or subtraction in the eleventh headline. This headline came out a day after the result of the referendum just like the tenth headline. Tayyip Erdogan expressed that he was not dependent on the European Union after the referendum. He did this by saying that he could bring the country to referendum again. In other words, Erdogan's message to both domestic and foreign policy-makers is that the people's support is behind him.

The eleventh lead is a description of post-referendum process. The effect of the result of the referendum and Turkey's stance against EU are analyzed.

No:12 *Headline*: "Why many Turkish citizens in Europe rallied behind the "yes" vote" *Lead*: "A large portion of Turkey's citizens living in Europe voted for the constitutional amendments that were approved in last Sunday's referendum. While that outcome might have stunned Western critics, there are some real reasons behind the support."¹⁹⁹

The twelfth headline is a general summary of the editorial view of the process just as the sixth headline of *TRT World* and *Deutsche Welle*'s fifth, seventh and tenth headlines. Therefore, such news is suitable for understanding the political position of the publisher.

¹⁹⁸ TRTWORLD: Erdogan hints at referendum on Turkey's EU accession. Apr 17, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/turkey/erdogan-hints-at-referendum-on-turkey-s-eu-accession-6400> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

¹⁹⁹ TRTWORLD: Why many Turkish citizens in Europe rallied behind the "yes" vote. Apr 20, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/turkey/heres-why-many-turkish-citizens-in-europe-rallied-behind-yes-vote-339295> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

The only lead to which *TRT World* adds a direct opinion is the twelfth lead. In this lead, it is claimed that the result of the referendum has shocked Western critics and later on, *TRT World* has explained the reasons behind this support from its own perspective.

No:13 *Headline*: “Germany says won't allow Turkish voting on death penalty” *Lead*: “There are around 1.4 million eligible Turkish voters in Germany, and a referendum on Turkey's constitutional change backed by the governing AK Party won 63 percent of the votes cast in the European nation.”²⁰⁰

The thirteenth headline belongs to the news which is about the restriction of Turks' voting right by the German state in the possible death penalty referendum in Turkey. Although the comment of the *TRT World* cannot be seen in this headline, the idea of the government is brought to the headline as the idea of the whole of Germany. (Which is actually true, almost no one has supported allowing the Turks to vote in the possible death penalty referendum.) Germany has expanded the differences in perspectives between the two states by making this statement and has also expressed that the possible referendum is based on anti-democratic elements.

The thirteenth lead is a portrayal of the European Turkish community's voting habit supported by figures. As it can be understood from the headline, the lead is about the possible death penalty referendum. *TRT World* states that the Turkish community in Europe may support the death penalty law.

No:14 *Headline*: “Berlin refuses Erdogan's request to address Turks, angering Ankara” *Lead*: “The Turkish government, accusing Germany of double standards and making the decision to appease voters in Germany's upcoming federal elections.”²⁰¹

²⁰⁰ TRTWORLD: Germany says won't allow Turkish voting on death penalty. May 5, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/germany-says-won-t-allow-turkish-voting-on-death-penalty-6791> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

²⁰¹ REUTERS: Berlin refuses Erdogan's request to address Turks, angering Ankara. June 29, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/germany-refuses-erdogans-request-to-address-turks-389754> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

The subject of the fourteenth headline is the continuation of the prohibition of the rally, which is the basis of the disputes between the two countries in the referendum process. The headline does not have any comment by *TRT World*. It refers to the rejection of Ankara's desire to appeal to the Turks during Erdogan's visit to Hamburg for the G-20 summit and the fact that it annoyed Ankara. Based on the evaluation of this headline, it is clear that the diplomatic crisis between Turkey and Germany during the referendum is far away from any kind of solution. Both countries are at the point where they were at the beginning of the crisis.

In the fourteenth lead, the refusal of Erdogan's wish to have a meeting with Turks again in Germany during the G-20 summit in Hamburg is discussed in the paragraph. Turkey's accusation of double standard is mentioned again in the lead paragraph.

No:15 *Headline*: “Erdogan tells Turks in Germany to vote against Merkel and allies” *Lead*: “Turkish President Recep Tayyip Erdogan calls on Turkish people living in Germany not to support the Christian Democrats, Social Democratic Party, the Green Party in the upcoming election.”²⁰²

In the fifteenth and last headline, Erdogan's statement is examined which appears in the three other news sources as well. The headline of *TRT World* is softer than the *Daily Sabah*'s headline. With this statement, Erdogan has made a rarely seen move in the frame of diplomacy. While *Daily Sabah* has quoted Erdogan's words which are hostile towards Merkel and several other parties in the headline, *TRT World* did not mention this. *TRT World* also could have wanted to apply the rule of reciprocity to European newspapers and the public, who also called vote for no in the referendum.

The fifteenth lead is a statement by Erdogan. Although there is no subjective addition of *TRT World*, it still needs to be analyzed due to the sharpness of the statement. Erdogan's extraordinary statement could be the harshest one in the frame of diplomacy. It is clearly directed to people and is an effort to influence Turks in Germany.

²⁰² REUTERS: Erdogan Tells Turks in Germany to Vote Against Merkel and Allies, Aug 18, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/erdogan-tells-turks-in-germany-to-vote-against-merkel-and-allies-9737>
Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

When *TRT World*'s lead paragraphs and headlines are examined, it can be seen that the headlines' purpose is to summarize the topic without using adjectives, etc. It is understood that the direct way of editorial interpretation is given to the reader in very few paragraphs. *TRT World* has presented the statements of individuals who are the subject of the news without using too many adjectives. In addition, paragraphs which only describe the events without political interpretation are predominant. As it was mentioned above, the Turkish mainstream media's readers have a tendency to read the news without the interpretations of editors. Although *TRT World* is officially a public broadcasting service, *Daily Sabah* seems to be acting more like a public broadcasting service due to its support of the government under all circumstances.

6. CONCLUSION

In today's world, the globalization process continues at full speed. Money, goods, communication and war can easily cross the borders and spread across the world. This makes borders between countries increasingly dysfunctional. The ethnic nationalist movements in the world today are a reaction to the globalization process we are witnessing. The almost complete disappearance of the concept of closed society in the modern world connects countries in every aspect, for instance in a political-economic-military way. Therefore, any kind of political movement, economic crisis or structural reform in Turkey, the country that is to prevent threats from the Middle East arriving in Europe have first-degree potential to affect Europe. Turkish society, the structure of the country, the political stance of the society has a significant meaning to Europe as well since it is an economic and political ally of Turkey. Although the media can be the voice of the public against powerful institutions such as states or companies, etc. it is also possible that media can be a propaganda tool of powerful institutions. This is one of the key issues of this thesis. The two leading media organizations of the two countries have been compared using the same method related to the way of their handling of the news. As a result of this, particularly in the German media, presenting what is the real truth to the reader rather than reporting the news is the way of their journalism style. This is also true for the Turkish newspaper, *Daily Sabah*. Another important result of the research is the fact that the German media observes that Turkey is being polarized because of the political climate. The fact that the

German media makes the Erdogan-Turkey distinction in its rhetoric and in some news of the German media, suggests that Turks, who do not support Erdogan, need help. The German media accepts and understands Turkey as being socially divided. The German media, hence the German public opposes Turkey to adopt a Presidential System due to the fact that the new system is anti-democratic and it will make Erdogan despotic. According to the German public, the new system does not comply with the values of the European Union and negotiations should, therefore, be terminated with Turkey. However, Turkey is not a partner to be abandoned easily. For this reason, no matter how hard the Turkish politicians accused Germany, Angela Merkel never broke the ties completely. The general reason is that Turkey is an economically developing, secular and powerful country. It has also been adopted to Europe. As mentioned before, the relationship between the AK Party government and Germany in the European Union has not always worked under this tension. “Due to increasing pressures from the European Union and some domestic dynamics, Ankara started to adopt European norms. Of course, there are still some points on which the European Union expects developments. However, up until now, Turkey created an environment that is more freedom-oriented than before. All these achievements realized by changing the old hard security image of the country have won sympathy around the world. Turkey has established itself an example of a well-functioning democracy in the Muslim world and is repeatedly illustrated as a possible model for other Muslim countries.”²⁰³ It could be true for a decade, especially between 2002 and 2007. Nevertheless, Turkey changed sharply after 2013 due to internal and external threats and policy. Thus, the European Union has lost its sympathy to Turkey but again it is not easy to divorce Turkey. The Turkish market is an alternative to the Russian market in case of a possible conflict between the European Union and Russia. The reason why the European Union and Turkey's relation has officially never ended is Syria's refugee crisis. Due to the fact that the number of refugees fleeing from Syria is more than the population of some European Union countries, the European Union has faced a major demographic problem. The EU has solved this problem with the help of Turkey. Turkey who hosts approximately 3.5 million Syrians in the country is Europe's assurance. For this reason, although Germany does not agree with Erdogan's government, it cannot fully break the ties. That is why the German media urges the German

²⁰³ YALÇIN, H. B.: The Concept of “Middle Power” and the Recent Turkish Foreign Policy Activism. *Afro Eurasian Studies*, No:1, Spring, 2012, p. 206, http://www.afroeurasianstudies.net/dosyalar/site_resim/veri/4842000.pdf
Retrieval date: 10.10.2018

government to act more harshly on Erdogan. In addition, the effects of the media on society is proven by *Daily Sabah*'s news which is made by benefiting from the broadcasting organization of the German State, ARD. The fact that $\frac{3}{4}$ of German society wishes to end Turkey's negotiation process with the European Union indicates that even though the German government has not officially severed the ties with Turkey yet, its link completely broke with the German society. It is obvious that the policies of the European Union in the early years of Erdogan have changed drastically because of changing conditions, balances and policies. Erdogan does not hide this. The support of half of the Turkish people to Erdogan shows that Turkish society is now looking at the European Union with suspicion.

When the relationship between Germany and Turkey is examined, it can be seen that one of the most valuable dynamics is the Turkish population in Germany. The Turks and Germans, who were former allies during the World War I period, cooperated again and the Turks migrated to Germany as the labor force. In fact, Turkey's largest import item in 1974 was the 1.5 million-dollar currency of the Turks living in Germany which was sent to Turkey each year.²⁰⁴ This particular case between Germany and Turkey forced Germany and Turkey to become a partner working closely. The tough the stance of Germany and the German society in the process of the referendum and afterward is directly related to the 3.5 million people of Turkish origin living in Germany. The 65% support given to Erdogan by the Turks actually means that Germany's 50-year integration process has collapsed. The reason for this is that Erdogan is a person who has never been accepted by German society. The high rank of support shows the division within the people of Germany. What the German state and society face in the post-referendum process is a failed integration process.

When analyzed in terms of Turkey, it is seen that Erdogan has created his own system and has imposed it on the rest of the world and has convinced his own people. A successful politician, Erdogan succeeded in converting the tensions with the European Union, particularly with Germany and the Netherlands, into a yes vote in the propaganda process. Erdogan and the pro-Erdogan media have claimed that the constitutional referendum determines the existence or collapse of Turkey. Thus, they established the propaganda on this basis. These diplomatic

²⁰⁴ KERSHAW, R.: Panorama. Aug, 1974. BBC. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3cb_T9t4aKI min:15.05 – 15.30 Retrieval date: 21.08.2018

tensions, which took the first place in the Turkish public opinion during the referendum process, have further strengthened this claim of the Turkish government in domestic politics. The reason is the strong idea held by some parts of Turkish society which claims that foreigners never wish to see the success of Turkey. Hence, if a foreign state or an institute declare an idea about a matter related to Turkey, the accuracy or inaccuracy of the content becomes trivialized. Besides, the main issue that harmed the relationship between the two countries is the 15th of July Coup Attempt. This event has changed Turkey completely. As a result of this event, Turkey has developed a new strategy and constructed an entirely different discourse for both domestic and foreign policy. Although the Presidential System was a pre-July 15 bid, no party supported the proposal, even some of AK Party's founders were against it. However, due to changed conditions in Turkey post-July 15, with the support of the Nationalist Movement Party, it was possible to take the proposed amendment to a referendum. Turkey has implemented policies that put skepticism and safety concerns to the forefront after July 15.²⁰⁵ Turkey's confidence in the EU countries and the US was severely diminished after the coup attempt. The Deniz Yücel event is one of the most concrete examples of it. When the contents of *Der Spiegel* and *Deutsche Welle* media about Turkey are examined, Deniz Yücel's detention is usually mentioned in the middle or at the end of the news. This is one of the main reasons why Germany has reacted to the Turkish government as a united front in the referendum process. The media has never dropped this detention status from the agenda of the German community for a period of one year. This has urged the German government to exert social pressure on this issue. When the two countries' structure of the media and its effect on society and politics are compared, it can be seen that the duties of the German media are to put pressure on the government and inform it about what the priority of the society is. The Turkish media establishes a relationship with the society based on the interest of the government and determining the agenda. In the 'opinion' news of the German media, it provides advice on what its own country should do, while the Turkish media provides advise on what the other country should do. If Germany and Turkey want to maintain a close relationship both socially and politically like they used to, the media is the most significant institute to take responsibility. Today, the two countries have lost their tolerance and empathy towards each other, both socially and politically. It is in the hands of the

²⁰⁵ Dw: Conflict Zone. Aug 01, 2018, DW, <https://www.dw.com/en/mevlut-cavusoglu-on-conflict-zone/av-44013585> Retrieval date: 09.10.2018

media to reestablish this connection and to create a more favourable atmosphere between the two communities. Both countries have to accept each other's internal dynamics. Present major problems between Germany and Turkey should not be used in the internal politics through the media and solutions should be sought through diplomatic dialogue.



7. BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. AFP: Turkey Hits Out As Netherlands Blocks Foreign Minister's Flight. March 11, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/turkey-hits-out-as-netherlands-blocks-foreign-ministers-flight/a-37903534> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018
2. AFP: Turkish PM Says Merkel Talk 'Productive,' But Spat Goes On. March 04, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/turkish-pm-says-merkel-talk-productive-but-spat-goes-on/a-37809998> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018
3. AFP: Erdogan says Yucel was a PKK plant with German support. March 03, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/en/erdogan-says-yucel-was-a-pkk-plant-with-german-support/a-37806928> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018
4. AFP: German Politicians Line Up Against 'Anti-Democratic' Turkish Referendum Campaign. March 03, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/german-politicians-line-up-against-anti-democratic-turkish-referendum-campaign/a-37797622>. Retrieval date: 07.09.2018
5. AFP: Germany doubles down on Erdogan rally ban during Hamburg G20. July 04, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/germany-doubles-down-on-erdogan-rally-ban-during-hamburg-g20/a-39530180>. Retrieval date: 04.10.2018
6. AFP: Germany To Investigate Claims of 'Intolerable' Spying by Turkey. March 28, 2017, *The Guardian*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/mar/28/germany-accuses-turkey-of-intolerable-spying-on-gulen-supporters> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018
7. AFP: Germany's Gabriel Hopes to Rebuild Turkish Friendship, Without Nazi Comparisons. March 08, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/germanys-gabriel-hopes-to-rebuild-turkish-friendship-without-nazi-comparisons/a-37847691> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018
8. AFP: Third German Town Cancels Turkish Referendum Rally Amid Yucel Spat. March 03, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/third-german-town-cancels-turkish-referendum-rally-amid-yucel-spat/a-37803173> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018
9. AFP: Turkey Summons German Ambassador Over Rally Cancellations. March 02, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/turkey-summons-german-ambassador-over-rally-cancellations/a-37782761> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

10. AFP: Turkey's AKP cancels campaign rallies in Germany. Mar 21, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/turkeys-akp-cancels-campaign-rallies-in-germany/a-38050660>. Retrieval date: 04.10.2018
11. AFP: Turkey's Cavusoglu accuses Germany of 'systematic antagonism'. March 07, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/turkeys-cavusoglu-accuses-germany-of-systematic-antagonism/a-37841018> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018
12. AFP: Turkey's Cavusoglu: Netherlands is 'capital of fascism.' Mar 12, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/turkeys-cavusoglu-netherlands-is-capital-of-fascism/a-37910611>. Retrieval date: 04.10.2018
13. AFP: 'You belong here,' Foreign Minister Sigmar Gabriel tells Germany's Turks. July 22, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/you-belong-here-foreign-minister-sigmar-gabriel-tells-germanys-turks/a-39800501>. Retrieval date: 04.10.2018
14. AKTAS, M.: Çavuşoğlu: Bizde Hollanda'daki Gibi Faşist Bir Hükümet Yok. [Çavuşoğlu: We do not have a fascist government like in Holland.] March 13, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703131027613124-cavusoglu-hollanda-fasist/> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018
15. AKTAS, M.: Çavuşoğlu: Yönetime Nazi Demiyoruz, Uygulama O Döneme Benziyor. [Çavuşoğlu: We do not call Nazi to administration. However the practise seems like that era.] March 09, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703091027558900-cavusoglu-almanya-nazi-uygulama/> Retrieval date 30.10.2018
16. ALDEMIR, H.: Referandum, Almanları ve Türkleri Nasıl Etkiledi? [How did the referendum affect Germans and Turks?] April 21, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201704211028181380-referandum-almanlari-ve-turkleri-nasil-etkiledi/>, Retrieval date: 25.10.2018
17. ALTAN, A.: Türkiye ile Almanya Arasında İncirlik Krizi. [Incirlik crisis between Germany and Turkey.] June 23, 2016, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/tr/t%C3%BCrkiye-ile-almanya-aras%C4%B1nda-incirlik-krizi/a-19349465> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018
18. ALTAN, A.: Yıldırım: I hope that Deniz Yücel will be free as soon as possible. Feb 14, 2018, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201802141032245437-binali-yildirim-angela-merkel-deniz-yucel/>. Retrieval date: 06.09.2018
19. ANADOLU AGENCY: Adalet Bakanı Bozdağ, Alman mevkidaşıyla randevusunu iptal etti. [Justice Minister Bozdag canceled his appointment with his German counterpart] March 04, 2017. *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available:

<https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703041027488236-adalet-bakani-bozdag-alman-mevkidasi/> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

20. ANADOLU AGENCY: Dışişleri Bakanı Çavuşoğlu'ndan Almanya ve Hollanda'ya Tepki. [Response from Foreign Minister Çavuşoğlu to Holland and Germany.] March 05, 2017, *HABERTURK*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.haberturk.com/dunya/haber/1414590-disisleri-bakani-cavusoglundan-almanya-ve-hollandaya-tepki> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018
21. ANDERSON, B.: Turkish Foreign Minister Addresses Controversy. March 13, 2017, *CNN*, [Online]. Available: <https://edition.cnn.com/videos/world/2017/03/13/tensions-rise-between-turkey-and-the-netherlands.cnn> Retrieval date: 20.10.2018
22. AP: Denmark Warns Turkish PM to Postpone Visit As Germany Mulls Legal Options. March 12, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/denmark-warns-turkish-pm-to-postpone-visit-as-germany-mulls-legal-options/a-37911650> Retrieval date: 29.10.2018
23. AP: Turkey's Foreign Minister Vows Revenge After Netherlands Turn Away Plane. March 11, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/turkeys-foreign-minister-vows-revenge-after-netherlands-turn-away-plane/a-37906966> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018
24. AP: Germany holds Erdogan 'personally' responsible for Turkey's referendum. Apr 18, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/germany-holds-erdogan-personally-responsible-for-turkeys-referendum/a-38461369>. Retrieval date: 04.10.2018
25. AP: Germany's Merkel Rejects Turkish Criticism After Meeting Bans. March 03, 2017, *RFERL*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.rferl.org/a/turkey-germany-double-standards-bozdag/28344947.html> Retrieval date: 29.10.2018
26. ARDÈVOL-ABREU, A.: Framing Theory in Communication Research. Origins, Development and Current Situation in Spain. *Revista Latina de Comunicación Social*, 2015, No: 70, p. 426, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/282843054_Framing_theory_in_communication_research_Origins_development_and_current_situation_in_Spain Retrieval date: 03.08.2018
27. AYDIN, E.: Erdoğan: Nazizmin Almanya'da Bittiğini Zannediyordum, Meğer Devam Ediyormuş. [Erdogan: I thought that Nazism was over in Germany. However, it still continue.] March 05, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703051027499796-erdogan-almanya-nazizm/> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

28. AYDIN, Y.: The German-Turkey Migration Corridor; Refitting Policies For a Transnational Age. *Transatlantic Council on Migration*, February 2016. [Online]. Available: <https://www.migrationpolicy.org/research/germany-turkey-migration-corridor-refitting-policies-transnational-age>. Retrieval date: 03.09.2018

29. BECKER, M.: It's Time To Break Off EU Membership Talks with Turkey. April 18, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/opinion-it-is-time-to-stop-eu-membership-talks-with-turkey-a-1143698.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

30. BENSCH F.: Almanya Dışişleri Bakanlığı: Erdoğan'in Deniz Yücel Hakkındaki Açıklamaları Mesnetsiz. [German Foreign Ministry: Erdogan's accusations to Deniz Yucel are meaningless,] March 04, 2019, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201703041027488948-almanya-disileri-bakanligi-erdogan-mesnetsiz/> Retrieval date: 29.10.2018

31. BENSCH, F.: Almanya Dışişleri: Türkiye'ye Çok Sabır Gösterdik. [German Foreign Ministry: We Showed too much Patience to Turkey.] July 20, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201707201029362403-almanya-disisleri-turkiye-almanya-sabir/>. Retrieval date: 25.10.2018

32. BAVELAS, J., KENWOOD B. C., PHILLIPS, B.: Discourse Analysis. In Knapp M., Daly, J. (Eds.): *Handbook of Interpersonal Communication*. Thousand Oaks, CA. SAGE Publications, 3rd ed, 2011, p. 102, <http://web.uvic.ca/psyc/bavelas/2002discourse.pdf> Retrieval date: 01.09.2018

33. BBC: Almanya Parlamentosu 'Soykırım Tasarısı'nı Onayladı. [German Bundestag has approved the Armenian Genocide Law.] 02 June 2016, *BBCTURKCE*, [Online]. Available: https://www.bbc.com/turkce/haberler/2016/06/160602_almanya_soykirim_oylama. Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

34. BBC: Erdoğan'dan AB'ye mülteci krizi tepkisi: Alnımızda enayı yazmıyor. [Erdogan's response to the EU about refugee crisis: We are not fool.] Feb 11, 2016, *BBC*, [Online]. Available: https://www.bbc.com/turkce/haberler/2016/02/160211_erdogan_omer_celik_multeciler_aciklama. Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

35. BBC: Turkey 'Spied' On pro-Gulen Opponents in Germany. March 28, 2017, *BBC*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-39416954>. Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

36. BEKTAS, Ü.: Alman Vekil Konya'daki NATO Üssü'ne Yaptığı Ziyareti Anlattı. [German MP described his visiting to NATO Base in Konya.] Sep 10, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available:

<https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201709101030074803-alman-vekil-konya-nato-ziyareti-anlatti/> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

37. BELL, A.: The Language of News Media. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1991, p. 20.
38. BELLI, O.: Erdogan Leads His Country into the Abyss. April 21, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/referendum-in-turkey-reveals-erdogan-vulnerabilities-a-1144296.html>. Retrieval date: 01.10.2018
39. BENSCH, F.: Merkel'den Türkiye'ye: Bu Provokasyon Yarışında Yer Almaya Niyetim Yok. [Merkel to Turkey: I do not intent to be in this race of provocation.] March 17, 2017, SPUTNIKNEWS, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201703171027679419-merkel-bu-provokasyon-yarısında-yer-almaya-niyetim-yok/> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018
40. BIA: Deniz Yücel: I Don't Want Freedom by Favor of Dirty Deal. Jan 17, 2018, BIANET. [Online]. Available: <https://bianet.org/english/human-rights/193388-deniz-yucel-i-don-t-want-freedom-by-favor-of-dirty-deal> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018
41. BLACK, P.: Brexit Campaign Stirs up Fears of Turks. May 24, 2016. CNN, [Online]. Available: <https://edition.cnn.com/2016/05/23/europe/turkey-brexit/index.html> Retrieval date: 01.08.2018.
42. BREITENBACH, D.: Why many Turks in Germany voted 'yes' in Erdogan's referendum. April 18, 2017, DW, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/why-many-turks-in-germany-voted-yes-in-erdogans-referendum/a-38472130> Retrieval date: 20.10.2018
43. BULBUL, Y.: Erdoğan: Bunların Kani Testten Geçirilmeli. June 05, 2016, [Their blood should be tested.] SPUTNIKNEWS, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201606051023175147-erdogan-almanya-soykirim-kan-testi/> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018
44. BULBUL, Y.: Erdoğan'dan Merkel'e: Nazi Uygulaması Yapıyorsun. [From Erdogan to Merkel: You are doing Nazi Practise.] March 19, 2017, SPUTNIKNEWS, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703191027704266-erdogan-ilim-yayma-vakfi/> Retrieval date: 29.10.2018
45. BURACK, C.: Erdogan Rules Out Releasing German-Turkish Journalist Yucel 'As Long As I Am In Power'. April 14, 2017, DW, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/erdogan-rules-out-releasing-german-turkish-journalist-yucel-as-long-as-i-am-in-power/a-38424975> Retrieval date: 10.09.2018
46. CAMERON, D. & PANOVIC, I.: *Working with Written Discourse*. SAGE, Los Angeles, USA, March 01, 2014, p.4, <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/af85/feda714d0be81a543d6c9896a4bfbad928d8.pdf> Retrieval date: 13.04.2019

47. CORUM S.: Almanya'dan Bozdağ ve Zeybekci'ye Miting Engeli. [Rally Barriers from Germany to Bozdağ and Zeybekci,] March 02, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201703021027462308-almanya-gaggenau-bekir-bozdag/> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

48. CAYLAN, E.: How Erdogan's Referendum Gamble Might Backfire. April 10, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/world/erdogan-faces-problems-as-turkey-referendum-approaches-a-1142719.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

49. CELEP, Ö.: Perspectives on Turkey's 2017 Presidential Referendum *Middle East Review of International Affairs*, Vol. 21, No. 1, p. 68, Spring 2017.

50. CHAN, S.: E.U. Warns Turkey in Escalating Dispute Over Constitutional Referendum. March 13, 2017, *NY TIMES*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.nytimes.com/2017/03/13/world/europe/eu-turkey.html> Retrieval date: 20.10.2018

51. CHASE, J.: What you need to know about the Turkish referendum. Apr 08, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/what-you-need-to-know-about-the-turkish-referendum/a-38353168> Retrieval date: 25.09.2018

52. CHONG, D. & DRUCKMAN, J.: A Theory of Framing and Opinion Formation in Competitive Elite Environments. Framing in Discourse. Evanston, US, *Journal of Communication*, p. 99, 2007, <https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/0291/fc2e4262a979e3bd4d485b4c2ba0763c946c.pdf> Retrieval date: 03.08.2018

53. CORDS, S.: 'Worse than the referendum itself' is Turkey's tragic polarization., Apr 19, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/worse-than-the-referendum-itself-is-turkeys-tragic-polarization/a-38465759>. Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

54. DAILY SABAH: Erdoğan calls on Turks in Germany to not to vote for 'hostile' parties. Aug 18, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/eu-affairs/2017/08/18/erdogan-calls-on-turks-in-germany-to-not-to-vote-for-hostile-parties>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

55. DAILY SABAH: German gov't united on anti-Turkey rhetoric ahead of federal elections. Aug 29, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/eu-affairs/2017/08/30/german-govt-united-on-anti-turkey-rhetoric-ahead-of-federal-elections>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

56. D. SPIEGEL: About Der Spiegel. *EUROTOPICS* [Online]. Available: <https://www.eurotopics.net/en/148789/der-spiegel>. Retrieval date: 04.11.2018

57. DAILY SABAH: Two-thirds of Germans want Turkey's EU accession talks to stop. Apr 21, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/eu-affairs/2017/04/21/two-thirds-of-germans-want-turkeys-eu-accession-talks-to-stop>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

58. DAILY SABAH CENTRE FOR POLICY STUDIES: The 2017 Constitutional Referendum in Turkey. Daily Sabah Centre for Policy Studies., No:1, Istanbul, 2017. p.16

59. DAILY SABAH: Germany's CDU wants restrictions on dual citizenship after Turkey referendum. Apr 19, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/europe/2017/04/19/germanys-cdu-wants-restrictions-on-dual-citizenship-after-turkey-referendum>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

60. DAILY SABAH: AFD takes to political soapbox in wake of Turkish referendum. Apr 21, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/politics/2017/04/21/afd-takes-to-political-soapbox-in-wake-of-turkish-referendum>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

61. DAILY SABAH: German politician Özdemir meddles in Turkish politics, urges 'No' vote. Mar 26, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/politics/2017/03/26/german-politician-ozdemir-meddles-in-turkish-politics-urges-no-vote>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

62. DAILY SABAH: Justice minister slams West for 'protecting terrorists'. Mar 21, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/politics/2017/03/21/justice-minister-slams-west-for-protecting-terrorists>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

63. DAILY SABAH: Report: Bundestag communicates with FETÖ, makes Germany a 'Mecca' for cult. May 30, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/war-on-terror/2017/05/31/report-bundestag-communicates-with-feto-makes-germany-a-mecca-for-cult>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

64. DALDAL, ASLI: Power and Ideology in Michel Foucault and Antonio Gramsci: A Comparative Analysis. *Review of History and Political Science*, American Research Institute for Policy Development, Vol:2, No:2, June, 2014, p.165

65. DEWDNEY J. & YAPP, M.: *The Military Coup of 1960*. Encyclopedia Britannica, [Online]. Available: <https://www.britannica.com/place/Turkey/The-military-coup-of-1960>. Retrieval date: 01.11.2018

66. DIJK, T. A: *Macrostructures: An Interdisciplinary Study of Global Structures*. Hillsdale, New Jersey, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers, 1980, pp.26-27

67. DIJK, T. A.: Macrostructures. Hillsdale, NJ, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, 1980, cited by: DIJK, T. A.: *News Analysis*. New Jersey, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers, 1988. p.226

68. DIJK, T. A.: Multidisciplinary CDA: a Plea for Diversity. In WODAK, R. & MEYER, M. (Eds.): *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis*. London. Thousand Oaks, New Delhi, SAGE Publications, 2001, p. 102.

69. DIJK, T. A.: Social Cognition and Discourse. In GILES, H. & W. ROBINSON (Eds.): *Handbook of Language and Social Psychology*. Hoboken, New Jersey, US, John Wiley & Sons Ltd, 1990, pp. 163-164.

70. DIJK, T. A.: Structures of News in the Press. In DIJK, T. A.: *Discourse and Communication*. Berlin, Germany, De Gruyter, 1985, p. 69.

71. DIJK, T. A.: *Discourse as Interaction in Society*. Thousand Oaks, CA, US, SAGE Publications, 1997, p.2

72. DIJK, T. A.: *News Analysis*. New Jersey, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers, 1988, p. 15

73. DJAHANGARD, S.: Pro-Erdogan Sites Take Aim at Critics in Germany. April 07, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/pro-erdogan-sites-take-aim-at-critics-in-germany-a-1141994.html>. Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

74. DJERF-PIERRE, M. & WEIBULL, L.: From Public Educator to Interpreting Ombudsman. Regimes of Political Journalism in Swedish Public Service Broadcasting, 1925–2005, 2008, cited by: SALGADO, S., & STRÖMBÄCK, J.: Interpretive Journalism: A Review of Concepts, Operationalizations and Key Findings. *Journalism*, No:2, February 01, 2012, p. 146

75. DRABBLE, M.: *Oxford Companion to the English Literature*. Oxford, Oxford University Press, New York, USA, 2000, p.284, http://ebooks.bharathuniv.ac.in/gd1c1/gd1c4/Arts_and_Science_Books/arts/english/Literature/Books/The%20Oxford%20Companion%20To%20English%20Literature.pdf Retrieval date: 01.09.2018

76. DRID, T.: Discourse Analysis: Key Concepts And Perspectives. *ResearchGate*, No:1, January, 2010, pp. 20-21. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/282184078_DISCOURSE_ANALYSIS_KEY_CONCEPTS_AND_PERSPECTIVES Retrieval date: 02.08.2018

77. DW: Conflict Zone. Aug 01, 2018, DW, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/mevlut-cavusoglu-on-conflict-zone/av-44013585> Retrieval date: 09.10.2018

78. DW TURKCE: Alman Siyasetçilerden Oberhausen Mitingine Tepki. [Reactions to the Oberhusen Rally from German Politicians.] Feb 19, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/tr/alman-siyaset%C3%A7ilerden-oberhausen-mitingine-tepki/a-37622860> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

79. DW TURKCE: Almanya'da Erdoğan Endişesi. [Erdogan concern in Germany.] Feb 20, 2017. *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/tr/almanyada-erdo%C4%9Fan-endi%C5%9Fesi/a-37628075> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

80. DW TURKCE: Yücel'in Tahliyesi Oncesi Türkiye'yle Silah Anlaşmalarına Onay. [Approved of arms agreement before release of Yucel.] Feb 23, 2018, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/tr/y%C3%BCcelin-tahliyesi-%C3%B6ncesi%C3%BCrkiyeyle-silah-anla%C5%9Fmalar%C4%B1na-onay/a-42721295> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

81. DW: What you need to know about the Turkish-German row. Mar 21, 2017., *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/what-you-need-to-know-about-the-turkish-german-row/a-38021950>. Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

82. DW TURKCE: DİTİB'e Casusluk Suçlaması Genişliyor. [The Espionage charges are expanding.] Feb 03, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/tr/ditibe-casusluk-su%C3%A7lamas%C4%B1-geni%C5%9Fliyor/a-37405085> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

83. DW TURKCE: İstihbarat: 13 DİTİB İmamı Gülen Yanlılarını İhbar Etti. [Intelligence: 13 DİTİB Imams informed against Gulenists.] Feb 09, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/tr/istihbarat-13-ditib-imam%C4%B1-g%C3%BClen-yanl%C4%B1lar%C4%B1-ihbar-etti/a-37484914> Retrieval Date: 06.09.2018

84. EU AFFAIRS: Swiss paper urges Turks to vote 'no' in referendum, calls Erdoğan dictator. Mar 13, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/eu-affairs/2017/03/13/swiss-paper-urges-turks-to-vote-no-in-referendum-calls-erdogan-dictator>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

85. E. BOARD: E. BOARD: Danger of creeping fascism in Germany. Mar 08, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/editorial/2017/03/08/danger-of-creeping-fascism-in-germany>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

86. E. BOARD: Fascism consuming Europe. Mar 12, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/editorial/2017/03/12/fascism-consuming-europe>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

87. E. BOARD: Germany's dangerous gambit with Turkey. Mar 03, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/editorial/2017/03/03/germanys-dangerous-gambit-with-turkey>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

88. ERIKAN, I.: Alman Siyasetçilerden İncirlik Tepkisi: Hesaplanmış Provokasyon. [Incirlik Response from German Politicians: Planned provocation.] June 23, 2016, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201606231023518798-almanya-turkiye-incirlik-tepki/>. Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

89. ELGER, K.: Erdogan Supporters Attack Turkish-German Politicians. August 25, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/erdogan-supporters-attack-turkish-german-politicians-a-1164560.html>. Retrieval date: 03.10.2018

90. EPPEL, A.: Making Sense of Rising German-Turkish Tensions. *Istituto Affari Internazionali (IAI)*, No: 17|08, August 2017, p. 4, <http://www.iai.it/sites/default/files/iaicom1708.pdf> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

91. ESEN, B. & GÜMÜŞÇÜ, Ş.: A Small Yes for Presidentialism: The Turkish Constitutional Referendum of April 2017. *South European Society and Politics*, Vol:22, No:3, October 11, 2017. pp. 5-306 <http://yoksis.bilkent.edu.tr/pdf/files/13125.pdf> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

92. FAIRCLOUGH, N.: *Analysing Discourse Textual Analysis for Social Research*. New York, Routledge, 2003, p.3.

93. FAIRCLOUGH, N.: Language and Power. London, UK, Longman, 1989, p. 129

94. FAIRCLOUGH, N.: Language and Power. London, UK, Longman, 1989 cited by: EGHLIDI, M.: Critical Discourse Analysis of 'People's Son' Story: A Micro and Macro-Levels Analysis. *Journal of Applied Linguistics and Language Research*, Volume 3, No: 5, 2016, p. 58

95. FOUCAULT, M.: *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. Paris, France, Éditions Gallimard, 1969, p. 38.

96. FRASER, S.: Turkish Minister: German 'Deep State' Working Against Vote. March 03, 2017, *AP*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.businessinsider.com/ap-turkish-minister-german-deep-state-working-against-vote-2017-3> Retrieval date: 07.09.2018

97. GALL, C.: Turkey's Effort to Repair Relations Trips Over Its Crackdown. Feb 16, 2018, *NY TIMES*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.nytimes.com/2018/02/16/world/europe/deniz-yucel-germany-turkey.html> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

98. GEBAUER, M.: Trump Wasn't Only Problem at NATO Summit. June 01, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/world/irascible-erdogan-trump-wasn-t-only-problem-at-nato-summit-a-1149707.html>. Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

99. GÖNDER, H.: Presidential System and Its Applicability to Turkey. *Bilecik Şeyh Edebali University Journal of Social Sciences Institute*, Vol:2, No:1 May 23, 2017 , p. 170

100. GRUNAU, A.: How Deniz Yücel's Year in Prison Affects German-Turkish Relations. Feb 14, 2018, *DW*. <https://www.dw.com/en/how-deniz-y%C3%BCcel-s-year-in-prison-affects-german-turkish-relations/a-42555983> Retrieval date: 10.09.2018

101. GÜLENER, S.: Constitutional Framework of Executive Presidency In Turkey. *SETA*, NO:29, 2017, p. 29, <https://setav.org/en/assets/uploads/2017/04/ExecutivePresidency.pdf> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

102. GURUN, E.: Cumhurbaşkanlığı: Almanya'nın Açıklamalarını Şiddetle Kınıyoruz. July 20, 2017, *SPUTNIKEWS*, [Online]. Available: [Presidency: We strongly condemn Germany's statements] <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201707201029365390-ibrahim-kalin-almanya-tepki/>. Retrieval date: 25.10.2018

103. HALL, S.: Encoding/Decoding. in DURHAM, M. G. & KELLNER, D. (Eds.): *Media and Cultural Studies*. 350 Main Street, Malden, MA, USA, Blackwell Publishing Ltd, 2006, p. 165.

104. HALL, S.: *Representation: Cultural Representations and Signifying Practices*. London, SAGE Publications, 1997, p. 6.

105. HERMAN, E. & CHOMSKY, N.: A Propaganda Model In Manufacturing Consent: The Political Economy of the Mass Media. In DURHAM, M. G. & KELLNER, D. (Eds.): *Media and Cultural Studies*. 350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA, Blackwell Publishing Ltd, 2006, p. 257.

106. HÓIJER, B. & FINDAHL, O.: Nyheter, fcirstdelse, och minne. Stockholm: Studentlitteratur, cited by: DIJK, T. A.: *News Analysis*. New Jersey, Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Publishers, 1988, p.14

107. HUGGLER, J.: Merkel Demands Turkey Release Arrested German Journalist Amid Pressure over Erdoğan Visit. March 02, 2017, *The Telegraph*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/2017/03/02/merkel-demands-turkey-release-arrested-german-journalist-amid/> Retrieval date: 10.09.2018

108. IZGI, A.: 'Hollanda ile kriz AK Parti seçmenini 'Evet'e yöneltti'. [The crisis with the Netherlands led the AK Party voter to vote yes.] March 25, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/analiz/20170325102779692-hollanda-ile-kriz-akparti-secmenini-evete-yoneltti/> Retrieval date: 20.10.2018

109. K. K. & EKIM, S.: *The Turkish Constitutional Referendum, Explained*. Washington DC., US, The Brookings Institution, April 13, 2017. p.2
<https://www.brookings.edu/blog/order-from-chaos/2017/04/13/the-turkish-constitutional-referendum-explained/> Retrieval date: 03.08.2018

110. KALIN, I.: Soft Power and Public Diplomacy in Turkey. *Perceptions Journal of International Affairs*, Volume: XVI, No:3, Autumn, 2011, pp. 5-6
http://sam.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/2012/07/Autumn_2011.pdf, Retrieval Date: 01.09.2018

111. KARADENİZ, T.: Turkey Accuses Germany of Double Standards Over Meeting Cancellation. March 03, 2017, *The Star*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.thestar.com.my/news/world/2017/03/03/turkey-accuses-germany-of-double-standards-over-meeting-cancellation/> Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

112. KARADENİZ, T.: Turkey Accuses Germany of Providing Succor to Its Enemies. March 03, 2017. *REUTERS* [Online]. Available: <https://uk.reuters.com/article/uk-turkey-security-germany/turkey-accuses-germany-of-providing-succor-to-its-enemies-idUKKBN16A1F1>. Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

113. KARADUMAN, S.: Perspective And Contribution of Critical Discourse Analysis to Critical News Research. Maltepe Üniversitesi İletişim Fakültesi Dergisi, December 01, 2017. p. 32, <http://dergipark.gov.tr/download/article-file/386936> Retrieval date: 03.08.2018

114. KARAMAN, M.: EU must accept Erdogan reality: Sabah Columnists' Club panel highlights. Apr 03, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/politics/2017/04/04/eu-must-accept-erdogan-reality-sabah-columnists-club-panel-highlights>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

115. KAYNAK, M.: Merkel Türkiye'de. [Merkel is in Turkey] Feb 02, 2017. *DW*, Feb 02, 2017. *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/tr/merkel-t%C3%BCrkkiye-de/a-37379969>. Retrieval date: 03.09.2018

116. KAZIM, H.: The Bizarre Behavior of Turkish-German Voters. April 18, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/referendum-in-turkey-the-bizarre-behavior-of-turkish-german-voters-a-1143735.html>. Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

117. KENDALL, G.: What Is Critical Discourse Analysis? May 2007. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.qualitative-research.net/index.php/fqs/article/viewArticle/255/561> Retrieval date: 01.11.2018

118. KERSHAW, R.: Panorama. Aug, 1974. *BBC*, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=3cb_T9t4aKI min:15.05 – 15.30 Retrieval date: 21.08.2018

119. KISSANE, B.: What Is at Stake in the Turkish Constitutional Referendum? *The Social and Political Foundations of Constitutions*, No:1 p. 6, 2017, http://eprints.lse.ac.uk/72835/1/Kissane_What%20is%20at%20stake%20in%20the%20Turkish%20constitutional%20referendum_published_2017%20LSERO.pdf
Retrieval date: 05.08.2018

120. KNIPP, K.: Opinion: Red card for Erdogan. Mar 12, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/opinion-red-card-for-erdogan/a-37910744> Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

121. KNOBBE, M.: 'Coup in Turkey Was Just a Welcome Pretext'. March 20, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/german-intelligence-chief-bruno-kahl-interview-a-1139602.html>. Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

122. KÜÇÜKCAN, T. & KÜÇÜKKELEŞ, M.: *European Perceptions of Turkish Foreign Policy*. SETA | Foundation for Political, Economic and Social Research, Ankara, No: April 10, 2012, p.22, https://file.setav.org/Files/Pdf/20121128152200_seta-european_perceptions_of_turkish_foreign_policy.pdf Retrieval date: 01.09.2018

123. LYNEHAM, C.: Sigmar Gabriel: 'Turkey will never join EU' under Erdogan. Aug 25, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/sigmar-gabriel-turkey-will-never-join-eu-under-erdogan/a-40236026>. Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

124. MCCOMBS M. E. & SHAW, D. L.: The Agenda-Setting Function of Mass Media. *The Public Opinion Quarterly*, Vol. 36, No. 2. 1972. p.177, https://www.academia.edu/13123517/The_Agenda-Setting_Function_of_Mass_Media Retrieval date: 03.08.2018

125. NEUKIRCH, R.: Germany Debates Tougher Stance Against Turkey. July 21, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/germany-debates-tougher-stance-against-turkey-a-1159138.html>. Retrieval date: 03.10.2018

126. OZBEK, C.: Almanya İçin İncirlik'in Alternatif Neden Ürdün? [Why Incirlik's alternative is Jordan for Germany?] June 05, 2017, *DW*, <https://www.dw.com/tr/almanya-i%C3%A7in-incirlikin-alternatif-neden-%C3%BCrd%C3%BCn/a-39116467> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

127. ÖZKAN, B.: Bakan Kaya: Cumhurbaşkanımız 'Artık donebilirsin' Demeseydi, Orada Ölecektim. [Minister Kaya: I would die there if our president would not tell me 'you may come home'.] March 14, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703141027619833-bakankaya-cumhurbaskanimiz-artik-donebilirsin-olecektim/> Retrieval date: 20.10.2018

128. PAN, Z. & KOSICKI, G. M.: Framing Analysis: An Approach to News Discourse. *olitica Communication*, No:1, January 1993, p. 59,

[https://www.researchgate.net/publication/248988086_Framing_An_Approach_to_News_Discourse](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/248988086_Framing_Analysis_An_Approach_to_News_Discourse) Retrieval date: 03.09.2018

129. PATTERSON, A.: *Democracy and the Media. A Comparative Perspective*. New York, US, Cambridge University Press, 2000.
130. PAUL, A. & SCHMIDT, J.: Turkey's relations with Germany and the EU: Breaking the vicious circle. *European Policy Centre*, No:1, October 2, 2017, p. 2, http://www.epc.eu/documents/uploads/pub_7973_turkey-germany-eu.pdf Retrieval date: 07.08.2018
131. PIKE, J.: *1980 – Evren Coup*. 30 July 2013. GlobalSecurity, [Online]. Available: <https://www.globalsecurity.org/military/world/europe/tu-military-coup-1980.htm>. Retrieval date: 01.11.2018
132. PIKE, J: *1971 – Communique Coup*. July 30, 2013. GlobalSecurity, [Online]. Available: <https://www.globalsecurity.org/military/world/europe/tu-military-coup-1971.htm> Retrieval date: 01.11.2018
133. POHL, I.: Opinion: Turkish referendum must be a wake-up call for Germany. Apr 17, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/opinion-turkish-referendum-must-be-a-wake-up-call-for-germany/a-38455736>. Retrieval date: 04.10.2018
134. POPP, M.: Netherlands Dispute Gives Turkey Perfect Election Fodder. March 13, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/world/erdogan-the-netherlands-and-a-perfect-campaign-storm-a-1138525.html>. Retrieval date: 01.10.2018
135. POPP, M.: Tensions Escalate Between Berlin and Erdogan. March 07, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/world/tensions-escalate-between-berlin-and-turkey-a-1137734.html> Retrieval date: 01.10.2018
136. POPP, M.: The Demise of the Anatolian Tiger. March 31, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/business/turkish-economy-heading-toward-crisis-under-erdogan-a-1141363.html>. Retrieval date: 01.10.2018
137. POPP, M.: Turkey Against the World. July 06, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/g-20-erdogan-and-merkel-with-plenty-to-discuss-a-1156320.html>. Retrieval date: 01.10.2018
138. PRICE, V. & TEWKSURY, D.: News Values and Public Opinion: A Theoretical Account of Media Priming and Framing. *Progress in the Communication Sciences*, Vol:13. New York, US, ABLEX, 1997. p. 184, https://www.researchgate.net/profile/David_Tewksbury/publication/304834087_News_values_and_public_opinion_A_theoretical_account_of_media_priming_and_framing/links/577681dc08ae4645d60d7a4e/News-values-and-public-opinion-A-

Retrieval date: 03.08.2018

139. ROBINSON, L.: Turkey Will Never Become EU Member, Says Angela Merkel. Sep 03, 2017, *The Independent*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.independent.co.uk/news/world/europe/turkey-german-chancellor-angela-merkel-eu-member-president-recep-erdogan-nato-a7927861.html>. Retrieval date: 05.09.2018
140. RACHMAN, G.: Multilateralism In One Country: The Isolation of Merkel's Germany. *Transatlantic Academy*, No:6. pp. 5-9, April 2017. <http://www.gmfus.org/publications/multilateralism-one-country-isolation-merkels-germany> Retrieval date: 06.08.2018
141. RACHMAN, I.: Europe, calm down, it is a Turkish referendum, not yours. Mar 14, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/op-ed/2017/03/14/europe-calm-down-it-is-a-turkish-referendum-not-yours>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018
142. RAPPORTEUR: The EU's apathy enables Erdogan's repression. June 15, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/rapporteur-the-eus-apathy-enables-erdogans-repression/a-39268817>. Retrieval date: 04.10.2018
143. REUTERS: Berlin refuses Erdogan's request to address Turks, angering Ankara. June 29, 2017, *TRT WORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/germany-refuses-erdogans-request-to-address-turks-389754>. Retrieval date: 06.10.2018
144. REUTERS: Erdogan tells Turks in Germany to vote against Merkel and allies. Aug 18, 2017, *TRT WORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/erdogan-tells-turks-in-germany-to-vote-against-merkel-and-allies-9737>. Retrieval date: 06.10.2018
145. REUTERS: Journalist for German Newspaper Arrested in Turkey. Feb 27, 2017, *The Guardian*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/feb/27/journalist-for-german-newspaper-arrested-in-turkey> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018
146. SAHIN, T.: Turkey's EU Relations During Angela Merkel's Rule as Chancellor. Oct 18, 2017, *TRT WORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/turkey/turkey-s-eu-relations-during-angela-merkel-s-rule-as-chancellor-11452>. Retrieval date: 05.09.2018
147. SHAW, S. & BAILEY, J.: Discourse Analysis: What Is It and Why Is It Relevant to Family Practice? Cited by: EGHLIDI, M.: Critical Discourse Analysis of 'People's Son'

Story: A Micro and Macro-Levels Analysis. *Journal of Applied Linguistics and Language Research*, Volume 3, No:5, 2016, p. 58

148. PATTERSON, T: The United States: News in a Free-market Society. 2000, cited by: SALGADO, S. & STRÖMBACK, J.: Interpretive journalism: A Review of Concepts, Operationalizations and Key Findings. *Journalism*, No:2, February 01, , 2012, p. 146
149. SAUGA, M.: Can the German-Turkish Relationship Be Saved? August 10, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available: <http://www.spiegel.de/international/europe/a-1162037.html>. Retrieval date: 03.10.2018
150. SCF: Minister Kaya Says Dared to Die in Netherlands, Returned Upon Erdoğan's Call. March 14, 2017, STOCKHOLMCF, [Online]. Available: <https://stockholmcf.org/minister-kaya-says-dared-to-die-in-netherlands-returned-upon-erdogans-call/> Retrieval date: 20.10.2018
151. SCF: Erdoğan's Aide: Germany Backs Gülen Movement, Trump Administration Works on Gülen's Extradition. March 19, 2017, STOCKHOLMCF, [Online]. Available: <https://stockholmcf.org/erdogans-aide-germany-backs-gulen-movement-trump-administration-works-on-gulens-extradition/>. Retrieval date: 06.09.2018
152. SCF: German Chancellor Merkel Meets with Wife of Jailed Turkish Journalist Deniz Yücel. Oct 25, 2017, STOCKHOLMCF, [Online]. Available: <https://stockholmcf.org/german-chancellor-merkel-meets-with-wife-of-jailed-turkish-journalist-deniz-yucel/> Retrieval date: 10.09.2018
153. SCF: German FM Gabriel Says Journalist Deniz Yücel is Turkey's Hostage. Aug 18, 2017, STOCKHOLMCF, [Online]. Available: <https://stockholmcf.org/german-fm-gabriel-says-journalist-deniz-yucel-is-turkeys-hostage/> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018
154. SCHINDLER, K.: Erdogan Hoped to Swap Journalist Yucel for Generals Fled to Germany After Coup. July 20, 2017, SPUTNIKNEWS, [Online]. Available: <https://sputniknews.com/middleeast/201707201055715697-turkey-germany-journalist-exchange-soup/> Retrieval date: 10.09.2018
155. SCHMIDT, A.: Almanlar Türk'lere Çifte Vatandaşlığın İptalini İstiyor. [The Germans wants to cancel the dual citizenship right of Turks.] April 21, 2017, SPUTNIKNEWS, . [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201704211028171840-almanlar-turklere-cifte-vatandasligin-iptalini-istiyor/>. Retrieval date: 25.10.2018
156. SCHUMACHER, E.: Ankara Mayor Slams German Green Party Leader for 'Treachery. Aug 19, 2017, DW, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/ankara-mayor-slams-german-green-party-leader-for-treachery/a-40158091>
157. SCHWARZ, T.: İncirlik'i Ziyaret Eden Alman Vekil: Ankara'nın Tavrı Misafirperver Değildi. [A MP who visited Incirlik: Ankara's attitude was not hospitable.] Oct 06,

2016, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available:
<https://tr.sputniknews.com/avrupa/201610061025172817-incirlik-ziyaret-almanya-turkiye/> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

158. SEZER, M.: ERDOĞAN: Merkel'in Henüz Aramaması Suçluluk Psikolojisi. [Erdogan: The reason for Merkel not to call me to congratulate is the psychology of guilt.] April 20, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available:
<https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201704201028154763-erdogan-merkelin-henuz-aramamasi-sucluluk-psikolojisi/> Retrieval date: 25.10.2018

159. SHAHEEN, K.: 'Assault on Freedom of Expression': Die Welt Journalist's Arrest in Turkey Condemned. Feb 28, 2017, *The Guardian*, [Online]. Available:
<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2017/feb/28/formal-arrest-of-die-welt-journalist-deniz-yucel-in-turkey-condemned-german> Retrieval date: 06.09.2018

160. SMALE, A.: German Parliament Recognizes Armenian Genocide, Angering Turkey. June 02, 2016, *NY TIMES*, [Online]. Available:
<https://www.nytimes.com/2016/06/03/world/europe/armenian-genocide-germany-turkey.html>. Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

161. SOLMAZ, M.: Anti-Turkey rhetoric backfires: Turks in Europe vote 'yes', Apr 18, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/eu-affairs/2017/04/18/anti-turkey-rhetoric-backfires-turks-in-europe-vote-yes>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

162. SPIEGEL STAFF: Turkish Referendum Casts Dark Shadow over Germany. March 14, 2017. *Der Spiegel*, [Online]. Available:
<http://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/erdogan-and-turkish-referendum-divides-german-society-a-1138272.html>. Retrieval date: 01.10.2018

163. SPUTNIK: Berlin, Ankara Clash Over Arrests in Turkey and Rally Cancellation in Germany. March 03, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available:
<https://sputniknews.com/europe/201703031051244045-berlin-ankara-erdogan-clash/> Retrieval date: 29.10.2018

164. STACK, C.: Deutsche Welle marks 65th anniversary. June 06, 2018. *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/deutsche-welle-marks-65th-anniversary/a-43591961>. Retrieval date: 04.11.2018

165. SUDAGEZER, E.: Almanya'daki Türkler 'Erdoğanı Mısın' Diye Sorulanır Hale Geldi. [The Turks in Germany were started to questioned by asking a question 'are you supporter of Erdogan?'] July 27, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available:
<https://tr.sputniknews.com/columnists/201707271029458479-almanya-turkiye-erdogan-sorgulanir-hale-geldi/>. Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

166. TINAZAY, T.: İncirlik Izni Alamayan Almanya'nın Bu Kez Savunma Bakanı Geliyor. [This time Germany's the Minister of Defense is coming where could not get permission of İncirlik.] June 26, 2016, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/savunma/201606261023566546-incirlik-izin-almanya-savunma-bakani-leyen/> Retrieval date: 05.09.2018

167. TEO, P.: Racism in the News: A Critical Discourse Analysis of News Reporting in Two Australian Newspapers. *Discourse & Society*, Thousand Oaks, CA, US, SAGE Publications. Vol.11, No.1, 2000, pp.11-13, https://www.researchgate.net/publication/240705919_Racism_in_the_News_A_Critical_Discourse_Analysis_of_News_Reportin Two Australian Newspapers Retrieval date: 02.09.2018

168. THE REPUBLIC of TURKEY, Constitution of The Republic Of Turkey Article 104. (As amended on January 21, 2017; Act No. 6771) Ankara, 2017, p.49

169. TM: German daily Bild says Atatürk Would Vote 'No' In Referendum If He Were Alive. March 27, 2017, *TURKISHMINUTE*, [Online]. Available: rtworld/ Retrieval date: 30.10.2018

170. TRAPPES-LOMAX, H.: Discourse Analysis. In DAVIES, A. & ELDER, C. (EDS): The Handbook of Applied Linguistics, Oxford, United Kingdom. Blackwell Publishing Ltd, 2008, p. 134.

171. TRT: About TRT. *TRT*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trt.net.tr/Kurumsal/Tarihce.aspx> Retrieval date: 04.11.2018

172. TRT: About TRT. *TRTWORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/about> Retrieval date: 04.11.2018

173. TRTWORLD: Erdogan says "spirit of fascism" reigns in Europe. Mar 15, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/erdogan-says-spirit-of-fascism-reigns-europe-317576>. Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

174. TRTWORLD: 7 things to know about the diplomatic row between Turkey and Germany. Mar 10, 2017, *TRTRWORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/7-things-about-the-diplomatic-row-between-turkey-and-germany-314013>. Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

175. TRTWORLD: Erdogan compares Germany's actions to those of 'Nazi period'. Mar 5, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/turkey/erdogan-likins-german-actions-to-those-of-nazi-period-310703>. Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

176. TRTWORLD: Erdogan hints at referendum on Turkey's EU accession. Apr 17, 2017, *TRTWORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/turkey/erdogan-hints-at-referendum-on-turkey-s-eu-accession-6400>. Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

177. TRT WORLD: Germany says won't allow Turkish voting on death penalty. May 5, 2017, *TRT WORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/germany-says-won-t-allow-turkish-voting-on-death-penalty--6791>. Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

178. TRT WORLD: Germany's decision to cancel Turkish ministers' rallies causes outrage. Mar 2, 2017, *TRT WORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/germany-s-decision-to-cancel-turkish-ministers-address-causes-outrage-308613> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

179. TRT WORLD: Turkey accuses Germany of "double standards". Mar 3, 2017, *TRT WORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/turkey-accuses-germany-of-double-standards--5493>. Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

180. TRT WORLD: Turkey may hold referendum on EU membership. Mar 25, 2017, *TRT WORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/turkey/turkey-may-hold-referendum-on-eu-membership-5944>. Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

181. TRT WORLD: Turkey says Germany supports terrorism. Mar 18, 2017, *TRT WORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/turkeys-says-germany-supports-terrorism-319304>. Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

182. TRT WORLD: Turkey, Germany relations in stalemate. Mar 9, 2017, *TRT WORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/turkey-german-relations-in-stalemate-313475>. Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

183. TRT WORLD: Germany rejects Erdogan's "Nazi era" comparison. Mar 6, 2017, *TRT WORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/germany-rejects-erdogan-s-nazi-era-comparison-5545> Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

184. TRT WORLD: Turkey and Germany continue spat. Mar 20, 2017, *TRT WORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/europe/germany-and-turkey-continue-spat-320653>. Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

185. TRT WORLD: Why many Turkish citizens in Europe rallied behind the "yes" vote. Apr 20, 2017, *TRT WORLD*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.trtworld.com/turkey/heres-why-many-turkish-citizens-in-europe-rallied-behind-yes-vote-339295>. Retrieval date: 06.10.2018

186. TSUNO, Y.: Hollanda Başbakanı Rutte: Erdoğan, Nazi Ifadesiyle Cizgiyi Fazlaşıyla Aştı. [Dutch Prime Minister Rutte: Erdogan surpassed the line with Nazi expressions.] March 11, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703141027619833-bakankaya-cumhurbaskaniniz-artik-donebilirsin-olecektim/> Retrieval date: 29.10.2018

187. TURAN, D.: Parliamentarism or Presidentialism? *Ankara University Journal*, No:1, 1993 p. 155, <http://dergiler.ankara.edu.tr/dergiler/42/454/5148.pdf> Retrieval date: 03.08.2018

188. UÇRAK, UTKU: Yıldırım: Venedik Komisyonu'nun Raporu Siyasi, Herkes Haddini Bilsin. [Yıldırım: The Report of Venice Commision is Political. Everyone Must Know Their Line.] March 14, 2017, *SPUTNIKNEWS*, [Online]. Available: <https://tr.sputniknews.com/turkiye/201703141027635584-binali-yildirim-venedik-komisyonu-raporu/> Retrieval date: 03.09.2018

189. VENICE COMMISSION: Unofficial Translation of the Amendments to the Constituton. Council of Europe, Venice, 2017.

190. WIDUNA, I. A.: The Function of CDA in Media Discourse Studies. *Journal of English Educators Society*, No:3(1)., April 4, 2018 p. 119 https://www.researchgate.net/publication/324251628_The_Function_of_CDA_in_Media_Discourse_Studies Retrieval date: 02.09.2018

191. WINTER, C.: Turkish referendum threatens formal divorce with EU. Mar 15, 2017, *DW*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dw.com/en/turkish-referendum-threatens-formal-divorce-with-eu/a-37951498>. Retrieval date: 04.10.2018

192. YALÇIN, H. B. The Concept of “Middle Power” and the Recent Turkish Foreign Policy Activism. *Afro Eurasian Studies*, No:1, Spring 2012, . p. 206, http://www.afroeurasianstudies.net/dosyalar/site_resim/veri/4842000.pdf Retrieval date: 10.10.2018

193. YAZICI, S.: Constitutional Amendments of 2017: Transition to Presidentialism in Turkey. *Hauser Global Law School Program, New York University School of Law*, No:1 October 2017, p.2 http://www.nyulawglobal.org/globalex/2017_Turkey_Constitution_Amendments.html Retrieval date: 04.09.2018

194. YERKEL, S.: Surrendered to populism, Germany increases anti-Turkey sentiment. Mar 19, 2017, *Daily Sabah*, [Online]. Available: <https://www.dailysabah.com/op-ed/2017/03/20/surrendered-to-populism-germany-increases-anti-turkey-sentiment>. Retrieval date: 05.10.2018

